Historical Studies

2014

VOLUME 80

The Journal published by

The Canadian Catholic Historical Association

A National Society for the Promotion
of Interest in Catholic History

(founded June 3, 1933)

CANADIAN CATHOLIC HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION

HISTORICAL STUDIES

Historical Studies is a peer-reviewed publication of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association. It publishes articles on the history of Catholicism in Canada and on topics having a connection with the Catholic Church in Canada.

Historical Studies is published annually. Subscriptions are available through the Membership Director, Canadian Catholic Historical Association, 81 St. Mary Street, Toronto, ON, M5S 1J4. For mailing addresses in Canada, the amount is $50 per year; for U.S. mailing addresses - $50 (USD) per year; for international addresses - $60 per year; for students - $30 per year. Copies of most back issues can be obtained from the same address at $25 per volume, postage and handling $5 in Canada and $15 for international addresses.

Correspondence relating to editorial matters should be addressed to:

Indre Cuplinskas
St. Joseph's College
University of Alberta
Edmonton, AB
T6G 2J5

The CCHA's homepage may be accessed at the following URL: http://www.cchahistory.org

CCHA *Historical Studies* is indexed in the *Canadian Periodical Index*, the *Catholic Periodical and Literature Index, Ulrich's International Periodicals Dictionary,* ABC-Clio's *America: History and Life,* and the *Canadian Historical Review's "Recent Publications Relating to Canada."*

ISSN 1193 B 1981

Canadensis Publications, Inc.
Ottawa, Ontario, 2014.

Table of Contents

Articles

List of Contributors

Marie Elliott, who received her BA and MA from the University of Victoria, is the author of a number of books on the history of British Columbia including *Gold and Grand Dreams, Cariboo East in the Early Years* (2000) and *Fort St. James and New Caledonia, Where British Columbia Began* (2009). She has a long-standing interest in the settlement of British Columbia, her native province, and is currently completing a history of the Fraser and Cariboo gold rushes and is continuing to work on the story of John Nobili.

David A. Kingma is the archivist for the Oregon Province of the Society of Jesus, and library faculty member of Gonzaga University, Spokane, Washington. He holds a master's degree in History and certification in Archives Administration, both from Western Washington University, Bellingham. He is currently serving as editor of *Archival Spirit*, the newsletter of the Archivists of Religious Collections section of the Society of American Archivists. This is his first article published in *Historical Studies*.

Edward MacDonald is an Associate Professor of History at the University of Prince Edward Island, where he teaches Prince Edward Island, Atlantic Canadian, and Canadian History. He is currently President General of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association.

Patricia E. Roy is professor emeritus of history at the University of Victoria and editor of *Historical Studies.* She has published extensively on British Columbia's history. Her most recent book is *Boundless Optimism: Richard McBride's British Columbia* (2012).

CCHA *Historical Studies*, 80 (2014), 5-7

Editors' Foreword

Three nineteenth century priests are the main focus of *Historical Studies,* 2014. Although operating in very different geographical regions: Prince Edward Island, the Pacific Northwest, and Yukon, and in different time periods, collectively they offer insight into the everyday work of priests whether in parishes or in missionary endeavours. Father Angus McDonald of Prince Edward Island served in a succession of established parishes in his home province. In contrast, Father John Nobili S.J. was far from his Italian birthplace when he worked among the native peoples of the Pacific North West. His fellow Jesuit, the American William Judge, remained in North America but in its extreme north west. While Judge began missionizing the native peoples of Alaska, he made his main mark among the gold seekers in the Canadian Yukon. Given variations in time and place as well as personality, it is not surprising that, despite significant differences, there are many commonalities in their experiences.

Diaries, Edward MacDonald suggests in his paper on Fr. McDonald, are never kept just for oneself. The diaries and correspondence of all three priests describe, in varying detail, their quotidian activities. As might be expected, sacramental duties are a major part of the record. McDonald was in his home territory and had frequent interaction not only with fellow priests, but also with his own siblings. That may partially explain why his diary, though more than a chronicle, is much less detailed than the surviving documents of Nobili and Judge. In contrast, the Jesuits Nobili and Judge were in foreign territory. They only occasionally had the companionship of fellow Jesuits or of other priests. Fr. Judge recorded daily activities, sometimes in detail, and also wrote letters to his superiors and to his own relatives. The most revealing diary – alas, no longer extant – was probably that of Fr. Nobili who used it as the source for informative letters to his superiors.

Having taken a vow of obedience, the Jesuits accepted the will of their superiors even if they were unhappy about having to move. Nobili reluctantly accepted the decision to turn the Okanagan missions over to the Oblates; Judge, though happy working with his "much beloved Indians" at Nulato, Alaska, packed up within a half hour to follow orders to open a mission at Forty Mile. As a diocesan priest, McDonald moved from post to post and parish to parish at the behest of the bishop but his diary and surviving records only hint at the reasons for his peripatetic career.

All three priests faced competition from Protestant churches. The sectarian politics of the Island complicated McDonald's work as rector of

St. Dunstan's College and provided material for his work as editor of the diocesan newspaper. The missionaries, Nobili and Judge, competed with Protestant missionaries to convert the native peoples in their territory. Yet, Judge became personal friends and co-operated with his Anglican and Presbyterian counterparts in Dawson City.

Travel and its difficulties are a recurrent subject. Distances in Prince Edward Island were not great and McDonald took frequent advantage of the railway that served much of the Island, but he also recorded travel over rough roads by horse and wagon or sleigh. His journeys pale in comparison with those of Nobili who largely relied on the Hudson's Bay Company's bateaux on the rivers or overland through canyons in the Cascade Mountains so treacherous that one packer committed suicide rather than carry on. In Alaska and Yukon, Judge could travel long distances with comparative ease by steamer, but when the river was frozen or its water low, he could not leave. The winter's bitter cold made overland travel dangerous.

Part of the success of Nobili and Judge as missionaries was their ability to adapt to the circumstances of the people around them. Nobili recognized the need to time his visits with the native peoples so they would not conflict with their hunting, fishing, or feasting times. He even changed his mind regarding Chief Nicola's practice of polygamy when he realized that the practice protected widows, orphans, and elderly women. Judge demonstrated his adaptability by putting aside theological differences to work with the Protestant clergy to provide social services in Dawson, the "instant" city created by a gold rush.

All three men had health problems and died prematurely. Much of McDonald's diary concerns his frequent illnesses, most likely arthritis and its complications, but it was stomach cancer that killed him at age 59. Nobili went to the missions as a healthy man, but poor nutrition led to scurvy. Frail health dogged him the rest of his life and, after stepping on a rusty nail, he died shortly before his 44th birthday. Judge recovered from poor health in his youth, but overwork may have contributed to his death from pneumonia when he was only 48.

Father Angus McDonald might well have sympathized with Archbishop William Mark Duke of Vancouver, the main subject of the fourth paper that brings us into the mid-twentieth century. Like McDonald, who at St. Dunstan's had to seek government assistance, Duke had to deal with British Columbia governments that were unwilling to fund the schools of the province's Catholic minority. Duke's problems were compounded by some enthusiastic laymen who used direct action, the surprise closure of two Catholic schools, rather than diplomacy and lobbying as a means of confronting the government.

Every other year, the Canadian Catholic Historical Association presents the Paul Bator Award to the author of the best article published in the past two years. We are pleased to announce that the winner for 2012 and 2013 was David Wilcox for his 2013 article, "'To Meet More Perfectly the Wants of Our People Here': The Christian Brothers and the Process of Anglicization in Ontario, 1850-1925." The judges also awarded Honourable Mention to Catherine Foisy for her 2012 article, "Preparing the Québec Church for Vatican II: Lessons from Asia, Africa, and Latin America, 1945-1962."

It is with pleasure that we present the eightieth edition of *Historical Studies*. We wish to thank those who submitted manuscripts, our editorial board, our anonymous reviewers, and our colleagues in the Canadian Catholic Historical Association who are always ready to answer our requests for assistance. We are especially grateful to Fr. Edward Jackman, O.P., Secretary General of the CCHA and the Jackman Foundation, for their continuing generous support.

Patricia E. Roy
Indre Cuplinskas

CCHA *Historical Studies*, 80 (2014), 9-27

The Working Life of an Island Priest: The Diary of Father Angus McDonald, Diocese of Charlottetown, 1879-1883[1]

Edward MacDonald

Diaries make us secret observers. We get to peer over the diarist's shoulder. We see what they see. We watch what they do. And every now and then we get a glimpse of what they think. Such is the case with Father Angus McDonald, who kept a diary of his everyday activities as a parish priest in the Diocese of Charlottetown, Prince Edward Island, between 1879 and 1883.[2]

Like many diaries, this one is more a record of activity than a mirror of thought, but it is nonetheless valuable. It is probably fair to say that for many generations the real meeting place between the institutional Roman Catholic Church and the lived life of the laity has been the parish priest. Yet we seldom encounter the historical pastor except in obituaries or in eulogistic historical sketches, when it is often in the context of heroic missionary labours in a pioneer setting. That is why the diary of this parish priest is exceptional.[3] It allows us to get closer to the rhythms of parish life in late nineteenth-century Canada.

While it is possible to approach the activities of parish priests through the annotated statistics of diocesan reports, the brief entries in parish registers, and the respectful renderings of local histories, a diary allows us to examine those activities from, as Royden Loewen notes with respect to Mennonite

[1] My thanks to the anonymous readers who reviewed this essay for their useful suggestions.

[2] A photocopy of the diary was given to the author by Boyde Beck of the Prince Edward Island Museum and Heritage Foundation in the early 2000s. Its provenance, however, is not known.

[3] A literature search uncovered thirty-two books and articles that relied extensively on diaries to highlight the activities of American or Canadian Christian clergy. Of that number, nineteen related to missionary work in frontier environments, and only five directly addressed the lives of Canadian Catholic clergy.

diaries, "the inside out."[4] Even if the pastor's entries offer little in the way of introspection – and Father Angus' diary rarely does – the controlling hand of the recorder is everywhere evident. It is their very routineness that lends such diaries their meaning; revelation flows from repetition, succession, and the conscious choice of detail. At least superficially, the motives for those choices are often prosaic. Made vulnerable by weather, farmers tracked first frosts and severe storms from year to year, compared dates for the seasonal cycle of sowing and reaping, charted the making and melting of the ice that in winter became their roads. Both women and men described the daily round of chores that defined their lives, and the comings and goings of family and neighbour. Work was almost its own reward, but it also spelled the difference between want and plenty, and so, yields and prices and costs also found a place in diaries that were part-almanac, part-ledger, and part record-book.

And what of the parish priest? What impelled him to keep a diary? What purpose did it serve? From this distance it is impossible to say why Father Angus McDonald kept his. It may have served as an *aide-memoire* in the preparation of parish reports. It may have been an exercise in self-discipline (for keeping a diary surely requires discipline). Certainly, it functioned as a medical journal of the chronic ill-health that hobbled his pastoral career. As with secular diaries, it catalogued weather, the state of the roads and the crops, correspondence and meetings, and those events that struck the diarist as extraordinary, galling, or gratifying. But it is also appears that the quotidian chronicle of how McDonald filled his days was an end in itself. And that, too, is suggestive.

Recent scholarship suggests that the disciplined "dailiness" of diaries reflects a modern preoccupation with the rigid demarcation of time (Father Angus' entries often sub-divide his hours into quarters) as well as an implicit desire to impose order on the life being lived, creating what Jennifer Sinor describes as "a fiction of stability."[5] By its very nature, then, the diary suggests both the tyranny of time and a deep-seated craving for order within its dominion. Both may have played about the fringes of Father Angus' decision to keep a daily diary. There is much order in its pages, if only a little introspection.

There are no obvious signs that Father Angus is writing for anyone other than himself in his diary. There are no explanations or annotations for

---

[4] Royden Loewen, ed., *From the Inside Out: The Rural Worlds of Mennonite Diarists, 1863 to 1929* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba, Manitoba Record Society, 1999), 1.

[5] For an interesting if esoteric discussion of how diaries reflect modern advances in time-keeping, see Jennifer Sinor, "Reading the Ordinary Diary," *Rhetoric Review*, 21, no. 2 (2002): 128-131, http://www.jstor.org.proxy.library.upei.ca/stable/pdfplus/3092997.pdf?acceptTC=true, <accessed 23 August 2013>. See also, Loewen, *From the Inside Out,* 4.

eventual readers, as in, for example, the carefully crafted journals of that more famous Islander, L. M. Montgomery. On the other hand, the scholarship on diaries avers that no diary is ever truly private.[6] "No one ever kept a diary for just himself," argues Thomas Mallon in *A Book of One's Own.*[7] The diarist may not be conscious of the fact and may not know who that audience might be, "but an audience will turn up. In fact, you're counting on it."[8]

The degree to which a diary is "private," that is, not meant for wider consumption, appears to relate to the motive for writing and how the diary is meant to be used. There are a number of variations, and a given diary might share several of them. Mallon has categorized diarists as chroniclers, travelers, pilgrims, creators, apologists, confessors, or prisoners. Each persona suggests a different purpose in writing, for example, to create a practical record with evidentiary purpose; to deposit personal memory, like a photo album, for retrospective retrieval; to take a voyage of self-discovery; to justify oneself to posterity. The diary can also be a place to try out ideas and attitudes, a liberating space where the confined spirit might feel free, a confessional for secret emotions or desires.[9]

Father Angus is not given to confession (except as a sacrament), and while he may well have felt trapped by the fate his God had dealt him, his diary is neither an escape nor a place for self-confrontation. But it is also more than a mere chronicle. There is a form of *apologia* implicit in its painstaking account of a ministry performed in defiance of physical pain. It is as if McDonald wanted *someone, some time,* to know of his travails. And in his own curious way, he was doing in his terse, daily entries what scholars claim all diarists do, "composing self."[10] "One cannot read a diary," writes Thomas Mallon "and feel unacquainted with its writer." Diaries are, in Mallon's words, "the flesh made word."[11]

---

[6] See, for example, José van Dijck, "Composing the Self: Of Diaries and Lifelogs," *The Fibreculture Journal*, no. 3 (2004), http://three.fibreculturejournal.org/fcj-012-composing-the-self-of-diaries-and-lifelogs/, <accessed 4 March 2014>. Van Dijck states as conventional wisdom: "The myth that the diary is a private genre, strictly written for oneself, is as misleading as it is persistent. A binary distinction between the diary as a personal record written for private purposes in contrast to a journal of fact written to show others, is hardly tenable."

[7] Thomas Mallon, *A Book of One's Own: People and Their Diaries* (New York: Ticknor & Sons, 1984), xvi.

[8] Mallon, *A Book of One's Own,* xvii.

[9] For more on this list, see Mallon, *A Book of One's Own,* especially, pp. 1, 41, 75, 119, 167, 208-09, 250.

[10] Van Dijck. "Composing the Self," n.p. Indeed, that is his title. Although this process of self-conscious self-creation is even more strongly linked, perhaps, to contemporary diarists and bloggers, van Dijck usefully compares the historical diary with its modern equivalents.

[11] Mallon, *A Book of One's Own,* xvii.

So it is with the diary of Father Angus McDonald. The self it composes is largely implied; even within the private confines of his diary, his ego at odds with the humility demanded of his vocation. It is a self that does not boast, but when it finds fault, the fault is usually with others. It portrays the diarist as a man of superior intellect, perhaps under-appreciated and under-valued; a dutiful pastor harnessed to the physically demanding labour of parochial work; a fierce will defying the frailty of a decaying body. McDonald did not go to his diary to find himself. Nevertheless, he is present there.

The diary opens with Father Angus McDonald in the gloomy twilight of what had once been a promising career.[12] Born on 4 November 1830, in the Scottish Catholic settlement of Fairfield near the eastern tip of Prince Edward Island, he survived a sporadic schooling in local schools, to enrol at Central Academy, a non-denominational institution located in the colonial capital of Charlottetown, from 1845 to 1852. By then sectarian tensions were rising on Prince Edward Island as older settlements matured and the various Christian denominations began to institutionalize. That perhaps sharpened McDonald's innate competitiveness. Decades later, a eulogist would note, "The school certificates of his first years at the Academy he carefully preserved as so many trophies wrested from worsted adversaries."[13] From Central Academy McDonald advanced to the Grand Séminaire de Québec in 1852,[14] but his studies there were curtailed by the ill-health that would dog the remainder of his life. After only a year, he returned to Prince Edward Island where he continued his studies under the tutelage of his bishop, Bernard Donald Macdonald.

Although his formal education had been stunted, the young student's intellectual acuity was evidently recognized. When St. Dunstan's College opened on 17 January 1855, the Bishop named Angus McDonald its founding rector even though he would not be ordained until the following November. For the next fourteen years "Father Angus" would devote his considerable energies to the development of the infant college, which was in academic

[12] Except where otherwise noted, the biographical details provided here are taken from Ian Ross Robertson, "McDONALD, ANGUS (1830-89)," in *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, vol. 11, University of Toronto/Université Laval, 2003 <accessed August 26, 2013>, http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/mcdonald_angus_1830_89_11E.html.

[13] "Death and Obsequies of Rev. Angus MacDonald," *Charlottetown Herald*, 1 May 1889. As Robertson notes, McDonald would have been one of comparatively few country scholars to attend Central Academy during this period, and that, too, might have fed this sense of victory over adversity.

[14] Bp. B. D. Macdonald to Superior, Seminary of Quebec, 6 September 1852, Archives of the Diocese of Charlottetown (hereafter, ADC), Charlottetown, Prince Edward Island.

terms roughly equivalent to a modern high school.[15] The task was made no easier by the grinding poverty of the colony's Roman Catholic population, which perpetually challenged college finances,[16] and the denominational rivalries that dominated Island politics by the late 1850s.[17] As elsewhere in British North America, the focal point for sectarian discord was education, specifically, the question of whether or not governments should fund denominational schools such as St. Dunstan's College.

The issue made McDonald a willing mouthpiece for the Diocese's new, vigorously ultramontane bishop, Peter McIntyre,[18] and during the early 1860s, he crossed swords in the Island press with a number of Catholic-baiting editorialists to defend Catholic teachings and Catholic demands. In October 1862, Bishop McIntyre launched his own, militantly Catholic newspaper, *The Vindicator*.[19] Although *The Vindicator* evasively denied it, the new paper's likely editor was Father Angus McDonald.[20] By the time a libel suit stopped its presses in 1864, McDonald's controversial career as a Catholic polemicist was winding down. In 1869 broken health ended his educational career as well. He was relieved as rector, and convalesced in Europe, where he evidently served as Bishop McIntyre's informal theologian at the First Vatican Council in Rome.[21]

---

[15] For the most detailed account, see G. Edward MacDonald, *The History of St. Dunstan's University, 1855-1956* (Charlottetown: Board of Governors of St. Dunstan's University and Prince Edward Island Museum and Heritage Foundation, 1989): 54-104. McDonald's fourteen-year tenure would be the second-longest in the history of the school.

[16] Bp. Peter McIntyre to A. Certes, Societé pour Propagation de Foi, 1861, ADC. "Both these establishments [St. Dunstan's College and Notre Dame Convent] are conducted with the strictest economy. The boarding and tuition in these establishments, to be made available to the Catholic Community, are so very low, that the fees derived from the pupils are inadequate to their support, and were the fees raised to a figure that would pay, pupils could not be had; and the consequences then would be that the establishments would have to be closed up."

