

Historical Studies

2009

VOLUME 75

The Journal published by

The Canadian Catholic Historical Association

(founded June 3, 1933)

Elizabeth W. McGahan, Ph.D.
Editor

Indre Cuplinskas, Ph.D.
Associate Editor

Editorial Board

Terrence Murphy, Ph.D.	Richard A. Lebrun, Ph.D.
Raymond Huel, Ph.D.	John S. Moir, Ph.D.
Glenn Wright, M.A.	Fred McEvoy, M.A.
Elizabeth Smyth, Ed.D.	Roberto Perin, Ph.D.
Jeanne Beck, Ph.D.	Mark McGowan, Ph.D
Peter Meehan, Ed.D.	

A National Society for the Promotion
of Interest
in Catholic History

**The Seventy-fifth annual meeting of the English Section
of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association
was held at the University of British Columbia and
St Mark's and Corpus Christi Colleges
2-3 June 2008**

CANADIAN CATHOLIC HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION

HISTORICAL STUDIES

Historical Studies, a publication of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association, features papers read at its annual conference. All articles are refereed, and are usually on the history of Catholicism in Canada or on topics having a connection with the Catholic Church in Canada.

Historical Studies is published annually. Subscriptions are available through the Secretary, Canadian Catholic Historical Association, 81 St. Mary Street, Toronto, Ontario, M5S 1J4. For mailing addresses in Canada, the amount is \$40 per year; for U.S. mailing addresses, the amount is \$45 per year; for European addresses, the amount is \$50 per year; for students, the amount is \$25 per year. Copies of most back issues can be obtained from the same address at \$25 per volume, postage and handling \$5 in Canada and \$15 for International addresses.

Correspondence relating to editorial matters should be addressed to the Editor, *Historical Studies*, University of St. Michael's College, 81 St. Mary Street, Toronto, Ontario, M5S 1J4.

The CCHA's "home page" may be accessed at the following URL:
http://www.umanitoba.ca/colleges/st_pauls/ccha

CCHA *Historical Studies* is indexed in the *Canadian Periodical Index*, the *Catholic Periodical and Literature Index*, *Ulrich's International Periodicals Dictionary*, ABC-Clio's *America: History and Life*, and the *Canadian Historical Review's "Recent Publications Relating to Canada."*

ISSN 1193 B 1981
© Historia Ecclesiae Catholicae
Canadensis Publications Inc.
Ottawa, Ontario, 2009

Table of Contents

75th Anniversary Issue

List of Contributors.....	4
Editors' Foreword	5
Papers not published	6

Conference Keynote Presentation

Bishop Remi J. De Roo, Retired (1999) Bishop of Victoria Proclaiming a Prophetic Vision: Blessed John XXIII and the Second Vatican Council	7-20
--	------

Articles

Mark G. McGowan The Fulton Sheen Affair: Religious Controversy, Nationalism, and Commercialism in the Early Years of Canadian Television, 1952-1958	21-38
Stéphane-D. Perreault National Identities on Display: Québec's Deaf Schools at the World's Columbian Exposition, 1893	39-61
David Webster Canadian Catholics and the East Timor Struggle, 1975-99....	63-82
Jacqueline Gresko O'Melia San and the Catholic Japanese Mission, Vancouver, B.C	83-99
Abstracts/Résumés	101
Kenney Prize Announcement	105
Submission Guidelines	107
A Current Bibliography of Canadian Religious History	B1

List of Contributors

Bishop Remi J. De Roo is a native of Manitoba. He received a Doctorate in Sacred Theology in 1952 from Angelicum University in Rome. Appointed in October 1962 to the Second Vatican Council, Bishop De Roo addressed the Council on four occasions. Upon reaching the mandatory age of 75, he retired as Bishop of Victoria in 1999.

Mark G. McGowan is a Full Professor of History at the University of Toronto and the Principal of St. Michael's College. He has written many award-winning books and articles on religion, identity, and Irish Catholicism, the latest of which is *Death or Canada: The Irish Famine Migration to Toronto, 1847*. He is currently writing a history of religion and broadcasting in Canada.

Stéphane-D. Perreault teaches history at Red Deer College, Alberta. He holds a Ph.D. from McGill University for a dissertation on Montréal's deaf communities between 1850 and 1920. He is the author of *Une communauté qui fait signe : les Sœurs de Notre-Dame-des-Sept-Douleurs, 1887-2006* (Montréal : Carte Blanche, 2006).

David Webster is a Kiriyama research fellow at the University of San Francisco, where his work involves the transnational histories of independence movements in Asia. He is the author of *Fire and the Full Moon: Canada and Indonesia in a Decolonizing World* (forthcoming in 2009 from University of British Columbia Press) and of numerous articles on East Timor. He co-edited *East Timor Testimony: Photographs by Elaine Briere* (Toronto: Between the Lines, 2004).

Jacqueline Gresko faculty emerita Douglas College, New Westminster B.C., is a sessional instructor at Corpus Christi College, University of British Columbia. Her publications include articles on missionaries in the West and a history of the Archdiocese of Vancouver. She is currently researching Catholic women religious work among Japanese evacuees in British Columbia during World War II. She serves as vice-president of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association.

Editors' Foreword

We are pleased to present Volume 75 of *Historical Studies*, the 75th anniversary issue of the journal, featuring papers presented at the 2008 annual meeting of the English Section of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association held at the University of British Columbia and St. Mark's and Corpus Christi Colleges. Papers presented at the 2008 conference but not published here for various reasons (either papers given without a view to publication or not offered to the editors) are listed separately on page 6.

Once again, all of the articles included in this edition of the journal have passed through a rigorous "double-blind" review process, meaning that they have been accepted on the recommendations of at least three assessors. We are indebted to all of the individuals whose cooperation in the writing, assessing and revising of these papers has made this edition of *Historical Studies* possible. The journal and the association continue to be grateful to Fr. Edward Jackman, O.P., Secretary General of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association and the Jackman Foundation for the generous support and encouragement that has made this, along with previous volumes, possible.

Included as well are the submission guidelines for prospective authors which appeared in the last volume. As introduced in Volume 72, full-run back issues of the journal and a detailed bibliography are available for purchase through the Association, either in hard copy form or on CD. The Association continues to make selected articles from the previous years' journal accessible on the CCHA homepage (http://www.umanitoba.ca/colleges/st_pauls/ccha.html).

The journal thankfully acknowledges the support that Saint Joseph's College, University of Alberta is providing Dr. Cuplinskas in carrying out her editorial duties for *Historical Studies*.

Lastly, two years ago Richard Lebrun, a former long-serving editor, reviewed the themes, regions and authors represented in *Historical Studies* since the inception of the Association and noted the journal's overall contributions to Canadian Catholic history. On this, the occasion of its 75th anniversary, *Historical Studies* renews its commitment to the presentation of scholarly articles focusing on Catholicism in Canada.

Elizabeth W. McGahan
Indre Cuplinskas

Papers presented at the Annual Meeting
University of British Columbia and St Mark's
and Corpus Christi Colleges 2-3 June 2008
but not included in this volume:

Robert Nicholas Bérard, “‘The End of the Gentlemen’s Agreement’: the Collapse of Catholic Education in Nova Scotia”

Richard A. Enns, “Proceeding in a ‘Weak and Defensive’ Manner: Federal Acquiescence in Light of Oblate Opposition to the Integration of Aboriginal Students Following World War II”

Colleen Gray, “Fragile Authority: Marie-Josèphe Maugue-Garreau and the Congrégation de Notre-Dame in Eighteenth-Century Montreal”

Heidi MacDonald, Moderator

Elizabeth Smyth

Ellen Leonard, CSJ

Elizabeth W. McGahan

Jacqueline Gresko

Roundtable on *Changing Habits: Women’s Religious Orders in Canada*

David Seljak, Co-editor

Paul Bramadat, Co-editor

Wendy Fletcher, Anglicans

Bruce Guenther, Evangelical Christians

Bryan Hillis, Lutherans

Solange Lefebvre, Roman Catholics (francophone)

Royden Loewen, Mennonites

Stuart Macdonald, Presbyterians and Reformed Christians

Mark McGowan, Roman Catholics (anglophone)

Myrosław Tataryn, Eastern Christians

Roundtable and Book Launch on *Christianity and Ethnicity in Canada*

Edward MacDonald, “Who’s Afraid of the Fenians? The Fenian Scare and the Politics of Place on Prince Edward Island”

Adrian Ciani, “Just Watch Me: Trudeau, Vatican Recognition and the Politics of Federalism”

Proclaiming A Prophetic Vision: Blessed John XXIII and the Second Vatican Council¹

Remi J. DE ROO, Retired (1999) Bishop of Victoria

My experience of the Second Vatican Council dates back to the summer of 1959. The story began to unfold on 25 January of that year, with the announcement made to a startled world by the newly elected Bishop of Rome, Pope John XXIII (now Blessed John). Convinced that he had received a message or vision from heaven, he had decided on a three-fold initiative. He declared that he would shortly convene an ecumenical council, hold a diocesan synod for his local church in Rome, and prepare a revision of the 1917 Code of Canon Law.

On 18 June he contacted all the Bishops of the world through a letter signed by his Secretary of State, Cardinal Tardini. He asked them to offer their suggestions concerning the agenda and content of this proposed Assembly, later to be known as the Second Vatican Council.

My own Archbishop at the time, Maurice Baudoux of St. Boniface, Manitoba, responded with enthusiasm to this invitation. He formed a research team of nineteen priests, of which I was one, and initiated a consultation with interested people throughout our diocese. He also consulted with his neighboring Archbishops with whom he had close fraternal relationships. They were Eparchial Archbishop and Metropolitan for the Ukrainians of Canada, Maxim Hermaniuk, a Redemptorist, and George Flahiff, Archbishop of Winnipeg (later Cardinal), a former superior general of the Basilian Fathers.

Archbishops Maurice Baudoux and Maxim Hermaniuk were of one mind on many matters of concern to both the Eastern Churches and those of the Roman or Latin Rite. I understand they also had the sympathetic support of

¹ Keynote presentation, 2008 Conference of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association, University of British Columbia, 2 June 2008. Revised for publication with the assistance of Richard Lebrun.

Archbishop George Flahiff. The combined efforts of these church leaders from Manitoba deserves greater attention than they have received to date.

I will recognize my bias in using the term “Western Canadian Team” to refer to the several Council participants who benefitted from the leadership of Archbishop Baudoux. Their combined efforts produced more grist for the mill of Vatican II than any other group in Canada. I learned this while participating in a seminar organized by the Dean of the Faculty of Theology of Laval University in Quebec, Fr. Gilles Routhier. He has done an impressive amount of research and publication over the years and is probably the best informed person in Canada regarding these matters.

As a member of the group working with Archbishop Baudoux, which formulated some sixty proposals, I was disappointed to find their more creative insights were not reflected in the seven draft documents or *schemata* which the Vatican Preparatory Commission, controlled by members of the Curia, eventually forwarded to all the prospective Council Fathers. But that is another story, since none of these preparatory documents survived the Council intact. Only traces remain in the subsequent publications produced by the Council.

I was privileged to work with Baudoux during more than ten years, beginning with my return in 1952 from doctoral studies in Rome. Through my association with this pioneering church leader, I was made more aware of some of the pre-council experiments which were already in progress in several countries. In retrospect one perceives how they were a distant preparation for the Council. Various initiatives aimed at renewing church life were being launched, mostly in Europe, a few in parts of Canada. It was thus that I encountered the early lay apostolate movements, then known as Catholic Action. Here I met exceptionally gifted lay leaders like Claude Ryan and Romeo Maione. Baudoux took full advantage of the first cautious experiments tolerated by Vatican authorities to promote exciting local initiatives in liturgy, Catholic Action, religious education, and ecumenism. In the course of my one year of service as his personal secretary and vice-chancellor, I came to appreciate more fully the significance of the episcopal motto he had etched on his coat of arms: *Superimpendar* (I will expend myself beyond measure). His French biographer, Denise Robillard, has entitled her as yet unpublished manuscript *Le Géant de l'Ouest*.²

Baudoux also encouraged me when I joined in some ecumenical initiatives with Fr. Irénée Beaubien, a Jesuit in Montreal, and Fr. Frank Stone, a Paulist, working with his assistant, Ms. Bonnie Brennan, in Toronto.

² Archives de l'archevêché de Saint-Boniface, Denise Robillard, *Le Géant de l'Ouest, Maurice Baudoux, 1902-1988*, (unpublished manuscript, n.d.).

They ran impressive Catholic Information Centres, and I established in St. Boniface a modest Catholic Inquiry Forum modeled after theirs. The public lectures and exchanges offered there aimed to inform interested people about the Catholic Faith as well as to develop better understanding and friendly relations with non-Catholics. In retrospect, these presentations were a distinct improvement over the kind of apologetics that passed for theology when I was a student at the seminary. But they still look rather primitive when compared to the ecumenical dialogue that has gained ascendancy since the Council.

In all of this, one can perceive how the Spirit was already moving before the Council even began. Pope John XXIII deserves full credit for having been sensitive to these stirrings and for having recognized the finger of God guiding them.

These experiences in Manitoba contributed to the observations that Baudoux and his co-workers submitted to the respective Commissions in Rome, along with the customary concerns focused on the Church disciplines current in those days. Bishops were already closely controlled by the Vatican, particularly through the countless indults that had to be obtained for any ecclesial initiative beyond established policy or routines. If time permitted I could share a number of horror stories, some with very negative consequences, others ludicrous when seen from a post-Vatican II perspective. (For example, an indult denied for the use of a drinking straw for a priest dying of throat cancer, unable to swallow the host; the Franciscan monopoly on erection of Stations of the Cross.)

As I recall, some sixty suggestions were sent to Rome from Saint Boniface. Most of them reflected the church model and discipline prevalent at the time and followed the outlines of the 1917 Code of Canon Law. But there were also a number of innovative and truly noteworthy insights. Some of these are cited in Bernard Daly's book *Beyond Secrecy: The Untold Story of Canada and the Second Vatican Council*.³

I quote from introductory remarks Baudoux attached to his suggestions (on file in St. Boniface Archdiocesan archives), where he proposed that as a "crucial general principle...the primary purpose of all council undertakings should be 'concern for that essential unity that is beyond the contingencies of times and places, following the example of the multiform unity manifested in God and in Creation.'"

Similarly, with regard to the reform of church discipline, he suggested that church laws should make the apostolate more efficacious among both

³ Bernard M. Daly, *Beyond Secrecy: The Untold Story of Canada and the Second Vatican Council* (Ottawa: Novalis, 2003).

Catholics and non-Catholics. Concerning the question of unity, he asked for clarification of the degree of incorporation of all human beings into Christ. As for “separated Christians,” he asked that the respect the church has for all Christian people and their expressions of church life be made manifest, while everything possible be done to expedite their return to the flock of Peter. One can see that Baudoux had an unusually open mind and heart with respect to ecclesial life and its impact on people at large.

During the first session of the Council, Baudoux courageously established a Secretariat for the Canadian Conference of Catholic Bishops (CCCB) at their College in Rome. He labored against the clock with his assistant theologian or *peritus*, Fr. Antoine Hacault, who became Auxiliary Bishop in 1964 and later his successor in Saint Boniface, now deceased. They were ably assisted by Fr. Bernard de Margerie of Saskatchewan, a dedicated avant-garde ecumenist, who was then studying in Rome. Much of the council work done by the Canadian Bishops was coordinated through that office. The exception was Cardinal Paul-Emile Léger, who made an outstanding contribution to the Council, but kept his own personal agenda close to his heart. (Here is a challenge to the CCHA: more research needs to be done on the contribution that the Canadian bishops made to Vatican II. Proportionately, their influence was well beyond their numbers.)

When Archbishop George Flahiff succeeded Maurice Baudoux as President of the CCCB (1963-65), he asked the latter to continue guiding this Secretariat and to keep developing the connections he had established with the increasing number of other Conferences. These were rapidly being formed, partly to counter the determined attempts of the Vatican curial officials to control the Council agenda.

The Second Vatican Council opened on 11 October 1962. An “optimist,” Pope John XXIII called for a “pastoral” council, recommending the use of the medicine of mercy. He rejected the “prophets of doom and gloom” and chastised them for not learning from history as our teacher. He had himself labored for long years to produce a five-volume work on the sixteenth-century pastoral reform initiated by St. Charles Borromeo, whom he greatly admired. His vision for Vatican II can be summed up in two words: *aggiornamento* and *ressourcement* (words that implied looking forward and looking in retrospect, that is, fidelity to tradition, but openness to the Holy Spirit).

John XXIII revealed his warm personality to non-Catholic Observers at the Council when he said: “your presence stirs my soul as a priest and bishop...please read in my heart...even more than my lips.” One Methodist, Dr. Albert Outler, later said that it was “the Johannine charismatic vision, this heart-lifting demonstration of the irresistible power of Christian

graciousness, that brought the Council into being and gave it its distinctive character.”⁴

After John XXIII died in June 1963, a Canadian Protestant Minister and friend came to offer me his condolences. His eyes filled with tears, he exclaimed: “We have lost our Pope!”

I have my own special memory of this beloved Pope. It is a beautiful amethyst ceremonial ring which I treasure as a relic of a Saint since his beatification on 3 September 2000. Shortly after my arrival at the Council in November 1962, I was received in audience along with the other Canadian Bishops. When Pope John was advised of the presence of the most recently appointed member of the Canadian hierarchy, he beckoned me to come forward. He inquired about my age and when told I was thirty-eight, he smiled and said he hoped I would live to be eighty-three. I marveled at his quick wit and humor. Only later did it dawn on me that something else was at stake. Aged eighty one, and aware he was dying of cancer, he knew that his own hope for a healthy old age was not to be fulfilled.

Something must also be said about the role of Pope Paul VI. He reconvened the Council after its interruption by the death of John XXIII. He also accepted his predecessor’s “vision from heaven,” describing the council as a “New Pentecost.” In the light of the first session, he further clarified its goals, speaking of a new awareness of the inner nature of the Church; of renewal and reform achieved by stripping away anything unworthy or defective; of hope for a “new springtime” for a “church of charity”; of the search for authentic Christian unity by living out the prayer of Christ; and of a dialogue with the world of today, erecting bridges of service and love.

He gave stern instructions to the Curia in April 1966, admonishing them to remember that Conciliar doctrine belongs to the magisterium of the Church and is indeed to be attributed to the breath of the Holy Spirit.

In retrospect it might be argued that Paul VI vastly underestimated the resistance to change which the Curia Officials resolutely maintained, supported by several other Prelates from abroad. An ideological re-reading of the council has been noted in many articles written since the Council ended.

In all fairness one must also admit that some local Bishop-Ordinaries did not whole-heartedly espouse the vision of John XXIII or even fully apply the teachings and directives of the Council. Among other things, to this day they continue to rely needlessly on Rome for guidance in areas

⁴ Dr. Albert C. Outler, World Methodist Council, Perkins School of Theology, Dallas, Texas (unpublished paper, n.d.).

where they are fully competent as personally and immediately responsible to Jesus Christ. Also in retrospect, it appears that the majority voting positively (generally over 90%) were naïve in assuming that their decisions would be automatically carried out. They failed to realize how ingrained and stubborn old mentalities and habits can be.

Again, an assessment made by Dr. Outler at the close of the Council is worth noting. Speaking of Paul VI, he said: “In accepting and modulating the Johannine program, [Paul VI] has become the highly reflective director of an incredibly complex enterprise that is solidly conservative in doctrine and discipline, on the one hand, and vigorously progressive in polity and program on the other.”⁵

From another perspective, the Council could be understood as a continuous act of liturgy. The body of vested prelates opened each day’s session with Mass in one of twenty-six possible rites. There followed the veneration and enthronement of a magnificent ornate Book of Gospels. When the Council held its first session, concelebration was not yet permitted. It developed naturally out of the experience of the council assembly, eventually to become the norm for group gatherings.

The Council was also characterized by natural human struggles. There were ongoing tensions and protracted argumentation (though within a fraternal atmosphere) and even some harsh disputes between differing schools of theology/ideologies. A future-oriented majority was opposed by a “status-quo (Roman/Western) orthodoxy focus” minority. There were also cultural tensions between the Western or Aristotelian “logical” mind, with focus on dualistic right-wrong, on “opposites,” and the Eastern approach, more concerned with holistic integration, seeking “harmony and balance.” It is a tribute to Pope Paul VI’s conciliatory skills that such a high degree of consensus was eventually reached.

One can also speak of the presence at the Council of elements in a growing “global consciousness.” Contacts increased apace between representatives of bishops’ conferences. We can take note here of the special, however discreet, role of “bilingual” Canada, (particularly through Baudoux and Flahiff) in consultative groupings, in countering the controlling efforts of the Curia. Canada had an early experience with a Bishops’ Conference (founded in 1943). Its bilingual nature made it a natural model from which other groups of Bishops could learn, as they “scrambled” to combine their efforts to offset or even counter the pressures from the Roman Curia. Some Vatican Officials fought tenaciously to control the Council and orient its deliberations.

⁵ *Ibid.*

There were as well pastoral insights based on international and intercultural (missionary) experience. There was dialogue between schools of theology, between theologians and other *periti* and with non-Catholic Observers. Very fruitful “socializing” went on among many of the several thousand academics and pastors gathered in Rome.

The consequent openness helped me, and probably many other Council Fathers, to deepen our sense of a living pneumatology in the Church, to feel the presence and activity of the Holy Spirit. I often thought of Cardinal Newman’s insights and his theory of development, as well as the observation attributed to him that to grow is to change and that to be perfect is to have changed many times.

A word must also be said about the special contributions of the theologians. Among my many personal contacts I recall, in alphabetical order: Gregory Baum, Marie-Dominique Chenu, Yves Congar, John Courtney Murray, Edouard Schillebeeckx, Jean-Marie Roger Tillard to name a few, contributing to and inspiring the work of the Commissions, sharing with the Bishops, drafting texts for interventions. To this day I am thankful to Blessed John XXIII for having “liberated” many of the leading theologians and allowed them free scope. One cannot say too much in praise of their competence, their self-less dedication, spending of themselves well beyond the call of duty, obviously out of a deep sense of faith and a perception of the deeper significance of what was happening at this providential time in history.

Women came late to the Council (at the 3rd session), as “listeners” (*auditors!*). Despite this regrettable delay, they still made a substantial contribution, even if mostly in an indirect fashion. A number of them were well known to and highly respected by the Bishops. The exchanges and on the spot consultations made possible by the areas set aside in St. Peter’s Basilica for relaxation, the three “coffee bars,” helped to enhance this important dimension. The latest one was designated as reserved to the women auditors. We Council Fathers soon opted to distinguish these venues by name: “Bar Jonah, Bar Abbas, Bar-Nun/None?”

Another characteristic of the personality of John XXIII was his sensitivity to the need of the Council participants for some relief from the tedious routine of listening to endless and not necessarily substantial speeches. Some were delivered in Latin accents not readily recognizable to those not totally familiar with this ancient language.

How can we sum up the Council, the impact of the vision of Pope John? Part of the Council’s importance is that it was the largest ever and most international council in history. Vatican II was more “catholic” and more “representative” than any previous council, with ten times more Council Fathers than the Council of Trent, and three times as many as Vatican I.

The main elements and results can be seen as growing out of Pope John's vision, which is to be found primarily in his Opening Address to the Council, and two of his encyclicals, *Mater et Magistra* (1961) and *Pacem in Terris* (1963). These provided the "orientations" that gradually conditioned the deliberations of the Council and inspired several of its documents (see, especially, *Gaudium et Spes*, *Ad Gentes*, *Unitatis Redintegratio*, and *Dignitatis Humanae*).

It is an impossible task to "dissect" such a substantial and somewhat complex body of teaching under simplistic headings! However, the following "clusters" appear to me to reflect or group some of the more salient features. At the risk of over-simplifying, I offer the following as a summary:

A) A new way of being Church. Our ecclesial life should not only manifest itself by communion, but it should also exhibit the marks of genuine friendship. I believe this dimension is at the heart of John XXIII's contribution and extremely important for the future if the Church is to have meaningful relationships with the world.

B) A new Pentecost and the gradual restoration of pneumatology (in ministry as well as liturgy). Blessed Pope John XXIII had a strong faith in the Holy Spirit. He rejected the prophets of doom and gloom and confidently predicted that the Council would bring about a new Pentecost. Pope Paul VI, convening its second session, and subsequently Pope John Paul II, deliberately repeated this expression.

The Council gradually came to a renewed understanding of and respect for pneumatology, the influence of the Holy Spirit as well as the variety of charismatic gifts bestowed on all baptized and confirmed members of the Church. (See below the consequences for Liturgy and Sacraments).

The theology of the Holy Spirit has been better preserved in the Eastern rites. This applies to the Liturgy of the Mass and the restoration of the key role of the Epiclesis.⁶

C) A Christ-centred Church, which manifests a renewed focus on mission as prior to maintenance. Jesus Christ who is perceived as a personal

⁶ One example of post-Vatican II development is the Agreement of 26 October 2001, ratified by Rome, between the Chaldean and Assyrian church, concerning the Anaphora of Addai & Mari. This decision is based on the pre-Nicæan tradition (*'lex orandi legem statuat credendi'*, let the law of prayer determine the law of belief: as we pray, so we believe). The "Anaphora" does not have the isolated "formula of consecration." The entire core is consecratory. This illustrates how **the transforming power comes from the words of Christ**, alive today and present in the Eucharist through the Holy Spirit, not from the words spoken by the ordained presider, however significant this ministerial function.

living revelation, message and messenger, a model of the Human. Describing the Church as the “Sacrament of Christ who is Sacrament for the World.” Maintaining a distinction between the Kingdom of God or the Reign of Christ and the institutional Church as such.

I also remember hearing Yves Congar tell the Canadian Bishops that the terms Christ and Spirit are sometimes practically interchangeable. Another of his expressions I recall is that in Jesus Christ, God made the Divine visible in the form of self-sacrificing love.

D) The Liturgy perceived as the “Divine Work” of Christ and members of His Body and re-centered on the Paschal Mystery.⁷

Pope Pius XII had already called for liturgical renewal in 1958, in response to grassroots stirrings signaling an awakening, primarily in Europe. John XXIII encouraged the Council Fathers to initiate their deliberations by focusing on the liturgy, the very heart of the Church, which extends the “Work of Christ.” All believers are called to participate in worship “knowingly, actively, fruitfully.”⁸

Vatican II was itself a solemn expression of worship, as each day began with Eucharist followed by the enthronement of the Book of Gospels. Liturgical renewal combined with modern biblical scholarship would ultimately result in “homilies” replacing “sermons,” the “breaking of bread and of the Word” taking priority over “instructions in morality.”

I recall Yves Congar O.P. telling the Canadian Bishops about the millennial shift that occurred. The Eucharist initially fashioned the Church throughout the First Millennium. But eventually, clerical leadership sought to control and shape the Eucharist with new problems ensuing as they quarreled over “definitions” of its nature. The Church then appeared to “make the Eucharist.” We now face a basic challenge for the next millennium to clarify this major issue regarding the “source and summit” of ecclesial life and to once again let the Eucharist build and shape the Church.

E) A Pastoral Council. This term “pastoral” actually expresses a broader meaning than the widely used “doctrinal,” that is, a council aimed at repressing heresy or clarifying disputed theological points. Spiritual guidance for Christian living (orthopraxis) must be recognized as equaling in importance correct doctrinal teaching (orthodoxy). St. John’s Gospel presents Jesus, “I Am,” as the Way and the Life, as well as the Truth. A

⁷ See Pope John Paul II in *Laborem Exercens* (1981) regarding the “subjective” nature of work, as developmental of the human. One might also recall here the studies done by Yves Congar on the Baptismal Priesthood (Romans and I Peter 2:9-10) and those of Marie-Dominique Chenu on Creation and Work.

⁸ *Sacrosanctum Concilium*, #11.

renewed focus on the kind of spirituality required today is necessarily holistic, embracing the totality of the human being. The mystics can achieve greater wisdom than the logicians caught up in their philosophical categories and neo-scholastic speculation! Pope John called for a clear distinction between the unchanging substance of doctrine and the way in which it is presented. *Aggiornamento* means that the Church is called to continual adaptation and reformation with the rectifying of deficiencies. Also, “Friendship” needs to be the central focus or identifying quality of our Church, just as much as “Communion.”

F) Historical consciousness (the influence of the Church in history and of history in the Church). There are many aspects to this development. Reconciliation of the Church with modernity. Relativising some “Absolutes” and “Systems.” Accepting the positive elements of the current shift towards democracy. Recognizing the current global universalist trend and the need for freedom of research. Practicing honesty in the pursuit of truth. Pursuing equality and responsibility before the law. Putting in place structural checks and balances. Making a habit of systematic evaluation and self-criticism. One might also remember and reclaim the “analogy of faith” which is part of our teaching heritage.

John XXIII reminded the Council Fathers that history is our teacher. He was sensitive to the development of doctrine made manifest by recent scholarship, as well as of the new humanism that was in the throes of birthing around the globe. The resultant challenge was to evangelize “secularity” with an appropriately adapted presentation of the Gospel, facilitated by a renewed philosophy and theology. Secular society has adopted its own sacramental gestures, and they are amenable to grace. Vatican II requires ongoing interpretation in this sense for fruitful dialogue to continue.

G) East-West Reconciliation. A number of serious issues remain unresolved: the question of the five original Patriarchates and of Eastern historic precedence (Jerusalem, Alexandria, Antioch, Rome, Constantinople). A specific and painful issue arose at the Council opening ceremony when the Cardinals (Counsellors to the Western Patriarch of Rome) were given precedence in seating ahead of the Eastern Patriarchs. Maximos IV reacted with a symbolic “boycott,” by absenting himself from the first day’s meeting at the Council. Archebarch Maxim Hermaniuk championed the return to their ancient role of the Synods. Much more could be said about the reclaiming of Collegiality. For example, the reaching out to the Churches that had been alienated because of the Great Schism.

Prelates from several Eastern Rites participated, with several Orthodox Observers also present because of their personal relations and friendship with John XXIII. The end of the Council would see the mutual lifting of

the excommunications of 1054. The variety of Rites (26) and their relative autonomy would be formally recognized in a special Decree *Orientalium Ecclesiarum*.

H) The return to the Sacred Scriptures,⁹ with *ressourcement* and renewed biblical scholarship (historical-critical method and scholarship accepted by the Council), new models/methodology for theological endeavors.

John XXIII gave definitive leadership during a dead-lock in the procedure, by ordering that a new draft of the Constitution on Revelation be prepared. This had far-reaching implications. Among them was the focus on Jesus Christ as being himself the total Message of Revelation as well as its Messenger. The bible, tradition and magisterium are precious tools or means, but they are not in themselves the source of Revelation, which is a Person, the Divine Word incarnate. The consequences for Ecumenism are obvious.

I) Reading the signs of the times. John XXIII's encyclicals provide us with rich insights in this regard. *Mater et Magistra* (1961) adds the notion of "socialization" to that of subsidiarity found in Leo XIII's *Rerum Novarum* (1891) and developed by Pius XI's *Quadragesimo Anno* (1931).¹⁰ *Pacem in Terris* (1963) focuses on the poor of this world and on the struggle for peace. It further identifies three signs of the times: workers claiming their rights; women demanding to be treated as subjects, not objects; and peoples around the globe aspiring to be agents of their own destiny, free from colonial domination. This was the origin of what has since become known as the "preferential option for the poor."

J) Mission reclaims priority over maintenance. The entire People of God is affirmed as Spirit-endowed. I recall Fr. Yves Congar O.P. and his special work on the laity. He shared with me his joy when the Council drafting Commission finally accepted his proposal to insert references to Romans and 1 Peter 2 concerning the universal royal or baptismal priesthood of all the baptized and their total lives offered as "spiritual sacrifices." Every Spirit-endowed believer is called to a three-fold role: missionary, ministerial and messianic. All are called to the fullness of sanctity and to mysticism. Lay responsibility extends to the entire church.

⁹ Note the emphasis on Scripture as the foundation of theology and spiritual life in the Decree on Priestly Formation, *Optatam Totius*, #4 and #16.

¹⁰ Subsidiarity was first presented as a principle by Leo XIII, and further developed by Pius XI. It is now too often ignored in practice by some central authorities of the Church.

A dynamic movement began to animate the previously static ecclesial structures, together with an awakening of the laity, all too long neglected, indeed a “slumbering giant.”

K) Nonviolence - Peace - Paradigm of Humanity. Another dimension of John XXIII’s personality was that his very being radiated nonviolence and peace. *Pacem in Terris* (1963) contains the equivalent of a Charter for Nonviolence. Paul VI in his encyclical *Ecclesiam Suam* (1963) develops another aspect of this teaching by detailing the conditions required for authentic and effective dialogue. Authentic communion is built on respect for the person of the “other” as other. The partner has the right to self-definition without pressure from the other party to conform to a different standard, as well as respect for the freedom of an informed conscience. Only thus can common ground be established, leading to true understanding and concord.

Paul VI expressed the mind of the Council when he addressed the United Nations in New York in 1965 and declared: “No more war! War never again!”

L) Ecclesial subsidiarity (a principle since Pius XI) applies to local Churches, synodality, collegiality, ultimately *diakonia* and *koinonia* as self-sacrificing service out of love, hence life-giving, authentic “auctor”-ity/ authority.

Convening the Bishops of the whole world was a return to early tradition and also implied transforming the vertical quasi-monarchical model of church government in vigor under Pius XI and Pius XII (the “pyramid” symbol) in favor of a consultative style (symbol of the “circle”), where all interested parties could express their convictions and ultimately share responsibility.

M) Ecumenism and inter-faith dialogue. Key insight that the true church “subsists in” but is not identical with the visible structures of the Roman Catholic church; freedom of conscience, hierarchy of truths, pluriuniformity in unity, exchange of spiritual gifts, (remember Bernard Häring, “salvific solidarity in a morality/ethics of responsibility”).

Non-Catholic Observers were invited to participate actively in Vatican II. The “vision” of John XXIII included transparency and earnest efforts to befriend people of different faiths. The Council recognized in all religions elements of truth, which came to be known as “seeds of the Word.” His own initiatives, notwithstanding determined reticence on the part of some Vatican officials, bore abundant fruit and began to substantially transform the attitudes of many other religious groups. Vatican II would recognize the rights of local churches and be led to acknowledge a “hierarchy of truths” relating to the central Truth of Christ. I will never forget hearing

Abbott Christopher Butler O.S.B. (later Bishop) ask the Council Fathers: “why should we fear that truth might tell against truth?” (*Ne timeamus quod veritas veritati noceat!*)

N) Last but not least! Paradigm shifts: communion and friendship as central symbols.

John XXIII proposed a model of the Church which featured communion and also friendship. It is meant to reflect the loving relationships of the Blessed Trinity.

He addressed his messages not only to the People of God, but also to all people of good will. His openness and affability endeared him to the entire world. There emerged from the Council an image of the Church where all the baptized were recognized as equal. The stage was set to bring back to the fore the scriptural teaching concerning the “triple baptismal priesthood”: “prophets, priests, sovereigns” (cf 1 Peter 2: 9-10), fallen into disuse in the wake of the Council of Trent, and the offering of self as “spiritual sacrifice” taught in the Epistle to the Romans.

A word can be said about Post-Vatican II developments. John Paul II affirmed Vatican II as a “reliable compass,” though calling for an “authoritative re-reading” (as did later, Benedict XVI!). In 1985, a special Synod of Bishops met in Rome to evaluate Vatican II on the twentieth anniversary of its closing. In their 8 December “Message to the People of God,” they gave a positive endorsement to its work, declaring: “We have shared unanimously, in a spirit of thanksgiving, the conviction that Vatican II is a gift of God to the Church and to the world. In full adherence to the Council, we see in it a wellspring offered by the Holy Spirit ...for the present and the future.”

I would even venture to suggest that the Council documents are preferably read “in reverse order,” that is, starting from the latest ones promulgated, taking into account the developments, maturing or refinements expressed in the documents promulgated later on, taking into account how the thinking of the Council Fathers progressed, deepened, and its formulation improved. The orientation underlying all the documents is to be taken from these later insights, which best represent the true mind of the Council Fathers, faithfully responding to the promptings of the Holy Spirit. In that sense we also recognize the deeper insights found in the Vision of John XXIII, which the Fathers only grasped more fully as the deliberations proceeded.

Let me offer a few examples:

Dignitatis Humanae on the dignity of the human person, the freedom of conscience and the nature of the act of faith;

Nostra Aetate on the respect due to various forms of truth found in other world religions and the different faith relationships of other peoples with God;

Ad Gentes on the “seeds of the Word” hidden in all cultures and traditions;

Presbyterium Ordinis, in particular #16, another statement about Sacred Scripture as the foundation and soul of all theology and the renewed emphasis on the need to communicate salutary truths in a contemporary manner;

Unitatis Redintegratio on the Holy Spirit as the principle of unity, the various degrees of communion within the broader Catholic family, the need for a change of heart in a church that is called to be continually reformed and its deficiencies corrected.

So, where to now? There are things left to do. In a nutshell, the core issue can be expressed in one sentence, which I extract from a book published by the Africa Faith & Justice Network, AFJN, entitled *African Synod: Documents, Reflections, Perspectives*.¹¹

“Whereas a prophetic and courageous transition from Judeo-Christianity to Gentile-Christianity was made in the first century, a similar transition from Eurocentric Christianity to world Christianity has not yet been clearly and prophetically achieved in the twentieth century. As a result, the universal church is still missing the great enrichment and beauty it could gain from various identities of the local churches.”

¹¹ Maura Browne SND (editor), *African Synod: Documents, Reflections, Perspectives* (Maryknoll: Orbis Books 1996), 18.

“The Fulton Sheen Affair: Religious Controversy, Nationalism, and Commercialism in the Early Years of Canadian Television, 1952-1958”

Mark G. McGOWAN

In 1952, Bishop Peter Fulton J. Sheen was arguably the most recognizable cleric in the English-speaking world. After thirty-two years of success as the keynote speaker on NBC radio’s “The Catholic Hour,” Sheen switched to television, hosting the smash hit, “Life is Worth Living.” With a network audience on DuMont carried on seventy-five stations, soon to mushroom to 139, and an audience of 5.5 million people (in 1955), the half-hour program featuring Sheen’s lectures, netted the prelate an Emmy Award in 1952, while denting the high ratings of “Mr Television,” Milton Berle, and driving Frank Sinatra’s variety show off the air. Sheen also won the American Freedom Foundation Award, was featured on the cover of *Time* magazine, was polled by Gallup as one of America’s ten most admired men, and would soon be dubbed the “Chesterton of America.”¹ Scholarly, witty, and theatrical, Sheen electrified audiences with his mixture of political commentary, ethical reflections, and plain-spoken common sense. As for Canadians, Sheen was known, but not seen: the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation, in 1952, with its new television monopoly in Canada’s major cities refused to broadcast “Life is Worth Living,” precipitating a three-year struggle that brought into question Canadian identity, inter-faith relations, and the commercialization of the national airwaves.

The question of how one of the most popular religious programs in the history of television was prohibited from Canadian audiences is a complex one. It would be too simple to suggest that the “banning” of Fulton Sheen was yet another episode in the historic tension between Catholics and Protestants in Canada. Indeed, one can find evidence for Protestant discomfort over

¹ Thomas C. Reeves, *America’s Bishop: The Life and Times of Fulton J. Sheen* (San Francisco: Encounter Books, 2001), 2; *BC Catholic*, 5 March 1953.

the larger than life presentations by Sheen, who always presented himself in full Episcopal regalia. Nevertheless, the “Sheen Affair,” should it be designated such, reflected more the difficulty of Canadian broadcasters and church leaders as they addressed the nature of the content and tone of religious programming, while at the same time grappling with how to nurture the fledgling Canadian television industry, without resorting to over-commercialization of the airwaves, particularly by importing too many American programs. Thus, in the Sheen Affair, one witnesses the confluence of several controversial issues: first, the attempt of broadcasters and clerics to balance the interests of all Canadian denominations on the CBC network; secondly, the attempt of the CBC to walk the tight rope between commercialized television and commercial free broadcasts; thirdly, the struggle to nurture home-grown programming versus over-dependence on American and British programs; and, finally, managing the tension that would arise between privately-owned local stations and the national publicly owned network that had to serve all Canadians, of all religions, in both official languages, and in all provinces and regions. Sheen’s exclusion from the CBC from 1952 to 1955 reflected the inexperience of broadcasters in defining religious television, and who controlled it, as much as it revealed the unease of religious leaders in accepting religious programming that was commercially sponsored and produced in the United States. In the end, Sheen’s program was victim to Canadian insecurity with the new medium television, the prospects of the commercialization and Americanization of Canadian programming, and the dying breaths of home-grown sectarian tension.

Fulton J. Sheen’s explosive entry into American living rooms, in 1952, coincided with the first television broadcasts by the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation. Unlike the development of Canadian radio, which was exclusively in private hands in its early years (1920-1932), public ownership of television by the Government’s corporation had a near monopoly on television broadcasting in the early 1950s. The CBC established its flagship stations in Toronto, Montreal, Ottawa, Halifax, and Vancouver, where legislation prevented private corporations or individuals from obtaining rival television licenses, a situation which assured that the CBC would dominate Canada’s largest viewing markets.² The CBC, however, which continued to serve as both broadcaster and regulator of all Canadian broadcasting, would issue licenses to private consortia in smaller markets like London, Sudbury, Hamilton, Wingham, or Victoria, although these stations often affiliated with the CBC in order to carry the national news and other specialty programs

² Albert A. Shea, *Broadcasting the Canadian Way* (Montreal: Harvest House, 1963), 109; Mary Vipond, *The Mass Media in Canada* (Toronto: Lorimer, 2000), 44.

and sporting events offered by the “mother” Corporation.³ By the mid 1950s, Canadian television came to resemble Canadian radio, which was characterized by a mix of stations owned by the CBC, private affiliates of the CBC network, and independent private stations. This Canadian experience of mixed broadcasting stood in sharp contrast to the United Kingdom, where the state controlled broadcasting through the BBC, and the United States where broadcasting was completely private and stations competed in a free market situation in which the National Broadcasting Corporation (NBC), DuMont, and Columbia Broadcasting System (CBS) dominated. In Canada, the CBC was both a competitor to private stations and the regulator of private stations, which became a source of great tension within the industry. Since 1936, when the CBC had replaced the short-lived CRBC,⁴ the Corporation was responsible for all licensing of radio stations, the discipline of broadcasters who transgressed regulations, and the monitoring of all matters relating to programming and technology, whether in private or public hands. These powers did not alter with the arrival of CBC Television, in 1952, much to the chagrin of private broadcasters. It was only in 1958, with the creation of the Bureau of Broadcast Governors (BBG), that the CBC ceased to be competitor to, and regulator of, private television outlets.⁵ Prior to 1957, and the creation of the Bureau of Broadcast Governors, if Sheen’s award winning “Life is Worth Living” was to be broadcast in Canada’s biggest and most lucrative markets it would have to be acceptable to CBC regulators and, in particular, meet the requirements and answer the concerns of the Corporation’s Religious Department, a special section of the programming division.

Religious broadcasting had been part of broadcast media since its infancy. Reginald A. Fessenden’s first voice broadcast to the ships of the

³ Shea, 110-11; Paul Rutherford, *When Television Was Young: Prime Time Canada, 1952-1967* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1990), 47-68.

⁴ As a result of the recommendation of the Aird Commission in 1929, the Canadian Radio Broadcasting Commission was established as a national broadcaster, in 1932, by the R.B. Bennett Government. It assumed the radio network stations of the Canadian National Railways and provided a commercial free and coast-to-coast alternative to the numerous private commercial stations across Canada. In 1936, the government of Mackenzie King amended the broadcasting act, abolished the CRBC and created the CBC, which served as both programmer and regulator of all broadcasting in Canada. Margaret Prang, “The Origins of Public Broadcasting in Canada,” *Canadian Historical Review* 46 (March 1965): 1-31; Mary Vipond, *Listening In: The First Decade of Canadian Broadcasting, 1922-1932* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 1992), 206-55; Shea, 104-106. Frank Peers, *The Politics of Canadian Broadcasting, 1920-1951* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1969).

⁵ T.J. Allard, *Private Broadcasting in Canada, 1918-1959* (Ottawa: The Communications Foundation, 1979), 174-214; Shea, 18; Rutherford, 104-6.

United Fruit Company, in 1906, had been Christmas Carols.⁶ In the 1920s, Roman Catholics, the United Church, Baptists, and the Christian Missionary Alliance owned their own stations in Canada, and the Wesleyan Methodists (VOWR) were pioneers in radio in Newfoundland.⁷ Controversy arising from the bombastic and aggressive preaching from five stations owned by the International Bible Students Association (Jehovah's Witnesses) prompted the cancellation of their licenses by the Minister of Marine and Fisheries,⁸ and the calling of the Aird Commission, in 1928, to investigate radio broadcasting in Canada; the Royal Commission, when it reported one year later, recommended the creation of a national government-owned broadcast network. When Catholic priest Charles Lanphier and Presbyterian Minister Morris Zeidman clashed on Toronto's airwaves in the late 1930s, the CBC created Regulation 7c, which prohibited the abuse of any "race, creed or religion" on the air.⁹ In addition, in order to keep religious peace in broadcasting, in 1938, CBC General Manager, Major Gladstone Murray, established the National Religious Advisory Council to advise the CBC on religious broadcasts and to determine a fair distribution of free air time on the CBC for Canada's religious denominations, Christian and Jewish.¹⁰ The NRAC consisted of two representatives (usually male clergy) from each of the major denominations (Catholic, United, Anglican, Presbyterian and Baptist), based on the relative size of each religious group in proportion to the Canadian population. In 1952, the NRAC had been doing its work, with remarkable ecumenical spirit, for 14 years, without any significant controversy. One member of the Council, the formerly controversial Father Charles Lanphier, had served as one of two Catholic representatives since the Council's inception, and would retain that position until shortly before his death in 1960. Members of the Council sponsored numerous radio programs, arranged broadcasts each Sunday from each of the country's regions, and divided the air time between each Anglophone denomination, with barely a whimper of protest from any group.¹¹

⁶ Reported in Sandy Stewart, *From Coast to Coast: A Personal History of Radio in Canada* (Toronto: CBC Enterprises, 1985), 7.

⁷ CKFC (Congregational/United Church, Vancouver), CJBC (Baptist, Toronto), CHMA (Missionary Alliance, Vancouver) and VOWR (Methodist, St. John's).

⁸ The Ministry of Marine and Fisheries, Radio Branch was responsible for the licensing and regulation of radio in Canada from 1905 to 1932 when responsibilities were taken over directly by the CRBC then the CBC, which by the 1930s fell under the Ministry of Transport. Vipond, *Listening In*, 7-22.

⁹ Library and Archives Canada [hereafter LAC], RG 41, CBC Fonds, volume 146, file 9-10, Acting Secretary, M. Landry to all Broadcasting Stations in Canada, 23 December 1936.

¹⁰ *Catholic Register* [hereafter CR], 4 August 1938.

¹¹ LAC, RG 41, vol. 223, file 1-23, pt. 2, Memo from C.R. Delafield, Program Division, 15 February 1939; RG 41, vol. 909, f. PG-11-4. pt. 1, P. Edward to Gladstone Murray, 30 March 1941.

In 1952, however, the Council assumed the responsibilities for programming and monitoring English-language religious television broadcasting and, it was assumed that the addition of the new medium would not alter the daily business of the NRAC significantly.

Nothing, however, prepared the NRAC or the CBC for the maelstrom that would ensue over “Life is Worth Living.” The figure at the centre of the controversy was the Rt. Reverend Peter Fulton J. Sheen. Born in El Paso, Illinois, in 1895, he attended St. Viator’s College, in Bourbonnais, Ill., St. Paul’s Seminary, in St. Paul, Minnesota, and, in 1919, was ordained for the Diocese of Peoria.¹² After briefly working in parishes, his bishop sent him to the University of Louvain, where he earned a doctorate in Philosophy, in 1925, and was the first American student ever awarded the Cardinal Mercier Medal for Philosophy. After having taught briefly in England, Sheen returned to the United States, where he took a teaching position at the Catholic University of America, in Washington DC. In 1930, his skill as a lecturer and public speaker won him an invitation to be a regular contributor to the “Catholic Hour,” a weekly live Sunday evening program, broadcast by NBC in New York and sponsored by the National Council of Catholic Men.¹³ He distanced himself from the highly controversial Catholic polemicist, Father Charles Coughlin, indicating that the Detroit priest dealt primarily with “material” matters, while Sheen himself dealt with the “spiritual,” which he believed had lasting value.¹⁴ Sheen’s talks ran the spectrum of issues from devotional practice to theology, from practical day-to-day common sense approaches to living, to vehement anti-communist diatribes and a defence of the American way of life. Proceeds from his programs and talks went primarily to the Society of the Propagation of the Faith, of which he was American director. His fame on radio and on the platform, in addition to his financial largesse to the missions, likely earned him his elevation, in 1951, to the office of auxiliary bishop of New York. That same year, with the advent of television, and an eagerness of American Catholics to exploit this new medium, the DuMont Network invited Sheen to host his own prime time television program.

Few American Broadcasters, including DuMont who offered the air time free of charge, gave Sheen’s program much of a chance. Taped at the Adelphi Theatre in New York, Sheen’s stage was very plain – a parson’s study complete with bookshelves, a statue of the Madonna and child, and

¹² Janel Rodriguez, *Meet Fulton Sheen: Beloved Preacher and Teacher of the Word* (Cincinnati: St. Anthony Messenger Press, Servant Books, 2006), 4-9; *Canadian Register* [hereafter *CR*], 26 February 1955. At this time the *Catholic Register* had become the *Canadian Register*.

¹³ Rodriguez, 16.

¹⁴ Reeves, 107.

a blackboard upon which Sheen would inscribe his characteristic “JMJ” at the top, before making notes. He dressed in full bishop’s regalia – cape, *zucchetto*, pectoral cross – swept on to the stage with dramatic flair, spoke in modulated tones with charm, wit, and passion, and never used notes. The director of “Life is Worth Living” later claimed that he had never worked with a performer with such “self-assurance.”¹⁵ Nevertheless, DuMont Executives knew that the show was in an “obituary spot” facing an 8pm Tuesday night line up which included CBS’s “Frank Sinatra Show,” and NBC’s “Texaco Star Theatre,” featuring Milton Berle, arguably America’s most popular television performer.¹⁶ Once again Sheen surpassed expectations. Slowly building an audience when it first aired on February 12, 1952, Sheen drove Sinatra from the timeslot and ate into the first half-hour of Berle’s show. By October, 1952, the American Admiral Corporation offered to sponsor “Life is Worth Living,” promising Sheen \$26,000 per show and a national audience of 75 stations.¹⁷ In addition, Sheen won the 1952 Emmy Award for Most Outstanding Television Personality, beating fellow nominees Lucille Ball, Edward R. Murrow, Arthur Godfrey, and Jimmy Durante.¹⁸

By autumn, 1952, Canadians were writing to the brand new CBC television network to include Sheen’s “Life is Worth Living” in the upcoming 1952-53 program schedule. For its own part, the Admiral Corporation had made a formal application to CBLT in Toronto to air the Sheen program. As had been the custom for religious programs on radio, the applications and program suggestions would have to be vetted by the NRAC. Because CBC Television was in its first year of programming, executives still leaned heavily on the precedents set by the radio division, when it came to applying policies, procedures and practices. The head of the Religion Department, W. John Dunlop, took the Sheen program to the NRAC members in November, 1952. If Dunlop succeeded in getting the approval from the NRAC, “Life is Worth Living” would be broadcast on all CBC Network stations, assuring that it would likely appear on nearly every working television set in the country, since, in 1952, there were no private stations, and effectively no competition except from American stations close to the border.

The members of the NRAC did not share the American enthusiasm for “Life is Worth Living.” The Council was uncomfortable with the application because Sheen’s program was commercially sponsored, an American

¹⁵ Reeves, 225. Fulton J. Sheen, *Treasure in Clay: The Autobiography of Fulton J. Sheen* (New York: Doubleday & Company, 1980), 70. Sheen insisted in his autobiography that each show took him thirty hours to prepare, which included giving the proposed talks (sometimes in other languages) to others two days prior to airing.

¹⁶ *Ibid.*, 224.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, 239.

¹⁸ Rodriguez, 52.

production, and a religious program that might offset the gentle Catholic-Protestant denominational balance that the Council was trying to achieve on Canadian television.¹⁹ According to CBC Executive E.L. Bushnell:

The members of the Council felt that this would open the field to many United States live and Kinescope programs to the eventual exclusion of Canadian talent. One of the members said he was surprised that such an application had ever been considered. Father Lanphier expressed the opinion that there were just as good men in Canada and we should make an effort to find them, but he wanted to think about it...²⁰

In fact Father Lanphier's position was not so different from his fellow counsellors who decided in December that "with rare exceptions as the Council may approve, religious televised programs be Canadian ones."²¹ No firm decision on Sheen's program was made, although the NRAC would consider developing a "camera test" for potential Canadian talent and would discuss the matter of commercial religious broadcasting on the CBC in the New Year.²²

The temporary delay in making a firm decision on "Life is Worth Living" evoked a speedy and heated public reaction from both the supporters and detractors of Sheen. In a similar tone to American fundamentalist preacher Carl McIntire's claim that Sheen's program was a monumental Papal threat to America, Dr. James W. Kennedy, Executive Secretary of the National Council of the Episcopal Church of New York applauded the CBC's misgivings: "We feel that Bishop Sheen's program has done real harm to the general policy of free broadcasting time for religion. You have certainly helped to strengthen our stand down here."²³ Kennedy's argument was sectarian based, reflecting an American Protestant fear of assertive Catholicism, but with a subtext that questioned whether any religious broadcast should be commercially sponsored, in this case by one of America's largest television manufacturers. Most correspondents to the CBC, however, disagreed. Telegrams poured in from southern Ontario and Quebec, from college professors, members of the Catholic Women's League, and from rank-and-file laypersons. One noted Basilian teacher and social critic, Father Eugene Cullinane, was typical of the Catholic response to the delay when he wrote: "Bishop Sheen's program should be televised. It is

¹⁹ LAC, RG 41, CBC Fonds, v. 223, file 11-23-1, part 1, "Minutes, 12 December 1952."

²⁰ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, "Life is Worth Living File," E.L. Bushnell Memo to Board of Governors, CBC," 21 November 1952.

²¹ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 1, "Minutes, 12 December 1952."

²² RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, "Memorandum from the NRAC to the Corporation," c. December 1952.

²³ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, James W. Kennedy to the CBC, 17 December 1952.

non-sectarian and strongly defends the spiritual and moral values that make democracy and democratic ideals possible.”²⁴

Amidst this groundswell of popular discontent with the inaction of the Corporation and its Religious Advisors, the NRAC continued to deliberate, with less an eye to sectarian concerns, but with a view to answering three specific questions: first, was “Life is Worth Living” a religious program, purely and simply? Second, could public television accept commercially-sponsored religious programs? And third, can Canadian airwaves avail themselves of American religious programming? The response to the first of these questions – was Sheen’s program religious – would determine the answers to the remaining questions. If it was determined that it was simply “educational,” as E.A. Cullinane’s letter suggests, then the CBC could air the program without referral to the NRAC conventions for free-time religious programming. This is precisely what DuMont and the Admiral Corporation argued. E.B. “Buck” Lyford of the DuMont Network claimed that “Life is Worth Living” was a philosophical program and “this particular philosopher happens to be a Catholic churchman.”²⁵ The Network officially claimed the program was classified as “educational,”²⁶ and that had it been designated as religious, Admiral would not have permitted its sponsorship. Furthermore, it was argued that it was because of the program’s non-religious designation that the sponsor refused to have the program air on Sundays.²⁷ Such claims were supported by some Canadian Catholic intellectuals, such as Dr. J.F. McCaffrey SJ of Loyola College, Montreal, who informed the CBC that:

Speaking as he does, to an audience that is not restricted to any one faith, under the sponsorship of a nationally advertised product, there is little or no probability that what he says gives offence to any except those who are enemies of our country and our civilization ... The war against communism is not only to be fought in Korea but right here in Canada and in the hearts and minds of Canadians ... The CBC can ill-afford to deprive its audiences of the help of Bishop Sheen without running a very grave risk of being misunderstood.²⁸

²⁴ *Ibid.*, Eugene Cullinane to NRAC, 8 December 1952.

²⁵ RG 41, v. 223, f.11-23-1, pt. 2, Lyford to Fergus Murtie, Director of CBC Television, 2 June 1953; and f.11-23-1, pt.1, W. John Dunlop to Chairman, 5 March 1953.

²⁶ CR, 7 August 1954.

²⁷ RG 41, v. 223, f.11-23-1, pt. 2, Memorandum W.E. Powell, Commercial Manager, 27 August 1954; Sheen, himself, likened his approach to Paul at Athens, indirect, using common denominators, and perhaps making a link to Christianity in his topics. Sheen, *Treasure in Clay*, 72-3.

²⁸ RG 41, v. 223, f.11-23-1, pt. 2, J.F. McCaffrey SJ to Chairman, Davidson Dunton, 9 December 1952.

On this side of the argument, by reason of Sheen's persistent presentations on the evils of Communism, his plain-speaking approach to life issues and social mores, and his restraint in preaching the dogmas of Catholicism, "Life is Worth Living" was considered by its creators and supporters a non-religious program.

"Naïve," wrote Fergus Murtie, Director of CBC Television, in the margins of Buck Lyford's memo.²⁹ Neither the NRAC nor the Corporation executives were convinced that Sheen's program was non-religious. In early 1953, John Dunlop, Director of the CBC Religion Department, and the CBC liaison with the NRAC, was clear: "it was the opinion of the Council that the program was definitely a religious one and Roman Catholic."³⁰ For those Canadians able to view the program, either directly from American stations with strong signals, or by the sample Kinescopes provided to the CBC by DuMont, Dunlop's assessment is not surprising. They would have seen a program principally on moral, social and political issues, narrated by a Roman Catholic bishop, sartorially splendid in his cape (*ferraiolo*), cassock, large pectoral cross, and *zucchetto* (skull cap), watched over by a Renaissance inspired statue of the Blessed Virgin Mary. If anything the program sent out a strong symbolic message – this is Catholic and it is for you. In his recent work *Selling Catholicism: Bishop Sheen and the Power of Television*, Christopher Owen Lynch argues convincingly that despite what may have been the denominational-neutral topic of the day, Sheen, the skilled philosopher and rhetorician, was able to thread Catholic teaching throughout his remarks, as a means of giving comfort to American members of the Church during the Cold War.³¹ Noted for his highly publicized conversions of major American figures to Catholicism, this subtlety was not lost on some Protestant viewers. Moreover, the Catholic space created by the set and showman in it endeared the program to Catholics, one of whom, A. J. MacDonnell, a Knight of Columbus from New Waterford, Nova Scotia, wrote that in the opinion of Cape Bretoners, Sheen's religious program would be more appreciated if it broadcast on Sundays.³² Viewers, regardless of denominational affiliation, were not fooled.

²⁹ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 2, Lyford to Fergus Murtie, Director of CBC Television, 2 June 1953.

³⁰ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 1, W. John Dunlop to Chairman, 5 March 1953 and Fergus Murtie to Assistant General Manager, CBC, 9 October 1953.

³¹ Christopher Owen Lynch, *Selling Catholicism: Bishop Sheen and the Power of Television* (Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, 1998), 11-13.

³² RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 3, A.J. MacDonnell, Recorder, Knights of Columbus Council 3209, New Waterford, Nova Scotia, to Program Director, CBC Television, 11 January 1955.