[17] This period of sectarian strife is best summarized by Ian Ross Robertson. See, "Political Realignment in Pre-Confederation Prince Edward Island, 1863-1870," *Acadiensis*, 15, no. 1 (Autumn 1985): 35-58; "The Bible Question in Prince Edward Island from 1856 to 1860," *Acadiensis*, 5, no. 2 (Spring 1976): 3-25; "Party Politics and Religious Controversialism in Prince Edward Island from 1860 to 1863," *Acadiensis*, 7, no. 2 (Spring 1978): 29-59. Variations on the same strategy were used in the general elections of 1858, 1859, 1863, and 1876.

[18] G. Edward MacDonald, "McINTYRE, PETER," in *Dictionary of Canadian Biography*, vol. 12, University of Toronto/Université Laval, 2003 < accessed August 26, 2013>, http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/mcintyre_peter_12E.html.

[19] Peter McIntyre to John Sweeny, Bishop of Saint John, 21 October 1862, Archives of the Diocese of Saint John, New Brunswick.

[20] Robertson, "McDonald, Angus."

[21] Rev. John C. Macmillan, *The History of the Roman Catholic Church in Prince Edward Island from 1835 to 1891* (Quebec: L'Evenement Printing, 1913), 285.

Afterwards, McDonald returned to the sleepy quiet of a rural parish. By 1871, the settlement period on Prince Edward Island had drawn to a close, and the missionary era with it. While new land was still being opened up in a few parts of the interior, the Island was essentially settled. After the mid-1850s, it was mainly natural increase that pushed the population to its 1881 total of 108,891 people. Some 47,000 of them were Roman Catholics: a scattering of English settlers and a handful of Mi'kmaq, but primarily Highland Scots, who dominated the local hierarchy, a roughly equal number of Irish, and about 11,000 Acadians. When McDonald was ordained in 1855, the Diocese had barely a dozen clergy to minister to a scattered flock of 32,000 Catholics, many of them newcomers and most of them poor. By 1879, a neat grid of parishes and missions covered the Diocese. A second generation of wood-frame churches, assertive and imposing, was springing up. And while there were not enough priests still to go around, a fifty per cent increase in the Catholic population had been accompanied by a three hundred per cent increase in Catholic clergy.[22]

Father Angus was assigned to the Irish-Catholic parish of Fort Augustus, a few miles up the Hillsborough River from Charlottetown. He did not prosper there. His tenure was first interrupted by a lengthy convalescence in New York in 1873-74, then terminated when, in the cryptic words of diocesan historian, Father John C. Macmillan, Bishop McIntyre "found it necessary" to remove him: "Religious affairs were not progressing in that locality as well as His Lordship would desire, and he deemed it advisable to make a change in the administration of the mission."[23] Community tradition in Fort Augustus has provided its own translation of this politic passage. McDonald, it maintains, was drinking heavily and his parishioners had pressed for his removal.[24] A year later, McDonald was ready to try again, and in September 1878, he was sent west to the Island Scots parish of Grand River, in Lot 14,[25]

---

[22] The statistics in this summary are extracted from the narrative in Macmillan, combined with census abstracts published in the *Journal of the House of Assembly of Prince Edward Island* (Charlottetown: Queen's Printer, 1856); *Census of Canada, 1880-81*, vol. 1 (Ottawa: MacLean, Roger & Co., 1882); and lists of clergy published in various provincial directories.

[23] Macmillan, *History of the Roman Catholic Church,* 318. Bishop McIntyre's correspondence for this period is not extant and so, there is no hint in the official record about the nature of McDonald's condition. Macmillan is similarly vague about McDonald's earlier illness (301): "His health, it would seem, left much to be desired."

[24] Personal communication to the author from Genevieve MacDonald, 4 August 2013. A local historian and genealogist, MacDonald is working on a history of the parish of Fort Augustus.

[25] In 1764-65, the island had been surveyed into sixty-seven townships or "lots," which were then granted by lottery to non-resident proprietors. The lots became the template for later settlement and the nomenclature outlasted the leasehold land tenure system.

with attendant missions at the Irish enclave of St. Bridget's, Lot 11, and on Lennox Island ("Indian Island" in the diary), the Island's principal Mi'kmaq reserve.[26] It is in Grand River, on 1 January 1879, that his diary begins.

Father Angus kept his diary in a small, lined journal, only 9.54 centimetres by 14.6 centimetres. Written in a tiny, precise hand, it fills nearly 250 pages, beginning on 1 January 1879 and ending on 31 December 1883.[27] It is impossible now to know whether or not he kept other diaries. If so they have not survived. But for four years we have a daily chronicle of his activities and observations, the familiar cycle of his liturgical year turning slowly inside the larger wheel of the seasons. With the exception of 1880, when no diary was kept, the entries are more or less continuous. McDonald's pastorate was not.

Although physically imposing, "tall, handsome, finely proportioned, with a commanding glance and a noble presence,"[28] Father Angus had always been fragile, and his last decade was a litany of ill-health, much of it confided to the silent sympathy of his private journal. His biographer speculates that McDonald suffered from a form of rheumatoid arthritis,[29] a diagnosis the diary shares along with other symptoms and ailments, for example, chronic fever, bronchitis, neuralgia, quinsy, and chronic insomnia. McDonald's body could not withstand the demands that the parish – or the pastor – placed on it. He lasted barely a year in Grand River. There is a long gap in the diary between 17 July and 1 October and then the entries end abruptly on 22 December 1879. Once again, according to the era's chronicler, Father John C. Macmillan, he had been relieved of his duties.[30]

After a one-year hiatus, the diary entries resume on 1 January 1881, another fresh start. He was now living at the western tip of the province with Father Dugald McDonald (the first St. Dunstan's student ever raised to the priesthood), in the Parish of St. Simon and St. Jude, where Catholics dominated the township's demography in the same way that their massive

---

[26] General details about the various parishes where McDonald served have been gleaned from the *Census of Canada, 1880-81*, vol. 1 (Ottawa: MacLean, Roger & Co., 1882); *Illustrated Historical Atlas of Prince Edward Island, Canada* (Philadelphia: J. H. Meacham & Co., 1880); and A.E. Burke, *The Burke Chronicles: The Story of the Beginnings of Roman Catholic Parishes on Prince Edward Island to 1885*, ed. by Ernest Macdonald (Charlottetown: Ernest Macdonald, 2007).

[27] Another thirty-six pages at the back of the journal record the high and low masses that McDonald celebrated during the period of the diary and a table of income received in 1882-84.

[28] The description is provided by the *Boston Pilot* (11 May 1889), whose assistant editor, James Jeffrey Roche, was a former student of Father Angus, and quoted in Macmillan, *History of the Roman Catholic Church,* 461.

[29] Robertson, "McDonald, Angus."

[30] Macmillan, *History of the Roman Catholic Church ,* 409.

brick church dominated its landscape. According to the census of 1881, there were 2,600 Catholics in the district, two-thirds of them francophone Acadians, the remainder mostly Irish. There was enough work for two priests, and Father Angus' ledger of masses suggests that he had been there for much of the previous year, helping out as his health allowed.

The pattern was now set for the remainder of McDonald's life. In between periods of physical collapse, he practised his vocation, less and less in Tignish and more and more in Charlottetown, where he said Mass at the local convents and the new Catholic hospital, put the Bishop's library in order, and occasionally served as his secretary. In the summer of 1882 he joined his friend, Father James Æneas MacDonald in Kelly's Cross for a time. Then, in November, he received his last pastoral appointment, as assistant pastor to Father R. P. MacPhee at St. Augustine`s Parish in Rustico, with its large Acadian congregation and its mission church in the Irish community of Hope River.

This, then, was the physical and professional architecture within which the diary resides. What can it tell us? Four themes tend to dominate the entries: work, health, family, and travel. From them, we can learn about everyday life in Father Angus' several parishes, about everyday life in his province, and about the everyday life of the pastor. We see how his days were spent, how his health fared, what he found worth recording, and, reading between the lines, how he chose to represent himself.

All of these elements are present in this typical set of entries from March 1879, when Father Angus was pastor at Grand River:

> March 1st. Hear a few confessions. Say Mass. Give communion to 4. Give Scapular of B.V.M. of Mt. Carmel to Elizabeth Brown. Fine day. I write to Jas. Donovan, 'Tablet' Office . . . London, asking him to send 'Tablet' and enclosing money order for thirteen shillings Stg. Receive 12 'Holy Week' from Murphy, Baltimore. Go to Lot 11.
>
> Sunday 2nd. Hear a few confessions. Say High Mass. Give com. [communion] to 8. Read Bishop's Lenten Pastoral. Preach. After breakfast return to Grand River. Very fatigued. Preached, heard confessions.
>
> Monday 3. Drive to Port Hill Station. See several of singers at their homes.
>
> Tuesday 4. Say Mass. Drive to Indian River over bay ice. Dr. O'Brien [Father Cornelius O'Brien, a former student] in Ch'town. [Charlottetown] Return at five o'clock. Great blow from S. East today. Very disagreeable on ice. Large singing class. Taught for nearly three hours office of Holy Week . . . .
>
> Wednesday 5th. Hear confessions. Say Mass. Gave com. to 1. After dinner go to Port Hill Station. Hear some confessions. Remain for night at Dan McDougall's. Cold night. Train today from Ch.town ran off track at County Line. Complete smash.
>
> Thursday, 6th. Say Mass at McDougall's. Give com. to 10. Preach. After Mass baptize two children of Stephen McCann's. Catechize children. Arrive

home about noon. Hear a few confessions. Receive letter from Eliza [Wilson, his sister].

Friday March 7th. Called early to see wife of Ambrose McDonald – not dangerously ill. Say mass on return . . . . After dinner go to Wellington Station to visit daughter of Joseph LaBobe sick of measles. Give her the last rites of Church. Wind very cold. Teach singing from 7 o'clock till ten.

Saturday 8th. Somewhat unwell from cold. Day very blustery and cold. Write to sister Eliza Wilson.

Sunday 9th. Fine day. Hear some confessions. Sing High Mass . . . . Preach. Give lesson in singing. After dinner visit sick squaw at McIsaac's Road. Return to Grand River and thence to Bideford. Hear confessions from 7 o'clock till 11 o'clock. Remain at Dan McDonald's.

Monday, March 10th. Hear a few confessions. Say Mass at 7 o'clock. Give com. to 29 persons. Catechize. Visit Mrs. Scott on Western Road. Visit Peter Martin. Return to Grand River towards 11 o'clock. After dinner baptize Major McInnis' child. Begins to snow heavy from S.W. towards 4 o'clock. Visit Ronald McCormack who is recovering.

Tuesday, 11th. Fine soft day. I go to Ch.Town by train. Arrive there at 6 p.m. Remain at Bishop's.

Vividly, in such entries, we see the pastor at work. His days are long, and they are spent in motion: travelling back and forth between parish and missions, singing High Mass, saying Low Mass, hearing confessions (lots and lots of confessions), visiting shut-ins, bringing the last rites to the mortally ill, preaching, catechizing, singing vespers, giving singing lessons to his parishioners, examining students, shuttling back and forth to Charlottetown.

The dignified monotony of pastoral work is here and there punctuated by Father Angus' more secular observations. After Mass on 4 September 1883, for example, he took a drive out to Cavendish Sandhills to visit the wreck of the famous sailing ship the *Marco Polo*.[31] The previous October, it was worth underlining the news that "Oscar Wilde lectures in City," though it is not clear whether McDonald went to hear him speak at the Charlottetown Market Hall or what he thought about Wilde's philosophy of aestheticism.[32] On 30 March 1881, again without comment, he records the assassination of the Russian tsar. He even found it worth noting in April 1881 that "the Census takers for the Dominion begin their work today."[33]

For anyone seeking the texture of parish life, it is actually the mundane that is extraordinary. In the 7 January 1879 entry, "The people haul wood

[31] Diary entry for 4 September 1883. Made famous as the fastest ship on the transoceanic run from Britain to Australia, the aging, leaking vessel made headlines when it ran aground off the Island's northern coast.

[32] Diary entry for 11 October 1882.

[33] Diary entry for 4 April 1881.

today to parochial house." Another communal effort followed that March. In his first parish report as pastor of Grand River, Father Angus had complained that the sixty-acre church farm was cropped out after twenty years without manuring the land.[34] To remedy that, he organized a mussel mud bee to fertilize his fields: "Grand turnout hauling mud," he wrote in a rare show of satisfaction. "About 400 loads put on farm."[35] Bishop McIntyre presided over a different sort of parish event on Thursday, 22 November 1883: "After first Gospel the Bp. gives a discourse on the use of Bells & the reason for blessing them. After Mass the Bishop blesses the new Bell for Hope River which is immediately hung in the Belfry. The entire collection taken for Bell was $146, the cost of same $113."

Thanks to the diary we even discover that the doughty Bishop McIntyre was not a good sailor. On 30 July 1883, Father Angus set out with him for the Magdalen Islands, at that time part of the Diocese of Charlottetown. The diary entry is slyly smug: "After dinner start for Souris via Hunter River. Meet Bp. at Junction on his way to Magdalen Islds. Go with him. Embark aboard Steamer [?] at 10 p.m. at Souris. Fr. Dan on board from Geo.Town. Bishop soon gets sick at about East Pt. [about an hour into the voyage]."

Other encounters were less amusing. The entry for 19 March 1879 mixes duty and repulsion: "At noon leave for Lot 12 to visit French woman in woods off Narrows. She is afflicted with a very disgusting sickness said by many to be the Leprosy. Prepared her and administered to her the Last Sacrament." That for 29 January 1881 is ominous: "Say Mass at [Tignish] Convent. Examine Clarinda Kilbride's throat. Discovered it to be a very bad case of diphtheria. They (the nuns) send for a Doctor and send all the other children away." Two weeks later, the diary tersely notes Clarinda's passing.[36]

While death was a constant presence for any working priest, the episode embedded in his entry for 20 January 1881 confronted the supernatural in an entirely different way:

> Morning clear & cold. Say Mass at Convent. Give com. to 2 besides nuns. Hear conf. [confessions] after. Later go to James Welch's, Kildare, and bless his house & premises in consequence of many visions seen at divers times about premises and conversations held by her with spirits, and operations done on cattle etc. by same witnessed by Welch & his wife. Evening becomes overcast. Baptize child of Margt McKay.

---

[34] Diocesan Parish Reports, 1878-79, St. Patrick, Lot 14, Archives of the Diocese of Charlottetown.

[35] In the late nineteenth century, mussel mud, lime-rich from deposits of decayed oyster and mussel shells, was commonly dredged from the sea bottoms of rivers and bays to spread on Island fields to ameliorate the trademark acidity of Island soil.

[36] Diary entry for 12 February 1881.

In the lively folklore of hauntings on Prince Edward Island, such documentary evidence of one is extremely rare.

And so it went, the ordinary and extraordinary daily rubbing shoulders in Father Angus' diary, the rhythms of rural life reflected in its spare entries:

> 13 December 1879: "Leave for Lot 11 at 1 ¾ p.m. and arrive there at 5 ½ p.m. Roads exceedingly rough and weather cold. Never travelled worse roads with a waggon."
>
> 6 February 1881: "Sing High mass but unable to do so on account of hoarseness. Continue low mass. Fair Congregation. Roads very much blocked up with snow. Snow five feet in woods. Baptize 1 child. Train which left Tignish on Friday morning arrives at S'Side [Summerside, a distance of 80 kilometres] about 9 A.M. today [Sunday]. Night clear, calm and frosty."
>
> 28 May 1882: "Splendid growing weather. The snow between H. [Hugh] Wilson's house and stables [in New Dominion] disappears."
>
> 23 March 1883: "*Good Friday.* Say Mass of Presanctified – adoration of the Cross etc. Very fatigued. Go to Hope River. Hear confessions. Preach. Give Cross to people to adore. Baptize one child. Bury boy Gautier. Hear confessions. Blew hard during night with some snow."
>
> 16 June 1883: "Very fine day. Say Mass at [Rustico] Convent. Go to Myrick's fishing stand, Rustico Harbor to attend Angus McEachern who was dead when I reached [there]. Hear confessions. The above McEachern was son of John McEachern, North Side,[37] and died of inflammation of the bowels."
>
> 31 August 1883: "Called from Ch.Town to visit Mrs. McKenna, St. Patrick's Road, Hope River. Administer Last Sacr't to her. Arrive at Rustico at 7 p.m. much fatigued not having dined at all."

The amount of such travel within the parish – in all weathers and conditions – is daunting. (No wonder the entries keep up a running commentary on the state of the weather and the roads!) The cumulative effect of reading such entries is to feel the figurative weight of a pastor's labours. It is also to sense an implicit argument, that here is a man dedicated to his ministry though wracked with pain and weary to the bone. Father Angus has no wish to make his work sound easy. Is there a hint here of special pleading? Perhaps. Anyone as fiercely competitive as Father Angus surely must have felt like a failure in these years, manifestly unable to manage a parish of his own, relegated either to assistant status or diocesan odd jobs. The fastidious record of an arduous ministry might well have acted as an antidote to feelings of inadequacy.

Of course, the most obvious reason for his pastoral difficulties was the state of his health. The running commentary on his medical condition is a thread that stitches together the diary entries in the same way the ritual

[37] That is, the northern coast of the province from roughly St. Peter's Bay eastward, which was McDonald's home region.

of work does. Hardly a week goes by without some reference to his often parlous physical state. Consider, for example, these entries from June 1879:

> Saturday 7. Feel very unwell from fever.
>
> Sunday 8. (Trinity) Very unwell. Say Mass with a great effort.
>
> Monday 9. Unwell. Tuesday 10th same. 11th do.
>
> Thursday 12. Corp. Ch. [Corpus Christi] Go to Lot 11 & say Mass. Very unwell. Return to Grand River.
>
> Friday 13. Unwell. 14th do. Visit Doctor.
>
> Sunday 15th. Unable to say Mass.
>
> Monday 16th. Unwell. Tuesday 17th Do. Wed. 18th Do.
>
> Thursday 19th. Unwell but go to Ch.Town by morning express to attend meeting of Trustees of St. Dunstan's College held at Bp's Palace. . . .
>
> Friday 20th. Remain in Ch'Town. Saturday 21st Return home. Very much done out.
>
> Sunday 22nd. Very ill and weak. Sing High Mass however.
>
> Monday 23rd. Tuesday 24th, Wednesday 25th, Thursday 26th, Friday 27th unwell. Hear Confessions however each day from 10 a.m. until 2 p.m.
>
> Saturday 28th. Feel better. Go to Lot 11.

March 1881 launched a further round of misery:

> Tuesday, 15. Very fine day. Sing High Mass at Convent.[38] Receive four girls into Confraternity of Scapular [of Our Lady of Mount Carmel]. Baptize one child. At mid-night called to sick person on Palmer Road. Return at 3 o'clock.
>
> Wednesday 16th. Unable to say Mass on account of want of rest and cold. During afternoon drive to Alberton. Remain at Fr. Stephen's [Phelan].
>
> Thursday 17th. Preach at Alberton Church on St. Patrick. Leave Alberton for Tignish at 4.40 p.m. Arrive there at 5.55 p.m.
>
> Friday 18th. Sing High Mass and perform funeral service. On returning to Presbytery fell heavily on ice fracturing tendons of left hip-bone. Send for Dr. Bearisto. Recommends perfect quiet. Become feverish. Pass restless night.
>
> Saturday 19th. Very feverish – pains all through body. Little or no rest.
>
> Sunday 20th. Passed day as yesterday.
>
> Monday 21st. The same as yesterday.
>
> Tuesday, March 22nd. Passed today as yesterday.
>
> Wednesday 23rd. Somewhat better. Bishop arrives at Tignish at 7 P.M. Slept none last two nights from pain & fever.
>
> Thursday 24th. By effort leave Tignish by train. Arrive at Ch.town at 5.25 P.M. Go to Bishop's. Side becomes more painful. Restless night.
>
> Friday 25th. Feel feverish. Write 4 letters with great effort. Rest better at night.

[38] The Congregation of Notre Dame, which had been brought into the Diocese in the 1850s, operated a convent school at Tignish for Catholic girls.

Another cycle of illness began during an excursion to Charlottetown that August:

> Monday Aug. 22nd. Mass at [Tignish] Convent at 5 ½ A.M. Go to S'Side in company with Hon. M. [Monsieur] Caron, Minister of Militia & Defence of the Dom. of Canada [Adolphe-Philippe Caron had visited Tignish the previous day], Messrs F. D. St. C. Brecken and Mr. Ed. J. Hodgson. Continue on to Ch.Town and arrive there about 4 ½ P.M. Bishops McIntyre, Sweeny [of Saint John], Rogers [of Chatham], and the newly consecrated Bp. McDonald of Harbour Grace [Newfoundland], accompanied by a number of priests arrive about 7 P.M. from Pictou. Two Sulpicians arrive towards nine o'clock. Palace crowded. Two persons obliged to sleep in several of the rooms. I roomed with Fr. Pelisson who opened window during night. The evening was very warm. Towards midnight the weather turned very cool. I slept opposite open window. Coughed during night.
>
> Tuesday 23rd. On awakening felt a strange sensation through my system.

By the 26th he was suffering from "severe pains in legs," but that did not stop him from travelling from Tignish back to Charlottetown and then to Souris, where he lodged with his sister Mary. On 30 August he consulted Dr. Muttart, "who says I am suffering from a bad attack of muscular rheumatism. Prescribes." Four doctors and two weeks later, he was convalescing at what over time became his principal refuge, the farm of another sister, Eliza Wilson, and her husband Hugh in New Dominion, across the harbour from Charlottetown. Illness would continue to stalk the entries across the entire extant diary.

What is notably absent from the entries are any references to his alleged alcoholism. There are several possible explanations. The oral tradition about Father Angus' drinking problems may simply be erroneous – there are no sources to deny or confirm it in the sparse diocesan records for the period.[39] Conversely, he may have stopped drinking by the time he began the surviving diary. Of course, the lengthy gap in the diary during 1879 (preceding his recall from Indian River) and the whole of 1880 might be read as evidence of a life that had spiralled out of control rather than the result of crippling ill-health. It is also possible, of course, that allusions to drinking are coded into the entries that refer to "feeling unwell" or "very tired," or concealed within his frequent trips outside his parish. But this seems unlikely. Most references to ill-health are followed by visits to the doctor and/or diagnoses of specific conditions. In the end, his drinking, like much else about his character, remains largely conjectural, and certainly does not account for his chronic ill-health.

[39] Surviving records for the last two years of McIntyre's episcopate and the more complete records for his successor, James Charles Macdonald, contain ample evidence that alcoholism was a problem among some of the diocese's clergy.

As the foregoing excerpts show, it was at moments of physical collapse that Father Angus most needed his family, but his relationship with them was more constant than that. His sisters, especially Margaret Keays[40] of Souris, whose husband kept a hotel, and Eliza Wilson, a farm wife from New Dominion, appear to have been the emotional anchor in his troubled life. He writes them frequently, visits them when he can, and convalesces with them when he must. Having a priest in the family was likely a point of pride, although his care was also a burden. Yet, familial duty cut both ways. For a time in 1879, Father Angus had Margaret's adolescent son, Angus, with him at Grand River, perhaps tutoring him privately for his subsequent entry into St. Dunstan's College. And when Margaret fell seriously ill in February 1881, he rushed to Souris, over one hundred miles by train, in order to be with her.

Father Angus' other family, of course, is the Church, and he takes obvious comfort in his clerical friends. There is much visiting back and forth, and only some of it is work-related. Some visits qualify as courtesy calls, but others are clearly gestures of friendship. His closest friend among his fellow priests was Father James Æneas MacDonald, another Scots Islander, nine years his junior but a member of the inaugural class at St. Dunstan's College, and, it seems, a kindred spirit. One of the earliest entries in the diary (7 January 1879) records an overnight stay with "Father James Æ" in Kelly's Cross. As opportunity permitted, they exchanged visits, culminating in a long sojourn with Father James in the summer and fall of 1882. When it came to another one of his ex-students, Father Cornelius O'Brien, friendship mingled, perhaps, with envy. After St. Dunstan's, O'Brien had gone on to a brilliant academic career at the Sacred College of the Propaganda in Rome, then carved out a reputation as a Catholic intellectual while a country pastor at Indian River, where he published *Philosophy of the Bible Vindicated*. In 1879, though, he turned down the rectorship of St. Dunstan's, perhaps with his eye on a larger prize.[41] If so, he got his reward. On 13 November 1879, Father Angus reports to his diary, "Say Mass at Convent. Hear news [of] Dr. O'Brien's appointment to the Archbishopric of Halifax."

It is tempting to read a "might have been" into the laconic diary entry a few days later: "27th anniversary of ordination to the priesthood." Shortly after, McDonald wrote O'Brien a congratulatory letter.[42] Then, on 3 January 1883, Bishop McIntyre assembled the priests of the Island for a grand banquet

[40] Consistently spelled "Keyes" in the diary.

[41] See Terrence Murphy, "O'BRIEN, CORNELIUS," *Dictionary of Canadian Biography Online*, <accessed 6 March 2014>, http://www.biographi.ca/en/bio/o_brien_cornelius_13E.html. McDonald was one of the College trustees that offered him the rectorship. (See, too, diary entry for 4 July 1879.)

[42] Diary entry for 6 December 1882.

in O'Brien's honour where he was feted with a formal address and gifted with a gold pectoral cross, chain, and ring. "Night cold," McDonald wrote afterwards. "Did not rest well," then added an afterthought that might be read as either forlorn or defiant: "I wrote address to Archbishop-Elect." If he could not be a bishop, at least he knew how to address one.[43]

While McDonald spent much time in the company of his fellow priests, the diary lacks any evidence of close friendships with his laity. This contradicts several obituaries, which would echo the *Summerside Journal*'s observation that he was "one who was very popular with his fellow men, and who made friends wherever he went."[44] Paradoxically, the priest both served and commanded in his parish. Pastor and flock might be bound together, but generally at a respectful distance. Family, both clerical and kin, must have helped ease the burden of loneliness that went with pastoral work.

That Father Angus was able to see kin and clergy so often is striking evidence of how often he travelled *outside* of his parish. In the diary's earliest entries, he takes a horse and sleigh all the way to Charlottetown from Grand River, a distance of over eighty kilometres. More often, however, he travels by train on the newly opened Prince Edward Island Railway. Christine Hudon has explored the social and cultural impact of rail (and steamboat) travel on the institutional Church in Quebec, where rapid, reliable communication helped the Catholic hierarchy extend its organizational reach by bringing clergy within easy reach of their bishops, but at the same time made it more difficult to control the scope and nature of the priests' travel.[45] Something similar seems to have been at work in the Diocese of Charlottetown. The train periodically brought the Bishop and his entourage, and it occasionally brought together the diocesan clergy for meetings and ecclesiastical conferences.[46] More often it took Father Angus away from home. The four-year span of his diary records more than sixty train trips (one way and return). By contrast, Father Angus' contemporary, Rev. Robert

[43] Quiet pride was replaced by pique on 15 January, when Father Angus braved 5° F weather to join the Archbishop-Elect for dinner at the home of O'Brien's mother near New Glasgow, only to find he "was unable to come from Town on account of other arrangements."

[44] "Death of Rev. Angus McDonald," *Summerside Journal*, 2 May 1889, 3. See also, "Obituary," *Daily Patriot*, 29 April 1889, 2; *Island Guardian and Christian Chronicle*, 3 May 1889, 2; "Obituary," *Daily Examiner*, 29 April 1889, 2. His biographical sketch in Rev. A. E. Burke's 1885 collection of diocesan profiles describes him as "a brilliant and popular rector."

[45] See Christine Hudon, "La sociabilité religieuse a l'ère du vapeur et du rail," *Journal of the Canadian Historical Association*, 10 (1999), 129-147.

[46] Diary entry for 5 August 1879. A decision was made to have conferences "once or twice a year."

Dyer, the Anglican minister at Alberton in West Prince County, made only seven trips outside his parish between 1879 and 1882.[47]

Some of Father Angus' travel was on church or personal business, some of it to seek medical attention (such as the time he travelled to Alberton with an excruciating toothache, only to find the doctor gone, requiring a second trip, to Summerside, a few days later),[48] and some of it was for pleasure. What did a 19th century priest do for fun? Seemly recreations included agricultural fairs, public lectures, and, more rarely, concerts. ("Go to the concert at St. Patk's Hall, given by the Society of St. V. de Paul for the poor," he wrote on 9 February 1882, "the first concert I attended since one in Florence, in 1869.") But Father Angus' favourite kind of outing was the same as for most other Islanders of the period: community picnics and tea parties. Every summer he attended at least one and sometimes several, often travelling on special excursion trains to distant communities.[49] It is possible to imagine him there, conspicuous by his height and his long black soutane, strolling slowly through the crowds of excursionists, often in company with fellow priests.

Though ill-health sometimes curtailed McDonald's travel, it likely left him more footloose than his fellow pastors since he was at best an assistant pastor during most of the period covered by the diary. He may also have been more restless. Consider this interlude in July 1883, when Father Angus was stationed at Rustico:

> Monday 16th. . . . . Go to Town after tea with with Fr. McPhee.
>
> Tuesday, 17th. . . . . Leave Ch'town at 9 a.m. and arrive at Rustico at noon.
>
> Thursday, 19th . . . . Drive to Miscouche with Fr. McPhee via Malpeque Road & St. Eleanor's . . . . Great crowd at Miscouche T. Party. I go by 4 p.m. train to Tignish."
>
> Friday, 20th . . . . Leave for S'Side by 2 p.m. train. Remain at Fr. Doyle's during night. Heavy rain.
>
> Saturday, 21st Fine day. Say Mass in S'Side Church. Leave for Indian River at 10 a.m. Dine at latter place. Leave for Rustico at 1 p.m. via Margate, Clifton, and Hope River arriving there at 6 p.m. Hear some confessions. Fatigued.
>
> Monday, 23rd . . . . After dinner go to Town via Hunter River thence immediately to Rocky Pt. and West River. Arrive at latter place about 7 p.m. Very heavy showers during evening.
>
> Tuesday, 24th . . . . Leave W. River at 1 p.m. Wait at Rocky Pt. more than two hours. Go aboard South Port [the local ferry] at 4 ½ p.m. Go to Shaw's

[47] Public Archives and Records Office of Prince Edward Island (hereafter PARO), Acc. 3254/1, Diary of Rev. Robert Dyer.

[48] Diary entries for 27 and 30 June 1881.

[49] A partial list includes Grand River, Tignish, Alberton, Miscouche, St. Peter's, St. Dunstan's College, and Souris.

> Wharf and thence to Ch.Town where arrive at 8 p.m. Very much fatigued. Remain at Bishop's overnight.
>
> Wednesday, 25th Leave for Hunter River by 6.45 train. Arrive in Rustico at 9 A.M. Confessions all forenoon and afternoon. Sick call to Point. Old Mrs. Gallant.

Clearly, the Catholic pastor of the late nineteenth century was not chained to his parish.

Peering through the lattice-work of such diary entries one can just make out the stern face of Father Angus himself. The diary is his half-intended self-portrait. He is extremely precise, especially about time, and keeps a scrupulous record of such things as how many people receive communion or take confession. He can also be waspish and irascible. There is palpable annoyance in entries such as this one, from 28 December 1882: "Pretty cold with frequent light snow flurries. Say Mass at Kelly's Cross Church. Cold. Return to Rustico at 4 P.M. Very cold. Set out at 5 P.M. on sick call to Peter Pitre, Hope River. Man not very sick. Return at 9 o'clock very cold & tired." And discrete outrage in this cryptic entry from 24 August 1881: "Retire about 9 P.M. after taking medicine. Violently disturbed soon afterwards by one of the household."[50] At other times, he sounds merely petulant. "Go to St. Peters to Pic-nic," he reported on 23 August 1882. "Bishop and many priests present at Party. Great crowd of people present. Weather very warm. No amusement. Very tiresome."[51]

The diary also depicts a self-conscious intellectual. Whether from whimsy or discipline or as a display of his powers, Father Angus wrote his diary entries for February 1879 entirely in Latin, a country pastor still polishing his scholarship. He also kept in touch with a wider world of ideas; there are various references in the diary to journal subscriptions (for example the London *Tablet,* the *Catholic Herald*, and the Island's *Weekly Examiner*) and to his books, which followed him around dutifully from posting to posting. The country pastor who had once defended Catholic doctrine in the press took careful note on 9 March 1879 that it was the twenty-fifth anniversary of Pope Pius IX's proclamation in 1854 of the dogma of the Immaculate Conception. And the former polemicist was quick to quarrel with pronouncements he did not like. There is a double-barrelled dose of indignation in his entry for 17 March 1882, St. Patrick's Day, which he spent in Charlottetown:

---

[50] He took an equally dim view of the monkish practice of nocturnal bell-ringing when he travelled to the Trappist monastery near Pictou, Nova Scotia, in 1882 to recoup his health.

[51] "The Bishop's Picnic" was a fundraiser for the new church being erected at St. Peter's. According to the *Daily Examiner*, it was "a great success," with over 4,000 people in attendance. See *Daily Examiner*, 21 August 1882, 2; and 24 August 1882, 3.

> Say Mass at [Charlottetown] Hospital. Fine day. Fr. [W. H.] Grant sings High Mass at 10 o'clock. Bp. present. Fr. [Alexander] McGillivray preaches on dignity of Priesthood. Attributes St. Patrick's success to the fact of his being a Priest. Not sound preaching in my opinion. Attended concert of Irish B. [Benevolent] Society given in the 'Market Hall.' R. R. Fitzgerald gave opening speech. Attributed the spirit of independence among Island Irishmen to the blood of the descendants of the passengers of the 'May Flower,' who landed at Plymouth Rock! The Concert was pretty much in accordance with this bold and insulting assertion.

In terms of the entertainment, it is unclear whether McDonald objected to the singing, the clogging, or the "Comicalities, Musical and Rhetorical."[52]

The rocket directed at Fitzgerald echoed the sectarian rivalries that had shaped Father Angus' early career – Fitzgerald was the Anglican son of a militantly anti-Catholic minister – but the spleen vented on Father McGillivray hints at something more personal. When McGillivray preached the sermon at a special Mass in St. Peter's that August, McDonald was again dismissive: "Fr. Dan [Macdonald] celebrant. Fr. McGillivray preaches after [?] com. in English and Gaelic. A very unsuccessful effort."[53] McGillivray had been named rector of St. Dunstan's Cathedral in 1879, shortly after coming to Prince Edward Island from the Diocese of Antigonish. It is perhaps no coincidence that the only other priest openly criticized in the diary is Father Thomas Carroll, whom Bishop McIntyre brought back from Montreal and named rector at the Cathedral in succession to McGillivray.[54] "See for first time Rev. Mr. Carroll from Montreal," Father Angus reported to his diary on 18 December 1883. "Apparently, not a strong man. Of opinion he is not the man for Charlottetown and that he is laying down a programme which he will not be able to carry out long."[55] Was such disapproval a nativist response to preference being given to outsiders or an implicit comment on his bishop's wilful "enthusiasms"? Or can we sense here the thwarted ambitions of a talented priest who might once have expected the rectorship for himself as a recognition of his abilities and a reward for his labours? Can he be blamed for thinking, if his health had only allowed, that he could do a better job himself? That his mind was superior to theirs? That his talents were being wasted?

---

[52] See "The Concert Last Evening," *Daily Examiner*, 18 March 1882, 3. The local press thought better of Fitzgerald's speech. The *Daily Examiner* reported it "excellent . . . thoroughly patriotic and suitable to the occasion."

[53] Diary entry for 23 August 1882. The entry on 4 July 1883 marking McGillivray's death was more charitable and the following day he offered a Mass for McGillivray's soul.

[54] Macmillan, *History of the Roman Catholic Church,* 425-26. It is perhaps ironic that McDonald would eventually be buried alongside McGillivray. See "Funeral of Rev. Angus McDonald," *Daily Examiner*, 1 May 1889, 1.

[55] As it turned out, McDonald was right. Father Carroll's health soon gave out and he went back to Montreal.

But in the end, as the diary makes clear, the parish remained at the heart of Father Angus' work, physically and spiritually. The parish priest was in many ways like the country doctor of a slightly later period, on perpetual call, something that was appreciated – but which was also *expected.*[56] In return, if the priest performed his duties unstintingly, he received status and respect that went well beyond the outward deference accorded his clerical collar. Depending on his personality, he might be accorded affection and loyalty as well. How much of the clergy's influence over their flock resided in their sacramental power and how much in their devoted service is probably a moving target, but it is clear that the pedestal on which the priest stood often prevented the laity from seeing him clearly as a person. That is another reason diaries such as this one are important. They restore to the construct of the parish priest a little of his humanity, and provide in the process a unique perspective on parish life.

Father Angus spent six years as assistant in Rustico and Hope River before a final, catastrophic breakdown in his health. He died of stomach cancer on 29 April 1889 after terrible suffering. In the fall of 1888, he had gone for treatment to Montreal, but he stubbornly came home to die. It was, his obituary related, "a supreme act of will."[57]

Father Angus' diary ends quietly on 31 December 1883, but the entry from a few days earlier, 28 December, is perhaps more characteristic of his life as a pastor:

> During night a heavy thaw sets in with occasional showers of rain. I say Mass at old convent [in Charlottetown] and give com. to all the Sisters. At 8:27 A.M. I take the train for Hunter River where I drive with Bagnall and arrive at Rustico at 12½ P.M. The roads were very bad in consequence of the heavy thaw. Fatigued with feet partially wet. At 5½ P.M. start for old Malpeque Road 2 miles N.W. of Bagnall's old stand to visit young Welsh, 20 years of age, who had been to confession. He caught cold in the muscles and was in danger. I prepared him as well as I could and gave him the last Sacraments. The weather was very disagreeable – rain sleet and storm – and the roads wretched. The driver went astray in the storm on our return and we had some difficulty in getting a person to pilot us through the fields in the darkness . . . .

It is perhaps fitting to take leave of our diarist there: out in the storm, beset by darkness, but struggling towards the light.