Once having determined that “Life is Worth Living” was a Catholic religious program, the NRAC had to assess whether or not they could maintain a denominational balance on the CBC schedule by including Sheen. Although there was some protest from Protestants later on, the network could easily balance the Sheen program with two Protestant shows, “What is Your Trouble?” and the Lutheran-sponsored, “This is the Life,” both of which were ready for broadcast in the fall schedule for 1953.³³ The tricky issue was not scheduling, but the policy issue of commercial sponsorship of religious programming. Since the early 1930s, all religious broadcasts on the CBC Network had been free-time, then again, CBC radio had historically been commercial free. While CBC television was not commercial free, would the radio precedent still be upheld with regard to religious programming? If religious programming, it was thought, was presented in a “sustaining” or offered as free-time broadcasts by the CBC, the Corporation could then ensure that all regions and denominations could be represented on the national network, and no particular religious group, by reason of its financial largesse, could dominate Canadian living rooms just because they had the money to do so. Conversely, if wealthy churches and sects could purchase air time and fill the schedule, the voices of many Canadian churches and religious voices would not be heard on the network paid for by the tax dollars of all Canadians. There was particular fear in some quarters that more controversial groups – Jehovah’s Witnesses, Christian Science, and Youth for Christ – might buy their way on to the air.³⁴ Thus accepting Sheen’s program, with Admiral Television’s advertisement prominent at the beginning and end of the broadcast, would set a very dangerous precedent for the CBC. Private stations, when they emerged, might accept such broadcasts; in fact several Canadian radio stations already carried “Life is Worth Living,” including CKLW, Windsor, one of the most listened to private stations in Canada.³⁵

In March 1953, the NRAC met with Corporation Chairman, A. Davidson Dunton, in order to discuss the question of commercialization of religious television. Dunton proposed a two pronged approach: first, to allow the CBC to offer free time to religious groups and, second, allow the NRAC to decide which commercially-sponsored religious shows might be acceptable. His proposal effectively took the CBC off the hook in having to deliberate on thorny denominational issues, and effectively mandated the NRAC to make the tough decision and, as it were, live with the consequences. Council member, Father Charles Lanphier, who had initially balked at Sheen, appeared convinced by Dunton’s suggestion, and began to lobby hard for

³³ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, W.J. Dunlop Memo to the CBC, 20 May 1953.

³⁴ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 3, Reverend Brian D. Freeland, Assistant Supervisor of Religious Programs to Supervisor of Religious Programs, 7 September 1954.

³⁵ CR, 30 May 1953.

Sheen's inclusion in the schedule. The rest of the Council was not convinced and, although word of Dunton's compromise was leaked to the press (likely by Lanphier), by May, the NRAC had decided to uphold the principle that no commercially-sponsored religious broadcasts would appear on the CBC and no church or group would be given access to the air by simple reason of their ability to pay. In 1952, it should be added, the CBC, under Control Number 5, did not permit religious groups to "appeal for donations or subscription," so the discomfort of mixing religion and money on air was already part of Canadian broadcasting culture.³⁶

It should be understood also that the members of the NRAC were not overtly hostile to the Sheen program itself, with several members acknowledging that its inclusion would have addressed the denominational imbalance on the CBC English language network, once the Protestant programs were aired in late 1953.³⁷ John Dunlop, on behalf of the NRAC, approached both DuMont and Admiral requesting that the CBC air the program, but without the commercial announcements. The Americans turned down the offer. Next Dunlop and the NRAC suggested that the Sheen Program could be broadcast, without the commercials, but with the inclusion of a credit line at the end of the programs, acknowledging the financial and production support of DuMont and Admiral. This proposal was shot down by the CBC's own commercial department, because it deviated from the commercial policy of the Corporation. There was also some question that should Admiral agree to pull its advertisement, it might be an implicit concession that the program actually was religious.³⁸ Lanphier, on his own initiative, attempted a different tack. He argued that the NRAC leave the decision to the CBC itself, suggesting that on an ad hoc basis, the CBC could permit commercially-sponsored religious programming in areas where there was inadequate private television coverage and thus the possibility that shows like Sheen's would never be seen. His idea was based on established precedents in private radio, where commercial religious broadcasts were permitted, if no free time was available on the CBC. His remedy would effectively be the inverse of what existed on radio. In this case the CBC would make a programming decision based on "regional coverage," without recourse to the Advisory Council.³⁹ The one problem with Lanphier's solution was that it had the potential of undermining the effectiveness of

³⁶ Archives of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Toronto (hereafter ARCAT), James C. McGuigan Papers, SU03.68a, T.J. Allard to McGuigan, 3 December 1952.

³⁷ Archives of the Archdiocese of Vancouver (hereafter AAV), Archbishop William Mark Duke Papers, Box 54:4, T.P. Slattery to General Manager, CBC, 7 July 1954.

³⁸ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 2, Memorandum W.E. Powell, Commercial Manager, 27 August 1954.

³⁹ RG 41, v. 909, PG11-4, pt. 1, NRAC Minutes, 24 June 1954; CR, 14 March 1953.

the NRAC in its capacity to manage the CBC's religious programming. CBC executives thought it ill-advised to ignore or over-ride the decision made by the NRAC regarding commercialization, although John Dunlop conceded, without divulging any evidence, that he was not convinced that the NRAC had refused the Sheen program for "only commercial" reasons.⁴⁰ Without a solution in sight, Sheen remained off the air in Canada for the 1953-54 season.

By August 1954, it had been nearly two years since the controversy had begun, the CBC was on the cusp of a new television season, and the NRAC had not changed its policy. In response to heavy criticism from the Catholic community the CBC maintained the hope that it could broadcast "Life is Worth Living" on "a free basis with only a credit line to the Admiral Corporation," because the non-commercialization policy of the NRAC would not be changed. "On the advice of the Council," the Memorandum stated, "the CBC has not agreed to accept the program on a sponsored basis with advertising, under the general policy against sponsored religious broadcasts."⁴¹ The fact that the program was an American production no longer was an issue; even the successful Lutheran program, "This is the Life," was produced in the United States. The NRAC had more of an issue with Mammon than Uncle Sam.

The Catholic protest that ensued that summer read the situation differently – the Sheen prohibition was just another chapter in a series of historical insults to Canada's Catholics. The two epicentres of protest were Toronto and Montreal, not surprisingly Canada's two largest television markets. In the latter city, *The Ensign* and the law firm of Slattery, Belanger and Fairbanks led the charge. Borrowing the DuMont argument that Sheen's program was "educational," while noting Sheen's many international awards and accolades, and suggesting there be a television policy distinct from that of Canadian radio, lawyer T.P. Slattery lobbied the bishops of Canada and members of Parliament, in the hope of applying pressure to the CBC.⁴² In Montreal, protesters inundated the offices of the CBC with 1000s of calls; 40,000 post cards were delivered to local parishes and mailed to the Corporation; daily newspapers were targeted with letters supportive of Sheen.⁴³ Meanwhile, in Toronto, *The Canadian Register*, led principally by Doug Loney's new column on the media, "Stop, Look, Listen," urged readers to flood the local CBC station with calls and letters of protest.⁴⁴ The paper also advertised American Television stations located close to the Canadian

⁴⁰ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, Memorandum from Dunlop, 22 September 1953..

⁴¹ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 3, CBC Memorandum, 30 August 1954.

⁴² AAV, Duke Papers, 54:4, Slattery to Duke, 26 July 1954, with enclosures.

⁴³ CR, 7 August 1954.

⁴⁴ CR, 17 April 1954 and 7 August 1954.

border that were carrying Sheen, produced times and dates when “Life is Worth Living” could be heard on Canadian private radio, and published American critiques of CBC policy.⁴⁵

The Catholic protest struck at the heart of two significant challenges facing Canadian broadcasting in terms of its relationship to religion. First, Catholics suggested that religious programming might be better served if in the hands of private broadcasters, thereby casting into doubt the vision of a national publicly owned network that was desperately trying to serve all Canadians regardless of creed, language or region. Secondly, some Catholic observers dared to ask the CBC why religious voices were so heavily regulated, when the views of the non-religious, the anti-religious, the communists, and holders of other ideologies were broadcast regularly.⁴⁶ In August 1954, a panicked CBC Executive in Montreal reported that there had been local agitation against the CBC’s “Charlie Chaplin Film Festival.” “The contention,” according to F.A. Coleman, “is that if we show films by alleged leftists,” why do we “refuse Sheen”?⁴⁷ In sum, the question of inclusion of religious broadcasts on the publicly-funded national network begged the greater question of how time allocations were made to other controversial groups and issues, and by whom. Given Canada’s historical record of sectarian and linguistic tension, it is little wonder that the CBC was skittish about religious matters, erred on the side of caution, and hoped that the NRAC would solve the major religious challenges faced by the Corporation.

The Catholic protest, however, challenged the CBC monopoly itself, claiming that the Corporation had to come to “grips with reality.”⁴⁸ Doug Loney went one step farther contending that the CBC was less a monopoly than a censor. He argued fervently that private television was a better forum for the free exchange of ideas:

Today all broadcasting in Canada on a national scale is controlled by the government-owned corporation. If private stations were permitted to form a national network, it would certainly result in the freer exchange of ideas. Such competition would greatly stimulate our broadcasting industry and foster a new sense of national unity. Our private stations are closer

⁴⁵ *CR*, 7 February, 23 March, 3 October, 28 November 1953 and 16 October and 6 February 1954.

⁴⁶ *CR*, 17 October 1953 and 6 June 1953 provide samples of this kind of reasoning.

⁴⁷ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 3, F.A. Coleman to S.W. Griffiths, 13 August 1954.

⁴⁸ *CR*, 3 April 1954.

to the people than the CBC and are capable of rendering a real service to the nation.⁴⁹

The Sheen Affair had forced serious questions about the CBC's programming policies, commercial policies, and its regulatory policies. Loney's attacks were by no means new, private broadcasters had been making them since the 1930s and the creation of government control of the industry.⁵⁰ What was different in the mid 1950s was that religious programming appeared to be more heavily controlled than had been anticipated in the early days of broadcast regulation, and the creation of Regulation 7c directed at abusive comments against creed, race or religion.⁵¹ The counter argument that appeared to be emerging was that good religious programs might need commercial sponsorship if they were ever to reach the air, otherwise many religious voices in Canada might be lost through loss of means to produce home-grown programs. Sheen's twenty million person audience⁵² in the United States seemed hard evidence of how voices of faith might be given attention, if the opportunity was offered them.

On September 10, 1954, Davidson Dunton, Chairman of the CBC, announced that "Life is Worth Living" would be broadcast on the CBC Network commencing in December. At a meeting on September 9, the NRAC had agreed to the broadcasts because two essential conditions had been met. First, the Council had authorized the experimental broadcast of Sheen, for six weeks commencing the previous June, on two private stations which were network affiliates, CKSO Sudbury⁵³ and CHCH Hamilton. Ironically, CKLW, a new private station in Windsor, had affiliated with DuMont and had just commenced live broadcasts of Sheen. The two CBC affiliates, however, were permitted only delayed broadcasts by means of Kinescope, with all the advertising deleted, except for a credit line at the end of the program to acknowledge DuMont and Admiral, which had been the second CBC and NRAC stipulation. The audience response was very

⁴⁹ CR, 12 June 1954. Loney anticipated the formation of the CTV network, in 1962, consisting of seven private stations, many of which had been permitted by the BBG to set up facilities in the major markets in direct competition with the CBC: CFCF (Montreal), CJOH (Ottawa), CFTO (Toronto), CFCN (Calgary)...see Shea, 71.

⁵⁰ Allard, 97; Shea, xi-xiii and 105-8; Marc Raboy, *Missed Opportunities: The Story of Canada's Broadcast Policy* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1990), 54 and 57-9.

⁵¹ Mark G. McGowan, "Air Wars: Radio Regulation, Sectarianism and Religious Broadcasting in Canada, 1922-1938," *Canadian Society of Church History Papers* (forthcoming, 2009).

⁵² CR, 27 February 1954.

⁵³ CR, 26 September 1953. CKSO was the first private television station in Canada.

positive.⁵⁴ With these successes noted the NRAC voted to accept the Sheen Program for the 1954-55 season. The only two dissenting votes came from the Presbyterian representatives “on grounds that programs of such a kind should not be in any way connected with commercial sponsorship or financial support.”⁵⁵ Nevertheless, endorsement of the Sheen program came from Catholic, United, Anglican, Baptist, and Lutheran members of the committee, with one Lutheran commenting that “Such a by-line [for Admiral] is surely Christian, giving credit to where credit is due.”⁵⁶ So much for any alleged serious sectarian division on the Council.

By December 1954 “Life is Worth Living” was featured on CBLT (Toronto) and CBOT (Ottawa) and three affiliates in Kingston (CKWS), London (CFPL), and Kitchener (CKCO), on Saturday nights at 7:00 pm. Some southern Ontarians could pick up the live Tuesday night feed from CKLW (Windsor), WHEN (Syracuse) or WHEC (Rochester), something which could have also been done with a strong aerial as early as 1952.⁵⁷ These earlier signals may account for Sheen’s modest ratings in the CBC rebroadcasts five days later. According to the International Surveys Limited, that charted TV viewers, in March 1955, “Life is Worth Living,” captured between one fifth and one quarter of the Toronto viewers in its Saturday timeslot, or between 51,700 and 64,320 households, thus ranking first or second, depending on the week in its Saturday timeslot.⁵⁸ The following season, 1955-56, Sheen appeared courtesy of ABC (which assumed control of DuMont) on Thursday nights at 8pm, competing with Groucho Marx’s “You Bet Your Life.” The CBC had twenty-five stations and affiliates, coast-to-coast, broadcasting the program by Kinescope on either a one or two week delay, with the credit line acknowledging Admiral and ABC.⁵⁹ Once again Toronto and Vancouver stations had to compete with American border stations that carried the program live weeks before. In a timeslot ruled by Groucho and Bob Cummings, Sheen, now in his fifth season and with the novelty of his presentations having worn off south of the border, could only muster a ten to twelve per cent share in the Toronto area, or

⁵⁴ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 2, Teletype from John Dunlop to C. Jennings, 25 October 1954; Memorandum from John Dunlop, 2 July 1954; f. 11-23-1, pt. 1, NRAC Minutes, 24 June 1954; f. 11-23-1, pt. 3, W.E. Powell to Denis Olerenshaw, Advertising Manager, Canadian Admiral, 11 August 1954. CR, 8 January 1955.

⁵⁵ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 2, Memorandum from Dunton, 10 September 1954; Press Release, 28 October 1954.

⁵⁶ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 3, Lutheran Reaction: A Statement, 1954, document 18-19-5-11-8.

⁵⁷ CR, 8 January 1955.

⁵⁸ RG 41, v. 514, ISL Ratings, Toronto, 1953-1955, January to April 1955.

⁵⁹ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1; CR, 21 May 1955.

between 31,900 and 33,500 households.⁶⁰ In the Vancouver-Victoria viewing region, the first available season of Sheen was a great success,⁶¹ although Sheen's ratings trailed off in 1956 to a point where he frequently ranked fourth in a five station market, with a share of only four to eight per cent of viewers, or between 4,280 and 8,320 households.⁶² British Columbia, with Catholics forming a small percentage of the population, would be a tough sell thereafter for Sheen.

Perhaps the greatest Canadian success story for "Life is Worth Living" came in the Montreal viewing region, which included the St. Lawrence Valley, Eastern Townships, and Laurentians. Despite the fact that the ISL reported that only nineteen per cent of televisions in Montreal were owned by Anglophone households, in 1955-56, "Life is Worth Living" captured between 26 and 32 per cent of the viewing audience, or between 73,580 and 81,920 households, depending on the night assessed.⁶³ Sheen's timeslot was won consistently by the French-language CBFT's "Le Fil d'Ariane." Given Sheen's high numbers relative to English-speaking viewers, he must have been able to entice many bilingual Francophones to his program. Hinting at this, one viewer from Quebec City wrote:

Bishop Sheen's program is one that nobody in our family ever wants to miss, and I am sure that as he gets better known, he will be popular in Canada, as he is in the USA. I know many French people right here in Quebec City who had never heard of Bishop Sheen a month ago are now among his most fervent admirers, and I am convinced that you have now for yourself the gratitude of practically all viewers by granting them this half hour of charm and truth.⁶⁴

Notwithstanding such praise by one member of the Catholic viewing public, it should also be noted that Montreal broadcasters were blessed by their geography: distance from transmission towers in Vermont and New York State and the hilly terrain of the Eastern Townships made for poor reception of American stations and therefore less competition for local Canadian signals.

⁶⁰ RG 41, v. 515, ISL Rating Books, Toronto 1956-1957, January to April 1956.

⁶¹ CR, 19 February 1955.

⁶² RG 41, v. 517, ISL Rating Books, Vancouver and Victoria, 1956, January to April 1956.

⁶³ RG 41, v. 511, ISL Rating Books, Montreal 1955-56, November to December 1955 and January to April 1956.

⁶⁴ RG 41, v. 223, f. 1-23-1, pt. 3, Violet McKenna to General Manager, CBC, 18 January 1955. Lynch estimates that Sheen may have had a Protestant viewing audience in the USA of just a little over 13%, which may very well have translated roughly into Canadian viewer habits as well. Lynch, 8.

The awaited coming of “Life is Worth Living” was not without its detractors. Letters of opposition and anger were received from several predictable sources. Edward Morris, President of the Canadian Protestant League, in Halifax, expressed his “emphatic protest to this program … a most subtle denomination propaganda” brought to the CBC under Roman Catholic pressure.⁶⁵ A single Presbyterian Congregation from Perth, Ontario, petitioned Prime Minister Louis St. Laurent to prohibit the program from the CBC.⁶⁶ In addition, the head of the Christian Homes for Children, Reverend H.G. Martin, complained that the program had no Protestant counterpart, to which Dunton replied the balance had been struck by the Lutheran “This is the Life.”⁶⁷ There were even a few non-religious complaints, including a condemnation of Sheen and his “lying assertions regarding the Russian people during the last war,” or how the Bishop slipped references to Admiral Televisions into his monologues.⁶⁸ For the most part, the complaints were few and the program continued in Canada until 1957, when Sheen, under duress from his superior, Cardinal Francis Spellman, gave up broadcasting.⁶⁹ Sheen re-emerged with several new programs and formats in the 1960s, some of which were sponsored in Canada by the Knights of Columbus,⁷⁰ but these new shows made Sheen look like a “relic in an era of change.”⁷¹

By mid 1957, the Sheen Affair in Canada was over. The five years of debate over “Life is Worth Living” revealed much about the uncomfortable relationship between religious broadcasting and the CBC. As a national network, with a virtual monopoly in large markets in its early years, CBC Television tried to be all things to all Canadians. The fact that Sheen was Catholic may have mattered in some quarters, but the fact that he was an American, produced by the American television industry, and financed by one of that industry’s giants posed serious questions about how distinct Canadian television could survive such an onslaught of American programming,

⁶⁵ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 2, Edward Morris to Gordon Cullingham, Talks and Public Affairs, CBC, 28 May 1955.

⁶⁶ RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 3, Reverend Robert Milroy, St. Andrew’s Presbyterian Church, Perth, to Prime Minister (copy), 21 May 1955.

⁶⁷ *Ibid.*, Davidson Dunton to H.G. Martin, 10 July 1956, and H.G. Martin to Dunton, 18 June 1956.

⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, James Ormerod, Vancouver, to Manager of CBC Vancouver, 31 March 1956; John Dunlop to Supervising Producer, CBLT, 8 February 1956. There is no evidence to suggest Sheen was even aware of the controversy in Canada; the Sheen Archives in the Diocese of Rochester Archives have very little of his correspondence and virtually nothing relating to Canada. It cannot be established with any certainty that Sheen adlibbed about Admiral Televisions with an intent to make a point to the CBC.

⁶⁹ Reeves, 256. “Life is Worth Living” lasted 125 episodes. Lynch, 11.

⁷⁰ Archives of the Archdiocese of Edmonton, Archbishop John H. MacDonald Papers, I.6.11.0, Lloyd Moss to MacDonald, 13 February 1960.

⁷¹ Reeves, 274.

including religious programming. Moreover, the commercialization of “Life is Worth Living” struck to the heart of Canadian broadcasting in two ways. First, it raised the uncomfortable question of whether or not the CBC should engage in commercial advertising, and particularly linking the broadcast of the “sacred” for filthy lucre’s sake. Secondly, the CBC and its advisors saw the problem of the public broadcaster being subject to dollar-driven religious programming, thereby creating “have” and “have-not” religious groups. This seemed to be an anathema to a public network whose mandate it was to serve all Canadians in a fair and balanced manner. In the end, the issue of commercialization proved to be the most important one as to whether Sheen was broadcast or not.

The Sheen Affair, however, also reveals the new challenges facing the concept of a religious presence in the public square in Canada by the late 1950s. Knowing the fragility of the denominational peace between Catholics and Protestants in many parts of the country, the CBC sailed gingerly into matters of faith-based programming, relying heavily on the National Religious Advisory Council to keep the peace and assure equity between the major Anglophone religious groups. For its own part, despite its Toronto-centric membership and clerical composition, the NRAC undertook its deliberations with an uncharacteristic ecumenical *esprit-de-corps*, long before the doors to formal Catholic-Protestant dialogue were eased open by Vatican II. The Sheen Affair was perhaps the greatest test in their short fourteen year history, and it managed the controversy reasonably well without significant sectarian fisticuffs or rhetorical abuse. As members of the Council may have discovered, in a network where religious programming in English may have accounted for between one and nine per cent of all programming, depending on the region, there appeared more to be gained by co-operation than sectarian bickering.⁷² If the NRAC could not achieve consensus, some network executives would have been prepared to abandon religious programming altogether, allowing this to be the exclusive domain of private stations.⁷³ Sheen’s presence signalled the arrival of a new means of evangelization for North American churches, and methods that might be tested and adapted by all denominations. For the churches, television held great promise and positive exposure at a time when their role and relevance in society would soon come under increasing scrutiny.

⁷² RG 41, v. 170, f. 11-15, Programme Statistics, CBC Programmes Statistics Magazine, April 1943-March 1944 and RG 41, v. 223, f. 11-23-1, pt. 3, Network Programme Report, 1953-54.

⁷³ RG 41, v. 909, f. PG- 11-4, pt. 1, Chairman of NRAC to Gladstone Murray, 27 November 1940.

National Identities on Display: Québec's Deaf Schools at the World's Columbian Exposition 1893

Stéphane-D. PERREAU

The World's Columbian Exposition held in Chicago in 1893 was meant to represent and construct a vision of progress the American way. The neo-classical architecture of the "White City" was rooted in American as well as world history, and intended to inspire awe in the visitors. It displayed the power of human ingenuity to overcome the social ills that plagued a continent undergoing rapid industrialisation.¹ Behind the white walls of the artificial and temporary city built on the shores of Lake Michigan, exhibits revealed the twin goals of the event: to celebrate the quatercentenary of the "discovery" of the Americas and to educate the visitors about modern city life. While anchored in history, the Exposition supported a thoroughly modern view of the world, boldly stating that human effort could improve humankind. The Columbian Exposition was a coming-of-age experience for the United States. The country showed itself as an emerging world leader by affirming its commitment to progress, to technology, and to political and economic leadership in the coming century.

The Chicago Exposition generated a diverse historiography, much of it centred on the controversy over the architectural influence of the White City.² While the adamantly neo-classical statement made by the architectural programme of the Exposition constitutes one of its more obvious influences on American society, it was what happened within its buildings that captured

¹ Neil Harris, *Cultural Excursions: Marketing Appetites and Cultural Tastes in Modern America*, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990), 112.

² One example among many is representative of some of the debates around this question. Dimitri Tsilos, "The Chicago Fair and the Myth of the 'Lost Cause,'" *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*, 26, 4 (1967): 259-268. This interpretation is even present in popular history as expressed in coffee-table books: Jay Pridmore and George A. Larson, *Chicago Architecture and Design* [revised edition] (Chicago: Harry N. Abrams, 2005), 67-74.

the imagination of visitors.³ This article focuses on the contents of some of the exhibits contained in the largest of the edifices on the site: the Hall of Manufactures and Liberal Arts. This immense structure, situated in the heart of the Exhibition grounds, was the major showcase for marvels in technology and education at the Columbian Exposition.⁴ The south and southwest galleries of this building contained an immense display on education. Within this exhibit were many collections of items sent by deaf schools as a demonstration of the progressive character of this branch of education. This article examines the exhibits sent by Montréal's Catholic deaf schools which exemplified key aspects of French-Canadian nationalism in the late nineteenth century. The stakeholders who designed the exhibits by the Catholic schools for the deaf used the Columbian Exposition to portray education in Québec as progressive, rooted in the latest pedagogical theories, and as contributing to the development of a modern national economy.

Nineteenth century education served as one of the means by which nationalism was strengthened and perpetuated.⁵ This partly explains the expansion of the educational enterprise during that century and the increasing state support from which it benefited. In the United States, where a cohesive nation remained to be constructed after the trauma of the Civil war, a project for teaching "American" values was deemed particularly urgent, and its success needed to be showcased to the world.⁶ Other countries aspired to develop educational systems that would help foster in their citizens a sense of common nationality and pride. This essentially meant an education that combined the mastery of academic disciplines and practical training in sciences and trades labelled socially useful. Within the field of education, the specialty of instructing deaf people embodied the use of human ingenuity to overcome limitations.⁷ Educating the deaf enabled them to function in society by learning its rules, beliefs, and laws. Gainful employment would

³ Marvin Nathan, "Visiting the World's Columbian Exposition at Chicago in July 1893: A Personal View," *Journal of American Culture*, 19, 2 (Summer 1996): 79-102.

⁴ Its dimensions were 1,687 feet in length and 787 feet in width, for a total exhibiting area of 44 acres, on two levels: 30 acres at ground level and 14 on the mezzanine. *Report of the Executive Commissioner for New South Wales to the World's Columbian Exposition, Chicago, 1893* (Sydney: Charles Potter, 1894), 220.

⁵ Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (revised edition), (London: Verso, 1991 [1983], chap. 6; Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger, *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), chap. 7.

⁶ Michael Kammen, *Mystic Chords of Memory: The Transformation of Tradition in American Culture* (New York: Random House/Vintage, 1991), part II.

⁷ Scholars in the field of deaf studies often use the capitalised "Deaf" to express cultural identity and the lowercase "deaf" to speak about the physical reality of not hearing. The use of "Deaf" would be anachronistic in the context of the nineteenth century, therefore this author has chosen not to apply this convention.

be achieved through vocational training also supplied at schools for the deaf.⁸ Deaf education concentrates the historical gaze on how citizens were made in an industrial society, because decisions about how to educate the deaf were made with an eye to conveying to students the essence of what it meant to live in a given society. Thus, starting in Paris in 1878, deaf educators began to take advantage of world fairs to display their skill, and discuss issues of the field.

Displays by deaf schools at the Columbian Exposition were particularly striking to visitors. Among these, the exhibits of Montréal's two Catholic deaf institutions provide clues to understanding how French-Canadian society in Québec viewed itself, and how it wanted to be portrayed to the world. Montréal had three schools for the deaf: a school for Protestant youth of both sexes, a Catholic girls' school and a Catholic boys' school. The Protestant school was headed by a board made up of members of Montréal's English-speaking bourgeoisie and headed by Harriet Ashcroft (née McGann), daughter of a former Superintendent of the Ontario school for the deaf in Belleville.⁹ The Catholic schools were headed by religious congregations: the girls' school by the Sisters of Providence and the boys' school by the Clerics of Saint-Viator, or Viatorians. The sex-segregated Catholic institutions contributed vastly different exhibits to the Chicago Exposition, showing the gendered dimension of education.

The exhibit by the Catholic girls' school for the deaf which forms the focus of this article was singled out in many reports as particularly representative of these national characteristics. Although no photographs of these exhibits have been located by this author, ample written descriptions exist and an analysis of these sources will form the core of the present argument.¹⁰ The discussion that follows examines the documents related to preparations for the Exposition, and analyses the significance of the World's Columbian Exposition for deaf education. Further, impressions gathered

⁸ Douglas Baynton, *Forbidden Signs: American Culture and the Campaign against Sign Language* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996), chap. 1; Stéphane-D. Perreault, "Intersecting Discourses: Deaf Institutions and Communities in Montréal, 1850-1920," (unpublished Ph.D. diss., McGill University, 2003) 67-74.

⁹ For a variety of reasons, Montréal's Mackay Institution for Protestant Deaf-Mutes and the Blind did not send an exhibit to Chicago. Its Superintendent did, however, write a history of the school that was included in a work that will be discussed further. Edward Allan Fay (ed.), *Histories of American Schools for the Deaf* (Washington, D.C.: The Volta Bureau, 1893), vol. 3. This text was the only way by which the Protestant institution was made visible at Chicago.

¹⁰ Many of these printed sources were contained in Gédéon Ouimet's Report to the government of the province of Québec on the school exhibit. *L'instruction publique de la province de Québec à l'Exposition colombienne de Chicago* (Québec: 1895).

about the French-Canadian deaf schools at Chicago are related to some of the characteristics of French-Canadian identity in the late nineteenth century.

1. Preparing for Chicago in Catholic Québec

The British North America Act of 1867 made education a provincial responsibility, confirming the evolution of the British North American colonies in the previous twenty-five years. In 1868, the province of Québec established a Department of “Public Instruction.”¹¹ This initiative, however, was short-lived and the Department was replaced in 1876 by a Council of Public Instruction which oversaw the educational work in the province under the effective leadership of two denominational boards: one for Catholics and one for Protestants.¹² Each of these boards was made up of church representatives and presided over by a Superintendent. As education was focused on religion as the basis for civic identity, ecclesiastical control of curriculum, teacher certification, and textbooks was deemed essential, especially for the Catholic hierarchy whose members had pressured the government to abolish the Department of Education.¹³

The actual work of education in the province was in part supervised by local school boards (for elementary schooling) and by the churches. Rural elementary schools were generally staffed by underpaid single women in one-room schoolhouses.¹⁴ Higher education for Catholics was dispensed through a network of church-led “classical” colleges located throughout the province. They offered an education in the humanities geared towards preparing men for further studies leading to professions or to the priesthood. No such college catered to women before 1908, and few thereafter.¹⁵ Various specialised schools for trades and agriculture, reformatories, and two schools for the deaf and one for the blind completed this network. Finally, a Catholic university existed, located in Québec City, with a satellite in Montréal.¹⁶ As education to age 16 was only made mandatory in 1943, a considerable number of pupils only attended school sporadically and barely completed the first years of elementary schooling before entering the workforce. Catholic

¹¹ Arthur Tremblay, *Le ministère de l'éducation et le conseil supérieur: antécédents et création, 1867-1964* (Québec: Presses de l'Université Laval, 1989), 3.

¹² Louis-Philippe Audet, *Histoire de l'enseignement au Québec, tome II (1840-1971)* (Montréal: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1971), 100-122.

¹³ Tremblay, *Le ministère de l'éducation*, 5-10; Jean-Pierre Charland, *Histoire de l'éducation au Québec: de l'ombre du clocher à l'économie du savoir* (Saint-Laurent: Éditions du renouveau pédagogique, 2005), 81.

¹⁴ Andrée Dufour and Micheline Dumont, (eds.), *Brève histoire des institutrices au Québec de la Nouvelle-France à nos jours* (Montréal: Boréal, 2004).

¹⁵ Claude Galarneau, *Les collèges classiques au Canada français (1620-1970)* (Montréal: Fides, 1978), 54.

¹⁶ Charland, *Histoire de l'éducation*, chap. 6.

schools beyond the elementary level were generally sex-segregated, as Catholic rules forbade the teaching of adolescents beyond the age of twelve in mixed-gender environments. This meant that the teachers had to be of the same sex as their charges, which reinforced the gendered construction of education and its role in training future citizens.¹⁷

Protestant schools in Québec constituted a parallel network that functioned quite independently from its Catholic counterpart. Protestants in Québec replicated in modified form the institutions that existed for the Catholic majority of the population in education and social services. Denominations had to pool their resources to offer services to the population rather than relying on state subsidies financed through state-supervised land grants on the British model.¹⁸ Moreover, Protestant schools were concentrated in some areas of the province, mainly the cities of Montréal and Québec, as well as the Eastern Townships, an Anglo-Protestant area of settlement near the U.S. border. The Protestant minority in the province benefited from a remarkably advantageous situation compared to the Catholic minorities that existed in other Canadian provinces, whose rights to schooling were severely curtailed in the late nineteenth century. The boosterish language used by promoters of Québec's Catholic educational institutions at Chicago stems in part from major crises in Catholic and French education outside Québec at the time.

Other Canadian provinces largely adopted a model of provincial government control that had gradually imposed itself in Canada West (Ontario) between 1843 and 1867.¹⁹ This model rested on state supervision over a system of tax-supported non-denominational (Protestant) public schools. Separate (generally Catholic) schools were allowed, but found themselves subject to increasingly punctilious state control as the nineteenth century wore on. Two major crises involving provincial governments restricting the educational rights of Catholics and French speakers erupted

¹⁷ This has been the object of study for girls in the 1980s. Nadia Fahmy-Eid and Micheline Dumont (eds.), *Maîtresses de maison, maîtresses d'école: Femmes, famille et éducation dans l'éducation du Québec* (Montréal: Boréal express, 1983); Dumont and Fahmy-Eid (eds.), *Les couventines: L'éducation des filles au Québec dans les congrégations religieuses enseignantes, 1840-1960* (Montréal: Boréal, 1986).

¹⁸ Janice Harvey, "The Protestant Orphan Asylum and the Montreal Ladies' Benevolent Society: A Case Study in Protestant Child Charity in Montreal, 1820-1900," (unpublished Ph.D. diss., McGill University, 2001).

¹⁹ Alison Prentice, *The School Promoters: Education and Social Class in Mid-Nineteenth Century Upper Canada* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1977), chap. 7; Prentice and Susan E. Houston, (eds.), *Family, School, and Society in Nineteenth-Century Canada* (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1975); Paul Axelrod, *The Promise of Schooling: Education in Canada, 1800-1914* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1997).

in New Brunswick in 1871, and then again in Manitoba in 1890. In both cases, issues such as using tax revenues to support separate schools, the wearing of the religious habit by teachers, the time spent teaching Catholic doctrine, or the very use of the French language caused major rifts between the French and Catholic minorities and the provincial governments. In 1893, the Manitoba schools question was still an issue of national importance that would only be resolved in 1897, albeit to the satisfaction of neither Catholics nor Francophones. The desire of Québec's French-Canadian Catholics to promote their educational institutions to the face of the world at Chicago has to be understood in this context of national strife over language and religion.

Catholic educators were neither indifferent nor hostile to the modern vision proposed at the Columbian Exposition. Nevertheless, too many conflicting discourses coexisted within the province to enable Québec educational promoters to fully embrace the American version of modernity and progress, as defined by industrial capitalism and state-supported social reform. Québec's Catholic educators were not against progress; they saw progress in a different light. To them, it required remaining faithful to a national vision rooted in the twin issues of language and religion. This is exemplified by Canon Paul Bruchési, the future archbishop of Montréal, who coordinated the educational exhibits for the province of Québec. He enthusiastically embraced the Columbian Exposition as an opportunity to showcase French-Canadian national pride. “Il me semble qu'il y a dans cette exposition scolaire, une belle œuvre à accomplir à l'honneur de notre religion et de notre nationalité.”²⁰ He repeated this message in the initial invitation sent to the various educational institutions of the province to gather materials for the Exposition, stressing that the exhibits should “faire une œuvre qui sera à l'honneur de la religion et de notre pays.”²¹ The Catholic face of Québec was to shine with particular brightness in Chicago. For organisational reasons that remain obscure but which were said to have resulted from difficulties in selecting a person to be in charge, the presence of Québec's Protestants at the Exhibition was minimal.²² This situation testifies to greater coordination within the Catholic church, but it may also have resulted from internal tensions over education in the province sparked by what was happening elsewhere in the country.

²⁰ “It seems to me this educational exhibit is a valuable work that will honour our religion and nationality.” [Translations are the author's] Canon Paul Bruchési to the Provincial Secretary, in Charles Langelier, *L'Instruction publique de la Province de Québec à l'Exposition colombienne de Chicago* (Québec: 1895) 11.

²¹ “Work towards honouring our religion and country.” *Ibid.*, 14.

²² Langelier, *L'Instruction publique*, 28.

It was not the first time that Québec's educational institutions had sent materials to a world's fair. In 1878, Canadian provinces had sent materials to the Paris Universal Exhibition, and Québec's exhibit alone commanded a ninety-five page catalogue to detail the artifacts sent across the Atlantic.²³ Québec had also sent exhibits to London's 1886 World's Fair. Government officials started exchanging correspondence about the upcoming Columbian Exposition in November 1890, but changes in government and various bureaucratic delays led to the official circular letter to school trustees and other authorities being sent out only in January 1892, leaving barely a year to gather the necessary materials.²⁴

These included descriptions of the schools and their facilities, statistics about personnel and pupils, and pictures. To showcase the work done in schools, their principals were instructed to send booklets, examples of penmanship and draftsmanship, maps, drills in accounting, and final examinations. Convents (schools for girls taught by women religious) were instructed to send samples of needlework, embroidery, and crochet work.²⁵ No specific instructions were given to schools for boys regarding samples from their workshops, possibly because of the cost of transporting bulky items such as works in carpentry. These materials were to be gathered first in individual schools, then trustees or religious superiors would channel them to Montréal for shipment.

Montréal's deaf institutions were to participate in this vast provincial organisation, but they had already been asked to contribute to the Exposition from a different source. In 1892, the editor of the *American Annals of the Deaf* (AAD), Edward Allen Fay, asked all principals of institutions for the deaf in the United States, in Canada, and in Mexico to send forth a prospectus outlining the programme of studies, facilities, and history of their institutions.²⁶ Since these were to be collated and published as a series of volumes to be distributed at the Columbian Exposition, they had to conform to a standard format of 9 x 5¾ inches (229 x 146 mm). The resulting publication, under the title *Histories of American Schools for the Deaf*, consists of three volumes. The first two contain pamphlets from public schools in the United States, and the third volume groups those from denominational schools and those outside of the U.S. Collectively, this work remains the single most comprehensive source on deaf institutions in North

²³ Thomas C. Keefer, *Handbook and Official Catalogue of the Canadian Section, Paris Universal Exhibition, 1878* (London: George E. Eyre and William Spottiswoode, 1878).

²⁴ Langelier, *L'Instruction publique*, 3-4.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, 5-6.

²⁶ Fay, "Introduction," *Histories of American Schools for the Deaf*, vol. I, xiv-xv.

America. This undertaking, spurred by the Columbian Exposition, testifies to the importance it had for deaf education.

Various institutions had already published histories, many of which had been published in the ; some simply had these reprinted for publication in Fay's collective work. All three Montréal institutions, however, produced new publications describing their history, current amenities, and programme of studies. The Catholic institution for deaf boys was the only one whose contribution was in a language other than English (French), with only selected sections concerning the programme of studies translated into English. This work was, by far, the largest of the three schools of Montréal, and amongst the most detailed in the entire collection. It was practically oriented and lavishly illustrated with engravings of the farm and photographs of the workshops. Its publication in French manifested a degree of national pride on the part of the Viatorians. The historical section of the prospectus included, after the description of the sewing, cobbling, binding, and printing workshops, a detailed description of the farm attached to the institution, stating in its opening paragraph that agriculture was the only legitimate calling for the educated deaf:

L'agriculture ! Voilà vraiment le travail qui convient au sourd-muet instruit. Seul dans son champ, sous le regard de ce Dieu qu'il a appris à connaître, en face du spectacle magnifique de la nature qui n'est plus pour lui un livre fermé, mais où il reconnaît maintenant un reflet de la majesté et de la bonté divines, entouré d'harmonies mystérieuses qui n'ont pas besoin du secours de tous les sens pour parvenir à l'âme, il grandit à ses propres yeux, ce pauvre enfant jadis rebute partout; son cœur se dilate, il se sent plus près de Dieu et reçoit, lui aussi, sa part de bonheur. Voilà la vie qui convient au sourd-muet : c'est aux travaux agricoles qu'il faut le former.²⁷

This farm operated from 1882 to 1896 without generating enough enthusiasm from the pupils to keep it alive. However, it represented a positive national vision to those among the Viatorians who endorsed the then-popular agriculturalist thesis. This ideology stated that salvation for French-Canadians was in agricultural development, shunning industrialisation

²⁷ “Agriculture! That truly is work befitting the deaf-mute [sic]. Alone in his field, under the gaze of this God whom he has learned to know, faced with the magnificent spectacle of nature, which is no longer a closed book to him, but in which he discerns a reflection of the divine majesty and goodness, surrounded by mysterious harmonies that do not require all senses to reach the soul, he grows in his own eyes, this poor child who had hitherto been rejected everywhere; his heart heaves, he feels closer to God, and he receives his own portion of happiness. There is a life fit for the deaf-mute: he must be trained in agricultural work.” “Notes historiques sur l’Institution catholique pour les sourds-muets pour la province de Québec,” Fay, (ed.), *Histories of American Schools*, vol. III, 27.

and exploitation by British and American capitalists.²⁸ This was meant to offer an alternative to rural exodus and migration into Montréal or, worse, participation in the massive movement of French-Canadian emigration to the industrial towns of New England.²⁹ It extolled country living and the sociability of the village over the dangers of the city. It garnered considerable support among politicians and clerics alike, but its popular appeal was limited. Agriculturalism pervaded commentaries about Québec's educational exhibits at Chicago.

This project to publish a series of volumes on deaf institutions for the Columbian Exposition was seen as an opportunity for expanded publicity within the province for the boys' institution. The school's printing shop produced 2,000 additional copies of this prospectus for distribution as a promotional tool to be sent to pastors of parishes, to ministers of the provincial government and to journalists.³⁰ The tone of the prospectus as well as the fact that it was almost entirely written in French suggest that this was the real audience the Viatorians were seeking. This expressed a keen sense of priorities on the part of the religious directors of the institution: the exhibition provided international prestige, but the local market was important for recruitment of pupils and financial support.

The pamphlet reflected a great controversy that rocked deaf education since the second congress of deaf educators held in Milan in 1880. That congress decreed that all deaf education should be conducted according to the "oral method," or "oralism."³¹ Sign language (often referred to as the "manual method" or "manualism" at the time) was thought to inhibit the pupils' learning of speech and thus was to be banned from schools. This trend already existed in European schools, but deaf educators in the United States reacted quite negatively to this coercive measure. Yet, by the 1890s, the move towards oralism was afoot in North America, largely because it was seen as a sign of progress in making the deaf "like" hearing people. Presenting successes in oral education of deaf children was a winning strategy for fundraising among people obsessed with progress. In the prospectus of Montréal's boys' school, great emphasis was placed on the type of education

²⁸ William F. Ryan, *The Clergy and Economic Growth in Québec, 1896-1914* (Québec: Presses de l'Université Laval, 1966), chap. 5.

²⁹ Yves Roby, *Franco-Americans of New England: Dreams and Realities* (trans: Mary Ricard), (Québec: Septentrion, 2004).

³⁰ The Viatorians received a \$300 subsidy from the Québec government to offset the cost of publishing these additional copies. Archives of the Clerics of Saint-Viator in Montréal (ACSVM), P9, *Journal de l'Institution*, Feb. 5, 1893; March 22, 1893.

³¹ Richard G. Brill, *International Congresses on Education of the Deaf: An Analytical History, 1878-1980* (Washington, D.C.: Gallaudet University Press, 1984), 20.

given, oral teaching occupying a prominent position, at least in the official discourse:

- 1^o Natural signs are tolerated during the first year of study.
- 2^o During the first three years, the pupils who follow the oral method, and during the whole course, the non-speaking pupils, receive dactylological and written explanations or instructions.
- 3^o After the first year, the pupils who follow the oral method are kept completely separate from the others.
- 4^o From the third year, up to the end of the course, the pupils of the oral department are exclusively taught by speech. Thus, these pupils receive instruction by means of lip-reading and writing.
- 5^o As a rule, pupils may be admitted to make their First Communion, in the fifth year of the course of studies.³²

This description reflected an ideal more than the reality, but it reveals that although oralism had considerable marketing value, signing continued to be used for practical reasons. The Viatorians obviously valued religious education and stressed the importance of receiving First Communion in the fifth year. Receiving Communion marked the attainment of religious knowledge sufficient to fully participate in the life of the Church. If the pupil persevered, this preparation would culminate in receiving the sacrament of Confirmation, which marked religious adulthood. In the French-Canadian society of the time, it was a sign of full citizenship.

Visual communication was deemed essential for religious instruction during the first three years of the programme, even for those pupils enrolled in the oral division. It allowed instruction in the basics of religious thought before students had acquired the basics of oral language. As religion remained paramount in this school, it appeared impossible to fully implement oralism in practice. This differed from the secularisation trend in most schools in the United States, where most institutions were non-denominational and state-funded. A religious focus contributed to the continued use of manualist methods in Montréal's boys' school. Manualism did not appear important for basic religious instruction at the girls' school. This may be because of the fact that many boys left the school as soon as was feasible to find work, whereas girls were expected to stay in school longer.

The other two Montréal institutions made more modest contributions to the collective work on deaf institutions published for the Columbian Exposition by Edward Allan Fay. The 16-page pamphlet of the "Institute for the Female Deaf & Dumb of the Province of Québec" followed the criteria set out by Fay

³² "Notes historiques," Fay, (ed.), *Histories of American Schools*, vol. III, 58. English in original.

in his instructions, but its history section was minimal.³³ It was a prospectus for the school that could have been destined to parents or benefactors but, contrary to the one generated by its male counterpart, it was entirely written in English.³⁴ The anonymous author of the pamphlet detailed the objectives of the Sisters of Providence, their physical plant, and the teaching methods they used. The booklet boasted of the school's pioneering use of the oral method as early as 1870 and of the establishment of separate classes for oral and manual pupils since 1879. The school was greatly expanded between 1882 and 1902 to accommodate the facilities that were necessary to implement the separation of students in the oral and manual division.³⁵

The educational objectives of the girls' school emphasised religion and practical training: first came "the teaching of Religion which reveals to man [sic] his dignity and destiny, directs him in his relations with his Creator and his fellow-creatures, and supplies him with the incitements and consolations necessary to meet with the difficulties of life."³⁶ The second goal was "to give the Female Deaf and Dumb a teaching which on one side develops their intelligence and enables them to fill the duties of social life, and on the other prepares them for a position that will assure their subsistence."³⁷ For girls educated in that school, religious training retained its full importance, much more than in any other deaf school at the time. Contrary to the boys' school, it did not appear to contradict the implementation of oralism, neither did it preclude the use of various hearing instruments showing a "modern" medical view of hearing deficiency at work. The objective was "to draw the students still nearer to society."³⁸

The leaflet published by the girls' school complemented the artifacts exhibited at the Columbian Exposition. It ended with a "general observation" explaining the meaning of the exhibits, describing their use as a demonstration of the process of awakening the deaf "slumbering intelligence" through the use of various exercises.³⁹ The exhibits sent to Chicago were to dynamically represent what happened in the school. Preparing these materials required

³³ "Canada. Institute for the Female Deaf & Dumb of the Province of Quebec, under the direction of the Sisters of Charity of Providence," Fay, (ed.), *Histories of American Schools*, vol. III.

³⁴ A French version was produced, most likely for distribution to benefactors. Archives of the Sisters of Providence (ASP), M10.37 (14), "Chronique de l'Institution des Sourdes-Muettes," I (1851-1906), 277.

³⁵ Stéphane-D. Perreault, *Une communauté qui fait signe: les Sœurs de Notre-Dame-des-Sept-Douleurs, 1887-2006* (Outremont: Carte blanche, 2006), 50-53.

³⁶ "Institute for the Female Deaf & Dumb," Fay (ed.), *Histories of American Schools*, vol. III, 3.

³⁷ *Ibid.*, 4.

³⁸ *Ibid.*, 6.

³⁹ *Ibid.*, 10.

considerable work on the part of the educators and their pupils, but it was worth it. In the words of the anonymous writer of the school's *chronique* (logbook) the Sisters of Providence were conscious of the “grands intérêts [qu']elle devait servir à faire valoir, je veux dire la gloire de notre Religion, l'honneur de notre Communauté, le niveau intellectuel de notre Province, la renommée de notre Institution!”⁴⁰ It is clear that these women were highly attuned to the political goals of the exhibits being sent by the province of Québec. Ethno-religious and political pride are paramount in this description that was destined for internal use, not for public propaganda.

The exhibit organised by the Institution for Catholic deaf girls for the Chicago Exposition was impressive. It included twenty-nine booklets of materials drawn from classes, as well as many examples of handiwork. These included oil paintings, wax and hair arrangements, models, drawings, needlework, and knitting representing the work of pupils of various classes and levels.⁴¹ These underscored the practical dimension of instruction at the school, which was meant to prepare “the students to provide by themselves in the future to their own subsistence.”⁴² One must wonder what exactly this meant in a society in which married women were not generally expected to be gainfully employed, but whose sewing talents would more likely be used for the daily mending needs of their families.

For Montréal's Catholic schools for the deaf, preparing for the World's Columbian Exposition was a matter of urgency for two reasons. The provincial government wanted to put together a show destined to impress the world with the quality of education that could be obtained in Québec's Catholic system. The coordinated efforts of educators within the Catholic branch of the educational network succeeded in putting together impressive displays. Deaf institutions were also encouraged to participate by the international network of deaf educators who took advantage of the Columbian Exposition to showcase their collective face. Of the two schools in Montréal that participated, the deaf girls' school put on the most striking show. The Sisters of Providence carefully designed an exhibit that clearly fit the objectives of the Québec organisers. These women responded to the nationalist spirit of the Exposition, which made for their exhibit's success. They neatly balanced the traditional appeal of the gendered handiwork with the appeal of progress inherent in embracing oralism and the most advanced pedagogy.

⁴⁰ “Great interests it was destined to serve, meaning the glory of our Religion, the honour of our [religious] Community, the intellectual level of our Province, our Institution's fame!” ASP, M10.37 (14), “Chronique de l'Institution des Sourdes-Muettes,” I (1851-1906), 277.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*, 278.

⁴² “Institute for the Female Deaf & Dumb,” Fay, (ed.), *Histories of American Schools*, vol. III, 10.

2. The World's Columbian Exposition and Deaf Education

The Columbian Exposition stressed several themes that resonated throughout the world of deaf education, particularly in the United States. First it emphasised the role of instruction and education for social and economic progress. It was thought necessary to discover better and more efficient methods of education in order to train productive citizens for the new industrial order. Deaf educators increasingly emphasised “practical” teaching rather than religious indoctrination. By century’s end, the concern of most educators, regardless of creed, was no longer to shape young souls for a specific faith as had been the case in earlier years, but rather to create young citizens whose contribution to the development of society would be economic.⁴³ This implied a new social identity based on a sense of common heritage rather than faith. Religion gave way to patriotism, and history served as a source of national consciousness.⁴⁴

The exhibition provided an occasion for all deaf schools in North America to show a collective face to the world, and to portray deaf education as necessary for the progress of society. The three volumes edited by Edward Allen Fay went a long way towards publicising deaf education as a specialty in the emerging field of education and social rehabilitation. Educational institutions were portrayed as places where the deaf would learn how to become functioning citizens, not as objects of public charity. Massachusetts exemplified this shift in 1867 by transferring the responsibility for overseeing deaf schools from the Board of Charities to that of Education.⁴⁵ In Montréal, by contrast, the situation had remained different and the institutions still fit the charitable paradigm, while also dispensing education.

Furthermore, the Exhibition was the occasion for gathering deaf educators from around the world. The first time deaf educators had used a world’s fair for gathering and showcasing their specialty was at the Paris fair of 1878. In September of that year, the Pereire Society, a wealthy and prominent supporter of oralism, sponsored a congress at which twenty-seven European delegates gathered.⁴⁶ American delegates only received their invitations after the congress had ended. In Paris, European proponents of oralism paved the way for the controversial resolutions passed at the Congress of Milan of 1880. After the uneventful congress in Brussels in 1883, no plans were made for convening again until the Chicago Exposition gave deaf educators in the United States an opportunity to invite their European colleagues to a “World’s Congress of Instructors of the Deaf.” Chicago’s

⁴³ Baynton, *Forbidden Signs*, chap. 6.

⁴⁴ Kammen, *Mystic Chords of Memory*, 140-141.

⁴⁵ Brill, *International Congresses*, 36-7.

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, 13.

congress was to be a reply to the European dominance in the field, but it ended up being a mostly North American gathering.

Issues discussed at Chicago revolved around three main concerns. The first was the question of the methods to use in deaf teaching. Philip Gillett's inaugural address underlined the link between the celebration of Columbus' discovery of America at the dawn of the Renaissance and the beginning of formal deaf education under the tutelage of Pedro Ponce de León in the sixteenth century.⁴⁷ This underscored the purportedly progressive nature of deaf education. The Exhibition provided an appropriate symbolic context for such an affirmation in stressing both the deep connection to the past and the advance of humanity through technological progress.⁴⁸ The second issue had to do with the value of sign language during and after schooling. Since this was the first international gathering of educators of the deaf where deaf people actually had a voice, dissent from the position taken at Milan was expressed. This international event had a decidedly American flavour and reflected the diversity of opinions that existed in that country.⁴⁹ Consensus emerged about the importance of learning the English language – written and possibly spoken – as the foremost objective of deaf education. Nevertheless, it was recognised that education required more than linguistic training and that it should enable the deaf to participate in society and in the workplace. Training the deaf in trades was the third main focus of the discussions.

The Congress held at the Chicago Columbian Exhibition marked the waning of the oralist controversy – but not of oralism itself – and a turn to more practical issues of vocational training. This shift in focus was at least partly due to the failure of the oral method to fulfill its promise of fully integrating the deaf in industrial society. In Montréal, vocational training did not result in increased employment opportunities for all of the deaf, and by the twentieth century many of them ended up looking for employment in sheltered workshops.⁵⁰ Similar situations existed elsewhere.⁵¹ This shift in focus reflected cultural preoccupations of the age as the popularity of the exhibit by Montréal's girls' school demonstrates. It struck visitors in part

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, 34. Ponce de León's teaching was based on oral methods and was made known to history by the writings of Juan Pablo Bonet, *Reducción de las letras y arte de enseñar a hablar los mudos* (Madrid: Francisco Abarca de Angulo, 1620).

⁴⁸ Karal Ann Marling, "Writing History with Artifacts: Columbus at the 1893 Chicago Fair," *The Public Historian*, 14, 4 (Fall 1992): 13-30.

⁴⁹ *Ibid.*, 53.

⁵⁰ Stéphane-D. Perreault, "Les Clercs de Saint-Viateur et l'Institution des Sourds-Muets, 1848-1930: Berceau de la communauté sourde montréalaise," (unpublished M.A. thesis, University of Ottawa, 1996), 118-119.

⁵¹ Robert M. Buchanan, *Illusions of Equality: Deaf Americans in School and Factory, 1850-1950* (Washington, D.C.: Gallaudet University Press, 1999).

because of the quality of its classroom workbooks, but interest was largely generated by the high quality of the handiwork that showcased the practical dimension of deaf education.



Deaf Boy's School Source: Archives des Clercs de Saint-Viateur de Montréal

3. French Canada's Deaf Schools at the World's Columbian Exposition

Exhibits about education from the United States were gathered in the south gallery of the Hall of Manufactures and Liberal Arts, whereas Canada's exhibits occupied a portion of the southern half of the western gallery reserved for British colonies and dominions. While the distance between the two was not great, Canadian deaf institutions, which had been grouped with the rest of North American deaf institutions in Fay's collection, found themselves isolated from schools in the United States on the floor of the Hall of Manufactures and Liberal Arts. This national division pervaded the Exposition, but it did not fit the internationalist focus of deaf educators, who saw their specialty as a transnational one. Canada's exhibition by deaf schools was thus not reported in the initial report on the exhibits of deaf schools published in the *American Annals of the Deaf*.⁵² This first report was followed by an examination of the schools from other countries in the January 1894 issue of the . It included some other exhibits by U.S. schools not grouped in the collective exhibit, plus exhibits by deaf institutions in Australia, Canada, France, Germany, Japan, Russia,

⁵² Lester Goodman, "The Collective Exhibit of Schools for the Deaf at the World's Columbian Exposition," , 38, 4 (Oct. 1893): 263-273; this exhibit was also commented on by the Australian commissioner in his report: *Report of the Executive Commissioner for New South Wales*, 345-349.

and Spain.⁵³ Three schools from Canada had sent displays: the Ontario Institution in Belleville and Montréal's two Catholic schools.⁵⁴ Commenting on the exhibits assembled by Montréal's institutions, one informed observer of the day wrote:

The Catholic Institution for the Male Deaf of the Province of Quebec, at Mile-End, Montreal, exhibited six volumes of examination papers, four volumes of art work and drawings, and a portrait in crayon of Msgr. Edouard Ch[arle]s. Fabre, Archbishop of Montreal, who is president of the corporation.

The Catholic Institute for the Female Deaf of the Province of Quebec, at Montreal, which received two medals from the Exposition held at Paris, exhibited a large amount of fine work. The Exhibit consisted of twenty-nine copy-books containing work done by fifty-eight pupils, six albums containing twelve photographs, seventeen plans drawn by pupils, wax flowers, hairwork, three pieces of relief-working, twenty-seven designs in drawing and painting, 127 pieces of needlework showing great variety, from the roughest flannel gown to the finest embroidery, and ninety pieces of weaving and knitting; the wool and flax used in the work were spun by the pupils. Seven framed oil-paintings completed the exhibit. The word Canada in wax flowers, the arms of Montreal worked on velvet, and J[acques] Cartier, discoverer of Canada, and his arrival at Quebec in 1535 worked in human hair, were noteworthy among the numerous creditable specimens of this exhibit.⁵⁵

Without a pictorial representation of the exhibits of Canadian schools at the Chicago Exposition, it is necessary to rely on various written accounts by visitors to the Fair to get a mental image of the exhibit. The advantage of such an exercise is that it also gives an idea of what particularly attracted the interest of these visitors. The account given by Lester Goodman above corresponds rather closely to the description given of the exhibit by the school authorities in their own writings.⁵⁶ These materials were displayed for public view in the Institution itself on 17 March 1893, allowing a variety of local ecclesiastics and educators as well as the general public to view it before it was sent to the Chicago Exposition.

⁵³ Goodman, "Exhibits of Schools for the Deaf and Work by the Deaf at the World's Columbian Exposition – II," , 39, 1 (Jan. 1894): 40-46.

⁵⁴ There were seven schools for the deaf in Canada in 1893. In addition to the three schools in Montréal and the Ontario school in Belleville, there was a school in Nova Scotia (Halifax), one in New Brunswick (Fredericton) and one in Manitoba (Winnipeg). Fay (ed.), , vol. III. Clifton F. Carbin, *Deaf Heritage in Canada: A Distinctive, Diverse, and Enduring Culture*, (Toronto: McGraw-Hill, 1996).

⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, 40-41.

⁵⁶ ASP, M10.37 (14), "Chronique de l'Institution des Sourdes-Muettes," I (1851-1906), 278.

The women religious in charge of the school intended to educate the public about their work, but they also wanted to learn from the Columbian Exposition. However, it was beyond their means for all of them to travel to Chicago. The summer of 1893 was spent raising funds among the benefactors of the Institution, and during the early fall the school's chaplains went to Chicago to visit the Exposition.⁵⁷ Interestingly, while the school was under the responsibility of a female congregation, it was the male chaplain and his assistant who travelled. Their clerical status, reinforced by their gender, gave them a level of authority that surpassed that of the sisters' female religious superior. While at the Exposition, the chaplains paid particular attention to the exhibits by schools for the deaf across the world. While in Chicago, they also visited three schools for the deaf situated in the Illinois metropolis and its vicinity. At the Exposition, they paid close attention to the works of industry as well as the workbooks exposed, drawing possible inspiration from what was done elsewhere and bringing that knowledge to the sisters upon their return, in an effort to keep the Institution abreast of the latest pedagogical trends.