---

[56] See Sasha Mullally, "Dr. Gus, Dr. Roddie, and the Golden Age of Medicine," *The Island Magazine*, no. 42 (Fall/Winter 1997): 3-9.

[57] "Death and Obsequies of Rev. Angus MacDonald [sic]," *Charlottetown Herald*, 1 May 1889.

CCHA *Historical Studies*, 80 (2014), 29-41

"Mission to New Caledonia": The Letters of John Nobili, S.J., 1845-1848

Marie Elliott

In 1844, John Nobili abandoned his uncertain future as a Jesuit priest during Italy's Risorgimento[1] for the perilous life of a missionary in the Pacific Northwest.[2] He left behind a rich heritage of art and culture but not political unrest, for nation building was also taking place in North America. Dominated by the Hudson's Bay Company (HBC), the joint British and American occupation of the land west of the Rocky Mountains was about to end as hundreds of American settlers poured into the lower Columbia region. When Great Britain ceded its interest in 1846, the 49th Parallel became the international boundary and the HBC commenced preparations to remove its operations north of the line. While diplomatic and HBC adjustments took place Nobili proselytized First Nations and Métis, from 1844 to 1848, first at Fort Vancouver and then along the 1500 mile HBC fur brigade route from Fort Vancouver through the Okanagan and central interior, as far north as Fort St. James and Babine Lake. His letters to Jesuit Father General Jan Philipp Roothaan in Rome and to his local superiors, Fathers Peter De Smet and

* There are many people to thank who helped on the long journey to preparing this article: Dr. Cinzia Forasiepi, University of San Francisco, for three and a half years of cheerfully meeting to work on translating Father Nobili's letters whenever busy schedules allowed; Dr. Charlotte Girard, Prof. Martin Segger, and Jacqueline Gresko for their encouragement; the archivists and librarians at Santa Clara University, the Jesuit Missouri Province Archives, the Oregon Historical Society and the British Columbia Archives; David Kingma, Archivist, Jesuit Oregon Province Archives, Gonzaga University; Gerald McKevitt, S.J., Santa Clara University; the McPherson Library, University of Victoria; and the Hudson's Bay Company Archives, Winnipeg. A special thank you to the anonymous reviewers.

[1] For the history of Risorgimento, see Edgar Holt, *Risorgimento, The Making of Italy 1815-1870* (Bristol: Macmillan and Co. Ltd., 1970).

[2] We know very little about Nobili's early years except that he was born in Rome and had one brother, Namesio. His father practiced law so presumably the family had a comfortable upbringing. He entered the Jesuit seminary at age 16, took his first vows in 1833, and prior to his ordination in 1843 taught humanities at colleges in Loretto, Piacenza, and Fermo. Charlotte S.M. Girard, "John Nobili (baptized Giovano Pietro Antonio)," *Dictionary of Canadian Biography, VIII* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1985), 654-655.

Joseph Joset, record several examples of how these major political changes affected his life, but more importantly they contain a broad spectrum of fresh information about New Caledonia (now known as British Columbia) before 1850. Nobili wrote his letters within days or weeks of making his diary entries and based the letters on them. Their immediacy and the fact that non-HBC material from the 1840s is rare make them valuable historical documents. The diaries would have been written under primitive circumstances, at the end of a tedious day of travelling, then carefully packed in his luggage to avoid dampness, for further recording once he reached an HBC post. There he would find ink and quill pens, writing paper and a desk. The main detriment was cold weather when the ink froze.[3]

Nobili regularly reported his progress to Roothaan, sending letters *in duos turnos* because of the danger of mail becoming lost or destroyed. One packet went out with the brigade to Fort Vancouver in the spring to catch the ship to England and a second set, updated with footnotes and postscripts, went with the express to York Factory or to eastern Canada later in the year. When the packets reached London, Father George Jenkins, procurator of the English Jesuit province, ensured that they reached Rome.

Reading Nobili's letters in conjunction with contemporary HBC correspondence reveals striking similarities between the Society of Jesus and the Hudson's Bay Company. Although one company was religious and the other commercial, both were hierarchies whose efficient operation required regular, detailed communication, absolute dedication and the ability to endure great physical and mental stress.[4] Nobili travelled to the Columbia annually to consult with an immediate superior who sent reports to Bishop Rosati in St. Louis, Missouri and to the Jesuit Father General in Rome. With the same purpose, HBC Chief Trader Donald Manson, in charge of New Caledonia, travelled to Fort Vancouver on the Columbia River, to bring out the fur brigade and to consult with his superior, Chief Factor John McLoughlin, who sent annual reports to Governor George Simpson and Council at York Factory and to the HBC Governor and Committee in London. At the same

[3] John Nobili, Mission ad Montes Saxosos [Rocky Mountain Missions] (Oregon), Vol. 1, Section VI, Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu, Rome [hereafter ARSI]. See also Gilbert J. Garraghan, *The Jesuits of the Middle United States,* Vol. II (New York: America Press, 1938), 350-368. I have not attempted to locate the diaries.

[4] For an overview of the Hudson's Bay Company in New Caledonia (British Columbia), see Marie Elliott, *Fort St. James and New Caledonia, Where British Columbia Began* (Madeira Park, B.C.: Harbour Publishing, 2009). For an overview of the situation at Fort Vancouver in 1844 regarding American/British relations and Chief Factor John McLoughlin's difficulties with Methodist missionaries at Willamette, see E.E. Rich, ed., *The Letters of John McLoughlin from Fort Vancouver to the Governor and Committee, Third Series, 1844-1846* (London: Hudson's Bay Record Society,1944) [HBRS 7], Introduction, xi-lxiii.

time, both Nobili and Manson were free to correspond directly with their respective headquarters in Rome and London.

Father Peter De Smet, S.J., was responsible for Nobili coming to North America. Several years after the Jesuits in the eastern United States were charged with ministering to First Nations west of the Mississippi in 1833, De Smet began annual western treks from the society's provincial headquarters in St. Louis. A man of amazing endurance and charisma, he sought to meet and baptize as many natives as possible. Eventually, he hoped to establish farming communities similar to the Jesuit reductions of seventeenth and eighteenth century Paraguay.[5] De Smet's letters and a book describing his work with First Nations became familiar to students in many European seminaries.[6]

During the same decade secular priests Nobert Blanchet and Modeste Demers went from Quebec to Fort Vancouver in 1838 to work with the Métis settlers and First Nations in the Willamette and Cowlitz valleys. When they found competition from Methodist and Presbyterian missionaries they sought De Smet's help to recruit Jesuits to work in Oregon Territory. De Smet, a powerful persuader, had already brought recruits from Europe. In August 1840, while at the camp of the Pend d'Oreilles, Demers wrote to De Smet:

> You have no doubt heard that we were sent hither in 1838 by way of the canoes of the Honorable Hudson Bay Company, which gave us our passage *gratis.* It was not long before we were aware of the need of help. We have written to Canada, but we have the grief of being still but two, to make head against everything, especially to arrest the progress made by so many Presbyterian and Methodist ministers, who are in occupation of the principal posts of the region because they got here before us. It would take too long to tell you all that they say to the Indians against us and our holy religion. We ought to have eight more priests, besides ourselves, to occupy various posts; there is a chance to do a great deal of good.[7]

HBC Chief Factor John McLoughlin also encouraged De Smet. In September 1841 he wrote, "if one of you with one or two of the lay brothers could come to assist Messrs. Blanchette [sic] and Demers till

---

[5] One of the Society's most famous endeavours was the development of native farming communities in South America called the Paraguay reductions. Over a period of 150 years the Jesuits established 32 towns or villages where natives enjoyed a special autonomous status under Spanish rule. Each community boasted a school, hospital, church and farms, and elected its own officials annually.

[6] Hiram Martin Chittenden and Alfred Talbot Richardson, eds., *Life, Letters and Travels of Father De Smet Among the North American Indians,* Vols. I-II and III-IV (New York: Francis P. Harper, 1905, reprint ed. New York, Kraus Reprint Inc., 1969); Peter J. De Smet, *Letters and Sketches: with a Narrative of a Year's Residence Among the Indian Tribes of the Rocky Mountains* (Philadelphia: M. Fithian, 1843), Canadian Institute for Historical Microproductions, No. 40925, Microforms/CIHM.

[7] Chittenden and Richardson, *Life, Letters*, III-IV, 1551.

their reinforcements came from Canada it would be an immense benefit to religion." Consequently, when De Smet visited two new Jesuit missions in the Rocky Mountains in 1842, he continued on to the Willamette Valley and met Demers and Blanchet at their large holdings. They offered De Smet some land for a school and church and he accepted the challenge to establish a Jesuit presence in the far west.

McLoughlin had been baptized a Catholic but participated in the Anglican service offered at the various HBC forts where he was stationed. At Fort Vancouver he returned to Catholicism, likely because of Demers and Blanchet. He had married widow Marguerite McKay, a Métis, in a Catholic service and built a small Catholic church on the Fort Vancouver grounds that Nobili would have used. It was replaced by a larger church a few years later. In 1847 Pope Gregory XVI bestowed on McLoughlin the Knighthood of St. Gregory.

After visiting Ireland and Europe in 1843, De Smet chartered the Belgian brig, *L'Infatigable*, under Captain M.J. Moller, to transport more than a ton of supplies and the brave, new recruits: six Belgian nuns from Notre Dame de Namur, Jesuit priests Nobili, Michael Accolti, Anthony Ravalli and Louis Vercruysse, and lay brother Francis Huybrechts. They set sail on 9 January 1844 from the mouth of the Scheldt River, at Antwerp, Belgium, arriving at Fort Vancouver on 4 August. Waiting at the dock to give them a hearty welcome were the most important personnel of the Hudson's Bay Company's Columbia Department: Chief Factor John McLoughlin, his wife Marguerite, Chief Factor James Douglas, resident physician Dr. Forbes Barclay and their wives and children.[8] The road to the main house led past a small village of native and Métis families who would be members of Nobili's congregation for the next ten months while he learned the languages and customs of Oregon Country. There was no time to waste; accommodating to a new environment was a crucial factor in successful Jesuit missions.

De Smet's group went on to the Willamette Valley while Nobili settled in at Fort Vancouver to minister to the families. Records are extant for the baptisms, marriages and funerals he performed during his ten months' residency.[9] As a keen linguist, he quickly acquired the Chinook trading jargon and a working knowledge of English. He was already fluent in Latin, French and Spanish. When the HBC brigade arrived at Fort Vancouver in June 1845, loaded with furs for England, Nobili was prepared to return with it to New Caledonia.

---

[8] Mary Dominica McNamee, *Willamette Interlude* (Palo Alto: Pacific Books, 1959), 132-137.

[9] Harriet Duncan Munnik, ed., *Catholic Church Records of the Pacific Northwest,* trans. Mikell de Lores Wormell Warner (St. Paul, Oregon: French Prairie Press, 1972).

Demers had visited the interior forts as far as Fort St. James with Peter Skene Ogden in 1842 and promised the natives that he would return. But after riding for days in the hot, dusty brigade of 200 horses, traversing steep, narrow mountain trails, and suffering attacks by swarms of mosquitoes and blackflies, one visit was enough.[10] Charged with administering the Columbia missions during Blanchet's absence in eastern Canada and Europe, Demers supported Nobili's desire to go to the interior, not only to fulfill the promise he had made to the natives in 1842, but also because New Caledonia offered a rich field of 9,000 people unhindered by Protestant missionary influence.[11] Although it was against HBC policy, McLoughlin supported their plans. He thought that a priest would have a positive influence on native tribes, thus improving their relationship with the HBC. Nobili also required the approval of De Smet who had recently departed for the Rocky Mountains. So keen was McLoughlin that he arranged for the Fort Walla Walla Express to deliver Nobili's letter seeking approval to De Smet.

In a grand farewell, the brigade left Fort Vancouver on 28 June 1845, with cannon booming and boatmen dressed in their best finery, colourful ribbons streaming from their caps. Brigade leader Chief Trader John Tod from Fort Kamloops, and second in command, Chief Trader Donald Manson from Fort St. James, were responsible for eight or nine clinker-built, 30-foot cedar bateaux, each one manned by a crew of eight plus a steersman. Strong enough to hold three tons, when empty, the boats were lightweight and easy to portage or repair. A year's worth of supplies for ten forts – provisions of every description, from food items to fishhooks, rolls of tobacco and women's clothing---was stowed around the passengers.[12] Baptiste, a young Métis novice, had been chosen to assist Nobili. Accompanying them for the first part of the journey was Father Anthony Ravalli who was going to Fort Colvile to establish St. Paul's church, in an effort to forestall the influence of the Protestant Missions.[13]

---

[10] Carl Landerholm, ed., *Notices & Voyages of the Famed Quebec Mission to the Pacific Northwest* (Portland: Oregon Historical Society, 1956), 152-158

[11] Landerholm, *Notices & Voyages*, 205; Nobili to De Smet, Fort Colvile, 1 June 1846, in P.J. De Smet, *Oregon Missions and Travels over the Rocky Mountains in 1845-46* (New York: Edward Dunigan, 1847), 227; ARSI, Nobili to Roothaan, February-March, 1846, Fort Shuswap (Kamloops).

[12] James R. Gibson, *The Lifeline of the Oregon Country: The Fraser-Columbia Brigade System, 1811-1847* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1997), 104-105. The forts were: Colvile, Okanagan, Kamloops (aka Shuswap or Thompson), Alexandria, George, Fraser, St. James, Kilmaurs (Babine), Connolly (Bears Lake), and McLeod Lake. (Kluskus, an outpost that replaced Fort Chilcotin in 1845, also required supplies).

[13] Demers' description of Protestant influence at Colvile and his desire for assistance is detailed in Landerholm, ed., *Notices & Voyages*, 29-30, 33-35.

When the brigade reached Walla Walla, Nobili found De Smet's letter of approval waiting for him. The last paragraph read:

> I have the strong hope that you are going to become the Apostle of New Caledonia, and the young novice of Vancouver can accompany you. Examine everything with your own eyes: first about the dispositions of these people, about their numbers and the most convenient places for a mission, and then about the need and the expense for this mission. Don't promise anything to any tribe about establishing a mission on their land. After examining everything, come back in the spring to report to the superior of the mission and decide what should be accomplished.[14]

De Smet also wrote to McLoughlin confirming his instructions to Nobili.[15] Nobili was touched by De Smet calling him an apostle, although this emphasized an accepted condition: Jesuits were required to be apostles---to be willing to go forth to all nations, committed to serving the Pope and their superiors with complete obedience and pragmatic zeal.[16] Nobili found Jesuit *esprit* in the fact that he was about the same age as St. Francis Xavier who first introduced missions to India and Japan. Acutely aware of the trials and tribulations of Jesuit missionaries who had set out for India, China, South America and eastern Canada in the previous centuries, he frequently compared himself to their exploits. However, his circumstances may not have been as difficult as those met by these earlier Jesuits because he could rely on the HBC to provide horses, interpreters and guides, to transport supplies, and to accommodate him within the protective walls of its forts. Although he witnessed several calls to arms in standoffs between the natives and the Hudson's Bay personnel, there was never any serious threat to his life.

We find every range of emotion in Nobili's correspondence, revealing a courageous, adaptable and sensitive human being. Despite poor health, having developed pericarditis on the voyage and scurvy two years later, he managed to make contact with all the major tribes in New Caledonia. He ventured beyond the Interior Shuswap, Chilcotin and Carrier reached by Demers in 1842 to the Babines and Sekani in the north, and the Lillooet in the west. During ceremonies, described in detail for Roothaan, the natives assisted in raising flagpoles and crosses, and establishing cemeteries. Nobili estimated that he instructed and baptized 1300 to 1400 adults and children. Before he left a tribe the chiefs were baptized and instructed on how to hold prayer sessions and baptize in his absence.

---

[14] ARSI, Nobili to Roothaan, quoted in French, February-March, 1846, Fort Shuswap.

[15] Chittenden & Richardson, *Lives, Letters and Travels,* III-IV, 1468-1469.

[16] Douglas Letson and Michael Higgins, *The Jesuit Mystique* (Toronto: Macmillan, 1995), 21, 33.

Nobili brought with him the usual European prejudices against First Nations but he soon became impressed with their friendliness and generosity, their ability to memorize or mimic, and their cunning. He wrote that they welcomed him everywhere he went, even when they had meager resources. On his way to Fort Alexandria from Fort George in the bitter cold of February 1847, he was grateful for the generosity of Latai and his wife who were camping beside the Fraser River. They made room in their small shelter for him and two young companions, fed them wild rabbit, and provided two woolen blankets, two coats, and a cloak of rabbit fur, adjusting it around him, "like a loving mother with her child."[17]

From the huge array of encounters with First Nations described in his letters, Nobili's relationship with Grand Chief Nicola (N'kwala) of the Okanagan tribe, stands out. On his first trip north with the brigade he met Nicola and learned that his son, his namesake and successor, had been killed in April by the accidental discharge of a gun in the hands of Fort Colvile employee, Patrick McKenzie. Fearing that Nicola might try to revenge his son's death, John Tod encouraged Nobili to say mass beside the young man's grave. Using an improvised altar that Tod constructed from willow branches and reed mats, Nobili's outdoor service seemed to pacify the chief.[18]

The following spring, Tod sent word to Fort Alexandria that Nicola was threatening to attack Fort Kamloops. Nobili offered to mediate but Chief Trader Alexander Caulfield Anderson and Tod resolved the matter peacefully. Later in the year, while travelling through the Okanagan with the brigade, Nobili met the chief again. When Nicola offered some land for a residence and church, Tod and Manson encouraged Nobili to accept it. Since the border between the United States and New Caledonia was being established, the HBC might require a new access to the Columbia River to replace Fort Colvile and Fort Okanagan. Nobili agreed to Nicola's gift on the condition that the chief promise to give up all his wives except one. Abolishing polygamy had been a major issue for Demers, too, in 1842. He had made the same request of Nicola who gave up four of his five wives. But when Demers did not return the following year as promised, Nicola took them back.[19]

As for relationships with HBC personnel, Nobili timed his visits to the forts so that he would not draw natives away from hunting and fishing or their annual feasts. He was always sensitive to the fact that the forts were not well supplied with provisions, so tried to make do with as little as possible. In exchange for wintering at Fort St. James he taught Donald Manson's

[17] ARSI, Nobili to Roothaan, 9 April 1847, Fort Thompson (Kamloops).
[18] ARSI, Nobili to Roothaan, 31 August 1845, Fort Alexandria.
[19] ARSI, Nobili to Roothaan, 11 August 1846, Fort Thompson (Kamloops).

children reading and mathematics. And since there were no schools at the forts, he encouraged HBC personnel to send their children to the boys' and girls' schools established by the priests and nuns in the Willamette Valley. John Tod and Donald McLean sent their daughters, and John and Marguerite McLoughlin sent their granddaughters to the Sisters of Notre Dame.[20]

Adaptation came in many forms. From his letters we know that Nobili, De Smet and the nuns copied from Blanchet and Demers the illustration of the history of the Catholic church, called the "Catholic Ladder," to use as a teaching aid.[21] The ladder was first developed in 1838 by Blanchet in the form of a Sahale stick (Chinook jargon for "stick from heaven") on which were carved simple notations for the forty centuries from creation to the Christian era, the thirty years of Christ's life, and "the period to Blanchet's arrival." A two-dimensional, illustrated version was soon drawn on cloth, with explanations for the notations written in French. De Smet had lithographed copies made to distribute to the various missions and Nobili took one with him to the interior. In a letter to Roothaan he described how the Chilcotins carefully studied the figures and the clothing in the illustrations. His methodology was also similar to that initiated by Blanchet and Demers. He usually spent at least one week with a tribe, and before leaving gave out rewards: small crosses to youngsters who had memorized the catechism and some of the prayers, and medals or larger crosses to the chiefs. What catechism he used is unkown. The complexity of his instruction increased according to the age of the students.[22] Nobili intensified the desire for this reward by refusing to baptize immediately most of the participants. They had to prove their sincerity by behaving themselves and waiting until his second visit. There is evidence that the chiefs considered the cross a status or power symbol, possibly a symbol of "good medicine," and this may be the main reason why black robes received hearty welcomes. HBC employee George Ross wrote to HBC Governor George Simpson, "for in the…ceremonious way of teaching, the Indians are quite confounded & think it is some great Medicine, similar to their own idolatry." The generous dispensing of tobacco and extra food were additional incentives.[23]

Two of Nobili's most difficult adjustments were to the food and travelling on water. The New Caledonia diet of dried salmon, called *barder* or *bardeau* because it was as hard as a shingle, was known to all HBC

[20] McNamee, *Willamette Interlude*, 200.