In reports written about the Exposition, one observation recurred: the Québec educational exhibit – particularly its schools for the deaf – stressed the necessity to provide pupils with the means of earning a decent living. Nonetheless, the fields in which these deaf graduates were expected to work had little to do with the changing industrial economy. Deaf participation in traditional work spheres was particularly striking, especially in the case of women, whose training chiefly prepared them for domesticity. For the education of the deaf, men and women, progress was couched in terms of their integration into traditional and rigorously gendered economic patterns that did not imply a very active participation of women in the paid workforce. The works exhibited did have an economic impact on the school, however, as orders for woven and sewn pieces came to it from Chicago, Halifax, and New York.⁵⁸

One anonymous visitor remarked on the quality of the pedagogy of the Québec schools, emphasising the progressive nature of their educational methods. His article, published in *Le Petit Figaro*, compared the exhibit of the school for Catholic deaf boys to those of other countries.⁵⁹ He was impressed by the level of skill demonstrated by educators in teaching the deaf as could be seen from the notebooks. He also praised the importance the United States had given to the education of the deaf by the grandeur of

⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, 285-287.

⁵⁸ ASP, M10.37 (14), "Chronique de l'Institution des Sourdes-Muettes," I (1851-1906), 287.

⁵⁹ "Les sourdes-muettes à l'Exposition de Chicago," *Le Petit Figaro*, (Aug. 1, 1893), cited in Langelier, *L'Instruction publique*, 104-5.

the schools' buildings. Yet, he was disappointed by the lack of substance of their exhibit since he was not able to evaluate the pedagogical methods used and the progress made by their pupils in these edifices.⁶⁰

Many reports focused on the more lavish exhibit by the Catholic girls' school. After listing details about the school's programme of studies, the writer of an article in the Montréal newspaper *Le Monde*, expressed his fascination with the quality of the pupils' handiwork and the usefulness such craftiness would hold for their future lives:

Les spécimens destinés à l'exposition sont là pour prouver que, une fois sorties du couvent, les Sourdes-Muettes sont en état de gagner leur vie par leur travail, quel qu'il soit. Il y a par exemple des raccommodages qui sont faits avec une perfection telle, qu'il faut avoir de bons yeux et faire beaucoup d'attention pour s'apercevoir qu'il y a une pièce ou une reprise. Les travaux de fantaisie qui, aujourd'hui, constituent le gagne-pain d'un si grand nombre de personnes, sont une spécialité dans laquelle les Sourdes-Muettes excellent et qui, pour un grand nombre d'entr'elles, sera plus tard l'unique gagne-pain.

L'œuvre des Sourdes-Muettes est admirable et a opéré et opère encore un bien immense dans tout le pays. [...] Les travaux accomplis à L'institution des Sourdes-Muettes ne feront que jeter un nouveau lustre sur l'exposition canadienne déjà si remarquable à tous les points de vue.⁶¹

This excerpt suggests that while much of the work for which the deaf girls were being trained was executed within the domestic sphere, it proved to be an income for many. Indeed, the female deaf institution regularly received orders from Montréal's bourgeois families for fancy lacework and other fashionable decorative objects. These were generally made by elderly former pupils of the institution who had taken residence within its walls, in a section dubbed the "asylum." That the educated pupils could continue earning an income outside the Institution remained quite possible; at the very least, their skills could be useful in fulfilling their role within the family.

⁶⁰ *Ibid.* On the contrary, the New South Wales Commissioner was rather impressed by the capacity of the U.S. exhibit to show the importance of deaf education. *Report of the Executive Commissioner for New South Wales*, 345.

⁶¹ "The specimens sent to the exhibition prove that, once the female deaf-mutes [sic] graduate from the convent, they are able to earn their own living through their work, whatever it may be. There are examples of mending that are done with such perfection that a good eyesight and careful attention are required to notice the repairs. Fancy works, which today enable many to earn their living, is a specialty in which the deaf-mutes excel and this will later become their only income. The deaf institution is admirable and accomplishes considerable good across the country. [...] The work of the deaf-mute institution will shed renewed light on the already remarkable Canadian exhibition." "Exposition des travaux exécutés par les Sourdes-Muettes pour l'exposition de Chicago," *Le Monde* (Montréal) [n.d.], cited in Langelier, *L'Instruction publique*, 58.

The idea of deafness as a handicap compounded the gendered perception of female helplessness, an image that the Institution sometimes cultivated and encouraged among its pupils. This fear of the world had justified the creation, in 1887, of a religious order for deaf women within the Institution.⁶² This attitude was inherent to women's lives in Catholic French Canada, in a society in which the Church shunned worldliness, and yet the Institution prepared deaf women to survive materially.

A writer from *La semaine religieuse*, Montréal's official Catholic newspaper, emphasised the approach adopted for the exhibit organised by the girls' school. Items were "scientifically" laid out, allowing the writer to describe the course of studies.⁶³ He went on to describe how these studies enabled students to acquire a variety of aptitudes to prepare them for life, garnering information from the various workbooks he examined.

Les devoirs de l'Institution des sourdes-muettes offrent une particularité qui mérite d'être relevée. Ils sont rédigés, en effet, de manière à mettre en relief, dans chacun d'eux, la méthode suivie pour éveiller progressivement dans l'esprit de l'élève, le raisonnement, et l'amener successivement de la compréhension des choses visibles à la conception des idées abstraites. Les questions et les réponses, les explications insérées dans ces cahiers des diverses actions effectuées pendant les classes, tout concourt avec un ordre étonnant à faire saisir sans effort, l'heureuse application des moyens employés.⁶⁴

The educators who organised this display were careful to ensure that visitors, who would likely not know about the specifics of deaf education, would get all the information needed to understand the methodology used in "awakening the mind" of pupils. In this way, they displayed the teaching dispensed at the school as being orderly, logical, and progressive in its approach. In this way, these women religious demonstrated a careful attention to detail noticed by many observers who visited the Canadian educational

⁶² Perreault, *Une communauté qui fait signe*; Constantina Mitchell, "Exclusion and Integration: The Case of the Sisters of Providence of Quebec," John V. Van Cleve, (ed.), *Deaf History Unveiled: Interpretations from the New Scholarship* (Washington, D.C.: Gallaudet University Press, 1993), 146-171.

⁶³ "Les écoles des sourds-muets à l'exposition de Chicago," *La semaine religieuse* (Montréal), (Aug. 26, and Sept. 3, 1893), cited in Langelier, *L'Instruction publique*, 125.

⁶⁴ "The workbooks of the institution for female deaf-mutes have an interesting characteristic. They are written in such a way as to emphasise, for each book, the method used in progressively awakening reason in the pupil's mind, and successively bringing her from the understanding of visible things to abstract ideas. Questions and answers, as well as explanations of the various class activities inserted in these workbooks contribute, in a surprisingly orderly fashion, to an effortless understanding the skilful application of the [educational strategies used]." *Ibid.*, 126-127.

exhibit and who made special mention of the girls' school.⁶⁵ Thus, teaching girls did not preclude the use of the most advanced and scientific methods; by comparison, the boys' school's exhibit looked incomplete.

The Sisters of Providence, in designing their exhibit for the Columbian Exposition, were careful to play out both the language of the most up-to-date pedagogical methods used in the deaf educational world and that of French-Canadian pride. This exhibit was unabashedly Catholic in a Protestant country (and continent), going so far as exhibiting a chasuble, a liturgical vestment worn by priests celebrating mass.⁶⁶ While this was to be expected in a Catholic school led by women religious, it clearly stated its core purpose: all this science was used in the greater project of giving God the glory they thought was rightfully his. This fit the French-Canadian national identity at the end of the nineteenth century, defined first by belonging to the Catholic church, before considerations of language.



Deaf Girls' School Source: Archives Historiques Providence, Montréal

⁶⁵ In Langelier's report, 14 excerpts specifically mention the girls' school, while 11 do for the boys'. In the 7 cases in which both schools are mentioned, the description of the exhibit by the institute for female deaf-mutes was much more detailed and laudatory than that of the males.

⁶⁶ "Exposition des travaux," cited in Langelier, *L'Instruction publique*, 57.

4. Portrait of a French Canadian Identity?

French Canadian nationalism and self-consciousness found an expression in the general exhibit about education. Catholic educators of the deaf from Montréal demonstrated progress in their application of well-tested teaching principles, stressing the need for grounding practice in tradition. Using polemical rhetoric that reveals some of the conflicts in the educational milieu in Québec, one author enthused:

L'exposition de Chicago aura pour résultat de faire connaître le système scolaire de notre province et de relever notre réputation dans l'esprit de ceux qui auraient pu croire, sur de fausses données, que nous n'avions rien fait ou à peu près pour répandre l'instruction chez le peuple canadien-français.

Il reste acquis, après tout, si l'on se rappelle les luttes que nous avons eu à soutenir pendant la première moitié de ce siècle, ainsi que l'hostilité ouverte ou déguisée d'une certaine partie de la population à notre égard et à nos moyens pécuniaires, que notre éducation n'est pas restée stationnaire, mais qu'elle a su répondre aux besoins du moment.

Nos collèges ont été les forteresses derrière lesquelles se sont abritées nos libertés menacées, et de ces remparts a fait irruption une nuée d'hommes instruits qui ont combattu les bons combats et défendu nos droits et nos institutions avec un courage et une intelligence qui font aujourd'hui notre orgueil. [...]

Ceux qui croient que l'on peut, du jour au lendemain, révolutionner tout un système d'enseignement, prouvent leur incompétence à juger la grave question de l'éducation. De nouveaux progrès, il y en a à réaliser sans doute, et ils se feront à mesure que s'accumulent les fonds nécessaires à leur réalisation. Au reste, la province de Québec possède assez d'institutions importantes pour croire qu'elle se tiendra à la hauteur des circonstances.

Respectons le passé; travaillons avec sagesse à l'amélioration de la situation présente, ayons foi dans l'avenir. Avec les années, le peuple canadien-français sera, par ses collèges, à la tête des peuples d'Amérique, comme la France a su jadis dominer l'Europe par ses travaux littéraires et la distinction de ses manières.⁶⁷

⁶⁷ “The Chicago exhibition will make our provincial school system better known and will raise its profile in the minds of those who would believe, based on false data, that next to nothing has been done to spread instruction among the French Canadian people. This exhibit demonstrated that, despite the fights we had to sustain during the first half of this century, despite the overt or covert hostility of a certain segment of the population towards us, and despite financial restrictions, education has not remained stagnant in the province, but has been able to meet the challenges of the day. Our colleges have been fortresses for our threatened freedoms, and from their walls poured out a mass of educated men who have fought the good fight, and who have risen to the defense of our rights and our institutions with courage and intelligence, in a way that inspires pride among us. Those who believe that an educational system can be revolutionised overnight prove their

Excerpts like these highlight the role played by Catholic educational institutions in building a strong French-Canadian identity. The text stresses the role of the classical colleges that trained the elite as bulwarks against cultural assimilation. In the tense context of the late nineteenth century, when Canada was rocked by ethno-cultural conflicts over the rights of minorities outside Québec for education in French and in the Catholic faith, such a text resounded with even greater emphasis. Displaying the achievements of educators from Québec and of their pupils at Chicago was thus a clear affirmation of French-Canadian pride in the institutions that gave it strength against the hegemonic forces that seemed to pressure it on all sides.

French Canada's exhibit clearly showcased national and religious pride through its educational institutions. It was rooted in the past with a view to the future. This was particularly the case of deaf education in Montréal. Practical education and industrial training were signs of that progress and they drew the attention of American observers. It led one of them to wonder, after examining the handiwork produced at the deaf girls' school, whether "the advent of machine work has done so very much good after all?"⁶⁸ The Chicago Exhibition represented a culture that believed in education as a solution to social turmoil. Québec exhibitors used that theme to their advantage to show themselves as progressive in their own way, daring to challenge the core values of industrial capitalism while embracing social progress and not abandoning traditional French-Canadian Catholic values.

The deaf schools' exhibits responded to two imperatives. From the global community of deaf educators, they drew inspiration about methods, and their participation in the collective *Histories of American Schools for the Deaf* squarely inserted them in a North American reality that transcended national and even linguistic barriers. On the floor of the mezzanine in the Hall of Manufactures and Liberal Arts, their inclusion in the general Québec educational exhibit, next to the exhibits of other schools led by the same religious orders, stressed their belonging to a national community, but visitors were quick to link these exhibits to the ones of other countries that had deaf schools whose exhibits were nearby.

own incompetence in gauging the delicate issue that is education. New progress must doubtless be made, and it will happen inasmuch as funds are made available. When all is said, the province of Québec is endowed with enough important institutions to face the challenges of the future. Let us respect the past and work wisely towards bettering the present situation, confident in what the future holds for us. Over the years, the French-Canadian people will, through their colleges, lead the peoples of America in the same way France in the past established its domination over Europe through its literary works and its distinguished manners." *Le Courrier de Saint-Hyacinthe* (Sept. 9, 1893) cited in Langelier, *L'Instruction publique*, 137-138.

⁶⁸ "Fair to Look Upon – Quebec Educational Exhibit is Worthy of Notice," *Chicago Tribune* (Sept. 21, 1893) cited in Langelier, *L'Instruction publique*, 202.

The gendered separation of Montréal's Catholic deaf schools, as well as their complete independence from one another, enabled each to design a distinct exhibit. Of the two, the girls' school shone with particular brightness thanks to the handiwork that accompanied the workbooks on display. It emphasised the need for women also to pursue training that would enable them to contribute towards the family income, even though that work was narrowly framed within the possibilities offered to women who were not members of the upper classes. For men, the emphasis seemed to be in showing the possibilities it offered deaf pupils to fully integrate an economy and a society that appeared dominated by small craft and agriculture. In both cases, Catholicism appears as a dominant characteristic for social belonging, and accordingly religious training was paramount. Successful studies were marked by sacraments more than by attaining a diploma.

The care used in bringing together the exhibit showed the educators' deep-seated pride in their religion and their nationality. It suggests that these religious women and men were not immune to the influence of politics and sought to participate in ways that were accessible to them in the project of building a strong ethnic and political identity for French Canada. While this was not entirely surprising for male religious, it questions the traditional image of female religious as removed from worldly debates; at the least, their attitude allowed multiple avenues for social participation. It also suggests that their pupils, while they were being cautioned against the dangers of life outside the convent, were being prepared to tackle the challenges of that life. This was exactly the message that the Chicago Columbian Exposition as a whole was meant to convey in a carefully staged manner. Thus, Québec's religious institutions found an avenue to showcase themselves as progressive and worldly, while holding to traditional religious values in a rapidly industrialising world.

Canadian Catholics and the East Timor Struggle, 1975-99

David WEBSTER

In many situations, Canadian churches carry out their own foreign policy that influences, responds to, and at times works in different directions from the Canadian government.* One such case was the response to the situation in East Timor during Indonesian military occupation from 1975 to 1999. The government of Canada quickly came to side with Indonesia rather than backing Timorese independence movements. Although Christianity and Islam cut across both countries, East Timor was eventually over 80% Catholic and Indonesia over 80% Muslim. This informed a transnational, church-based network that stood in solidarity with the East Timorese independence movement, and played a role in shifting the policy of governments including Canada's. The transnational movement also significantly influenced the language of human rights and redemption-through-suffering used by East Timorese activists, with church ties across borders proving crucial in this development.

East Timor's history as a Portuguese colony shaped its religious and cultural character, but the lusophone Catholic presence affected mostly elite groups, existing as surface appearance alongside continued non-Catholic indigenous practices. That began to change after the Indonesian military invaded in 1975. The government of Canada was aware an invasion was likely, but saw Indonesia as a priority partner in Southeast Asia, and wished to do nothing to rock the boat.¹ With no history of Canadian missionary presence in East Timor, there was no Timor-linked missionary pressure

* Much of the information in this paper comes from interviews and private collections. Thanks for assistance go to Jess Agustin of Development and Peace, Hanadi Loubani and Connie Sorio of KAIROS, Elaine Briere, Maggie Helwig and Kerry Pither, all formerly of the East Timor Alert Network, Joe Gunn, formerly of the Canadian Conference of Catholic Bishops, Bern Jagunos and Daisy Francis, formerly of the Canada Asia Working Group, and others including many Timorese who have been willing to share their experience, especially the late Fr. Hilario Madeira.

¹ Sharon Scharfe, *Complicity: Human Rights and Canadian Foreign Policy, the Case of East Timor* (Montreal: Black Rose Books, 1996); David Webster, *Fire and the*

on Ottawa to change its policies. Canadian Catholic networks did begin to operate, acting in solidarity with Timorese Catholics seen as threatened and in need of overseas succour.

In a quarter-century of Indonesian rule, Timorese adherence to the Catholic church rose from less than a third to account for the vast majority of the population. This was linked to its role as the carrier of a distinct Timorese identity. This article traces four phases. In the first, from 1975 to about 1983, there was minimal support from outside and Timorese complained of the “silence” of the global church. As Timorese bishops, priests, religious and lay people began to be heard internationally through the 1980s, a second phase saw the beginnings of international solidarity. Solidarity took hold in a third phase beginning with a Papal visit to East Timor and an appeal to the United Nations by East Timor’s Bishop Carlos Ximenes Belo in 1989. A fourth phase after the award of the Nobel Peace Prize to Bishop Belo in 1996 saw active support that helped East Timor achieve its independence following the end of Indonesian rule in 1999.

East Timor appeared poised for independence following the end of Portugal’s Salazar-Caetano regime in 1974 and the promise of independence to the colonies. Two main parties contended, with smaller groups including one that aimed at union with Indonesia. The UDT (Timorese Democratic Union) called for eventual independence with a continued link to Portugal, but did not challenge the basis of the existing social system. Fretilin (Revolutionary Front for an Independent East Timor) sought speedier independence, rural reform and popular education on the model of Brazilian educator Paulo Freire. The Portuguese Bishop of Dili diocese (covering the entire colony) opposed Fretilin’s “materialistic and atheistic Communism and socialistic Marxism,” despite the fact that most of its leaders were the product of Jesuit formation at the Dare seminary, East Timor’s only place of higher education. When Indonesian forces invaded in 1975, however, Bishop Ribeiro could see the Timorese suffering mass killings, arrests and torture. The death toll from war and war-induced famine eventually topped 200,000. By 1976, Bishop Ribeiro was calling the Indonesian army “a thousand times worse” than Fretilin. By 1977, a priest wrote, he could take no more. “He is tired. He sees everything reduced to ashes; all the values are shattered, and Christian family life is betrayed.”²

Full Moon: Canada and Indonesia in a Decolonizing World (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2009).

² Jill Jolliffe, *East Timor: Nationalism and Colonialism* (St Lucia: University of Queensland Press, 1978); John Taylor, *Indonesia’s Forgotten War: The Hidden History of East Timor* (London: Zed Books, 1991); Juan Federer, “The Catholic Church in East Timor: Its Lone Struggle for Justice” (unpublished paper, 1994), 27; Peter Carey, “The Catholic Church, Religious Revival and the Nationalist Movement in East Timor,

With Bishop Ribeiro granted permission to retire, Timorese priests nominated Martinho da Costa Lopes to head up the Dili diocese. The appointment called for a delicate Vatican balancing act. Indonesia claimed to have integrated East Timor as its 27th province and the Indonesian bishops' conference asked that Dili be added to their purview, but the United Nations still saw East Timor as Portuguese territory with the right to self-determination. Therefore the Pope named himself bishop of Dili, with the native-born Msgr. da Costa Lopes as "apostolic administrator." This middle course evaded the call of the Indonesian bishops without risking offence to Indonesia. Under the tenure of Msgr. da Costa Lopes, Timorese flocked to become Catholics. The church provided "a thread of continuity, a link with the past" and acted as "the repository and protector of the cultural values of the people [and] their servant and advocate." It became a voice for silenced Timorese, as one writer has said,

[...] interpreting their aspirations and seeking to defend individuals against the persistent violation of their human rights, and the nation against its assimilation into, or suffocation by, a foreign culture.... Church membership has become a symbol of Timorese identity to such an extent that there has been a fusion of the religious and the secular, a merging of Catholicism and nationalism. The Church has offered to the Timorese people whatever consolation and fellowship it could in their time of grief, and a spiritual context for the experience of suffering. It has been able to articulate and express their pain.³

East Timor underwent a profound religious transformation in this period. Some Portuguese priests fled, but others – and the native Timorese priests – remained with the people and shared their experience. Anyone could hear the anguish in the voice of Msgr. da Costa Lopes as he spoke later from exile about women being raped in front of their families, and recounted other horrors. Amidst death and routine daily violations of basic human rights, people came to identify with the Catholic church. The identification was extended with masses in traditional sacred (*lulik*) spaces. Of enormous significance, the church chose to develop a new liturgy in Tétun, one of the indigenous vernacular languages. Tétun thereby began to develop into a new national language for the Timorese, through its use in the mass and its role as the common language used by guerrilla members of Fretilin. The church meanwhile accepted a rapprochement with Fretilin, symbolized by a secret meeting between Msgr. da Costa Lopes and resistance leader José

1975-98," Indonesia and the Malay World 77: 77-95; letter from a Timorese priest, 13 Oct.1977, in Torben Retboll, (ed.), *East Timor, Indonesia and the Western Democracies: A Collection of Documents* (Copenhagen: IWGIA, 1980).

³ Pat Smythe, "The Catholic Church in East Timor," in Torben Retboll, (ed.), *East Timor: Occupation and Resistance* (Copenhagen: IWGIA, 1998), 154-8.

Xanana Gusmão, who insisted that the church's "prophetic mission ... is to support the people in their struggle for liberation."⁴

Recalling this period of trial, Bishop Belo would later compare the church to "a mother" who "deeply understands its children's pains, sorrows and suffering." The church grew partly because it accepted some synthesis with indigenous beliefs and carried Timorese identity in a time of trial, he said.

You know, even as animists, the Timorese community have their vision, their beliefs, so that even as animists, we call them here 'genteels,' they believe in one God. They believe also in the eternal life of the souls of their relatives. And when they are presented with the opportunity to become Catholics, I see that there is a similarity between the Catholic faith and the local religious beliefs. Many people feel that it is natural to become Catholics and we see that our people have a simple faith but are very, very profound in this faith. Not intellectual, not theoretical but a kind of emotional faith, a living faith.⁵

The major complaint of the church in East Timor in this period was that the church outside did not hear them or stand with them. During Msgr. da Costa Lopes' term, only one international message of support arrived. "Only one letter during 8 years, but it was good for us because this letter gave us comfort in our suffering," he recalled. In 1981, a letter from religious communities mourned being "suddenly thrown into emptiness and isolation.... We felt stunned by this silence which seemed to allow us to die deserted." Msgr. da Costa Lopes began to speak out publicly against Indonesian military actions "in accordance with the Church's prophetic mission" at a mass of 12,000 people in honour of Our Lady of Fatima.⁶

⁴ Audiotape of Msgr. da Costa Lopes interview in author's possession; *East Timor: An International Responsibility* (London: Catholic Institute for International Relations, 1992), 16; Carey, "The Catholic Church"; Arnold Kohen, "The Catholic Church and the Independence of East Timor," in Richard Tanter, Mark Selden and Stephen R. Shalom, *Bitter Flowers, Sweet Flowers: East Timor, Indonesia and the World Community* (Sydney: Pluto Press Australia, 2001), 49 Xanana letter to a priest, 27 June 1986, in East Timor News Dossier (Hong Kong) 1 #4 (Sept. 1987) Elaine Briere papers (private collection, Vancouver); Rowena Lennox, *Fighting Spirit of East Timor: The Life of Martinho da Costa Lopes* (Annandale NSW: Pluto Press Australia, 2000), 190.

⁵ Belo, cited in Timor Link #33 (June 1995); text of video interview with Belo, 1994, East Timor Alert Network (hereafter ETAN) papers (private collection, Toronto).

⁶ Msgr. da Costa Lopes cited in Pat Walsh, "Timor Prelate Visits Australia," in Torben Retboll, (ed.), *East Timor: The Struggle Continues* (Copenhagen: IWGIA document collection, 1984); letter from the Religious of East Timor, 1981, in *The Church and East Timor: A Collection of Documents by National and International Catholic Church Agencies* (Catholic Commission for Justice, Development and Peace, Melbourne Archdiocese, 1993), 13-15; Robert Archer, "The Catholic Church in East Timor," in

Vatican policy on Timor in this period was dictated by the needs and fears of the church in Indonesia, where it was a small and vulnerable minority. The Suharto dictatorship appeared as a shield against the Muslim majority. Delegates to an Asian bishops' conference noted that the dominant theme of Christian-Muslim tensions throughout the continent was fear: "fear of a minority group towards a majority." Indonesian Catholics often acted as their government's advocates in international forums, including church networks. They were, in the words of one dissident Catholic intellectual, "trapped in a minority complex." Calling East Timor a test case for the Indonesian church, one Jesuit wrote: "remember, we are not a heroic community. We are a cross section of society, weak and fearful like most people." Given this context, the nuncio in Jakarta consistently sought to downplay Timorese advocacy. In 1983, acting on pressure from Defence Minister Benny Murdani, a Catholic general, Nuncio Pablo Puentes orchestrated the removal of Msgr. da Costa Lopes from Dili in favour of a handpicked successor expected to be more docile.⁷

This context of silence and Jakarta-based manoeuvring sharply reduced the prospect of a strong response on East Timor from the church hierarchy. Solidarity groups formed in this period were mainly isolated secular organizations, their ties to church-based groups uneasy. Pope John Paul II embraced the oppositional role of the church in his Polish homeland, where communism threatened the church's survival, but his personal commitment to human rights did not always affect policy. As Portuguese Bishop Manuel Martins said, "the Pope is a prisoner of the Vatican." The Vatican had diplomatic imperatives that seemed important to its global diplomatic corps, with the protection of minority Catholics in non-Christian majority countries like Indonesia seeming to be the priority, and good relations with these governments vital to maintain. As a result, there were few public advocacy efforts from the Vatican. Church channels were most important not for exerting public pressure, but rather for the dissemination of information from East Timor while it was closed to the outside world.⁸

Peter Carey & G. Carter Bentley, *East Timor at the Crossroads: The Forging of a Nation* (London: Cassell, 1995), 122-3; Federer, "Catholic Church in East Timor," 29.

⁷ Statement of the second bishops institute on inter-religious affairs of the Federation of Asian Bishops Conferences, Kuala Lumpur, 20 Nov. 1979, in *For All the Peoples of Asia: The Church in Asia, Asian Bishops' Statements on Mission, Community and Ministry, 1970-1983* (Manila: IMC Publications, 1984); Federer, "Catholic Church in East Timor"; Patrick A. Smythe, "*The Heaviest Blow*": *The Catholic Church and the East Timor Issue* (Münster: LIT Verlag, 2004), 69, 38 and passim; David Webster, "New Bishop Joins Nobel Prize Winner in Work for Timorese Independence," *Catholic New Times*, 20 April 1997, 14; interview with Msgr. da Costa Lopes, *TAPOL Bulletin* 69 (Sept. 1983).

⁸ Arnold Kohen & Stephen Baranyi, "East Timor: Keeping the Issue Alive, Working with the Timorese and Beginning to Shift Policy," in *Making Solidarity Effective: Northern Voluntary Organizations, Policy Advocacy and the Promotion of Peace in Angola and*

In distant Canada, there was no East Timorese community to make it an issue within the church, as it became in Portugal and Australia. Nor had any Canadian missionary society worked in East Timor – there was none of the missiological context that informed Canadian attitudes towards China, Japan or India. The Canadian government lined up with its allies to back the pro-Western Suharto regime and to seek trade and investment opportunities. Development aid in 1975-76 reached a record level of \$36.7-million, placing Indonesia third among Canada's bilateral aid recipients. Officials in Ottawa saw East Timor as a “lost cause,” meaning the best thing was to forget the whole issue. Visiting Jakarta in 1983, Prime Minister Pierre Trudeau said East Timor “raised the problem of self-determination of peoples” but that “on balance we decided that stability of the region should be the foremost concern and thus had supported Indon[esia].” The United States, Britain, Australia and Japan also became key backers of the Suharto regime. In each of these countries, the church was circumscribed by their country's foreign policy and by the relatively weak position of Catholics in the country from taking an oppositional position over East Timor.⁹ Although Canadian government policy also supported the Indonesian government, the Canadian church was less circumscribed. In Quebec especially, it was willing to confront the government when necessary, with the 1949 Asbestos strike as a foundational event. “The bishops now played the role of societal goads rather than overlords,” Terence Fay has noted. Canada's church appeared globally as relatively progressive, seeing “the potential of the church to be an expression of God's love, that is, a sacrament of human rights to build a more humane Canada.” The Social Affairs Commission of the Canadian Conference of Catholic Bishops in 1983 reaffirmed the principle that labour came ahead of capital, with Bishop John Sherlock of London noting that the bishops “are moving to clear-cut condemnation of capitalism.” Yet there were many louder calls on the thin social justice resources of the CCCB than East

East Timor (London: CIIR discussion paper, 1997), 36; Arnold S. Kohen, *From the Place of the Dead: The Epic Struggles of Bishop Belo of East Timor* (New York: St Martin's Press, 1999), 96, 113; Smythe, *Heaviest Blow*, 20, 196; interviews.

⁹ Geoffrey B. Hainsworth, *Innocents Abroad or Partners in Development: An Evaluation of Canada-Indonesia Aid, Trade and Investment Relations* (Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies, 1986); David Morrison, “The Choice of Bilateral Aid Recipients,” in Cranford Pratt, (ed.), *Canadian Development Assistance Policies: An Appraisal* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1994), 132; Library and Archives Canada (hereafter LAC), External Affairs departmental memorandum by W.T. Delworth, 9 Oct. 1979, RG25, vol. 8664, file 20-TIMOR [6]; “Twenty Years in East Timor: A Chronological Overview” [1994], Department of Foreign Affairs file 20-TIMOR, obtained through access to information.