[21] Philip M. Hanley, *History of the Catholic Ladder* (Washington: Ye Galleon Press, 1993), 10-11; McNamee, *Willamette Interlude*, 111; Catholic Ladder, Oregon History Project, www.ohs.org. <accessed 20 July 2014>.

[22] ARSI, Nobili to Roothaan, 30 November 1845, Fort Alexandria.

[23] D. Ross to George Simpson, 10 July 1846, D.5/18,f31a, Hudson's Bay Company Archives.

employees as far east as York Factory. At hiring time boatmen had refused to sign up to work in New Caledonia, even when offered a large bonus. In Nobili's case, the poor food eventually led to scurvy.

Except for the 150-mile horse trail from Fort Okanagan to Fort Alexandria, all brigade travel was by canoe or bateaux. HBC boatmen were ordered to portage the most dangerous rapids, but almost every year someone drowned. The crosses marking the burial sites along the riverbanks certainly did nothing to calm Nobili's fears. He could not swim and walked whenever possible. Nevertheless, he saw the humour in some of his difficult situations. He described one trip on Stuart Lake in late November, when the boatmen whistled for wind for the sails in order to cut through the waves as fast as possible. Just as fervently Nobili prayed for calm weather – and his prayers were answered.[24]

Nobili's love of words and languages is one of the major strengths of his letters. Although his prose was no match for De Smet's romantic style, he described his adventures in vivid detail, frequently employing dialogue. He apologized for his prolixity and acknowledged that he hoped his letters would be read aloud in the Italian seminaries. Concerned that Roothaan might question their veracity, he assured him that at all times he strictly followed the information in his diary.

Many of his vignettes must have delighted the seminarians as three examples suggest. On one occasion, Chief Nicola, dressed in the cloak of scarlet red given to him by HBC Governor George Simpson, reminded Nobili of a cardinal. At Fort Kilmaurs the natives huddled in the candlelight in Nobili's room, sang with him to the tune of a French march, as he translated a prayer into Carrier. Another time, John Tod's little daughter, Mary, was terrified by what seemed to be black-robed ghosts when the Sisters of Notre Dame formed a circle by lamplight to welcome her to their Willamette boarding school late at night.

Nobili liberally employed his expanded vocabulary, weaving French Canadian, Italian and native words into the texts. His kettle is a *caldaruccia;* the brigade leader a c*ondottiero*, or a *cavalier;* snowshoes are *raquets*, the woven baskets to catch fish, *varveaux*. The Kallispel words *quailak lakacikt* meant "black robe, our father". He warned Roothaan, "Don't be surprised, Father, that my Italian is becoming more and more difficult to write, and almost impossible to speak without mixing it with French, English, Chinook or whatever. It's not my fault." We can imagine his distress when, after two years of not speaking Italian he returned to Willamette and had difficulty

[24] ARSI, Nobili to Roothaan, 28 September 1846, Fort St. James.

conversing with Father Accolti. The two old friends had to revert to a mixture of French and Italian.[25]

After almost three years of ministering to First Nations, Nobili's major crisis came at Fort Kamloops in March 1847 when he received a letter from Joseph Joset, who had replaced De Smet as his superior, advising that he would not be able to establish any missions beyond the Okanagan as planned:

> I would like to always have good news to tell you but, alas, this is not the case. What I have to tell you is something that will make your heart ache, but I have no doubt that you will be able to accept everything that the Lord orders through our Rev. Father General. His Paternity limits the field of our action to the country south of the Columbia, leaving all the rest to the secular priests, and to other religious people who accompany Mgr. the Apostolic Vicarate [Norbert Blanchet]….Next spring don't leave anything behind, animals or goods, but bring everything back to Colvile or to Walla Walla.[26]

Joset appealed to Nobili's vows of obedience to accept the decision, but Nobili's subsequent letters reveal considerable inner torment. He wrote to Roothaan on 25 April 1847, quoting his reply to Joset written on 16 March 1847 at Kamloops:

> Do you really believe that our reverend father gave such a positive and absolute order to leave this field for south of the Columbia, and that he did not leave anything to the discretion of the immediate superiors who govern this far away mission? Would our reverend father have given this order if he had received the news that we have already occupied and cultivated that field, following the recommendations of Mgr. Blanchet himself? – Or would he have given this order now that I think he has been informed by my letter that we have established many churches among these poor savages, that we have baptized almost 1,000 people.

Nobili ended his letter to Roothaan by stating his preference for a replacement: "it is not enough for this country, a casual priest called here by Mgr. Blanchet. You need one who is called by God to the mission – and to this mission in particular. Mgr. Demers himself is afraid and runs away."[27]

Nobili joined the brigade when it passed by Okanagan Lake in late spring, in order to seek medical advice from Dr. Forbes Barclay at Fort Vancouver for scurvy. He then visited Jesuit headquarters in the Willamette Valley and met with Father Accolti and Father Joset. With the intercession of Accolti, Joset allowed him to return to the Okanagan and provided an assistant Jesuit priest, Anthony Goetz.[28] During the measles epidemic and

---

[25] ARSI, Nobili to Roothaan, 18 September 1847, Oregon City.

[26] ARSI, Nobili to Roothaan, 25 April 1847, from St. Joseph's, Okanagan Lake, quoting from Joset's letter, undated.

[27] ARSI, Nobili to Roothaan, 21 May 1847, St. Joseph's.

[28] In August 1847, Archbishop Francis Norbert Blanchet arrived from Europe with twenty-one recruits for the Oregon missions. Among them were three Jesuit priests,

the long, cold winter of 1847/48, Nobili and Goetz resided at the log house Chief Nicola had built near the brigade stopping place, Talle d'epinette, at the north end of Okanagan Lake. The chief and members of his tribe had also grubbed out a garden of six plots, centered by a 40 foot cedar cross, and planted potatoes and turnip seed. Nobili named the site St. Joseph's, for the patriarchal protector of Christians.[29]

In one of his last contacts with Nicola, Nobili surprised the chief by advising him to take back all his wives. Sharing De Smet's aspirations, Nobili had wanted to build houses for single and elderly native women similar to the Paraguay reductions but his experience with the various tribes during the past three years had helped him to understand that polygamy was necessary in northern native communities where widows, children and elderly women needed a protector. They would be a burden if they returned with children to their home tribes. He wrote to Roothaan:

> He [Nicola] looked astonished….He stared at me, and finally he said that he was surprised to hear me talking so differently from the way I spoke last summer, when as a condition for the establishment of a house on his land I had asked him with such fervour to limit himself to only one woman. But since I was now changing my mind for strong reasons, he would obey me. "You see," I replied, "this is because I think highly of your faithfulness to the promise, of your old age, of your fear and praise of God, and I know for certain that you will not abuse the other women, so I allow you to keep them in your lodge for now." Nicola responded, "I am old now. I am not a child – don't doubt me."[30]

Nobili was not alone in realizing that it was necessary to adapt policy to meet local conditions. By April 1852, Roothaan also realized that De Smet's dream of establishing reductions at the Rocky Mountain missions was impractical because the natives had to leave their farms to gather and hunt in order to survive. He wrote to De Smet: "It seems that the idea of renewing the miracles of Paraguay amid those mountains was a Utopia…. the nature of the land is quite different and one cannot hope to wean the bulk of the savages from their nomadic life during a great part of the year when they are on the hunt and scattered and disbanded."[31]

In the spring of 1848 Nobili had been eager to receive written approval from Roothaan that he could carry on with his mission. He joined the first brigade from Fort Kamloops to Fort Langley in May, hoping that a letter had arrived by ship. The brigade was led by Donald Manson, assisted by Chief

---

Gregory Gazzoli, Anthony Goetz, and Joseph Menetrey. Wilfred P. Schoenberg, *Paths to the Northwest*: *A Jesuit History of the Oregon Province* (Chicago: Loyola Press,1982), 54.

[29] Gerald McKevitt, S.J., provides an excellent analysis of why the First Nations accepted European Jesuits in "Northwest Indian Evangelization by European Jesuits, 1841-1909," *The Catholic Historical Review,* 91, no. 4 (2005): 688-713.

[30] ARSI, Nobili to Roothaan, 30 May 1847, Fort Okanogan.

[31] Roothaan to De Smet, April 15, 1852, in Garraghan, *Jesuits*, Vol. 11, p. 438.

Trader Alexander Caulfield Anderson. The new route was entirely in New Caledonia because the 49th parallel was now the border. Steep and rocky in places through the Cascade Mountains, it lacked sufficient pasture for horses, and proved so strenuous that 150 animals died either on the return journey or during the following winter. Supposedly because of the stress, one of Anderson's packers, Jacob Ballenden, committed suicide at the Fraser River campsite near Spuzzum. Nobili conducted the burial service.

At Fort Langley Nobili was deeply disappointed to find no letter of encouragement from Roothaan. Nevertheless, he sent a message to Goetz to continue building new accommodation at St. Joseph's and to plant some beets, "his favourites."[32] With his intense determination, and assistance from Goetz, Nobili might have succeeded in holding on to his mission, but he had not taken a barrel of lime juice with him from Walla Walla in the fall of 1847 and scurvy made it impossible to do much work.

St. Joseph's was abandoned in late 1848 when Joset took Nobili to St. Mary's Mission in the Bitterroot Valley. Fathers Ravalli and Mengarini nursed him back to health and in 1849 he made his final profession at St. Ignatius Mission. Reduced funding from Europe meant that none of the Catholic missions in the Willamette Valley was doing well, either secular or Jesuit, but the California gold rush provided an opportunity to pay off their debts.

Father Accolti accompanied Nobili to San Francisco, where Joseph Allemenay, Bishop of Monterey and California, asked Nobili to supervise the restoration of an abandoned Franciscan mission into Santa Clara College. In time it evolved into Santa Clara University. Fathers Goetz, Gregorio Mengarini and Peter DeVos joined Nobili and in 1851 the Sisters of Notre Dame also moved from Willamette to nearby San Jose. In 1855 Father Accolti assisted in establishing St. Ignatius Church and College in San Francisco and taught at Santa Clara College. Unfortunately, in 1856, just when the future of the college looked secure, Nobili stepped on a rusty nail while supervising the restoration and died from tetanus. He was only 46 years old.[33]

Nobili's work paved the way for the Oblate missionaries who arrived in the interior in 1859, during British Columbia's gold rush. Wherever they went First Nations people pulled out treasured slips of paper that a decade earlier had been hastily torn from Nobili's breviary and inscribed with

---

[32] Nobili to Father Goetz, 6 June 1848, en route to Fort Langley, *Woodstock Letters,* trans. W.J. Davis, S.J., photocopy, E/A/N66, British Columbia Archives.

[33] John Bernard McGloin, "John Nobili, S.J., Founder of California's Santa Clara College: The New Caledonia Years, 1845-1848," *British Columbia Historical Quarterly,* v. 17 *(*July-Oct, 1953), 192-195.

their baptismal names. Today, Catholicism continues to play an important part in the lives of the Interior Shuswap, Chilcotin and Carrier peoples. By expanding our knowledge of missionary work with the Hudson's Bay Company and First Nations, and our general knowledge of First Nations and the HBC personnel, the letters make a tremendous contribution to British Columbia and Canadian history, and to the history of the Pacific Northwest.[34]

[34] Other publications on early religious activity in the Pacific Northwest include: Jacqueline Peterson and Laura Peers, *Sacred Encounters: Father De Smet and the Indians of the Rocky Mountain West* (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1993); Patricia Killen, "Writing the Pacific Northwest into Canadian and U.S. Catholic History," CCHA *Historical Studies* 66 (2000): 74-91.

CCHA *Historical Studies*, 80 (2014), 43-62

Calling Them to Their Duties: William Henry Judge, S.J., American Missionary to the Canadian North

David A. Kingma

On 18 January 1899, the headline of the *Klondike Nugget* of Dawson City reported a local event that was already well known to most of its readers: "'Father' Judge, as all loved to call him, both Catholics and Protestants alike, died at the hospital he has cared for so long and lovingly on Monday afternoon, January 16th, at 1:30." Dawsonites clearly shared the editor's esteem. News of his death two days earlier had immediately circulated, filled the town by nightfall, then spread up the gold bearing creeks so quickly that one traveler imagined it outdoing his own pace.[1] It was as if everyone could recognize that their young, still tenuous community had lost its one irreplaceable man, William H. Judge, S.J. Within days of his passing Judge was being called the "Saint of Dawson," an epithet repeated by historians, fellow clerics and local boosters ever since.[2] Although the outlines of Judge's career are well known, by drawing from a wider array of sources, this article relates a more complete, nuanced story, and reveals how circumstances and

[1] Editor, "The Klondiker's Friend; Rev. William H. Judge, S.J., Part I," *Donahoe's Magazine,* 54, no. 4 (1905): 587-589.

[2] Some of many examples include: Louis Renner, S.J., "The 'Saint of Dawson,'" *North/Nord: Indian and Northern Affairs Canada*, 30, no. 1 (Spring, 1983): 38-43; K. Coates and W. Morrison, *Land of the Midnight Sun: A History of the Yukon* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2005), 116; "The Saint of Saint Mary's," in Mary Lee Davis, *Sourdough Gold* (Boston: W.A. Wilde Co., 1933), 120-130; Pierre Berton, *Klondike: The Life and Death of the Last Great Gold Rush* (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1958), 73; Editor, "Forces of Change – Dawson City," *Alaska Geographic*, 15, no. 2 (1988): 48; Trevor Ashfield, "Father William Judge, the 'Saint of Dawson', Commemorated," Environment Canada Press Release, 17 August 1991; Dan Davidson, "The 'Saint of Dawson' Finds a Place in History," *The Yukon Sun,* 12 September 1991; John Richthammer, "Saintly stampeder lives on," *Yukon News*, 19 July 1999 and "The venerable life of a sainted priest," *Mission Canada,* Winter, 1999/2000; Alistair Burns, "'Saint of Dawson' Commemorated in Bronze," *B.C. Catholic*, 27 May 2014.

personalities in Dawson produced ecumenical harmony, and suggests why he is still referred to as a "saint."

Father Judge's role in the early history of Dawson City appears to illustrate perfectly what social historian Charlene Porsild has argued, that Dawson was in many ways an 'instant' city, whose residents sought to replicate as quickly as possible the social norms, structures and class lines of the established communities they had left.[3] Unlike other gold rush towns of the era, a wide range of religious and social institutions was in place from its very beginning in 1897, the most prominent among them being Judge's St. Mary's Catholic Church and Hospital. Not coincidentally, violence and general lawlessness also were remarkably rare. A quite different scenario is easy to imagine, especially in mid-1898 when thousands of fortune seekers arrived *en masse*, only to find all claims worth working already taken. With saloons in abundance and streets full of idle men, many made destitute by their journey or frustrated by bureaucratic incompetence and petty fraud, Dawson City could well have descended into chaos.[4] Most of the new arrivals, however, were serious of intent, respectful of authority and had little interest in civil disorder. Historians have given ample credit to the North-West Mounted Police (NWMP) for Dawson's relative calm. Besides routinely securing the peace, the NWMP tolerated a certain level of vice, yet reinforced familiar social standards through such means as requiring all business activity to cease from midnight Saturday until Monday morning.[5] But enforcing Sunday observance alone could not have reproduced this familiar cultural exercise without church communities in place to animate and complete it. By mid-1898, along with St. Mary's, a choice of Anglican, Presbyterian, Methodist and Salvation Army services was available for those

[3] Charlene Porsild, *Gamblers and Dreamers: Women, Men and Community in the Klondike* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1998), 191-199, and Porsild, "Creating New Angles of Repose: Northern Canadian Communities in a Nation Context," in Kerry Abel and Ken S. Coates, eds., *Northern Visions: New Perspectives on the North in Canadian History* (Peterborough, ON: Broadview Press, 2001), 117-125.

[4] Political historian David Morrison notes that William Ogilvie, Yukon Territory Commissioner, needed to devote 48% of his first budget ($100,000) in 1898-99, to the care of indigents. (*The Politics of the Yukon Territory, 1898-1909* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1968), 21-22 and 12-17; S. Hall Young, *Hall Young of Alaska, "The Mushing Parson," the Autobiography of S. Hall Young* (New York: Fleming H. Revell Co., 1927), 341, 362-372; Kathryn Winslow, *Big Pan-Out: The Story of the Klondike Gold Rush* (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1951), 145-151; Tappan Adney, *The Klondike Stampede* (New York: Harper & Bros., 1900), 432-441; Pierre Berton, *The Klondike Fever* (New York: Alfred Knopf, 1958), 324-332.

[5] Adney, *Klondike Stampede*, 433; Thomas Stone, "The Mounties as Vigilantes: Perceptions of Community and the Transformation of Law in the Yukon, 1885-1897," *Law & Society Review*, 14, no. 1 (Autumn, 1979): 83-114; Coates and Morrison, *Midnight Sun*, 105-114; Berton, *Klondike Fever*, 318-324; Walter Hamilton, *The Yukon Story* (Vancouver: Mitchell Press Ltd., 1964), 115-129.

seeking a salubrious alternative to usual mining town pursuits. Pastoral solicitude could be found at Father Judge's hospital as well, along with rudimentary medical care, provided without charge when necessary. The great majority of patients were given a second chance at their ventures, often as changed men, while the remarkably few who died received a burial that reminded all of the dignity of life.[6] This paper contends that religious praxis during Father Judge's time in Dawson City took a form that valued succor over public morality and common cause over sectarian and social class differentiation.

Perhaps Judge's motivation to provide miners with medical care stemmed in part from his own experience with poor health in his youth. Born in Baltimore in 1850, unspecified health problems at age fifteen forced him to abandon his plans to attend college in preparation for joining the Maryland Province Jesuits. Instead, for the next decade he supported his family by working as a clerk in a large woodworking mill. During his formative years, in place of studies, he did physical labor and acquired a wide variety of practical skills. Though he could not have known it at the time, this was the very training that would serve him so well as an Alaskan missionary.[7] And unlike most Jesuit aspirants of the day, whose religious formation developed in an academic setting, Judge matured within his large and fervently Catholic family. One brother and three sisters eventually also joined religious orders.[8] As revealed in *An American Missionary*, the published compendium of letters Judge wrote to these four siblings, their home environment seems to have favored personal piety – intense, yet modest and pragmatic – over doctrinal concerns. That too would better equip him for ministry in the far north.