Timor, whether internal debates such as the position of women in the church, or the closer call of justice issues in Latin America or South Africa.¹⁰

Canadian Catholic support thus came mainly through the channel of global development agencies. The major channel here was the Canadian Catholic Organization for Development and Peace (D&P), formed in response to Pope Paul VI's statement that "development is the new name for peace." The Suharto regime's main legitimizing factor was the promise of economic development (*pembangunan*) but the regime understood development to mean channelling popular participation out of politics and into state-led development. This approach led to clashes in East Timor. Bishop Belo, once he took over as the head of Dili diocese in 1983, leaned on Catholic social teaching in seeking development that was "truly human in character." Development, he wrote, too often becomes "an ideology and justification for violating the basic rights of the people." The Asia Partnership for Human Development, a church-based agency formed in the early 1970s with D&P as a founding member, proved willing to call for international pressure for human rights in East Timor. Asian bishops in 1970 called for the church to be "more truly the Church of the poor," to work for "the total development of our peoples" and to "eradicate injustice."¹¹

This language, rooted in Catholic social teaching, lined up well with CCCB thinking embodied in such documents as "Northern Development: At What Cost?" issued in 1975 on the problems with "development" inside Canada. The vision of human-centred development formed the guiding vision of D&P. "We truly belong to Christ in as much as we share with compassion in the misery and the sufferings of the poor," the Canadian bishops wrote in their pastoral letter on the new agency in 1968. Forty years later, D&P remained "an effective means for the Catholic Church in Canada to express its preferential love for the poor, the marginalized and the oppressed." Indonesia barred foreign aid agencies from East Timor until 1989, but D&P backed such efforts as Arnold Kohen's East Timor Research

¹⁰ Terence J. Fay, *A History of Canadian Catholics: Gallicanism, Romanism and Canadianism* (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2002), 250-1, 282, 301; Eric O. Hanson, *The Catholic Church in World Politics* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987), 113, 411; Renate Pratt, *In Good Faith: Canadian Churches Against Apartheid* (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1997); interviews.

¹¹ Joe Gunn, "Did a Pope's Letter Change Canada's church?" *Catholic Register*, 26 Oct. 2007; Ali Murtopo, *The Acceleration and Modernization of 25 Years' Development* (Jakarta: Yayasan Proklomasi, 1973); Carlos Filipe Ximenes Belo, *The Road to Freedom: A Collection of Speeches, Pastoral Letters and Articles* (Sydney: Caritas Australia, 2001), 15-16, 35; "East Timor and Self-Determination," Asia Partnership for Human Development newsletter #22 (July-August 1983); Smythe, *Heaviest Blow*, 27; *East Timor: A Christian Reflection* (London: CIIR, 1987), 9; Christians in Solidarity with East Timor, "East Timor's Struggle: The Church Responds" (Melbourne, n.d.).

Project founded in Washington in 1979. In Canada, the voice of East Timor was starting to be heard.¹²

When Carlos Belo replaced Msgr. da Costa Lopes as apostolic administrator in Dili, Vatican officials hoped he would prove a less confrontational figure. A Timorese-born Salesian priest, Belo had been at seminary in Portugal since before the invasion. He was not the choice of Timorese priests as his predecessor had been, and many of them boycotted his installation ceremony. Belo had the confidence of the Pope, however. His status was confirmed when he was subsequently named as titular bishop of the extinct see of Lorium, a move that gave him the full rank of bishop but avoided the issue of whether his real diocese, Dili, lay in Indonesian territory. He began with a low-profile pastoral approach, quietly doing what he could to protect those at risk of torture, arrest and other human rights violations. In an atmosphere of fear and intimidation, anything more was dangerous. Belo spoke out publicly in a pastoral letter to mark UN Human Rights Day on 10 December 1988. “We do not agree with this barbarous system and condemn the lying propaganda which claims there is no abuse of human rights in Timor,” he wrote. Belo’s credibility in church channels, access to the informal church-sponsored network based in Washington, and communications skills gave him excellent access to the world media for this and other statements.¹³

Bishop Belo was no fiery liberation theologian. His homilies, speeches and pastoral letters were very deliberately grounded in Papal encyclicals. His central message was that “the people are the church, the church is the people.” The role of the church in East Timor, he said, was “to defend the human people, human dignity, justice.” He later described his theology as “contextual, liberating, and characteristically Timorese.” It preached unity of all Timorese, not an effort to level social class. In calling for inclusion of the laity, it accepted acculturation with pre-Christian traditions. The church was to avoid political involvement, standing above politics as a mediating and unifying voice. Belo laid special stress on the “sacred responsibility” to protect and promote human rights as a constitutive aspect of Catholic mission. Lacking a staff, Belo’s pastoral letters and statements in this area drew on an informal international network of advisors working within Catholic organizations overseas, including the D&P networks. The vision

¹² Fay, *History of Canadian Catholics*, 270; “Letter on the Mission of Development and Peace,” October 2007, D&P theology committee; CCCB pastoral letter on 40th anniversary of Development and Peace, 6 May 2007; interviews.

¹³ Interviews; Federer, “Catholic Church in East Timor”; Archer, “Catholic Church in East Timor”; Belo pastoral letter, 10 Dec. 1988, Canada-Asia Working Group (hereafter CAWG) *Currents* 11 #2 (July 1989), 2; Kohen, *Place of the Dead*, 135.

was Belo's own, but the wording often drew on an unofficial social justice staff overseas.¹⁴

A major turning point came in February 1989 when Bishop Belo wrote to UN Secretary-General Javier Perez de Cuellar to request UN support for a referendum in East Timor. "For our part, we, the people of Timor, think that we must be consulted on the future of our land," he wrote. The world community, he said, had failed in its duty to seek peace and self-determination. Meanwhile, "we continue to die as a people and as a nation." The letter ended any remaining doubts in the Timorese church about Belo, drawing universal support from priests and religious in the country. In a follow-up letter appealing to Bishop Martins of Portugal to press the UN for a response, Belo reported he was under enormous criticism in Indonesia for his words.

The Christian people pray, while hiding letters under the statues of the Saints, and hope that the happy day will come when they can freely express their aspirations as free men. Excellency, please pray for me because from one day to the next I may meet the same fate as Monsignor Romero.¹⁵

The letter risked Belo's life, but became in his biographer's words "a decisive document in recasting the terms of debate on the East Timor issue" that for years after "remained a benchmark of an acceptable solution." Bishop Belo never retracted this call for a referendum, and it shaped the future direction of East Timor's history significantly. In a telephone press conference six years later, his voice crackled over the line as he responded to a question on whether a referendum was still needed. "You should ask the people," he said. "Please ask them!"¹⁶

International church support for this initiative was ambiguous. The Pope offered periodic defences of Timorese cultural rights, and personal words of encouragement to Bishop Belo. On one of Belo's *ad limina* visits, the Pope told Belo to "work for the church, to fight the suffering of the people, and seek for a right solution for peace in Timor."¹⁷ Vatican political structures, however, tried to balance the needs of the Timorese and Indonesian churches. The Jakarta nuncio dismissed Bishop Belo's UN letter as personal and unrepresentative of the church; the chair of the Indonesian Conference of

¹⁴ Interviews; Belo, "Making peace through reconciliation: the contribution of the churches to the peace process in East Timor," address to the Katholische Akademie, Munich, Oct. 2001, courtesy Development & Peace.

¹⁵ Belo letter to Manuel Martins, bishop of Setubal, 27 June 1989, Briere papers.

¹⁶ Kohen, *Place of the Dead*, 138; telephone press conference with Bishop Belo, Dec. 1995.

¹⁷ *East Timor: An International Responsibility* (London: CIIR, 1992); *East Timor: A Christian Reflection* (London: CIIR, 1987); interviews.

Catholic Bishops urged “the wisdom of silence.” When Bishop Martins in Portugal and Bishop Aloysius Nobuo Soma in Japan collected the signatures of 160 bishops from around the world on a letter of support for Belo’s appeal, Vatican Secretary of State Casaroli forbade them from sending it to the UN. This was in keeping with an earlier directive to the Australian bishops to be “non-cooperative” with activism in support of East Timor and the early role of the US-run Catholic Relief Services in working with the Indonesian government in East Timor. Despite the official silence, however, the Vatican had allowed a protest to be registered, but not placed on the official record. Meanwhile some bishops simply sent individual letters to the UN on behalf of people in their dioceses – among them Bishop Remi De Roo of Victoria. The CCCB’s human rights committee also backed the appeal.¹⁸

Vatican balancing was on full display when the Pope visited Indonesia in 1989, a tour that he insisted include East Timor. A vast open-air mass in Dili welcomed 100,000 people, a substantial proportion of the entire Timorese population. The Pope kissed the ground on arrival in Indonesia. All of John Paul’s travels were weighted with strong symbolic power, and enormous symbolic weight went to whether he would kiss the ground on arriving in East Timor. In the event he kissed a cross placed on the altar, satisfying those in the Indonesian Catholic establishment who wanted him not to kiss the soil of East Timor on arrival, as well as East Timorese who saw the kiss of the Holy Cross as a symbolic kiss of the entire “Rai Santa Cruz” (land of the Holy Cross, East Timor). John Paul’s homily struck a balance too, calling for respect for human rights but avoiding strong language. After the mass ended, a small group of young Timorese unfurled pro-independence banners. Indonesian soldiers waded into the crowd and beat them while the Pope and his retinue looked on. These events shocked many, and may have led to a shift in the Pope’s personal interest in the East Timor cause.¹⁹

While Catholics in Europe and North America were increasingly willing to speak out on East Timor, Asian bishops sympathized on human rights grounds but preferred silence. The ambiguous position of the Dili diocese

¹⁸ Federer, “Catholic Church in East Timor,” 31; Smythe, *Heaviest Blow*, 60-1, 94; Lennox, *Fighting Spirit*, 147; CAWG *Currents* 11 #3 (Sept 1989); Soma letter to Asia-Pacific bishops, 1989, in *The Church and East Timor*, 35-6; Remi De Roo to Javier Pérez de Ceullar, 29 June 1990, Briere papers; CCCB human rights committee statement on East Timor, 4 July 1990, in *The Church and East Timor*, 39.

¹⁹ Interviews; CAWG *Currents* 11 #2 (July 1989); Agostino Bono, “Measuring the Political Dimensions of a Papal Kiss,” *Catholic New Times*, 5 Nov. 1989; Hanson 5-6; Pope’s homily in Dili, 12 Oct. 1989, http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/john_paul_ii/homilies/1989/documents/hf_jp_ii_hom_19891012_dili_en.html, accessed 17 April 2008; *Timor Link* #20-21 (Jan-Feb. 1990); Kohen, *Place of the Dead*, 145-6; Belo, “Penetrating the Darkness of Hatred,” speech delivered to Pio Manzu International Research Center, Remini, Italy, 29 October 2000.

meant it was never part of the Asian bishops' conferences. The first words of support from the Indonesian bishops' conference came in 1983 after a meeting with Bishop Belo. The bishops expressed their "solidarity" with the Timorese, but cited "Indonesian-style prophetic action" as requiring avoidance of any sort of confrontation or criticism of the government. A typical example of the problems within Asia-wide bodies came in the ecumenical Christian Conference of Asia. When the CCA's New Delhi Assembly in 1984 expressed "solidarity with the church and the people of East Timor in their struggle for peace and justice," the Indonesian delegation walked out. When East Timor was discussed again at the 1985 CCA assembly in Seoul, the Indonesians withdrew from the organization's decision-making bodies in protest, denouncing the CCA's "leftist, revolutionary, radical and militant features." Indonesia's Communion of [Protestant] Churches criticized the CCA for preferring a vision of Christ as being on the side of the poor and marginalized, rather than one of all people saved and reconciled through Christ.²⁰

On the other hand, the East Timorese church was increasingly able to win support outside Asia. With Msgr. da Costa Lopes in exile, Bishop Belo asked him to "pray for us, and launch an appeal to the free world to open its eyes to the barbarities of which the Indonesians are capable." This letter leant the full weight of the East Timorese church to the words of its former bishop. Msgr. da Costa Lopes kept up a busy schedule in the 1980s, touring Europe, Australia, Japan and the United States. He was able to spur the creation in 1985 of an international Christian Consultation on East Timor, and convince colleagues to write support letters to Bishop Belo of the sort he had never received himself. In international discourse on East Timor the voice of the church, with its message of human rights and deliverance from suffering, began to displace the voice of the guerrilla resistance, which had used the third-worldist language of liberation from colonialism. In place of the early Fretelin links to the People's Republic of China, the church inspired a turn to common identification with the cause of other suffering people, including those of Tibet.²¹

²⁰ Indonesian bishops conference letter to Bishop Belo and the priests and religious of Dili diocese, 17 November 1983, in Retboll, *The Struggle Continues*, 183; Federer, "Catholic Church in East Timor," 37; Pat Smythe, "Bishop Belo: Advocate for Justice," in Retboll, *Occupation and Resistance*, 164; Yokoyama Masaki, "The Asian Ecumenical Youth Movement and the ET Issue," (unpublished paper, n.d.); "Resolution of the Central Board of the Communion of Churches in Indonesia regarding our participation in the CCA", 20 June 1986, Briere papers.

²¹ Belo to da Costa Lopes, 1983, in *The Church and East Timor*, 16; Lennox, *Fighting Spirit*, 209; Kohen & Baranyi, 37; David Webster, "Non-State Diplomacy: East Timor 1975-99," *Portuguese Studies Review* 11 #1 (Fall-Winter 2003): 1-28.

This sort of language was carried into Canada, where public interest was low. As one government official noted, “Indonesia is not a sufficiently flagrant violator to attract the attention of the public as some other countries do.” Canadian awareness rose in 1985 when Amnesty International launched a campaign on human rights in East Timor to mark ten years of occupation. Amnesty’s Canadian campaign in Canada was coordinated by members of the Nova Scotia East Timor Group, the first dedicated solidarity group in Canada. It included among other things the first Canadian Conference of Catholic Bishops letter on East Timor to the Canadian government. The letter went privately and the CCCB declined requests to make the text public, but it still signalled the start of concern from the leadership of the Canadian church. Two new solidarity groups formed in the 1980s, both with funds from ecumenical church coalitions: the Indonesia East Timor Programme in Ontario, and the East Timor Alert Network in British Columbia. ETAN would in time become the national network of Canadians concerned with East Timor, always with core funding from the Catholic, Anglican, United and Presbyterian churches. It worked closely with the Canada Asia Working Group, a Toronto-based ecumenical coalition, and with other coalitions such as Ten Days for World Development.²²

These groups, while small, did begin to be noticed in Ottawa. To meet the growing volume of letters, the Department of External Affairs produced a background paper on East Timor, which acknowledged severe human rights issues in 1975-80, but argued the situation was improving. The best way to advance human rights was to increase Canadian engagement with Indonesia. Canada under Prime Minister Brian Mulroney continued to back Indonesia’s rule of East Timor as “an accomplished and irreversible fact.” However, church-driven lobbies in Canada were beginning to be heard by their government.²³

By the 1990s, the Catholic church in East Timor was playing three key roles. It was a space for dissent, a shield against human rights violations, and an alternative voice for people-centred development. The role of churches as space outside state control has been evident in numerous repressive states,

²² International NGO Forum on Indonesian Development record of meeting with Canadian delegation to Inter-Governmental Group on Indonesia, The Hague, 17-18 June 1988, Briere papers; interviews; William J. Ryan, general secretary of CCCB, to Julia Morrigan, 17 Dec 1985, Indonesia East Timor Programme (IETP) papers (private collection, Toronto); Amnesty International Canadian Bulletin, March 1986; “East Timor Campaign Update,” by Audrey Samson & Bill Owen,” 26 June 1985; “Ten Days’ Helping Publicize Timor Tragedy,” *Arrowsmith Star*, 3 February 1987.

²³ LAC, External Affairs to Jakarta, 8 Nov. 1984, RG25, file 20-INDON-2-2; “East Timor,” External Affairs and International Trade backgrounder, Jan. 1986; Joe Clark to Christine Stewart MP, 13 Oct. 1989; Jakarta telegram 242, 28 April 1987, all in ETAN papers.

from communist Poland and East Germany to the Philippines under Marcos and South Africa under apartheid. As “an indigenous institutional and cultural expression against an outside occupying force,” the church stands outside state control, offering one of the few independent spaces for civil society. Bishop Belo called protecting the church’s flock a gospel calling, and worked hard to prevent reprisals against clandestine pro-independence activists. The ever-closer identification of church and Timorese nation led the Indonesian authorities to directly attack the church and Catholic religion for the first time starting in the mid-1990s. “Call on your Jesus to come down and save you,” one torturer mocked a young activist. Another drew crosses on a woman’s naked body as she was beaten. Indonesian soldiers entered a mass, took communion then spat out and trampled on the host, smashed a statue of the Virgin Mary, and otherwise targeted symbols of faith and identity.²⁴

With the ground prepared by the Pope’s visit and Bishop Belo’s letter in 1989, East Timor hit world headlines on 12 November 1991 when Indonesian soldiers massacred more than 250 unarmed protesters at the Santa Cruz cemetery in Dili. Tensions had been running high in the preceding weeks, prompting the Catholic Agency for Overseas Development (CAFOD) to initiate an international bishops’ letter stressing grave concern for the safety of Timorese people and calling for an international protection force. Twenty bishops including Jean-Guy Hamelin of Rouyn-Noranda for the CCCB signed the appeal. Days later, the feared massacre took place. For the first time, international journalists were there. Footage aired around the world, including on CBC. A flood of bishops’ conference statements followed. Australian and American bishops in particular became more willing to go on the record, and the Japanese bishops made their first statement as a group. The Vatican’s observer at the UN reported that the news had “deeply touched the Holy See.” As the Indonesian government tried to minimize the scale of the massacre, a fact-finding mission from the Indonesian bishops’ conference reported the death toll was far higher than the government would admit, and that troops had opened fire on defenceless protesters.²⁵ Solidarity also rose in Asia. A 1994 Asia Pacific Conference on East Timor opened in Manila with Cardinal Jaime Sin pointing to parallels with the role of the

²⁴ Carey, “The Catholic Church,” 90; Pratt 205; Paul Christopher Manuel, Lawrence C. Reardon and Clyde Wilcox, (eds.), *The Catholic Church and the Nation-State* (Washington: Georgetown University Press, 2006), 101; “Report on Torture in East Timor” (Toronto: ETAN, 1991); torture photos in ETAN papers.

²⁵ Bishops’ appeal, 6 Nov. 1991, author’s files; Federer, “Catholic Church in East Timor,” 41; Smythe, *Heaviest Blow*, 136, 154; Indonesian bishops statement on fact-finding mission, 1991, in *The Church and East Timor*, 52-3; “Church Group: 100 Die in East Timor Massacre,” *Montreal Gazette*, 30 Nov. 1991; Tracy Early, “East Timor in Spotlight,” *Prairie Messenger*, 9 Dec. 1991.

Philippine church during the years of the Marcos dictatorship. “Our faith tells us that it is Christ who suffers everytime human rights are trampled upon,” he wrote in a letter to Bishop Belo. Bishop Soma of Japan spoke on the “long, terrible road of suffering” walked by the Timorese. A settlement, he said, could not be left to governments since they “have as their primary concern selfish goals that they refer to as their ‘national interest,’ goals which have little to do with justice, peace or love for one’s fellow human beings.” This assertion of a duty to independent foreign policymaking signalled the increasing influence on the East Timor issue exerted by non-governmental organizations, including transnational church-based networks.²⁶

Meanwhile secular solidarity groups in Canada saw an influx of support. The Mulroney government, stung by public concern over the Santa Cruz massacre just weeks after the prime minister had declared at a Commonwealth conference “we shall no longer subsidize repression and the stifling of democracy,” suspended three future aid projects for Indonesia. Indonesia remained a trade priority, however, with two-way trade up 47% over the course of 1992. Without announcing it (again to avoid offending Jakarta), External Affairs Minister Barbara McDougall imposed an informal embargo on arms exports to Indonesia and instructed the embassy in Jakarta to highlight “rising public concern” in Canada over East Timor. The government began to look for aid projects that could be opened inside East Timor, as a means to demonstrate concern without opposing Indonesian rule. The Canadian International Development Agency offered Development and Peace funds to open a project, but withdrew the offer when D&P insisted that Canada offer protection for Timorese partners. “We weighed, we discussed, we cried over it,” one D&P staffer recalled. In the end, the demands of solidarity won out over the demands of development.²⁷

From 1989, D&P began looking at projects inside East Timor. Two major projects allowed the Dili diocese to function more effectively, reaching and involving more lay people in its work. First was a radio station that “enabled it to keep in touch with its parishioners and inform them of events in ways which were not possible before.” Second was a diocesan peace and justice commission that provided “the means of documenting the ongoing human rights abuses and liasing more effectively with human rights groups outside East Timor.” Both projects opened in the mid-1990s

²⁶ Interviews; Sin letter to Belo, *Timor Link* #7 (Oct. 1986); Soma and Sin statements from APCET *Report and Proceedings* (Manila, 1994).

²⁷ Mulroney speech at Commonwealth heads of government meeting in Harare, Zimbabwe, 16 Oct. 1991; Chris Dagg, “Linking Aid to Human Rights in Indonesia: A Canadian Perspective,” *Issues* 7 #1 (Winter 1993); David Webster, “Canada Expands Export of Military Goods to Indonesia,” *Catholic New Times*, 25 June 1995, 13; Jakarta telegram, 20 Nov. 1991, DFAIT file 20-TIMOR; interviews.

and were possible only with D&P's ongoing support. The group went on to fund a wide range of civil society organizations, some clandestinely to avoid Indonesian government detection. This support continues after independence, primarily directed at women's organizations. D&P also sponsored Bishop Belo's 1993 visit to Canada, continuing the development of "a personal, real relationship." Belo was able to convince the Canadian government to provide a small grant for a new seminary, a key independent educational institution outside Indonesian government control. Direct lobbying was left to the secular groups like ETAN, backed by an annual D&P grant, and the Toronto-based ecumenical Canada Asia Working Group.²⁸

The CCCB, too, became more willing to speak on East Timor. There had been letters of support to Bishop Belo from the CCCB human rights committee in 1990 and from CCCB president Archbishop Marcel Gervais of Ottawa in 1992, but Belo's visit established a personal connection. Until 1994, the social affairs office at the CCCB concentrated on advocacy work on economic justice within Canada; after that it was more willing to address international human rights causes rather than delegating the bulk of that work to D&P and CAWG. The commitment born of justice work within Canada translated well to international solidarity. In 1996, the CCCB social affairs commission issued a statement offering strong support for Bishop Belo and the Timorese church, calling on Indonesian troops to withdraw, and asking the Canadian government to work for a negotiated solution and impose an arms embargo on Indonesia. This last demand, spelled out in an ETAN campaign that gained CCCB support, signalled a more supportive working relationship with the secular solidarity movement.²⁹

A similar phenomenon was seen in the East Timor Hope Foundation, a joint project by ETAN members and committed local Catholics in Windsor, Ontario that aimed to "foster a spirit of hope, financial and material assistance, and an offering of partnership between Canadians and East Timorese." It also forged a link between Saint Vincent de Paul parish in Windsor and the parish of Suai in East Timor, including bringing Suai's priest Fr. Hilario Madeira to Windsor for a three-month pastoral exchange in 1995. "Father Larry," as locals called him, died in 1999 at the hands of pro-Indonesia militias as he tried to prevent the massacre of people taking shelter in his church. "[H]e died doing what he was supposed to be doing,

²⁸ Carey 91; interviews; D&P 2006-11 program, Program of Support for Civil Society in Asia, http://www.devp.org/devpme/documents/eng/pdf/ProgramAsia2011_ENG.pdf, accessed 17 August 2008.

²⁹ Archbishop Marcel Gervais to Belo, 20 Jan. 1992, in *The Church and East Timor*, 58; interviews; CCCB Episcopal Commission on Social Affairs message, 18 July 1996; Foreign Affairs e-mail to Canadian embassy Jakarta, 2 Nov. 1998, DFAIT file 20-TIMOR; Belo, *Road*, 17.

protecting his flock,” a Windsor priest said. “The blood of martyrs is the seedbed of the church, but it’s not supposed to happen to people you know. It’s supposed to happen to those nameless people over there.”³⁰ The issue increasingly became a concern for other Canadian churches. The ecumenical Canada Asia Working Group, which called for human rights to “form the core of Canadian foreign policy,” always kept East Timor on its agenda. CAWG also developed a close link with the small East Timor [Protestant] Church (GKTT). Solidarity links were strengthening and broadening.³¹

In 1996, Bishop Belo became the first Catholic bishop to be awarded the Nobel Peace Prize. Because of concerns he would not be able to speak freely, the Nobel committee added resistance diplomat José Ramos Horta as co-laureate. In Oslo, the dual award allowed Bishop Belo to concentrate on his preferred themes of social justice and human rights, leaving conflict resolution proposals to Ramos Horta. Belo’s Nobel speech drew together the strands of twenty years: Catholic social teachings, human rights; bearing witness to suffering by giving voice to the voiceless. “As a member of the Church, I take on myself the mission of enlightening and denouncing all human situations that are in disagreement with Christian concepts and contrary to the teachings of the Church,” he said. The prize honoured not a man, but the message “that the Catholic Church has developed over the centuries in defence and promotion of the rights of human beings.” It was “the recognition of pleas for an end to suffering.” Belo was there as “a spokesman of the voiceless people of East Timor” who sought only respect for their human dignity, seeking to “bear witness to what I have seen and heard, to keep the flame of hope alive, to do what is possible to warm the earth for still another day.” Church support shifted from the early years of breaking silence, to a new phase of working for change. Bishop Belo was able to attend an Asian bishops’ synod at the Vatican, where he was the only one to raise human rights. Indonesian bishops issued a Lenten pastoral call for “profound introspection as to why, after 20 years of integration, some Timorese have yet to live it.”³²

³⁰ East Timor Hope Foundation leaflet, ETAN papers; David Webster, “E. Timor Haunts Vancouverites,” *BC Catholic*, 20 Sept. 1999, 1; Fr. Jim Roche cited in David Webster, “East Timorese: Destroy Their Religion, Destroy Their Identity,” *Catholic New Times*, 3 Oct. 1999, 1.

³¹ United Church of Canada Ottawa presbytery resolution on East Timor, 26 Nov. 1991; CAWG submission to parliamentary committee on Canadian foreign policy, 4 June 1994; interviews.

³² Interviews; Belo Nobel speech, 10 Dec. 1996; Belo, *Road*, 28; *Timor Link* 39 (April 1997).



Bishop Belo and the Military, *circa* 1999. Source: Jess Agustin, Development & Peace

In this period, church and solidarity group pressure within Canada contributed to a reversal of government policy on East Timor. Prime Minister Jean Chrétien's government focussed foreign policy on trade promotion. His first foreign minister, André Ouellet, had "strongly held views" against any action on East Timor. Officials cast about for ways to "get ETAN off our back," but efforts to retain Indonesian friendship continued. By raising the political cost of doing business with Indonesia, solidarity groups helped to shift Canadian government foreign policy.³³ Church support was important here. CAWG organized a 1998 Canadian church mission to East Timor that included CCCB general secretary Msgr. Peter Schonenbach (who concelebrated mass at Dili's cathedral) and Rt. Rev. Bill Phipps, moderator of the United Church. Where D&P forged direct ties in development work and a tie of solidarity between Catholics in Canada and East Timor, CAWG facilitated a political tie between Canadian church leaderships and the Timorese political leadership that echoed its earlier work connecting church and secular solidarity groups within Canada. The ecumenical mission returned to Ottawa and pressed Foreign Minister Lloyd Axworthy for international human rights monitoring, the release of political prisoners, an international protection force and a transition period leading up to a referendum. This hewed closely to Ramos Horta's own requests

³³ Marginal note on Jakarta e-mail, 21 Feb. 1995; Marius Grinius, DFAIT, to Ambassador Gary Smith in Jakarta, 27 Feb 1995; DFAIT telegram to New York, 15 March 1995, DFAIT file 20-TIMOR.

to Ottawa, reflecting the close working relations that had been established between church, solidarity movement and the Timorese resistance. At the end of 1998, Canadian policy finally shifted to include a call for Timorese self-determination and for the UN Security Council to pay more attention to preventing violence in East Timor.³⁴

Indonesia's economic collapse in 1998, part of a wider Asian financial crisis, created an opening for the growing democracy movement in Indonesia to topple the Suharto regime. The new "reform" government decided to cut its losses and offer East Timor a UN-run referendum. The Indonesian army felt differently, however. It began to establish and arm pro-Indonesia militia groups. Indonesian officials had been predicting "civil war" for some years and now set about manufacturing one. Violence included a massacre inside a church that prompted the CCCB, in a joint letter with the United Church, to call for an international force to keep the peace. The appeal, coordinated by CAWG, was echoed and amplified in a letter from fifteen church, labour and activist groups a month later. The Canadian government repeated that call at the UN Security Council to no avail.³⁵

When the UN announced the vote result – almost 80% for independence, on a turnout of more than 98% – militia groups went into action, burning infrastructure, killing and forcibly moving hundreds of thousands of people. There was no longer any church effort at "balance." The Pope wrote that he was "profoundly saddened that the glimmers of hope born of the recent popular consultation have been transformed into the terror of today, which nothing and no one can justify." Indonesian bishops denounced the "systematic massacre and forced removal of people." Archbishop Jean-Claude Turcotte, president of the CCCB, called for a novena for East Timor leading up to the feast of the Canadian martyrs on 26 September, calling it "fitting for Canadian Catholics to remember East Timor on a day

³⁴ "Canadian Church Leaders Witness East Timor Unrest," CCCB news release, 16 Oct. 1998; "Report on the Ecumenical Visit to East Timor, 6-15 Oct. 1998"; CAWG minutes of ecumenical delegation meeting with Axworthy, 3 Nov. 1998; Art Babych, "Church Leaders Meet Foreign Affairs Minister," *Prairie Messenger*, 11 Nov. 1998; draft record of Axworthy-Ramos Horta meeting, 29 Oct 1998, DFAIT file 20-TIMOR.