On 23 August 1875, now a tested twenty-five year old, Judge joined a class of twenty other new Jesuit novices at Frederick, Maryland. He

---

[6] Editor, *Donahoe's Magazine*, 54, no. 4 (1905): 581-585.

[7] Charles J. Judge, S.S., *An American Missionary: A Record of the Work of Rev. William H. Judge, S.J.* (New York: Maryknoll, 1907), 1-2; Mary Joseph Calasanctius, S.S.A., *The Voice of Alaska: Memoirs of a Missioner* (Lachine, PQ: Saint Ann's Press, 1947), 140-145.

[8] Judge's father Henry Judge and first wife, Ellen McNulty, emigrated from Ireland shortly after their marriage in 1834, settling first in Kingston, Jamaica. They had three sons, but the third childbirth proved fatal to Ellen. Her sister, Anne McNulty, went to Jamaica to help care for the children, then accepted Henry's marriage proposal. The new couple relocated from Jamaica to Baltimore in mid-1841, and Henry established himself as a respected organ-builder and musician. Henry and Anne had nine children over a fifteen year period (1840-1855), of whom William Henry was the sixth. One of William's older brothers distinguished himself by defying his father's wishes and joining the Confederate forces during the Civil War. (Jesuit Oregon Province Archives (hereafter JOPA), "Genealogical materials," William H. Judge Papers, 1/13).

progressed through his scholastic curriculum in typical fashion, and received his ordination from Cardinal James Gibbons, Archbishop of Baltimore, on 28 August 1886. Indicating a recognition of the young priest's maturity, Judge's superiors gave him a first assignment that entailed considerable responsibility – House Minister for Woodstock College, a complex with no less than two hundred men in residence. "I must stop," he concluded a letter to his sister during that time, "it is now eleven P.M., and my alarm goes off at quarter before four." Yet he was happy and confident, despite "no end of causes of worry and vexation in the management of a big community like this."[9] A similar position followed at the Frederick Novitiate, and then for unexplained reasons Judge requested a transfer to the Rocky Mountain Mission in the Pacific Northwest. He pronounced his final vows 13 May 1890 at Sacred Heart Mission, on the Cœur d'Alene Indian Reservation in north central Idaho.[10] This formally concluded the fifteen year period typical of the Jesuit religious training process. No time was lost in beginning the next phase, however, for a month later Judge was on his way to St. Michael, Alaska, by way of steamer out of San Francisco. Two days before sailing he wrote his superior, Rev. Joseph Cataldo, S.J., "My health is good & I was never happier in my life – May God grant me grace & strength to do & suffer something for His Glory."[11] Hardship and suffering were expected features of the Alaska Mission, which had been established only four years earlier, but apparently the clear-eyed Cataldo considered him ready for the ordeals that awaited.

Judge's assignments for the next four years were at the Holy Cross and Nulato Missions on the middle Yukon. To the Sisters of St. Ann at Holy Cross he seemed divinely fitted for the work of the Alaska Missions. With equal ease he could add a hot water reservoir to the kitchen stove, construct a bake oven and become the mission baker, devise a sauna system for scurvy victims, decorate for Christmas and then delight the children as Santa Claus.[12] Judge applied his clerical skills every summer at St. Michael near the mouth of the Yukon, managing shipments of provisions for the scattered stations of the Jesuit Alaska Mission. It is clear from letters to his superiors that he took this crucial task seriously and was very adept at it.[13] During the winters of 1891 and 1892, Judge went by dog sled up the Shageluk [now Innoko]

---

[9] *Catalogus Provincia Marylandiae Neo-Eboracensis Societatis Jesu* (Woodstock, Maryland: 1887), 33; Judge, *American Missionary*, 11-13.

[10] JOPA, "Personnel records," Judge Papers, 1/1.

[11] JOPA, Judge to Joseph Cataldo, S.J., 8 June 1890, Judge Papers, 1/18.

[12] Calasanctius, *Voice of Alaska*, 140-144; Margaret Cantwell, S.S.A., *North to Share: The Sisters of Saint Ann in Alaska and the Yukon Territory* (Victoria, BC: Sisters of St. Ann, 1992), 67-68.

[13] JOPA, Tosi to Cataldo, 24 June 1891, Tosi Papers, 1:17, and "Correspondence to Jesuit Superiors," Judge Papers, 1/18.

River on month-long excursions to missionize among the five native villages in the region. His reports to Cataldo disclose that his zeal was no exception to the spirit of sectarian competition that had framed missionary expansion in Alaska ever since other faiths began to enter the once exclusive Russian Orthodox domain.[14] Episcopalian Reverend John Chapman, in January 1889, had been the first to visit the natives of the Shageluk drainage, two years before Fr. Judge's opening venture into the area. En route back to Holy Cross at the end of his own first excursion, Judge stopped briefly at Anvik, where Chapman had established his base of operations. Judge took special care to stay with the natives in their "cacino" despite the other cleric's invitation of hospitality, lest he leave them with the impression that he approved of Chapman's religious teaching. "This is one of the largest villages on the river and it makes me feel badly to see it in the hands of the Protestants," Judge decried. He repeated this pattern in his 1892 visit to Anvik. Needing to leave the "cacino" because of overcrowding, he opted to stay with the local trader, a brother of the Russian priest, again rather than with Chapman.[15]

[14] "The action of the Board is none too soon," Rev. Sheldon Jackson admonished the Presbyterian Board of Home Missions after it commissioned him to Alaska in the spring of 1878, "as the Jesuits are also entering the field." (Ted C. Hinckley, "Missionaries, Indians and Politics," in Mary Childers Mangusso and Stephen W. Haycox, eds., *Interpreting Alaska's History: An Anthology* [Anchorage: Alaska Pacific University Press, 1989], 162). Full treatment of the important subject of competition and cooperation among proselytizers of the Christian faith in Alaska is beyond the scope of this paper, but it may be useful to note some relevant features. First, the opening of the Alaska mission field to Americans followed directly after the "Grant Peace Policy" episode, which had greatly inflamed sectarian antagonism among American missionary groups. Second, competition was far more intense for native recruits than within white communities, because natives converted as whole bands and then adopted long term identification with whichever sect had first initiated the conversion. Third, competition was mitigated by the fact that northern natives were so dispersed over such a vast territory. This allowed each denomination, including Catholics, to monopolize within their informally designated region of influence. That exercise of pragmatism was a principal driving force behind the U.S. and Canadian Protestants' Ecumenical Missionary Conference of 1900 (New York), which in turn culminated in the 1910 Edinburgh World Missionary Conference. The report of that latter's Commission VIII, "Cooperation and Promotion of Unity," remains a remarkable and interesting document. For further study: Alexander Krivonosov, *Where East Meets West: A Landscape of Familiar Strangers – Missionary Alaska, 1794-1898* (Thesis, Pennsylvania State University, 2008), online at http://etda.libraries.psu.edu/theses/approved/WorldWideIndex/ETD-2684/index.html, <accessed 23 May 2014>; documents of the above cited 1900 conference, online at https://archive.org/stream/ecumenicalmiss01unknuoft#page/, and 1910 conference, online at http://www.edinburgh2010.org/en/resources/1910-conference.html, <both accessed 9 June 2014>.

[15] John Wight Chapman, *Forty Years in Anvik* (Hartford: Church Missions Publishing Co., Soldier and Servant Series Pub. No. 162, February, 1931); JOPA, Judge to Joseph Cataldo, S.J., 19 June 1891 and 2 June 1892, Judge Papers, 1/18.

A steamboat stopping at Nulato in mid August, 1894, delivered into Judge's hands a directive from his immediate superior, Father Pasquale Tosi, S.J., to board that same steamer and begin a new mission a thousand miles upriver at Forty Mile. In 1886, substantial gold deposits had been found in the Fortymile River drainage, and a supply depot for the new strike quickly formed on the flats where that stream flowed into the Yukon.[16] By 1894 Forty Mile had become the main economic hub in the upper Yukon, large enough that its occupants and visitors could choose between two bakeries, restaurants, dance halls, blacksmiths or doctors. There was a hardware store, theater, barber shop, and school, a tinsmith, dressmaker, watch repairman, and a few prostitutes, of course, along with numerous saloons and distilleries. The first contingent of NWMP in the Yukon Territory had purposefully located its base, Fort Constantine, in ready proximity to the boisterous new town. Father Judge initially expected a population of about eight or nine hundred; he later estimated there were one hundred and fifty based in the town site, with another five hundred out in the neighborhood. Though Forty Mile itself was in Canada, most of the diggings were in Alaska and Americans comprised the majority of the community. It depended almost entirely on supplies from San Francisco via the Yukon, and sold nothing but U.S. stamps in its simple post office. Unlike Dawson City, its successor, Forty Mile was populated by veteran miners, who held scant interest in structured society. Styled as a "community of hermits," Fortymilers seemed to have had in common little more than a mutual passion for independence and habit of isolation. Few showed interest in the Anglican church services available at nearby Buxton Mission, though some made use of the Mission's library. In his own efforts to "bring them back to their duties," Judge later described them as "men who have been running away from civilization as it advanced westward in the States, until now they have no farther to go, and have to stop here."[17] Tosi's directive initiated a major redirection in Judge's career, one which his brother and future biographer would later frame as an "American missionary" to the Canadian North.[18]

---

[16] No records are found that explain why Tosi extended the Jesuit Alaska Mission endeavor to the white mining community, when his resources were already spread painfully thin, or why he chose Judge in particular. Among Tosi's available personnel, only Judge and fellow Marylander, Francis Barnum, were not European transplants, and of these two Judge was considerably more experienced and able to perform independently. Acceptance of responsibility for the mining community, it can be safely assumed, was likely seen as a temporary commitment consistent with the Jesuit ethos to respond to any point of greatest need.

[17] Judge, *American Missionary*, 128-129, 162-165; Coates and Morrison, *Midnight Sun*, 53-58; Michael Gates, *Gold at Fortymile Creek: Early Days in the Yukon* (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1994), 32, 55-56, 69-71, 74-76, 81, 97; Berton, *Klondike Fever*, 17-23.

[18] This is, of course, the title phrase chosen by Rev. Charles Judge, S.S., for his published compendium of letters received from and about his renowned Jesuit sibling. Himself a product of the nursery of Catholicism in the U.S., Charles Judge was likely

Supremely content in his second Alaska Mission assignment at Nulato, Judge was afforded all of a half hour to drop his commitments there before embarking on the *Arctic*, "to that new and undesirable [Forty Mile] Mission, leaving behind me my much beloved Indians." A few weeks later, however, he was able to tell his family, "But I assure you, I have never felt happier or more like a Jesuit than I do now; and I am sure it will not be long before I am as much attached to this new Mission as I was to the other … Of course, miners, as a rule, 'ain't no saints'; but I am not afraid, and in fact I rather like to deal with such men." Firm intentions notwithstanding, it is unlikely he ever developed such feelings for Forty Mile. The venture certainly did not start well. Upon arrival he purchased a lot and began to construct a log cabin on it, but soon learned that the demijohn of mass wine shipped to him from Holy Cross had broken en route. Judge first tried without success to obtain a supply from Anglican Bishop William Bompas at Buxton Mission. Then, deciding it would be fruitless to missionize without being able to offer mass, he re-boarded the *Arctic* on its downriver run to retrieve a replacement at Holy Cross. By the time he was ready to go back, water in the upper Yukon was too low for any further steamer traffic that year. So, he spent the winter of 1894/95 among the Shageluk Indians, trying to establish a permanent mission station there, before engaging in his usual summer duties at St. Michael. Returning at last to Forty Mile on 13 September 1895, Judge chose this time to rent instead of build, largely because in his absence the Alaska Commercial Company had reclaimed his supply of logs to construct its own headquarters. A double cabin – one side a bungalow, the other a chapel – was leased for a year, costing Judge a modest $9.17 per month. Finally, after a full year's delay, he could begin in earnest his ministry to the miners of Forty Mile.[19]

Now a solitary priest in a newly founded mission, Judge began to document his ministerial activities on a regular basis. These notations were recorded in three journal books that are currently with his personal papers in the Jesuit Oregon Province Archives. Though he used the title "Diary of Forty Mile Mission," this resource includes a retrospective account of

---

practicing, probably unconsciously, what has been called "an ecclesial agenda of constructing an 'American' Roman Catholicism … understood as rooted in the English Genteel, Maryland Catholic tradition and appropriated by all right thinking immigrants to the U.S." (Patricia O'Connell Killen, "Writing the Pacific Northwest into Canadian and U.S. Catholic History: Geography, Demographics, and Regional Religion," CCHA *Historical Studies* 66 (2000): 81). There is no evidence whatsoever in William Judge's writings that a nationalistic agenda or bias played a part in his ministry in the far north. It is my view that Charles Judge meant to convey little more than a general sense of 'Local Boy Makes Good' in his choice of title wording.

[19] JOPA, preface to "Diary of Forty Mile Mission," Judge Papers, 2/2; Judge, *American Missionary,* 128-130.

events in 1894 as well as subsequent events in Dawson City through August, 1898. His journal entries while at Forty Mile reveal no more enthusiasm for his ministry than seen by the clerics of Buxton Mission. Attendance at his masses was always sparse. Only four communicants joined him, for example, at Christmas Mass, 1895, and the same at Easter, 1896. One telling entry, 3 December 1896, reads "Mass at 6~. 2 Communions. After breakfast went down the creek & saw a number of Canadians who were once Catholics, but could not get them to their duties." On 27 April 1897: "Went to Cudahy & tried to get Mr. Chapman to think of his soul & the hereafter – but could not succeed." Four days later Judge penned, "Mr. Chapman, who has been sick at Cudahy, died this afternoon … He died as he lived, without faith." Judge only occasionally included entries with autobiographical and historical details, one of which was a laconic account of his four-week tour of the creeks in January 1896. One day on the trail was particularly cold, minus 50°F, and it ended "with difficulty," having to make a fire in the O'Brien Creek house and rub circulation back into a frozen foot with snow. Judge was much more forthcoming about that same day in a letter to his sister, in which he revealed that he had been walking for two hours with wet feet, how very close to exhaustion he had become as night descended, and would likely have missed the empty, floorless cabin in the dark if his dog had not recognized it. For that precious fire he had had to retrieve a candle from his sled without gloves, since they were frozen solid and useless, and then crawl up the incline back to the cabin on his knees and elbows. Later in the tour he was housebound as a miner's guest for ten days while waiting out a minus 60°F to 80°F cold spell to ease. From a sacramental perspective, Judge noted in his diary, "it was a good place to be as I had six or seven at Mass every day."[20]

Another reason Judge probably did not develop a strong attachment to Forty Mile was the August 1896, Klondike gold strike which began drawing away his parish before it really had a chance to form. Even prior to the strike prospectors were flooding into the region; in his 23 May 1896 diary entry, Judge estimated that the first steamer of the season was carrying five to six hundred men on their way farther upriver. Aboard the *Arctic* when it departed Forty Mile on 16 October, just two months after the discovery, he noted no fewer than a hundred Fortymilers heading for the new bonanza. Rumors about first comers taking upwards of $100 per shovelful or refusing $50,000 purchase offers for their claims fueled the exodus. Good claims were expected to hold six to seven million dollars in placer gold.[21] Judge

[20] JOPA, "Diary of Forty Mile," Judge Papers, 1/30 and 2/1-2; Judge, *American Missionary*, 166-169.

[21] JOPA, "Diary of Forty Mile," Judge Papers, 2/1-2; Judge, *American Missionary*, 179; Providence Archives, Seattle, Judge to Rev. Mother Joseph, S.P., 28 December 1896.

was unsurprised; he had been around miners long enough to see first hand how they could quite outdo Jesuits in the art of detachment from place and present circumstance.[22] Had the *Arctic* not closed operations for the winter, he may well have placed himself on its next run upriver to the entrepôt that would soon become Dawson City.

How Judge spent his detainment at Forty Mile over the winter of 1896/97 explains much of his later notable success. In fact it seems not a moment was wasted. By the end of January 1897, he had somehow "secured" a three acre site in Dawson City, asked the Sisters of Providence to staff the hospital he intended to build,[23] and purchased 5000 feet of lumber with which to build it. Ordinary 50 x 100 feet building lots, he wrote his brother two days after Christmas, were already selling for $1000, and the real rush had not even begun. To further motivate the Sisters he cautioned, "But it is very important for you to take it at once, for the Episcopalian Mission will open one if you do not. They brought everything last year for a hospital at Circle City but could not get it up on account of the Steamers being overloaded." The day came at last, 22 March 1897, when Judge "started at 8 a.m. with Mr. Young and John, my boy, for Dawson City. Mr. Young will cut logs for me. I will visit the mines … & see about a place to build a Church and Hospital." Entering into the endeavor that would come to define him was a naturally pragmatic, disciplined and confident man, now middle-aged but in generally sound health, and hardened by nearly seven demanding years in the north. It took the small party four days to reach the cabin of Alex McDonald, soon to become the "Klondike King," in Dawson City. On Saturday, 10 April, two days after a two week fundraising tour along the creeks, Judge tersely scribed, "Bought ground for building from Smith and Anderson for three

[22] During this period, miners in the far north followed a recurrent seasonal pattern of concentration and dispersal, accompanied by a continual reshuffling of group affiliation. Their mobility, both in geographic and social terms, was appropriate to meeting the requirements for survival in the Yukon environment and maximizing their chance of success in the long odds business of prospecting for major undiscovered ore deposits. (See: Thomas Stone, "Flux and Authority in a Subarctic Society: The Yukon Miners in the Nineteenth Century," *Ethnohistory* 30, No. 4 (Autumn 1983): 203-216.) Jesuits, for their part, are renowned for emphasizing the importance of obedience to superiors and willingness to go wherever the gospel is deemed most needed. The desire to be "pilgrim priests," with "the attitude of a voluntary exile who wishes to follow Christ in total renunciation, in poverty, in chastity, in total trust in Divine Providence," can be traced to the earliest documents of the Order. (See: Joseph F. Conwell, S.J., *Impelling Spirit: Revisiting a Founding Experience – 1539 – Ignatius of Loyola and His Companions* (Chicago: Loyola Press, 1997), 2-9, 15-19, 106-117, 165-176, 381-393).

[23] In a letter to his sister, dated 8 September 1896, Judge indicates that the Sisters of Providence had been contacted even earlier, and were "anxious to come, and are only waiting for the word." See: Judge, *American Missionary*, 174.

hundred dollars. In the afternoon went up the river about twelve miles to see Mr. Young who is logging for me."[24]

Wasting no time, on 12 April Judge set out for Forty Mile to conclude his affairs there, and arrived by the end of the next day. He was back in Dawson City by 3 June, this final trip but a four hour cruise aboard the *Bella* steaming up the now ice-free Yukon. In the interim, however, there had been a setback, as the spring current swept away Young's first raft of logs for the hospital. Again moving quickly, Judge purchased a replacement raft of 425 logs two days later and had workmen engaged in construction a week after that. Over the next four months Judge employed about fifty men in the church/hospital project, many committing to long periods of service and some even willing to work a few shifts *gratis*.