³⁵ David Webster, "The Big Family: Shadowy Forces in Indonesia were behind September's East Timor Massacre," *Canadian Forum* Nov. 1999, 16; Schonenbach and Phipps letter to Axworthy, 12 April 1999; joint letter to Axworthy, 31 May 1999, signed by Anglican Church of Canada, CAWG, Canadian Action for Indonesia and East Timor, CCCB Social Affairs Office, Canadian Council for International Cooperation, Canadian Federation of Students, Canadian Labour Congress, Development and Peace, CUSO, ETAN, International Centre for Human Rights and Democratic Development, National Action Committee on the Status of Women, Parliamentarians for East Timor, United Church of Canada, USC Canada; draft of Axworthy letter to Ottawa Citizen, n.d [August 1999], DFAIT file 20-TIMOR.

when they are already recalling the significance of Christian witness and solidarity.”³⁶

International pressure finally forced Indonesia’s army to leave East Timor, in favour of an interim UN administration that oversaw East Timor’s transition to independence in 2002. Attention shifted to reconstruction from a state comparable to “Year Zero in Cambodia” in one aid worker’s words, and to a fight for the perpetrators of violence to be held accountable.

Several themes run through the story of transnational solidarity for East Timor and its church. They include a vision of human rights, redemption through suffering, Timorese Catholic identity, breaking silence to bear witness, and two-way solidarity that also sees East Timor’s church as an example from which to learn. The church in East Timor always highlighted human rights, with that language displacing the early language of anti-colonialism in representations of East Timor. The Timorese cause became one rooted within an evolving global human rights movement in which economic and social rights took their place alongside civil and political rights. This global human rights movement did much to shape East Timorese identity during the independence struggle, so that the new state almost immediately and as a matter of pride ratified every UN human rights treaty and covenant.



Bishop Belo with a friend, *circa* 1999. Source: Jess Agustin, Development & Peace

³⁶ Papal message to Timorese bishops, 9 Sept. 1999, http://www.vatican.va/holy_father/john_paul_ii/letters/documents/hf_jp-ii_let_09091999_east-timor_en.html, accessed 17 Aug. 2008; Archbishop Jean-Claude Turcotte, president of CCCB, circular letter to Canadian bishops, 15 Sept. 1999, CCCB.

The Timorese nation was born amidst suffering well before independence. Bishop Belo portrayed the occupation as a crucifixion, its ending as a resurrection, and human rights as compassion for those who suffer. “Suffering, for the people of East Timor, is not distinct from their vision of God,” one author wrote. “It is, in fact, integral to their identity as Timorese.” Timorese identity by 1999 was almost indistinguishable from their identity as Catholics. “The Catholic faith of the people is a kind of symbol to unite them, it is a way of expressing the fact that they are Timorese,” Bishop Belo said. This hybrid Timorese-Catholic identity implicitly asserted a demand for support from Catholics outside East Timor. “What grieved us most was the silence of the world and of the church,” one priest wrote.³⁷

Slowly at first, but with growing effect, the global church moved from silence to solidarity. First as a transnational network spreading information and bearing witness, then as a voice of active solidarity, overseas Catholics made increasing efforts to support a political change in East Timor, one in keeping with the will of its people. A model of people-centred development and social activism within the Canadian church proved open to similar currents within the Timorese church. Starting with groups like Development and Peace, and diffusing upwards, Canadian Catholics leant their voices to those pressing the Canadian government to make human rights more central in its relations with Indonesia. This pressure, at certain key moments, contributed to shifts in Canadian government policy. Catholic efforts did not transform the basis of Canadian foreign policy into one based on principles of social justice, but they affected government policy on the specific issue of East Timor.

The solidarity movement’s role was to stand with the Timorese in bearing witness, to break the silence and make the world hear about East Timor. The East Timor cause inspired many because the Timorese church seemed to be truly living as a prophetic church that stood with its people amidst suffering, an example to others. In one publication, the Melbourne Archdiocese Peace and Justice Commission wrote: “In times of great isolation and the destruction of their families and land, they emerged stronger in faith and commitment to the Gospel values. We have much to learn from them.”³⁸ Solidarity, in the end, ran in two directions.

³⁷ Belo, *Road*, 3, 9, 36; Archer, “Catholic Church in East Timor,” 120; Belo interview, CAWG *Currents* 15 #4 (Dec. 1993); Smythe, *Heaviest Blow*, 46.

³⁸ *The Catholic Church and East Timor*, editorial conclusion, 62.

O'Melia San and the Catholic Japanese Mission, Vancouver, B.C.¹

Jacqueline GRESKO

Visitors who ask about Roman Catholic missions to the Japanese at the Japanese Canadian National Museum in Burnaby, B.C. get this response: "Oh you mean O'Melia San." The O'Melia San in the answer is not a Catholic priest or a bishop, but a woman teacher and social service worker who died in 1939. Museum staff and volunteers use the term San after her name out of respect for her efforts helping immigrants in the early-twentieth century.²

This essay discusses what lies behind this vignette, the origins of women religious' work in missions to Japanese in British Columbia and the gendered nature of writing on this subject. The first part of the essay relates the story of religious women founding the Vancouver Catholic Japanese Mission through an exploration of the autobiography of an Anglican convert, Kathleen O'Melia, later Sister Mary Stella of the Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement. In sharp contrast, the archbishops in British Columbia and the main missionary order in the province, the Oblates of Mary Immaculate, played a minimal role in establishing Catholic missions to Asian immigrants.³ The latter part of the essay considers Sister Mary Stella's story in light of the

¹ Thanks are due to anonymous CCHA *Historical Studies* reviewers and to commentators on versions of this paper prepared for the CCHA/CHA in Toronto in 2002 and the ACHA/AHA in Seattle in 2005. Research on the biography of Kathleen O'Melia, Sister Mary Stella S.A. for the *Dictionary of Canadian Biography* Vol. XVI, forthcoming, also contributed to revisions of this paper.

² Lurana Kikko Tasaka, "An Unforgettable Past-A Time to Remember-With Gratitude," *The Bulletin* a journal for and about the Nikkei community, Vol. XXXVIII No. 7 (July 1996): 12-13.

³ Deborah Rink, *Spirited Women: A History of Catholic Sisters in British Columbia* (Vancouver: The Sisters' Association of the Archdiocese of Vancouver, 2000), 165 on the Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Conception, Vancouver mission begun in 1921, and the Missionary Sisters of Our Lady of the Angels, Victoria mission begun in 1939-40. There were pre-1912 efforts by Sisters of Saint Ann and Sisters of Providence to convert Asian hospital patients in Victoria and Vancouver. Huguette Turcotte, "Hospitals for the Chinese in Canada: Montreal (1918) and Vancouver (1921)," CCHA *Historical Studies*, 70 (2004): 131-142.

framework developed by the Personal Narratives Group for discussing the gendered nature of women's writing. The essay as a whole aims at widening historical discussion of Catholic missions in British Columbia, especially the role of women religious in their construction.

Overviews of the history of the Catholic community in British Columbia focus on the male missionary efforts with Aboriginal peoples and make scant mention of women like Kathleen O'Melia and the founding of missions to Asian immigrants. Vincent McNally asserts that the assignment of these missions to religious women reflected their "inferior status" in the Church. He says that the Vancouver Mission to the Japanese, begun in 1912, offered English language classes and that the Franciscan tertiaries who ran it, like the Missionary Sisters of the Immaculate Conception who began their mission to the Chinese in Vancouver in 1921, made few converts.⁴

Historians might take an alternate approach to research the Vancouver Catholic Japanese Mission by examining records of the women religious and by viewing the women's experience through the lens of gender.⁵

If historians take this alternate approach in looking for material on Catholic Missions to the Japanese in Vancouver, they will find the records of the Franciscans of the Atonement, particularly Sister Mary Stella's autobiography written in 1934 and published in *The Candle* magazine 1940-1943.⁶ Although few diocesan records survive on the early-twentieth century to corroborate the autobiography, studies of British Columbia history support

⁴ Vincent J. McNally, *The Lord's Distant Vineyard: A History of the Oblates and the Catholic Community in British Columbia* (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press and Western Canadian Publishers, 2000), 301-303. Huguette Turcotte, "Hospitals for Chinese in Canada: Montreal (1918) and Vancouver (1921)," *CCHA Historical Studies*, 70 (2004): 131-142, explains that the Vancouver mission included an elementary school, a home for the aged and Mount St. Joseph's Hospital.

⁵ Gillian Creese and Veronica Strong-Boag, (eds.), "Introduction: Taking Gender into Account in British Columbia," *British Columbia Reconsidered: Essays on Women* (Vancouver: Press Gang, 1992), 4-5.

⁶ [Kathleen O'Melia] Sister Mary Stella S.A., "The Life and Work of Sister Mary Stella O'Melia, S.A., (Died 5 September 1939) (As written by Herself under Obedience in 1934)" *The Candle* [Quarterly journal published by the Sisters of the Atonement, Graymoor, Garrison, N.Y.] Vol. XVII-Vol. XX (1940-1943 for serial publication). Sister Annunciata Griffitts S.A. provided the author with copies of the original articles and with a 69-page typescript of the set of articles that she compiled in November 1995 as "The Life and Work of Sister Mary Stella O'Melia, S.A., Foundress of the Japanese Mission Work In Vancouver, B.C., Canada." Page numbers refer to the typescript compilation. The autobiography, titled *Some Reminiscences* by Sister Mary Stella is available at www.thefranciscansisters.com, the website of the Franciscan Sisters Benevolent Society, Vancouver, B.C.

and extend this personal narrative and provide context for its analysis in terms of gender studies.⁷

Sister Mary Stella's autobiography, though shaped for religious purposes, does discuss questions of historical significance: what was her background in England, why did she immigrate to British Columbia, why did she begin the Anglican Japanese mission in Vancouver, and then why did she convert to Roman Catholicism? Once she crossed the religious boundary, how did she organize a Catholic Japanese mission in Vancouver?

Sister Mary Stella begins her autobiography by explaining that she wrote it in 1934, "under obedience," at her superior's direction, at the time of her final vows as a Franciscan Sister of the Atonement.⁸ She explains her father was an Anglican minister serving rural English parishes. Her mother was dedicated to the Christian education of her three daughters. Kathleen, the youngest, was born in 1869. A confirmation gift of Thomas à Kempis' *Imitation of Christ* fed her interest in "high Anglican" church practices and those of the Roman Catholic Church. Kathleen sat Oxford and Cambridge local examinations, receiving certificates in a wide range of subjects, but did not attend university.⁹ She taught in a National School at Sherborne in Dorset for a few years in the 1890s.

When her older sisters married and left home, Kathleen returned to care for her aging parents. She volunteered in her father's parish, Northstoke, Somersetshire, instructing village children in catechism. She began to follow Catholic practices of Confession, Communion and Lenten observance. She read biographies of saints, particularly enjoying one on St. Francis of Assisi. After her parents died, she felt called to the missions of British Columbia. At age thirty-three she decided to go out to assist St. Luke's, an Anglican hospital in Vancouver, B.C. managed by a Sister Frances Redmond.¹⁰

Miss O'Melia arrived in Vancouver in March 1902. She assisted with nursing at St. Luke's as well as teaching and parish work for Reverend H.G.

⁷ Jacqueline Gresko, *Traditions of Faith and Service: The Archdiocese of Vancouver 1908-2008* (Vancouver: Archdiocese of Vancouver, 2008), Chapter 3 and 4 on the difficulties of researching the years 1910-1931.

⁸ Sister Mary Stella S.A., "The Life and Work," 1-8, is the source for this section. Kathleen O'Melia was born in Walpole, Norfolk, but lived most of her years in England in her father's parish of Northstoke, Somersetshire. See Jacqueline Gresko, "Kathleen O'Melia," *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, Vol. XVI, forthcoming.

⁹ *Ibid.*, 8; M. Vicinus, *Independent Women: Work and Community for Single Women 1850-1920* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985), 125 on women taking higher local examinations.

¹⁰ *Ibid.*, 9-14; Helen Shore, "Frances Dalrymple Redmond," *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, Vol. XVI, forthcoming, explains she founded a hospital in Vancouver in 1887 and assumed the title Sister.

Fiennes-Clinton, rector of St. James Church, adjacent to the hospital. Father Clinton provided high Anglican services that suited O'Melia. He and the women's group at St. James supported her in 1903 when she felt called, after teaching English to Chinese and Japanese men, to focus on teaching English and religion to Japanese immigrants.¹¹ At that time there was no Anglican mission to the Japanese in Vancouver. O'Melia studied the Japanese language and culture with her interpreter assistants, one of whom she says "was well versed in Buddhist scriptures." That proved useful "in translation of English religious language into Japanese."¹² O'Melia was less satisfied with religious Christian books available in Japanese as the Oxford Movement had not "penetrated" the Anglican church in Japan, so "Low Church" or so-called 'Evangelical' teaching prevailed.¹³ In the Vancouver Anglican Japanese Mission, the directress, Kathleen O'Melia, "belonging. . . to the 'High Church' School of thought, tried to make [her] teaching as Catholic as possible." Reverend Clinton supported her. The Japanese converts were taught to believe in the "real Presence of Our Lord in the Holy Eucharist," and to practice Confession and fasting Communion. O'Melia reported that several pupils and both interpreters became Anglicans.¹⁴

Reverend Clinton's reports on the Japanese Mission to the Anglican Synod in 1910 and 1911 applaud the success of Miss O'Melia and her assistants, Miss Forbes and Miss Ellis.¹⁵ The mission women and the converts were raising funds for a larger building and a Japanese priest. Neither Clinton nor O'Melia, however, record that the Methodists had an older, larger mission to the Japanese in Vancouver, staffed by Japanese ministers and including a kindergarten.¹⁶

¹¹ Lyndon Grove, *Pacific Pilgrims* (Vancouver: Fforbez, 1979), 48, 72. Henry Glynne Fiennes-Clinton was an aristocratic high churchman who came to St. James Vancouver in 1886.

¹² Toyo Takata, *The Nikkei Legacy: The Story of Japanese Canadians from Settlement to Today* (Toronto: NC Press, 1983), 31. Takata notes O'Melia "mastered Japanese by painstaking study of dictionaries and through constant dialogue."

¹³ A. Hamish Ion, *The Cross and the Rising Sun: The Canadian Protestant Missionary Movement in the Japanese Empire 1872-1931* (Waterloo, Ont.: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1990), xiii and 19.

¹⁴ Sister Mary Stella S.A., "The Life and Work," 15-17.

¹⁵ Anglican Synod Archives, Diocese of New Westminster, Synod of the Diocese of New Westminster, 1910 and 1911, H.G. Fynes-Clinton [sic], Report of the Japanese Mission, 1910 and 1911.

¹⁶ Reports of Methodist educational and outreach work in Victoria and Vancouver were summarized in H.L. Platt, *The Story of the Years: A History of the Woman's Missionary Society of the Methodist Church of Canada from 1881 to 1906* Vol. I (Microform CIHM No. 84715), 105-118; and in E.S. Strachan, *The Story of the Years ... Vol. III Canada 1906-1916, A History of the Women's Missionary Society of the Methodist Church, Canada, 1906-1916*, (Microform CIHM No. 84717), 60-64. See also Rosemary Gagan, *A Sensitive Independence: Canadian Methodist Women Missionaries*

O'Melia's work as an Anglican diocesan missionary based on Cordova Street, adjacent to the Powell Street, Little Tokyo district of Vancouver should be explained further in terms of that community's history. Japanese immigration to Canada began in 1877, but the majority of the immigrants arrived after 1890. Two major settlements evolved in British Columbia: Steveston, a fishing village on the Fraser River, and a larger centre, Powell Street, near Chinatown in Vancouver. There, the first generation immigrants, the Issei, mainly male workers engaged in fishing, lumbering or farming, found Japanese stores and services such as boarding houses and employment agencies. Powell Street community organizations provided social and political life denied the Japanese by racial discrimination in the larger British Columbia society. The white racists of the Asiatic Exclusion League violently attacked both Chinatown and Powell Street during the September 1907 Anti-Oriental Riot.¹⁷ Although restrictions on immigration followed this event, the Japanese male immigrants were still able to send for "picture brides." As Japanese immigrants married, the Japanese Canadian birth rate grew at a rate faster than the white population, alarming the racists further.¹⁸

In the early decades of the twentieth century, Asians, especially the Japanese, were "highly visible and very unpopular," in Vancouver. When Japanese families moved out of Little Tokyo to other neighborhoods they "often met hostility."¹⁹ Buddhist temples continued to attract worshippers. Less than one-third of the Japanese in the province attended Christian churches.²⁰

In 1912 when Kathleen O'Melia left the Anglican Church and her mission to the Japanese and joined the Roman Catholic Church, she was well aware of the needs of the people she was leaving behind. However, she herself had long felt a spiritual call to the Roman church. After her Anglican

in Canada and the Orient 1881-1925 (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1992), 170-176.

¹⁷ Patricia E. Roy, *Vancouver an Illustrated History* (Toronto: James Lorimer & Company, 1980), 61. See also Patricia E. Roy, *A White Man's Province: British Columbia Politicians and Chinese and Japanese Immigrants 1858-1914* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1989).

¹⁸ W. Peter Ward, *White Canada Forever: Popular Attitudes and Public Policy Toward Orientals in British Columbia* (Montreal: McGill-Queens University Press, 1978), 109-111 and Michiko Midge Ayukawa, *Hiroshima Immigrants in Canada 1891-1941* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2008).

¹⁹ Roy, *Vancouver*, 103.

²⁰ Charles H. Young and Helen R.Y. Reid, *The Japanese Canadians* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1938), cited in Ward, *White Canada*, 113-114. See also Cathy James, "An Opportunity for Service": Women of the Anglican Mission to the Japanese in Canada, 1903-1957," unpublished MA Thesis, Social and Educational Studies, University of British Columbia, 1990, 24 n. 36.

spiritual advisor, Father Clinton died in January 1912, her mind increasingly turned to the Catholic Church, its “unity and doctrinal strength.”²¹

Secular concerns as well as spiritual ones contributed to O’Melia’s decision to seek entrance into the Roman Catholic Church. On Father Clinton’s death, the mission house which the converts had helped purchase was found to be in his name with a trust to the Synod. O’Melia and her converts felt “unappreciated” and had concerns about plans to put a Low Church English minister in charge of the mission.²²

Miss O’Melia went to see the Roman Catholic Archbishop of Vancouver, Neil McNeil, on 2 August 1912. He welcomed her and arranged for her to stay with the Sisters of Saint Ann at their Vancouver convent academy. Then the Oblate Fathers arranged a teaching position for Miss O’Melia in the preparatory section of their St. Louis College boys’ school in nearby New Westminster, B.C. There, O’Melia was received into the Roman Catholic Church. She began English classes for adult Japanese and visits to local Japanese families.²³ Although Paul Okamura, an art teacher at St. Louis College, had been converted to Catholicism, Roman Catholics had done little missionary work among Asian immigrants prior to Miss O’Melia’s efforts.²⁴

Studies of Anglican Japanese missions in British Columbia on the whole support O’Melia’s account of her work and her conversion. However, the shock of her departure shadowed records about her life in the Anglican Church.²⁵ The defection of this valued missionary to the Church of Rome “precipitated a crisis” as “many of her helpers and followers” went with her. “[A]s a result the Anglican mission foundered for some years after.” Miss O’Melia’s move was such an “embarrassment” that few references to it “exist in primary source documents.”²⁶

O’Melia’s autobiography helps explain why the Anglican missions were in crisis after she departed in August 1912. Within five months O’Melia was back running English and Catholic religion classes on Cordova Street close

²¹ Sister Mary Stella S.A., “The Life and Work,” 17.

²² Norman Knowles, “A Selective Dependence: Vancouver’s Japanese Community and Church of England Missions, 1903-1942,” *Journal of the Canadian Church Historical Society* XXXVIII (1996): 70 and 56.

²³ Ken Adachi, *The Enemy That Never Was: A History of the Japanese Canadians* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1991), 423. No figures are available for the Japanese population of New Westminster in 1911. In 1921 it was 424. Vancouver’s Japanese population was 2036 in 1911 and 4246 in 1921.

²⁴ See Jim Wolf, “Through Japanese Eyes,” *British Columbia History* 38:4 (2005): 18-23

²⁵ Violet E. Sillitoe, *Early Days in British Columbia*, n.p. (1922), 36.

²⁶ James, “An Opportunity for Service,” 34.

to the Anglican mission. Archbishop McNeil encouraged her to do so. He also gifted her with religious books before he departed for his new post in Toronto. By April 1913 she had prepared two converts and one Anglican Japanese for reception into the Catholic Church. Father Joseph F. O'Neil, a diocesan priest, came to her rented mission rooms to provide instruction through an interpreter.²⁷ Visiting Japanese-speaking priests like Father Albert Breton M.E.P., founder of the Los Angeles Japanese Catholic Mission, came to preach and hear confessions.²⁸ From Toronto Archbishop McNeil encouraged students of the Sisters of Saint Joseph to send donations to the Vancouver Catholic Japanese Mission.²⁹

O'Melia's autobiography for the years immediately after her conversion focuses on her spiritual progress but does discuss mission work. She tells of her joy in becoming a Third Order Franciscan or Tertiary Sister on 2 August 1914, the feast of Our Lady of the Angels. She took the name Sister Mary of the Angels. "Owing however to the fact that there was a deficiency of faculties for [her] reception, [she] ... had both reception and profession renewed by the Provincial of the Franciscans of Canada, Father John Joseph O.F.M."³⁰ A few other tertiaries came to help her. The women wore habits, lived a communal life and went by the name Sister as did some other Third Order Franciscans of the era.³¹

Gradually Catholic women's auxiliaries came to the aid of the Japanese mission. The contributions were welcome as the missionaries relied on fees

²⁷ Sister Mary Stella S.A., "The Life and Work," 17-24. The Vancouver Catholic Japanese Mission address was 367 East Cordova Street whereas the Anglican Mission was at 430 East Cordova.

²⁸ *The Monthly Bulletin*, Vol. 4 No. 6 June 1920, 26-28 refers to Father Breton's visit and that of Bishop O'Dea of Seattle and Maryknoll Sisters. Father Albert Breton M.E.P. became a bishop in Japan in 1931. The Paris Foreign Mission Society [Société des Missions Étrangères de Paris] to which he belonged had re-established Catholic missions in Japan in the mid-nineteenth century. See Cyril H. Powles, *Victorian Missionaries in Meiji Japan: The Shiba Sect 1873-1900* (Toronto: University of Toronto and York University Joint Centre on Modern East Asia, 1987), 6.

²⁹ Sister Mary Stella S.A., "The Life and Work," 22-24.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, 25. The dates of these renewals were 1923 and 1924.

³¹ The term Third Order or Tertiary can be confusing as it applies to groups of lay people following the rule of St. Francis [or other saints] and to lay associates of religious congregations called Third Order Seculars. In the nineteenth and early-twentieth century Third Order Regulars took religious vows, lived as a religious community, wore habits and might develop into new congregations. See S. Hartdegen, "Third Orders," *New Catholic Encyclopedia* Vol. 14 (New York: McGraw Hill, 1967), 93-97. See also *Canada Ecclésiastique*, 1943, 947, description of Sœurs Missionnaires Notre Dame des Anges, founded in Lennoxville, PQ, in 1919. "Comme toutes les autres Congrégations du Tiers-Ordre régulier de Saint-François d'Assise," they follow the Franciscan rule but with constitutions adapted to their special vocation, missionary work in China.

and donations for support. The Archdiocese of Vancouver was suffering from financial difficulties in those years and could lend little assistance.

Oblate priests, like the French-Canadian Julien-Augustin Bédard, gave Sister Mary O'Melia what assistance they could.³² Bédard, stationed at the cathedral parish, inserted articles about Sister Mary's work in the *Monthly Bulletin*, the archdiocesan publication. In August 1920 the magazine gave the history of the Japanese Catholic Mission, listing eighteen converts by name and calling for funds for a larger building and the support of more teachers. In the winter forty to fifty pupils paid \$2.00 a month to attend the school but the rent of the house was \$35.00 a month and the number of pupils went down by half in the summer.³³ In that season many men went off to work camps.



Source: The Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement Archives, Graymoor, New York

³² Gaston Carrière omi, *Dictionnaire Biographique*, I, 68; Jacqueline Gresko, "Julien-Augustin Bédard," *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, Vol. XVI, forthcoming. Bédard, born in Ontario in 1858, died in British Columbia in 1932. He served both North Vancouver B.C. and Holy Rosary, Vancouver, B.C. parishes 1917-1924.

³³ J.A. Bédard would have had the cooperation of William O'Boyle omi, [1875-1949] the pastor of Holy Rosary, Vancouver parish, 1913-1927 and editor of the *Monthly Bulletin* in publishing articles in support of O'Melia's work. O'Boyle was also local superior of the Oblates 1921-26 and vicar general under Archbishop Casey. See Gaston Carrière omi, *Dictionnaire Biographique*, III, 22-23. The number of converts, eighteen, listed in the *Monthly Bulletin*, August 1920, 46, contrasts with the ten listed by McNally, *The Lord's Distant Vineyard*, 301-302.

The mission's existence seemed to be on a firmer footing in the early 1920s.

By 1922 the Canadian Order of Friars Minor Franciscans sent Father Martin to Vancouver to assist the Catholic Japanese Mission. The Franciscan Fathers invited three Canadian Tertiary Sisters to join the work. Sister Francis, Miss Hamilton Mellick, from Quebec, would become a longtime associate of Sister Mary O'Melia. Significantly Sister Jeanne Marie Griffin was a widow whose mother was Japanese and father was Chinese. Because she spoke Chinese and understood Japanese she "was much liked by the Japanese women."³⁴ O'Melia recalled in her autobiography: "Thus for a time we were four Tertiary Sisters wearing the Habit, and we were able to carry out many of the practices of Community Life [W]e were very hopeful for a time that a regular community would be formed."³⁵

Distinguished visitors encouraged Sister Mary and her colleagues. Among them she notes "His Grace, the Archbishop of Tokio [sic], Father Frazer [sic] of the Canadian Missions, and Father Walsh, the founder of Maryknoll." Rev. Francis Xavier Iwashita visited on his way back from Rome to Tokyo, and later sent the Vancouver mission "Catholic books and magazines."³⁶

In June 1920 the *Monthly Bulletin* reported that Bishop O'Dea and Maryknoll Sisters from Seattle had toured the Catholic Japanese Mission. The Maryknoll connection merits comment. O'Melia's autobiography says that one of the mission's converts, "a young Japanese lady was married ... went to the States, and upon the death of her husband," became a Maryknoll Missionary Sister.³⁷ The Maryknoll Sisters of St. Dominic, founded in 1912 in New York State, began services to Japanese immigrants in American west coast cities during the interwar years, but emphasized foreign missions.

During the 1920s Sister Mary O'Melia longed to combine missionary work with the religious life in order to ensure the continuity of the Vancouver Catholic Japanese Mission. She turned first to the Canadian Franciscan Fathers for support. They considered founding a congregation devoted to Japanese mission work in Vancouver, but "saw too many difficulties in the

³⁴ Sister Mary Stella S.A., "The Life and Work," 28.

³⁵ *Ibid.*, 31-33.

³⁶ *Ibid.*, 30-32. I have not yet identified the Archbishop of Tokyo or Rev. F.X. Iwashita. Father John Fraser founded the Canadian Scarborough Foreign Mission Society in 1919, See Alvin Austin, 89. Father James A. Walsh and Father Thomas Price co-founded the American Catholic Foreign Mission Society, known as Maryknoll in 1911. See "Maryknoll Missioners," *New Catholic Encyclopedia*, Vol. 9, 396-399.

³⁷ Sister Mary Stella S.A., "The Life and Work," 29.

way.”³⁸ Sister Francis Mellick, who had been a postulant at Graymoor, and Sister Mary O’Melia, who had read Society of the Atonement publications, opted to approach Mother Lurana White of the Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement and then to seek entrance to this community.³⁹ The Franciscan Sisters and the associated Franciscan Friars of the Atonement had begun when two groups of Anglican religious, founded in 1898, began to pray for Christian unity, then converted to Roman Catholicism in 1909. The two congregations aimed to promote Christian unity and Christian mission services rather than parishes and parochial schools as most other active congregations of men and women did at the time.⁴⁰ Franciscan spirituality and rule, and the mission goals of the Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement suited Sister Mary O’Melia and her colleagues.⁴¹

At the Graymoor motherhouse in Garrison, New York, the Atonement superiors saw the Vancouver Japanese Mission as fitting their charism but also their plans for future foreign mission work. Mother General expressed the hope that “Vancouver will be our gateway to Japan.”⁴²

In 1926, at fifty-seven years of age, Sister Mary O’Melia, with the approval of Archbishop Timothy Casey, left the Vancouver Japanese Mission in the care of Tertiary Sister Francis and went to Graymoor to enter the novitiate. Before she returned as Sister Mary Stella S.A. in 1928, four Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement, Monica Garrigan, Margaret Mary Jacobelli, Paula Dougherty and De Chantal Caylor, had come west to Vancouver. Using Atonement funds they purchased a larger building at Cordova and Dunlevy Streets. They expanded mission work from English and religion classes and hospital visiting to include day nursery care for the

³⁸ *Ibid.*, 32.

³⁹ *Ibid.*, 33-37 on arrangements for Sister Mary [Kathleen] O’Melia to enter the Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement. Correspondence in the Archives of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Vancouver, GR 3 S3/04 supports Sister Mary Stella’s autobiographical account. See for example, Mother L.M. Francis, S.A., St. Francis Convent, Graymoor, to Rev. Father O’Boyle, the pro-cathedral, Vancouver, 8 February 1926.

⁴⁰ Charles V. Lafontaine S.A. “‘Repairer of the Breach’ – Mother Lurana White, Co-founder of the Society of the Atonement,” in *Essays in S.A. History* (Garrison, N.Y.: Franciscan Friars of the Atonement Heritage Commission, 1984), 55-69. [Also in *Catholic Historical Review* vol. 62 no. 3 (July 1976): 434-454].

⁴¹ Sister Mary Celine S.A., *A Woman of Unity: A Biography of a Remarkable Woman Mother Lurana of Graymoor* (Graymoor, Garrison, N.Y.: Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement, 1956), 118-119, 146-147, and 193-196. The Atonement sisters had had Franciscan chaplains and interest in missionary work prior to discussions with “Miss O’Melia” on taking up the work at the Vancouver Catholic Japanese Mission. As members of a recognized religious congregation, they referred to O’Melia, a Franciscan tertiary, as “Miss” not “Sister” in formal correspondence about her entrance.