In mid-July Tosi's successor as Apostolic Prefect of Alaska, Father John René, S.J., paid him a surprise visit. He came away pleased and impressed by what he had seen. While there, René finalized legal recording requirements for the three acre site purchased in April, which he thought "the very best location in the new city. [Father Judge] had nothing but a tent, as church and house; but he intends building as soon as he can, a church and a residence for two priests. He seems to be much esteemed and loved by all the people about him. Everybody praises his zeal and charity."[25]

On 18 July, the day after René's departure, Judge added this ominous entry: "We have had a death every day or two for several weeks past – some sudden, some from drownding [sic], accidents & Typhoid fever, etc." From his tent Judge continued to celebrate mass and oversee the erection of the two adjacent buildings. The hospital was a two story log structure, with nine foot high ceilings, and sat on a twenty by fifty foot base, while the church measured slightly wider at twenty four by fifty feet, large enough to seat about two hundred. Both were exceedingly rough in design, insulation and furnishings. The hospital's bedsteads were crudely constructed of wood and fitted with mattresses consisting of muslin sacks stuffed with dried grass and other herbage. Though not yet completed, St. Mary's admitted its first patient on 20 August 1897 and soon filled about twenty beds on a regular basis. Doctors Chambers and LeBlanc, both Americans, were its first staff physicians, assisted by several male nurses, while Judge seemingly did everything else. Noticeably absent was the contingent of Sisters of St. Ann

[24] JOPA, "Indenture anent Dawson City property, 1899," and "Diary of Forty Mile," Judge Papers, 1/15 and 2/2; Judge, *American Missionary*, 177-187; Providence Archives, Judge to Rev. Mother Joseph, S.P., 28 December 1896.

[25] JOPA, "Diary of Forty Mile," Judge Papers, 1/1-2; Judge, *American Missionary*, 183-187, 200-202; René to Editor, 31 October 1897, *Woodstock Letters*, vol. 26, no.3 (1897): 521.

who had been engaged because the Sisters of Providence were unable to undertake the new mission. Like Judge three years earlier, the sisters had departed too late in the fall and were turned back by low water in the upper reaches of the Yukon. Late fall shipments of food were blocked as well, which sparked some panic and flight downriver on account of an expected "starvation winter." News of the 1896 gold strike did not reach the outside world until summer 1897, so many of Dawson's approximately four thousand residents had been able to reach the town that same year only by traveling lightly with a minimum of supplies.

Though actual starvation did not develop, the effects of malnutrition could be seen in the many pneumonia and scurvy cases that predominated at the hospital over the winter of 1897/98. Its first recorded fatality occurred 19 September, only a month after opening. His name, Judge recorded, was Andrew Johnson, a Lutheran. By 11 March 1898 he could tell his sister that his hospital had served one hundred and sixty-eight patients since its opening, and "has been the means of leading quite a few sheep back to the fold."[26]

If Judge's seven years in the north taught him to anticipate the medical needs of a gold rush, nothing could have prepared him for the full scope of the Klondike phenomenon, especially when the main body of stampeders flooded into Dawson City in mid-June 1898. By early July Dawson City had become nearly the size of Winnipeg or Seattle. In midsummer, the NWMP estimated its population at about eighteen thousand, plus another five thousand or so working on the creeks.[27] However, with so many men on the move it was impossible to know for sure. One local wag's quip a year earlier, that "the population is estimated at from 3000 to 15,000, mostly human beings," still held some truth about the situation.[28]

Chaotic and colourful to be sure, Dawson City quickly became unsanitary as well. Its sudden growth had far outpaced development of public health practices, and making matters worse, the mud flats on which the town was built were poorly suited for drainage. The *Nugget* reported on 13 August 1898 that thirty of the fifty-eight patients in St. Mary's Hospital were typhoid cases. By mid-September the epidemic was spreading up the creeks and the hospital staff of twelve men and six women was working around the clock. A month later at the peak of the crisis, the *Nugget* summarized the situation at St. Mary's, in part to launch a debt reduction effort. A total of 695 in-house patients had been treated since its first admission, 20 August 1897; over the past eleven months, 73 had died and 138

[26] JOPA, "Diary of Forty Mile," Judge Papers, 2/1-2; Judge, *American Missionary*, 202-217; Berton, *Klondike Fever*, 171-187.

[27] Berton, *Klondike,* 300.

[28] *Klondike News*, 25 August 1897, in Yukon Archives, Film CM 006-001.

were currently under care. By early November 1898 the worst had passed and weekly tallies of patients discharged began to outnumber those admitted.[29]

By the end of 1898 the St. Mary's complex had undergone almost as much change as Dawson City itself, and like the town most of it happened in the second half of that year. The sequence of events began late Saturday night, 4 June, when fire destroyed the church. Judge was called away from his prayers to attend a patient and neglected to douse his altar candle, which then ignited nearby draperies. Hundreds of townsmen turned out to form a bucket brigade, not to save the church but the hospital. Its sixty-five patients were all removed to safety without incident until the danger was past.[30] The following Saturday Father Camille Lefebvre, O.M.I., arrived from upriver, the vanguard of the Canadian Oblates who were to assume responsibility for the parish. A week later, Judge was already moving ahead. "P.S.," he informed his brother, "I am building a new church three times as large as the old one, and one of my friends will pay for it." That friend was his old patron the "Klondike King," Alex McDonald, who had become so successful at speculating in claims that a donation of $25,000 was of minor financial consequence. On 3 July Oblate Father Pierre Gendreau arrived to replace Lefebvre as principal vicar, and two days later the steamer *Alice* brought Jesuit Brother Bernard Cunningham and three Sisters of St. Ann. At the end of the month, Father René paid Judge another three day visit. Since the Oblates now held ecclesiastical jurisdiction over the Yukon Territory, René directed Judge to turn over the new church to them when it was completed, but remain in Dawson City until July, 1899, in order to settle as many accounts as possible. By 7 August, a mere nine weeks after the fire, a handsome new church stood on the same site as its rustic predecessor. Seven hundred people passed through the church doors that day to attend the two masses and evening vespers. The new church was formally dedicated two weeks later, 21 August, with Judge as the honorary homilist. According to one witness, "Father Judge preached on the Real Presence; no gestures, no complex sentences, only plain, forcible convincing words which were understood by anyone who understood English. This was the great beauty of his preaching; it was always plain, and so clearly from his heart that it

[29] *Klondike Nugget*, 18 October, 5, 12 and 26 November and 31 December 1898. Estimates of the number of hospital deaths and patients treated vary widely. Those cited by the *Nugget* can be considered a reliable baseline, since it is likely that Judge himself supplied the figures to the press. A credible alternative, drawn from Sisters of St. Ann records, states that a total of 1,092 patients were treated during 1898, with 124 deaths recorded in "the register." (See: Cantwell, *North to Share*, 86). Many other sources exaggerate, claiming "thousands" of patients treated and implying many hundreds of deaths.

[30] JOPA, "Diary of Forty Mile," Judge Papers, 2/2; Judge, *American Missionary*, 218-221; *Klondike Nugget*, 16 June 1898.

sank deep into the hearts of his hearers." Gendreau and his fellow Oblates continued to see about six hundred attendees every Sunday for the rest of the year. By then they were also comfortably housed in a new two-story frame rectory.[31]

During his July 1898 visit, René had also directed Judge to transfer ownership of the hospital to the Sisters of St. Ann the following spring. By this time the original medical staff had been replaced by licensed Canadian doctors who were joined in late August by a second contingent of Sisters, who proved to be exceptionally competent nurses despite their lack of formal training. So as the typhoid epidemic grew in force that fall, the most critical problem was not a lack of staff but a shortage of space. At the same time as his reinforcements arrived, Judge undertook a major expansion, a three story log annex that measured twenty-four by seventy feet on its base. The need was so great that its first floor was filled to capacity before the upper floors were even finished and roofed. With thirty-nine beds on each floor, the annex effectively doubled the hospital's capacity.[32]

Reinforcements in the form of a competing facility arrived as well. The driving force behind the Good Samaritan Hospital was Reverend Andrew S. Grant, who had arrived in Dawson City on 5 May 1898. An ordained Presbyterian minister, Grant also came with practical experience gained by applying his three years of medical training during a four month-long traverse of the White Pass-Lake Bennett route. When his hospital was ready to receive patients three months later – in time for the worst of the typhoid epidemic – the Good Samaritan consisted of two twenty by fifty foot log structures connected by a covered breezeway. The two wards were capable of housing seventy to eighty patients on a sustained basis. Besides Grant, it relied on members of the Victorian Order of Nurses. The first VON nurse to arrive, Georgina Powell, was so taxed by the hospital's first month of operation that she contracted typhoid fever herself, and had to be nursed back to health by her replacement. The Good Samaritan was certainly as primitive as St. Mary's; its beds lacked sheets and pillows entirely, and mattresses were so scarce they had to be rotated among patients. No hospital gowns were available, candles provided the only light and there was no running

[31] JOPA, "Diary of Forty Mile," Judge Papers, 2/2; Judge, *American Missionary*, 220-221, 238-240; Marie Jean de Pathmos, *A History of the Sisters of Saint Anne* (New York: Vantage Press, 1961), 351; Adney, *Klondike Stampede*, 420-421; Berton, *Klondike Fever*, 190-191, 296-299; Sisters of St. Ann Archives (hereafter SSAA), Victoria, Edmond Turenne, O.M.I., "A Monument to a Man of God," 1962; Cantwell, *North to Share*, 81-82, 85; *Klondike Nugget*, 23 August 1898; Editor, *Donahoe's Magazine*, 55, no. 2 (1906): 184.

[32] JOPA, "Diary of Forty Mile," Judge Papers, 2/2; Cantwell, *North to Share*, 84-86; SSAA, Mary Joseph Calasanctius, S.S.A., "Reminiscences of the Klondyke," 1941; *Klondike Nugget*, 3 September 1898.

water. Like St. Mary's it practiced no sectarian discrimination. Deceased patients Edward Quinn of Wisconsin and Patrick McMahon of Quebec, for example, were transferred to the Catholic parish cemetery for burial.[33]

Differing sectarian allegiances seemed to have little negative effect on the relations between the two hospitals. This pattern continued even after the typhoid crisis of 1898 subsided, when the need to cover expansion costs in spite of a dwindling population might have intensified competition. Doctor W.T. Barrett, Medical Director of St. Mary's, recalled, "two or three years of greatest harmony, in a friendly rivalry – each [institution] stimulated by the other to improve its services."[34] Indeed, this testimonial applies equally well to a spirit of denominational amity and cooperation in general that marked Dawson City's earliest years. This behavioral pattern mirrored secular values and practices among the region's highly diverse and mobile set of inhabitants. To survive and succeed in the Klondike, aspiring miners needed to be flexible, practical and accommodating, in order to form the opportune partnerships with fellow stampeders. The religious needs of such a group were elemental, often connected to the simple truths and values learned in childhood. For Judge's Catholics this may have taken the form of remembering "their duties" learned from, and owed to Mother Church. Protestant ministers pointed more directly to the blessings of biological mothers, the childhood home and the certainties learned from both.[35]

But if there was openness to basic religious observance in early Dawson City, the clerics also seem remarkably suited to that opportunity. Besides Father Judge, these others were Reverends S. Hall Young, Presbyterian, and Richard J. Bowen, Anglican. Young, a seasoned Alaskan missionary, had arrived in early October 1897. Like Judge, he was an American whose credibility preceded him. Old friends sprang to his aid, allowing him to establish within days a church in an unfinished boarding house. Young's description of his first, unexpectedly crowded meeting there is illustrative. All attendees were eagerly inclined and responded warmly to hymn singing, which served to re-connect them to their former lives 'outside.' There was no need for "conventional sermon forms or theological expositions," he found, because "life there was too earnest and straightforward to admit of

[33] Ruth Mellor, *Courage and Caring: The Story of VON Canada's Klondike Nurses* (VON Canada, 1997), online at http://www.von.ca/english/thestoryof_klondike%20nurses.pdf, <accessed 3 February 2014>; Thora McIlroy Mills, *The Contribution of the Presbyterian Church to the Yukon During the Gold Rush, 1897-1910* (Toronto: United Church Publishing House, 1977), 18-19, 46-49; SSAA, W.T. Barrett, M.D., "Reminiscences of Early Klondike Days," n.d. (Also available in *Saint Ann's Journal* (April, 1947); "St. Mary Sacramental Records," Yukon Archives, Film CM 016-001.

[34] SSAA, Barrett, "Reminiscences."

[35] Gates, *Gold at Fortymile*, 98-99; Young, *Hall Young of Alaska*, 287, 350-351; James M. Sinclair, *Mission: Klondike* (Vancouver: Mitchell Press, 1978), 42.

wasting time in such non-essentials … I swung out of the exposition style and more and more into emphasizing Christianity as a *life*, rather than as a system of doctrine." Besides his religious services, Young soon had a 1500 volume library available for drop-in visitors as well. By Easter Sunday, 1898, he could count eleven different denominations represented in his congregation. All three of his church's elected elders were Methodists, and its five trustees consisted of two Congregationalists, one Baptist, one Church of Christ member, and just one Presbyterian.[36]

Reverend Bowen, by contrast, was an Englishman with only two years' experience in the Yukon. But he spent those two years exceedingly well, and seems to have been cut from the same cloth as Judge and Young. Arriving at Forty Mile in August, 1895, his designated assignment was to assist Bishop Bompas with the Han natives clustered around Buxton Mission. Quite unlike Bompas and earlier Anglican missionaries at Forty Mile, however, Bowen quickly gained acceptance among the miners. He knew how to impart religious verities in the guise of a conversation on prize fighting, and about the power of music to "stir feelings which these work-hardened men had long stored in their subconscious minds." Bowen also came with valued practical abilities and the good sense to charge nothing as he "filed a few saws, drew some plans to scale, dressed some wounds, extracted some teeth and dressed some frozen limbs." In 1896 he was "loaned" to American Episcopal Bishop Peter Rowan, who assigned him to Circle, the downriver post that serviced miners spread throughout the Birch Creek diggings. In addition to his religious duties there, he also operated a two-bed hospital over the winter of 1896/97. In the spring, Bowen joined the mass exodus out of Circle for Dawson City and began building St. Paul's Anglican Church. Perhaps sensing that this would become a major, long term post, he paused long enough during construction to return to Buxton Mission and marry its schoolmistress, Susan Mellet.[37]

All three clergymen – Judge, Young and Bowen – were on friendly personal terms, especially during the simpler times before June 1898, when the great population surge began. At St. Mary's Hospital they could find common ground through shared concern over the medical emergencies of their respective parishioners. "The very first day I spent in camp," Young

---

[36] Young, *Hall Young of Alaska*, 350-352, 361, 373-374.

[37] Gates, *Gold at Fortymile*, 98-100, 123; H.A. Cody, *Apostle of the North: Memoirs of the Right Reverend William Carpenter Bompas, D.D.* (London: Seely & Co., Ltd., 1908), online at http://anglicanhistory.org/canada/bompas/cody1908/16.html, <accessed 10 October 2013>; Library and Archives Canada, R.J. Bowen Collection Guide, CAIN No. 268810, online at http://www.archivescanada.ca/english/search/BasicSearch.asp, <accessed 23 October 2013>; "Treasures of the Yukon – Concertina," online at www.yukonmuseums.ca/treasures/olc/12.html, <accessed 10 October 2013>.

recalled, "I was called to see some Protestant patients, and thereafter, as long as I was in Dawson, I was almost a daily visitor … Father Judge and I were always great friends, although he was fond of theological controversy, and good-natured arguments took place daily. I found him an eager chess player, and the relaxation of the game was good for both of us." Deaths and other hardships were shared realities as well. One day Young conducted five funerals, with Fr. Judge and Mr. Bowen experiencing the same. When fire destroyed Young's primitive church on 21 November 1897, both Judge and Bowen – whom Hall remembered as "a fine young fellow, unused to that kind of life but eager to do what he could" – along with a number of local merchants served on his disaster relief committee.[38]

The development of a competing hospital in 1898 did not necessarily diminish this spirit of friendly cooperation. Young, who stayed on for three months after Grant's arrival to help with fundraising, tells an amusing tale of turning a ten dollar investment into a $1000 clear profit, some of which went to St. Mary's as well as the Good Samaritan. While returning to town from the creeks, he purchased a newspaper headlining the account of Admiral Dewey's great victory in Manila Harbor from a fresh arrival who had no idea of how news-starved were the local residents. Quickly renting Pioneer Hall, Young then blanketed the town with flyers announcing a public reading of the dramatic story, plus a few poetical and musical entertainments, with $2.50 as cost of admission. By the end of the evening three successive capacity audiences had been treated to the two-hour program. No longer breaking news, admission to the next night's reading was reduced to one dollar, thus filling the house four times in a row for the same program. As construction began on the Good Samaritan, Bowen joined its Board of Directors, even though Grant held decidedly cooler views than Young about ecumenical collaboration.[39] Apparently he saw Bowen as an exception, and was even willing to conduct an open air "union service" with him among the shanties of Klondike City (later Lousetown) across the river.[40]

---

[38] Young, *Hall Young of Alaska,* 349-350, 354-355..

[39] By his account, Young had extended the warmest of welcomes to Archbishop Charles Seghers and Father John Althoff, when the two Catholic clerics arrived in Wrangell in May 1879 and sought his advice and support for establishing their own mission there. "Yes, there is this large Foreign Town up the beach in which we have been unable to make even a beginning…There is virgin ground for you and I wish you would till it." Such an attitude probably contributed to the Home Mission Board's early judgment that "despite his apparent ambition to move large groups of men, Young was a vivacious Christian whose triumphs would more likely lie in the small-scale, person-to-person realm." See: Young, *Hall Young of Alaska*, 171-172, and Hinckley, "Missionaries, Indians and Politics," in Mangusso & Haycox, eds., 167.