⁴² Japanese Canadian National Museum, Sister Antoinette McDonough S.A., interview 20 June 1983.

children of Japanese working mothers, and, in 1929, a kindergarten. The kindergarten competed with the United Church [Methodist] and Anglican kindergarten programs. These programs had been stepped up in 1925 in order to prepare Japanese children for English language public school and thus avert segregated classes.⁴³

Sister Mary Stella's autobiography only briefly comments on how, at the request of Archbishop William Mark Duke, the Sisters of the Atonement organized a Catholic mission for the Japanese fishing village at Steveston, in Richmond, south of Vancouver. Sister Antoinette McDonough remembered that when she arrived in Vancouver in 1930 Sister Mary Stella oriented her to mission work and began teaching her Japanese. Then, early in 1931, Sister Mary Stella took Sister Antoinette with her door to door in Steveston to talk up the founding of the mission, its English and religious classes, and its daycare for working mothers. Sister Antoinette and her colleagues in Steveston rented a house and arranged a small chapel in it. But, as they had no resident priest, they had to take the tram to Marpole in South Vancouver to attend Sunday Mass. The Steveston Mission Sisters wrote to their congregational "family letter" about thirty children on the day nursery register. The Sisters reported, "Japanese people are very good to us, bringing fish, potatoes and strawberries."⁴⁴ Visiting Canadian Franciscans provided some liturgical services and instruction until the 1932 arrival of two Franciscan Friars of the Atonement, Fathers Benedict Quigley and Pacifus Brown.⁴⁵

⁴³ F. E. Runnalls, *It's God's Country: A Review of the United Church and Its Founding Partners, the Congregational, Methodist and Presbyterian Churches in British Columbia* (n.p. 1974), 198. See also Mitsuo Yesaki, *Sutebuston: A Japanese Village on the British Columbia Coast* (Vancouver: Peninsula Publishing, 2003), 66; and Roy, *The Oriental Question*, 34-35.

⁴⁴ Japanese Canadian National Museum Sister Antoinette McDonough S.A., interview 20 June 1983, [audiotape] 60 minutes, transcript 6 pp. 94/80.007 a-b; Sister Mary Angela, "Catholic Japanese Mission, Steveston, British Columbia," *The Candle*, 1931, 111. Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Vancouver Archives, Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement GR 3 S3/04 includes correspondence on the founding of the Steveston Mission; e.g., W.M. Duke to Sister Monica, Superior, 31 March 1931, inviting her community "to open a house for work among the Japanese people at Steveston, B.C." Leslie T. Ross, *Richmond: Child of the Fraser* (Richmond, B.C.: Richmond 79 Centennial Society, 1979), 73. The Methodists had run a mission to the Japanese in Steveston since the 1890s.

⁴⁵ Alphonsus Hoban S.A., "The Society of the Atonement as a Missionary Society: The Western Canadian Experience," *STA Heritage* Vol. I No. 6 (May 1984), 5.



May 7, 1931 After the first Mass
Steveston Mission Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement and Archbishop Duke

Steveston Mission, 1931. Source: The Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement Archives, Graymoor, New York

By 1934 when Sister Mary Stella returned to the Graymoor, New York, Motherhouse for her final vows she spoke of how the Vancouver and Steveston missions had converted 200 Japanese.⁴⁶ Four young Japanese Canadian men were studying in the Friars' seminary at Graymoor, inspiring hopes for more mission staff and more conversions. In Vancouver confessions were heard in Japanese and the Sisters' chapel had almost two hundred people in attendance at Sunday Mass. The Atonement congregation magazine, *The Candle*, printed "family letters" from British Columbia in 1934, including news of Steveston's sixty babies in the nursery and eighty children in Sunday School. The Catholic Japanese Mission in Vancouver spoke of Forty Hours Devotion in February, Holy Week in Lent, a *Missa Cantata* on Easter Sunday, First Communion for seventeen children, and an April bazaar featuring Japanese and Canadian goods.

Atonement publications also make reference to the archdiocesan health clinic staffed by sister nurses from the Sisters of Charity of the Immaculate Conception of Saint John, New Brunswick and Japanese Canadian dentist

⁴⁶ Young and Reid, *The Japanese Canadians*, 216, Table XVII, Chinese and Japanese Population ... by Religious Denomination for British Columbia, 1931, gives a total of 208 Roman Catholic, 1240 Anglican, 4789 United Church, 102 Presbyterian, 14707 Confucian and Buddhist.

Dr. Nomura. Sister Mary Stella praised his work as a catechist and translator, as did Father Boniface ofm.⁴⁷

Sister Mary Stella's autobiography, written while she prepared for her final vows as an Atonement Sister in 1934, ends on an optimistic note. She is confident that her work for God in the Japanese mission will go on. It did. Although Sister Mary Stella died 5 September 1939 and did not live to see it,⁴⁸ one of her former pupils, Peter Baptist Katsuno was ordained in 1940. He was posted to the Vancouver mission in 1941. He went with Friars and Sisters of the Atonement and Japanese Canadian Catholics to Greenwood, one of the wartime internment centres, in 1942.⁴⁹

Sister Mary Stella's autobiography and the story of the Vancouver Catholic mission to the Japanese before World War II need to be considered as gendered stories if we are to understand why the mission is identified with O'Melia San and the Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement, rather than bishops and priests.

The Personal Narratives Group's 1989 publication, *Interpreting Women's Lives: Feminist Theory and Personal Narratives*, offers a perspective on how O'Melia's autobiography might be analyzed so as to widen historical discussion of missions in British Columbia and to enhance understanding of the role of women in their construction.⁵⁰ The Personal Narratives Group's framework suits analysis of women religious in the Catholic Church in British Columbia for it brings forward "the dynamic interaction" between "the constraints of social structure [and] the power of individual agency."⁵¹

Sister Mary Stella's autobiography shows this interaction. She moved from her father's manse to her own accommodation as a teacher, and then went back, as dutiful daughter to care for her parents. While doing

⁴⁷ Father Boniface, *Pioneering in the West*, 181-183 on Dr. Nomura, a dentist and "fervent convert," assisting with the visit of Father Urbain Cloutier O.F.M. in 1928. Sister Mary Stella S.A., "The Life and Work," 30, mentions this "professional Japanese" teaching a class in Bible History and assisting the mission in many ways. In the 1980s and 1990s Sister Diana Harsch scic served as the archivist for the Archdiocese of Vancouver and shared with researchers her memories of working in health care with Dr. Nomura.

⁴⁸ Obituaries for Sister Mary Stella appeared in the Vancouver *Province*, 6 September 1939 and *The B.C. Catholic*, 16 September 1939.

⁴⁹ Sister Mary Stella S.A., "The Life and Work," 38, mentions four students preparing for the missions. Peter Baptist Katsuno S.A. is listed at the Vancouver Catholic Japanese Mission in *Canada Ecclésiastique* 1942, 599, and at Greenwood B.C., 1943, 620.

⁵⁰ The Personal Narratives Group editors, *Interpreting Women's Lives: Feminist Theory and Personal Narratives* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1989), vii, and 3-15, "Origins."

⁵¹ *Ibid.*, 5.

that she worked on her spiritual interests and developed skills in parish work. After the death of her parents she set off for the missions of British Columbia and founded her own Japanese mission house, but she accepted the supervision of Rev. F. Clinton. When she left the Anglican Church for the Church of Rome she went first to the Sisters of Saint Ann convent, then to rented rooms. She chose to become a Franciscan tertiary and then to join the Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement. Again the ultimate supervisors of her work, and the liturgical ministers for it, were church men. Although she deferred to patriarchal church figures, and, in writing her biography, to the matriarchs of her congregation, O'Melia San negotiated her own place, her own space. Like her, the Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement were not assigned to the Vancouver Japanese Mission or to overseas mission plans: they chose them.

For a gender studies consideration of Sister Mary Stella's autobiography, the four-part framework that the Personal Narratives Group developed provides "useful interpretive frames for women's personal narratives" including context, narrative form, narrator-interpreter relations and truths.⁵²

The Personal Narratives Group defined context as "the political and socioeconomic relations that shaped a life." Members agreed that for "women's lives to be understood, [they] had to be thoughtfully situated in time and space."⁵³ A comparison of biographies of pioneer Sisters of Saint Ann in British Columbia with Sister Mary Stella's autobiography indicates parallel patterns of gender and mission. The Sisters of Saint Ann, a Montreal diocese congregation, arrived in British Columbia in 1858, the same year as the main male missionary group, the Missionary Oblates of Mary Immaculate [Oblates]. Contemporary and historical records feature the Oblates' system for conversion of Aboriginal peoples and overlook or minimize the Sisters' system of educative and caring institutions. Yet, despite the patriarchal nature of their church and society, the Sisters of Saint Ann "were not without agency or respect. They saw themselves as '*religieuses missionnaires*,' setting out for the West just as St. Francis Xavier had left for the East years before."⁵⁴

⁵² *Ibid.*, 12.

⁵³ *Ibid.*

⁵⁴ Jacqueline Gresko, "Gender and Mission: The Founding Generations of the Sisters of Saint Ann and the Oblates of Mary Immaculate in British Columbia," unpublished Ph.D. Dissertation, Educational Studies, University of British Columbia, 1999, 10-12. See also Jacqueline Gresko, "Gender and Mission: The Sisters of Saint Ann in British Columbia," in E.M. Smyth, (ed.), *Changing Habits: Women's Religious Orders in Canada*, (Ottawa: Novalis, 2007), 274-295.

Historians looking at the context of mission history in British Columbia focus on the male superiors and underestimate the female followers of St. Francis Xavier. A major linkage between the Sisters of Saint Ann, the Franciscan tertiaries and the Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement was what Helen Rose Ebaugh calls the “patriarchal bargain.” This concept regarding “the nature of gender ideology” needs to be clarified as a non-pejorative one. It shows women in religious society played an active role in their own history and were not just victims of male ecclesiastical superiors. As Ebaugh says, “Despite the classic patriarchy of the Roman Catholic church, American Catholic nuns entered into patriarchal bargains that latently gained them access to resources and status [...] By means of educational advancement and professional careers, encouraged by the male hierarchy as necessary to performing the works of the church, nuns gained both informal power in the system and an awareness of their disadvantaged position.”⁵⁵

Sister Mary Stella O’Melia and her colleagues played an active role in their own history, negotiating with their male ecclesiastical superiors for power within the church organization. The pre-World War II Franciscan tertiaries and the Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement did have formal male clerical superintendents for the religion classes and social services they provided to Japanese immigrants. But for the Catholic women religious, like their Anglican women missionary contemporaries, the “culture of the mission [...] was largely a women’s culture.” The women missionaries “worked within the confines of the maternal feminist ideology to build a sphere of their own which encouraged personal growth. In this sense the mission was as important to the workers as it was to the Japanese Canadian community.”⁵⁶ Sister Mary Stella remembered with joy the association of “four Tertiary Sisters wearing the Habit [...] able to carry out many of the practices of Community Life.” Anglican Grace Tucker recalled that she enjoyed her work and “loved the Japanese Canadians,” and Sister Antoinette McDonough recalled that she loved the Vancouver Japanese Mission and considered opening the Steveston mission “an adventure.”⁵⁷

Consideration of the context of Sister Mary Stella O’Melia’s autobiography, of women playing an active role in their own lives, leads into discussion of another interpretive frame, narrative form. Personal Narratives Group members said it allowed them “to understand how women

⁵⁵ Helen Rose Ebaugh, “Patriarchal Bargains and Latent Avenues of Social Mobility: Nuns in the Roman Catholic Church,” *Gender and Society* 7: 3 (September 1993): 400-414.

⁵⁶ James, “An Opportunity for Service,” 148.

⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, 149, and Japanese Canadian National Museum, Sister Antoinette McDonough S.A., interview 20 June 1983.

themselves interpreted their own life experiences.”⁵⁸ Sister Mary Stella O’Melia’s autobiography was intended to preserve records of her own past, and to show women aspiring to be Sisters of the Atonement how they might challenge existing norms, inspired by their Christian faith and supported by their Franciscan religious culture.

That last point brings up the third aspect of the framework, narrator-interpreter relations. It addresses the ‘Arthur Munby problem,’ “the power relationships surrounding the production of personal narratives.”⁵⁹ As regards Sister Mary Stella’s autobiography, historians have to consider that it was a narrative written ‘under obedience,’ and religious community obedience. It might be said that Sister Mary Stella’s superiors wanted inspirational literature, wanted material for turning a woman into a saint. Yet modern historians have to consider that scholarly analysis is the business of turning saints back into women, albeit while recognizing the truth of the personal significance of religious calling or vocation.

As developed by the Personal Narratives Group each of the “interpretive frameworks – context, narrative form, narrator-interpreter relations – provided a different lens through which to view a life story,” in this case Sister Mary Stella O’Melia’s autobiography. “Each lens refracted the life from a different angle of vision.” Examining O’Melia’s life offered a “complexity of images arising from these multiple perspectives, [and] questioned what [I was] seeing.” O’Melia’s life suggests many “truths.” There are “fundamental truths … embedded and reflected in women’s experiences as revealed in their life stories not … *a* truth or *the* truth.” Rather the group was “talking about *truths*, a decidedly plural concept meant to encompass the multiplicity of ways in which a woman’s life story reveals and reflects important features of her conscious experience and social landscape, creating from both her essential reality.”⁶⁰

It is true to say, as McNally does, that Sister Mary O’Melia made few converts in her first years as a missionary and that her work of teaching was inferior to that of preaching in the church. It is also true that the Catholic Church was part of a racist British Columbia society. Taking gender into account provides a lens from which to see other truths: women religious negotiating their own way in the church and in the mission field, combining Anglican and Catholic traditions and practices, pioneering English as a second language and day care, and adapting to the culture of their converts.

⁵⁸ The Personal Narratives Group, *Interpreting Women’s Lives*, 13. See also Elizabeth Smyth, “‘Writing Teaches Us Our Mysteries’: Women Religious Recording and Writing History,” in B. Boutilier and A. Prentice, (eds.), *Creating Historical Memory* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1997), 101-128.

⁵⁹ The Personal Narratives Group, *Interpreting Women’s Lives*, 13.

⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, 13-14.

Exploring the history of women religious also helps historians contextualize male religious in Vancouver's Catholic past. When groups of male missionaries arrived to work with Asians in Vancouver, for example the Franciscans in 1922 and the Franciscans of the Atonement in 1932, it was in support of missions pioneered by women religious such as Sister Mary Stella O'Melia and the Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement

POSTSCRIPT

After World War II most Japanese Canadians moved East of the Rockies and the Franciscans of the Atonement transformed their Vancouver Cordova Street work into an inner city mission. Father Peter Katsuno and some of the Sisters from the Vancouver mission went to start a foundation in Yohahama. Japanese young people who returned to Vancouver in the late 1940s joined local parishes, but also benefited from a club founded by the Sisters of the Atonement. It was "named the Maria Stella Club, honoring Sister Mary Stella O'Melia, the woman who had devoted her life to assisting the Japanese in British Columbia."⁶¹

⁶¹ Rink, *Spirited Women*, 217-224 describes the Sisters of the Atonement in British Columbia during and after the war. See also Jacqueline Gresko, "Roman Catholic Sisters and Japanese Evacuees in British Columbia: A Research Note," *Journal of the Canadian Church Historical Society* Vol. XXXVIII No. 1 (April 1996): 123-126.

Abstracts/Résumés

Remi J. DE ROO

Proclaiming a Prophetic Vision: Blessed John XXIII and the Second Vatican Council

In his keynote presentation on the occasion of the 75th anniversary meeting of the CCHA, Bishop Remi J. De Roo captures the excitement of pre-Vatican II preparations; the human struggles of a diverse global church encountering the Roman Curia; the personality of John XXIII, and his contacts with outstanding theologians of that era. Coupled with these first person recollections is Bishop De Roo's call for further research on the influence of Canadian bishops at Vatican II, which he suggests "was well beyond their numbers."

Dans son discours officiel, lors du 75^e congrès anniversaire de la Société canadienne d'histoire de l'Église catholique (SCHEC), l'archevêque Remi J. De Roo a clairement communiqué l'essence de l'enthousiasme des préparations pré-Vatican II, des conflits humains d'une église universelle diversifiée face à la Curie romaine, de la personnalité de Jean XXIII, et de ses contacts avec des théologiens éminents de l'époque. Parallèlement à ces remémorations personnelles, l'archevêque lance un appel à plus de recherches sur l'influence que les évêques canadiens ont eu sur Vatican II, influence qui selon lui « a été bien plus importante que leur nombre »

Mark G. MCGOWAN

The Fulton Sheen Affair: Religious Controversy, Nationalism, and Commercialism in the Early Years of Canadian Television, 1952-1958

In 1952, Bishop Fulton J Sheen was arguably the most recognizable cleric in the English-speaking world. With a television audience numbered in the millions, his smash hit "Life is Worth Living" netted the prelate numerous accolades and awards including an Emmy. For Canadians, however, Sheen was known, but not seen: the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation, in 1952, with its new television monopoly in Canada's major cities refused to broadcast

the program. The “Sheen Affair” reflected the difficulties experienced by Canadian broadcasters and church leaders as they addressed the nature of the content and tone of religious programming, while at the same time grappling with how to nurture the fledgling Canadian television industry, without resorting to over-commercialization of the airwaves, particularly by importing too many American programs. The “Affair” also marked the attempt of broadcasters and clerics to balance the interests of all Canadian denominations on the CBC network. Sheen’s prohibition from the CBC until 1954 reflected the inexperience of broadcasters in defining religious television, and who controlled it, as much as it revealed Canadian insecurity with the new medium television, and the prospects of the commercialization and Americanization of Canadian programming.

En 1952, l’archevêque Fulton J Sheen était, on peut dire, le prélat le plus reconnaissable du monde anglophone. Avec ses millions de téléspectateurs, son émission à succès « La vie vaut la peine d’être vécue » a rapporté à l’évêque de nombreuses accolades et prix y compris un Emmy Award. Cependant, au niveau du public canadien, Sheen était bien connu, mais n’était pas vu : en 1952, la Société Radio-Canada, avec son nouveau monopole de la télévision dans la plupart des grandes villes canadiennes, refusait de télédiffuser son émission. L’« affaire Sheen » reflétait les difficultés auxquelles faisaient face les reporters de télévision et les leaders religieux canadiens pendant qu’ils adressaient la nature du contenu et l’allure générale des émissions à caractère religieux. De plus, ils se débattaient aussi avec la façon de stimuler la toute nouvelle industrie télévisée canadienne sans recourir à la commercialisation à outrance des ondes, surtout par l’importation excessive d’émissions américaines. L’« affaire » témoignait aussi de la tentative des reporters et des membres du clergé de déterminer la prépondérance des intérêts de toutes les confessions canadiennes sur les réseaux de la SRC. La censure de Sheen des réseaux de la SRC, qui s’est prolongée jusqu’en 1954, a mis en évidence autant le manque d’expérience des téléspectateurs dans la définition de l’étendue des émissions à caractère religieux, et qui les dirigeait, que l’insécurité des Canadiens vis-à-vis du nouveau média, la télévision, et vis-à-vis des perspectives de commercialisation et d’américanisation des émissions canadiennes.

Stéphane-D. PERREAULT

National Identities on Display: Québec’s Deaf Schools at the World’s Columbian Exposition, 1893

Chicago’s Columbian Exposition, held in the summer of 1893, focused on education, social reform, and economic progress. This attracted the

attention of educators of the deaf, who put together a massive exhibit from deaf schools from all of North America. One Montréal institution for the deaf shone with particular brightness: the school for Catholic deaf girls, run by the Sisters of Providence. The exhibit from that school articulated key aspects of French Canadian nationalism. The deaf Catholic boys' school in Montréal, run by the Viatorians, was more noticeable for its contribution to a compendium of histories of schools for the deaf published for the Exposition. Both demonstrate the considerable skill used in portraying the ideals of French-Canadian society for the world to admire.

L'Exposition colombienne de Chicago, qui a eu lieu à l'été de 1893, mettait particulièrement en relief l'éducation, les mouvements de réforme sociale et le progrès économique. Ces thèmes ont amené les éducateurs de sourds d'Amérique du Nord à organiser une imposante exposition rassemblant les diverses écoles du continent. Parmi celles-ci l'Institution des sourdes-muettes de Montréal, tenue par les Sœurs de la Providence, s'est particulièrement fait remarquer. La contribution de cette école mettait en relief des éléments fondamentaux du nationalisme canadien-français. L'Institution des sourds-muets de Montréal, tenue par les Clercs de Saint-Viateur, s'est davantage fait remarquer pour sa contribution à une publication collective rassemblant les histoires des institutions pour les sourds en Amérique du Nord. Toutes deux ont habilement fait ressortir les idéaux de la société canadienne-française aux yeux du monde

David WEBSTER

Canadian Catholics and the East Timor Struggle, 1975-99

The former Portuguese colony of East Timor was occupied by the Indonesian armed forces from 1975 to 1999. During that time, a profound religious transformation saw the majority of the population become Catholics. Suffering massive human rights violations, they called on Catholics outside the country for support. Slowly at first, but with growing effect, many Canadian Catholics began to work in support of human rights in East Timor. Their efforts played a significant role in shifting the policies of the government of Canada from one of silence and complicity to one of acting in support of human rights and self-determination.

L'ancienne colonie portugaise du Timor-Est a été occupée par les forces armées indonésiennes de 1975 à 1999. Pendant cette période, une profonde transformation religieuse a eu lieu, et la majorité de la population est devenue catholique. Victime d'énormes violations des droits de la personne,

ils ont fait appel au soutien des Catholiques hors du pays. Lentement au départ, mais avec un effet croissant, beaucoup de Canadiens catholiques ont commencé à œuvrer en faveur du soutien des droits de la personne au Timor-Oriental. Ces efforts ont joué un rôle considérable dans le changement de politique du gouvernement canadien, qui est passé d'une politique de silence et de complicité à celle d'action en faveur des droits de la personne et de l'autodétermination.

Jacqueline GRESKO

O'Melia San and the Catholic Japanese Mission, Vancouver, B.C.

This essay discusses the origins of women religious' work in missions to Japanese in British Columbia and the gendered nature of writing on them. The first part of the essay relates the story of the Vancouver Catholic Japanese Mission through exploration of the autobiography of an Anglican convert, Kathleen O'Melia, later Sister Mary Stella S.A. [1869-1939]. She established the mission by working with Franciscan tertiaries and later by joining the Franciscan Sisters of the Atonement. The latter part of the essay considers Sister Mary Stella's story in light of a theoretical framework developed by the Personal Narratives Group for discussing the gendered nature of women's writing. The essay as a whole aims at widening historical discussion of Catholic missions in British Columbia, especially the role of women religious in their construction.

Cet essai traite des origines du travail religieux des femmes dans les missions auprès des Japonais, en Colombie Britannique, et la nature genrée des écrits à ce sujet. La première partie de l'essai raconte l'histoire de la Mission catholique japonaise de Vancouver à travers l'exploration de l'autobiographie d'une convertie anglicane, Kathleen O'Melia, qui deviendra Sœur Marie-Stella (1889-1939). Elle a établi la mission en collaboration avec les ordres franciscains, et plus tard, en se joignant à l'ordre des Franciscan Sisters of Atonement. La dernière partie de l'essai porte un regard sur l'histoire de la Sœur Marie-Stella à la lumière du cadre théorique mis au point par Personal Narratives Group pour discuter de la nature genrée des écrits féminins.. L'essai en tant qu'ensemble vise à étendre la discussion historique des missions catholiques en Colombie Britannique, et surtout le rôle qu'ont joué les religieuses dans leur construction.

THE JAMES F. KENNEY PRIZE

This prize is awarded annually by the Canadian Catholic Historical Association in honour of its founder, James F. Kenney (1884-1946), for the best essay on any aspect of the History of Catholicism in Canada written in a course by an undergraduate student in any university.

Conditions: Entries must be undergraduate essays between 2500 and 5000 words in length on some aspect of the History of Catholicism in Canada. The author must be a part-time or a full-time undergraduate student in a degree programme at an accredited university or college in Canada. The essay must have been written to meet the requirement of an undergraduate credit course during the current academic year.

Submissions: Entries shall be submitted by course instructors no later than 1 May 2010. No instructor shall submit more than two entries. Essays must be typed neatly and should not indicate the instructor's comments or grade. Essays may also be submitted electronically. Entries should be sent to the President, Canadian Catholic Historical Association [Dr. Peter Meehan, Liberal Arts Program, Seneca College, 1750 Finch Avenue East, Room B3005, Toronto, ON M2J 2X5 peter.meehan@senecac.on.ca].

Adjudication: Entries will be judged by a panel determined by the CCHA. The winner will be announced in the autumn of 2010. There will be no runners-up or honorary mentions. The CCHA reserves the right not to award a prize in a given year should applications not be of sufficient quality.

Prize: \$ 500

www.umanitoba.ca/colleges/st_pauls/ccha

Recent prize winner: Joshua C. Blank, University of Ottawa,
“Many Miles to Moralize: Pre-1950 Roman Catholic Missionaries in the Central and Eastern Arctic.”

SUBMISSION GUIDELINES

Historical Studies

Journal of the Canadian Historical Association

1. General Author Guidelines

Published once a year by the Canadian Catholic Historical Association, *Historical Studies* is a fully refereed journal that features articles, critical notes, book reviews and a bibliography aimed at advancing knowledge in the religious history of Canada. The journal accepts comparative and interdisciplinary approaches and welcomes manuscripts from the greatest possible number of researchers, including graduate students. All manuscripts are assessed through a double-blind process that ensures confidentiality. The editorial board considers only unpublished manuscripts and does not consider works of popularization. The journal only publishes English-language articles.

Submission Guidelines

Manuscripts must be submitted electronically as Word or WordPerfect files. Texts should be double-spaced and should be no longer than 35,000 characters (6,500-8,500 words) or **25 double-spaced pages**, including notes.

Authors whose manuscripts are selected will be required to provide the editors with a revised version of the manuscript in a timely manner following the application of any changes and corrections required.

Articles accepted for publication must be accompanied by an abstract (roughly 150 words) as well as a biographical sketch of the author (no more than 75 words).

Article Selection and Copyright

Submissions are evaluated by the editors of *Historical Studies* and by board-selected external readers. The editors decide whether to publish, reject or request a revision of each article. In cases of conditional selection, the editors will communicate with the author to insure that the conditions for publication are fulfilled. The editors reserve the right to reject articles that, although acceptable in terms of content, will require in their estimation too much revision in order to meet publication deadlines.

Authors whose work has been accepted for publication in *Historical Studies* assign to the Canadian Catholic Historical Association the exclusive copyright for countries as defined in section 3 of the Copyright Act to the contribution in its published form. The CCHA, in turn, grants the author the right of republication in any book of which the author is the exclusive author or editor, subject only to the author giving proper credit to the original publication in *Historical Studies*.

2. Submission Format

As the journal does not possess a secretarial office, we thank you in advance for meeting the following conditions *exactly* so as to help us reduce printing costs and speed up the publication process. The editors reserve the right to reject manuscripts that stray too far from the following formatting rules.

Reminder: Texts must not exceed 25 pages, notes included.

Texts should be formatted for standard dimensions (8.5 x 11). Long quotations and notes should all be **single-spaced** within the text. The first page of the manuscript should contain the title of the article followed by the author's name.

Titles, Tables, Figures and Illustrations

Historical Studies does not normally publish articles with subtitles. All tables, graphics, figures and illustrations should be referred to in the body of the text. They should be numbered in Arabic numerals and include an appropriate title or key. Notes on the source, if any, should follow immediately. Maps (vector processing software), graphics (e.g., Lotus and Excel spreadsheets) and tables (spreadsheet or word processing software) must all be submitted in electronic format.

Photographs must be submitted as jpeg files, and include captions, credits and permissions where appropriate.

Capitalization, Parentheses, Abbreviations, Dates and Spacing

Texts should make as little use as possible of capitalization, parentheses and abbreviations.

Centuries should be indicated in written form (i.e. "nineteenth century").

In text references and footnotes, dates should be indicated as follows: day, month, and year (i.e. 1 April 1966).

Paragraphs should be preceded and followed by a 6-point spacing. Make sure to indent the first line of each paragraph. The period ending each sentence should be followed by two spaces.

Italics

The use of italics should be reserved for foreign-language terms and titles of books and periodicals.

Quotations

Authors should endeavour to avoid excessively lengthy quotations (more than ten lines). Quotations of more than three typed lines should be placed as a separate paragraph with a five-space indent on the left, no indent on the right and without quotation marks. Omissions or cuts within quotations are indicated by bracketed suspension points [...].

Notes

Historical Studies employs footnotes for the purpose of referencing. Superscript numbers in-text should be offered sequentially in the paper, and should be placed immediately following punctuation marks. Notes and references should be single-spaced and appear at the bottom of each page.

Bibliographical information should be provided in full when books and articles are first cited. Afterwards, only the name of the author, the first few words of the title and the page number need be mentioned. Never use *op. cit.* *Ibid.* is used only when the previous reference is immediately repeated.

Here are some examples:

Books

Robert Choquette, *Language and Religion: A History of French-English Conflict in Ontario*, Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1975), 161-247.

For subsequent references: Choquette, *Language and Religion*, 9-43.

Articles

Elizabeth Smyth, “Congregavit Nos In Unum Christi Amor: The Congregation of the Sisters of St. Joseph, in the Archdiocese of Toronto, 1851-1920,” *Ontario History*, 84, vol. 3 (1992): 230-233.

Archival

St. Francis Xavier University Archives (hereafter STFXUA), Extension Department Papers (hereafter EDP), Moses M. Coady to R.J. MacSween, 24 March 1953, RG 30-2/1/2963.

Web Site

Author's name, title of publication, date of publication, <url>, and date accessed.

For example: William Lyon Mackenzie King Papers, MG 26J, Series 13, Diary entry for 10 June 1940, <http://king.collectionscanada.ca>, accessed on 20 June 2005.