[40] Young, *Hall Young of Alaska*, 349-350, 353-355, 378-379; *Klondike Nugget*, 28 June and 16 July 1898; Mills, *Contribution,* 19, 42-45. Grant had no intention of duplicating the multidenominational "Union Church" in Skagway, formed by fellow

As 1898 drew to a close, Judge could justifiably scale back in his labors, take stock of his commitments to St. Mary's, and begin looking ahead to his next expected assignment. Though still chaplain at the hospital, the worst of the typhoid epidemic was over, and the six Sisters of St. Ann had its daily administration well in hand. Brother Bernard Cunningham was now available for general assistance and companionship. By New Year's Day, 1899, a separate chapel annexed to the hospital was completed. No longer would he have to use the small shed that doubled as a morgue, arranging his mass items on the same shelf that alternately held bodies awaiting burial. The Oblate Fathers had full charge of the debt-free church, and Judge's only remaining responsibility there was to officiate every third Sunday.[41] Dawson City itself was undergoing a transition in its history as well. One no longer needed to be a true 'Klondiker' to reach the gold fields, with the completion of the White Pass and Yukon Railway to Bennett Lake and the area's first public road from town to the creeks. New strikes of readily accessible ore were no longer expected, but it was not yet apparent how quickly hand mining would yield to corporately financed dredging operations. Still, by fall 1898 many residents were already slipping away downriver, before freeze-up, to prospect in the Nome area. Ahead lay the disastrous fire of 26 April 1899, which would raze much of the town, and the discovery of gold on the beaches of Nome in June 1899. By August, steamboats were busily carrying away Dawsonites, eight thousand in one week alone. Building lots that had cost from ten to forty thousand dollars a year earlier could be had for the taking, the log cabins on them thrown in for free. The great Klondike stampede was over, almost as quickly as it had begun.[42]

In a letter dated 27 December 1898, Judge confirmed his understanding with Father René that he would devote the next six months to resolving the financial affairs of the hospital.[43] A historian of the Sisters of St. Ann

---

Presbyterian Rev. Robert Dickey shortly after his arrival there in October 1897. Even Catholics participated there, an especially irksome concern for Grant. For nearly two years the Union Church began its Sunday services with a morning Roman Catholic mass at 7:00, followed by the Episcopalians at 11:00, the Baptists at 1:00, the Methodists at 3:00, and finally the Presbyterians at 7:30 in the evening. During the week, scores of would-be miners took refuge in its reading room, for shelter, companionship, and protection from the con men and thugs who then held Skagway in their grip. Grant frowned on the fact that "the church building was, and is, used for all kinds of things and any tramp that comes along must be heard." See: Sinclair, *Mission Klondike*, 41-43, 98-100, and Mills, *Contribution*, 19.

[41] Judge, *American Missionary*, 240, 255; Editor, *Donahoe's Magazine*, 55, no. 1 (1906): 9 and 55, no. 2 (1906): 186.

[42] Berton, *Klondike Fever*, 405-413; Winslow, *Big Pan-Out*, 150; Coates and Morrison, *Midnight Sun*, 149-152; http://nevada-outback-gems.com/prospecting_info/nome_gold.htm, <accessed 10 February 2014>.

[43] JOPA, Judge Papers, 1/18.

claims that Judge disregarded René's injunction against constructing the three story hospital annex, inferring that he had thus accrued unnecessary debt as a result.[44] This seems a dubious charge, especially in light of the long record of trust his superiors had placed in him over matters that involved substantial financial responsibility. From the beginning Judge used a subscription system – for fifty dollars, a ticket would entitle the holder free hospital care for a year – to generate revenue. This worked to a degree, but was insufficient to cover the expenses of so many patients without means to pay. In the accounting given by the *Klondike Nugget* on 18 October 1898, about 50 percent of St. Mary's patients had left their bills unpaid, incurring a standing debt of $43,683. At that point the typhoid epidemic showed no signs of abating, while at the same time local wealth from the gold fields was still expanding. And Judge had gained valuable friends in Gene Allen, owner of the *Nugget*, and Arnold George, its lead reporter, who began a vigorous campaign to steer some of that wealth toward the hospital debt. From this vantage, his decision to expand the hospital's capacity seems both morally urgent and fiscally reasonable. But instead of retiring debt for the next half year, Judge had only twenty more days to live. Surely the result of general exhaustion, pneumonia set in and caused a collapse on 7 January 1899. Four days later, during a brief relapse in his fever, he was able to revise his last will and testament, transfer administration of the hospital to a board of directors and place its estimated $55,000 value under Father René's name.[45]

Judge was portrayed equally heroic in death as in life. During the ten days of his illness, friends and co-workers were in constant attendance and kept the town informed about his prognosis on a daily basis. When it came, his was a 'happy death.' Attending physician Barrett recalled the profound serenity of his patient's final hour, and the "shining light of joy that illuminated his countenance, as though going forth to meet a dear and cherished friend." At the moment of his passing the overcast winter sky parted just long enough for the sun to fill his chamber with warmth and light, then faded away, accompanied by the "the pure soul of Father Judge." Like some canonized Saints, he too seemed to have possessed divine foresight into the timing of his own death, much to the consternation of

[44] Cantwell, *North to Share*, 84-86.

[45] Why this had not been done during René's July visit remains unclear. On 17 July 1899, six months after Judge's death, René re-transferred both properties, the church to the Oblates for $5000, payable over two years, and the hospital over to the Sisters of St. Ann, along with its over $45,000 in outstanding debt. (*Klondike Nugget*, 21 September, 18, 22 and 29 October and 7 December 1898; Russell A. Bankson, *The Klondike Nugget* (Caldwell, Idaho: Caxton Printers, Ltd., 1935), 95-96; Judge, *American Missionary*, 265-266; JOPA, "Last Will and Testament," Judge Papers, 1/16; de Pathmos, *History of SSA*, 351-353; JOPA, "Miscellaneous Papers re Church in Dawson," Box V: 178).

his nearest friends. Later they noted the uncanny parallel with his mother's onset of illness and death, on the exact same dates, thirty three years earlier.[46]

The legacy of Father Judge as "saint of Dawson" began on 18 January 1899, with the obituary printed by the *Klondike Nugget*. Though at odds with Judge's own account of his opening trek to Dawson, the *Nugget* painted a far more compelling image of a solitary, feeble old man, pulling a sled alongside his single dog, intent on securing a hospital site before the rush arrived. Similarly, it lauded the genuine heroism he displayed through his hospital work, especially during the recent typhoid epidemic. For its tone and how that has shaped remembrance of Father Judge, much of the *Nugget's* dramatic tribute warrants re-reading:

> By the side of the dead and dying, burying them when none others appeared on the scene for that duty, superintending and personally directing even the smallest detail of the rapidly increasing hospital, cheering the sad, joking the convalescent, devising means of comfort for the irritable sick, coaxing the obstinate, praying with and for the religiously inclined, planning appetizing morsels from an almost empty larder, cheering and encouraging the downhearted and sad – thus we find the good man spending his time until himself laid low by the cruel hand of remorseless disease. … On a hard couch in his office…he spent the few hours devoted to sleep, ready at an instant's notice to respond to night calls of sickness. A standing order with nurses and watchmen was that no matter what the hour or how unnecessary the call, he was to be instantly awakened if patients desired his presence.

Black crepe adorned much of Dawson City on the day of his funeral, 20 January 1899. Flags were at half-mast, all houses of business closed and any Mountie could get off duty to attend if he wished. The temperature, recorded at minus 80°F two days earlier, had warmed nicely to minus 15°F, a welcome improvement for the many gathered outside overfull St. Mary's Church.[47] The *post mortems* all contained a common thread. Judge's official burial record, co-signed by 230 attendees, reads in part, "in the presence of a great concourse of people composed of the most respectable citizens of this town, WITHOUT REGARD TO NATIONALITY OR CREED [original capitalized], we the undersigned Parish Priest have buried under the Gospel side of the altar of this church the remains of the late Father William Judge." A resolution in his honor by the Dawson Citizens Relief Committee included the line, "With a wide catholic charity that embraced all creeds and conditions of men, his ear was ever open and his door never closed to the cry of pain and suffering." Tributes in lyrical verse held the same sentiment:

---

[46] Judge, *American Missionary*, 255-261; SSAA, Barrett, "Reminiscences."

[47] Editor, *Donahoe's' Magazine*, 54, no. 4 (1905), 588; [RCMP log] "Dawson – January 1898 to March 1899" in Yukon Archives, Film CM 011-010; Judge, *American Missionary*, 268; SSAA, Calasanctius, "Reminiscences of the Klondyke."

Not for creed or circumstance, would he a helping hand refuse,
Nor pomp, nor power, nor grand finance; Could change his broad and noble views
He saw his duty. Who can tell; How much we loved him in the West?
But He, who doeth all things well, To his tired soul had whispered "Rest."[48]

Perhaps the repetitions about Judge's broadness of mind and spirit also reflect nostalgia for simpler times that already seemed to be passing away.[49] The nature of Dawson City society in the post-stampede era that historian Porsild details so convincingly became steadily more Canadian, hierarchical, and conformist. For example, whereas the churches and private charity had previously cared for the sick and the indigent, once a territorial government was established in June 1898 and began collecting taxes, people responded to the hospitals' appeals with the cry, "Let the Government look after the sick."[50] In the restructured Dawson City, clergy, notably Rev. George Pringle, a Presbyterian, increasingly devoted their energies toward replacing the vices associated with the saloon demimonde with the wholesome norms found in established civic society further south.[51] The story of Father Judge and his contemporary clerics is a reminder that even in an "instant" community, practical Christianity, that served the physical as well as the spiritual needs of its people, had to trump denominational rivalries or the imposition of the mores of a more established society. It is by taking a prominent role in this realignment of values that Father William Judge earned his reputation as "The Saint of Dawson."

[48] "St. Mary Sacramental Records," in Yukon Archives, Film CM 016-001; *Klondike Nugget*, 2, no. 6 (21 January 1899); SSAA, Folder "Judge, Fr. William H."

[49] Coates and Morrison state that the whole scale restructuring of Klondike society did not begin until 1901 Coates and Morrison, *Midnight Sun*, 152.

[50] Report of Commissioner Wm. Ogilvie, 1898-99 quoted in D. Morrison, *The Politics of the Yukon Territory, 1898-1909*, 22.

[51] Morris Zaslow, *The Opening of the Canadian North, 1870-1914* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1971), 137.

CCHA *Historical Studies*, 80 (2014), 63-88

The Maillardville, B.C. School Strike: Archbishop W.M. Duke, Catholic Schools, and the British Columbia Election of 1952

Patricia E. Roy

On 2 April 1951, after their Easter holiday, 840 students returned to Our Lady of Lourdes and Our Lady of Fatima schools in Maillardville, a suburb of Vancouver. They, and all but one teacher, were surprised to find the schools closed.[1] Instead, parents and others escorted them to the nearby offices of Coquitlam School District (#43) many of whose overcrowded public schools already operated on shifts. Thus began the Maillardville "strike." The ostensible reason was the refusal of District #43 to let Catholic school students ride its buses.

The basic issue, the desire for government support for Catholic schools in the province, was not new nor was the involvement of Archbishop William Mark Duke of Vancouver in electoral politics. However, in 1951-52, the actions of the Maillardville school boards and their friends meant he had to modify his tactics. Hitherto, if it had not lobbied the provincial government itself, the hierarchy had relied on prominent Catholic laymen, many of whom were associated with the provincial Liberal party. Known as the "Iron Duke" for his firm control of the archdiocese and his strict discipline,[2] Archbishop Duke watched over events but, in this case, the Maillardville parishes challenged him, while leadership in the agitation for government assistance passed to laymen, several of whom had learned their political skills in labour unions. The school question played a minor role in defeating the Liberals in the 1952 provincial election but the election of a Social Credit government did little good for Catholic schools. In the meantime, the dramatic action at Maillardville got lost in a larger campaign.

* I wish to thank the archivists of the Archdiocese of Vancouver and of the province of British Columbia for their assistance in making the material available to me; to the anonymous reviewers who gave helpful advice for revising this paper; and especially to Associate Editor Indre Cuplinskas who shepherded this paper through peer review and applied her fine editorial eye to it.

[1] New Westminster *British Columbian,* 3 April 1951.

[2] http://rcav.org/archbishop-william-mark-duke/, <accessed 6 May 2014>.

Catholic schools existed in British Columbia before Confederation in 1871 but received no assistance from the colonial government.[3] Thus, Catholics had no claim under Section 93 of the BNA Act.[4] British Columbia's first Public Schools Act in 1872 created a system that was "conducted upon strictly non-sectarian principles," inculcated the "highest morality," but taught no religious dogma or creed."[5] Three times in the 1870s and 1880s, the province's bishops sought support for their schools but were told that Catholic parents could send their children to the non-sectarian public schools. Catholics continued to complain about unfair treatment and the lack of any government support for their schools. In 1895, the editor of *The Month*, a magazine published under the auspices of the bishop of New Westminster, rued that while Catholics did "not question the efficiency of the Public Schools," they wanted their children to be taught the rudiments of their faith. What could be more equitable, he asked, than a system of separate schools where "out of the common public fund, to which Catholics contribute proportionately, a proportionate share is allowed for their own schools."[6] Yet, possibly discouraged by earlier rebuffs and hindered by some weak ecclesiastical leadership Catholics seemed resigned and abandoned formal appeals to the government. In 1925, *The Bulletin,* a weekly newspaper that covered Catholic news throughout the province, told parents, "it costs a little more to send your children to the private school and to pay taxes as well for the public school, but there is very little worthwhile in this world of struggle without the consecration of sacrifice."[7]

New ecclesiastical leadership revived the campaign for government support. In 1928, William Mark Duke arrived in Vancouver as Co-Adjutor Archbishop. His New Brunswick birthplace, where he had ministered as a

---

[3] On the colonial era see Jean Barman, "Transfer, Imposition or Consensus? The Emergence of Educational Structures in Nineteenth Century British Columbia," in Nancy M. Sheehan, J. Donald Wilson, and David C. Jones, eds., *Schools in the West: Essays in Canadian Educational History* (Calgary: Detselig, 1986), 241-264 and Vincent J. McNally, *The Lord's Distant Vineyard: A History of the Oblates and the Catholic Community in British Columbia* (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press, 2000), 196-198.

[4] Section 93 in theory guaranteed the rights of denominational schools to government support as it existed at the time of Confederation. As the Manitoba Schools Question of the 1890s demonstrated, the guarantee was stronger on paper than in reality.

[5] B.C. Statutes, 35 Vic. c. 16 "An Act Respecting Public Schools." In 1873 the Superintendent of Education John Jessop reported that of the 1707 children attending school about 400 were in private or denominational schools. (British Columbia, Department of Education, *Report for the Year ended 31 July 1873*)

[6] *The Month*, October 1895. A brief sketch of the bishops' campaign in the 1870s and 1880s may be found in Victoria Cunningham, *Justice Achieved: The Political Struggle for Independent Schools in British Columbia* (Vancouver: Federation of Independent Schools Association of British Columbia, 2002), 20-22.

[7] *The Bulletin,* 27 August 1926.

parish priest, had worked out a gentlemen's agreement whereby Catholic schools received some government aid.[8] In British Columbia he discovered that most municipalities required Catholic schools to pay local property taxes but some provided medical and dental services to their students. In Vancouver, the city exempted Catholic schools from most property taxes but did not offer health services.[9] In 1933, the legislature's municipal committee rejected the requests of private schools for an exemption from municipal taxation and the specific request of Dr. J.J. Gillis, a Liberal MLA and Catholic, for an exemption for church-supported schools.[10]

When the Liberals formed a government later that year, the archbishop had reason to be optimistic. In *The Separate School Question in Canada*, G.M. Weir had written that Canada had no place "for racial animosities, religious prejudice, [or] coercive attempts to secure educational uniformity." Weir was now Minister of Education.[11] The archbishop pressed the Liberals for tax relief and for medical and dental care for students in Catholic schools but to no avail.[12] At the hearings of the Rowell-Sirois Commission on Dominion-Provincial Relations in British Columbia, the archbishop's spokesman declared that no Canadians should be forced to endure the hardships that British Columbia Catholics bore "for the sake of conscience in educational matters" and called for the "same recognition in educational matters, as enjoyed by their co-religionists in other provinces."[13] Commissioner N.W. Rowell doubted if it was in the Commission's mandate but the final report noted "a sense of grievance" in educational matters in several provinces that might "contribute to national disunity."[14]

---

[8] A brief account of Archbishop Duke's background and the context in which he served in Vancouver may be found in Jacqueline Gresko, *Tradition of Faith and Service: Archdiocese of Vancouver, 1908-2008* (Vancouver: Archdiocese of Vancouver, 2008), 11.

[9] L.G. McPhilliips to W.M. Duke, 20 January 1929, Archives of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Vancouver (hereafter ARCAV), 400/15. Vancouver required private schools to pay for a business license. (Charles Jones to Duke, 22 August 1929, ARCAV, 400/15). At one point, several Vancouver aldermen proposed that the city tax private schools. That worried the hierarchy until it was ascertained that their targets were schools that operated as commercial enterprises. (James Coady to Duke, 15 September 1937, ARCAV, 401/1; *BC Catholic,* 18 September 1937).

[10] *Victoria Daily Times*, 17 March 1933.

[11] G. M. Weir, *The Separate School Question in Canada,* (Toronto: Ryerson, 1934), 240. The Archbishop later quoted this in a sermon. (*BC Catholic,* 8 January 1938).

[12] Duke to Gordon Sloan, 10 March 1934, ARCAV, 401/1.

[13] *BC Catholic,* 2 April 1938; M. Griffin to Duke, 28 March 1938, ARCAV, 401/2.

[14] Canada, Royal Commission on Dominion-Provincial Relations, *Report* (Ottawa: King's Printer, 1940), Book II, 51. Similar representations had been presented in Manitoba and from francophones in the Maritimes, Alberta, Manitoba, Saskatchewan, and Ontario and the St. Jean Baptiste Society of Montreal.

Anticipating a provincial election in 1941, the archbishop warned Weir that unless the government promised to assist Catholic schools with health services, access to manual training and domestic science classes, and relief from property taxes it could not count on Catholic votes. Weir agreed that health knew no denominational boundaries but getting the necessary legislation would be difficult "based mostly on prejudice."[15] Duke then suggested incorporating Catholic schools into the public system as in some other provinces.[16] In the meantime, he urged Catholic organizations to ask cabinet ministers to state in writing what concessions they would grant if re-elected but his request was too late to have any effect.[17] Premier T.D. Pattullo, who believed that Catholics voted Liberal, blamed his party's failure to win a majority on the separate school issue and the archbishop's "indiscretion" on the Sunday before the election of advising "all Catholics to vote for the man and not the party."[18] A Catholic minority – about a sixth of the population – could not get what it wanted but possibly could deny office to unsympathetic politicians. After the election, in which no party won a majority and the Co-operative Commonwealth Federation (CCF) formed the official opposition, Liberals and Conservatives formed a Coalition under the leadership of John Hart, a Liberal and a Catholic.

Hoping that a Catholic premier would be friendly and realizing that tax exemptions were more important in principle than in practice, Duke now stressed health and dental services. H.G.T. Perry, the new Minister of Education, agreed that health knew no denominational boundaries but his department could not assist private schools. Duke again proposed incorporating Catholic schools into the provincial system but there is no evidence of a reply.[19] Subsequently, Duke re-organized the Catholic School

[15] Duke to Weir, 25 April 1941, Weir to Duke, 8 May 1941; Weir to Duke, 12 May 1941; Weir to Duke, 12 June 1941, ARCAV, 401/7. Weir was also provincial secretary with responsibilities for health. In the meantime, in Vancouver, Catholic Charities, with some funding from the Community Chest, gave some health services to city students. In 1948, the Community Chest gave a year's notice of its withdrawal of funding.

[16] Duke to Weir, 21 May 1941, ARCAV, 401/7.

[17] Duke to diocesan presidents of the Catholic Women's League, the Holy Name Society, and the Catholic Youth Organization, 11 October 1941, ARCAV, 401/7.

[18] *Province,* 20 October 1941; T.D. Pattullo to W.L.M. King, 14 November 1941, Library and Archives Canada, (hereafter LAC), W.L.M. King Papers, #264801. Duke told Catholics to vote according to their consciences in 1937 but endorsed Pattullo's Health Insurance plebiscite.

[19] H.G.T. Perry to S.J. Willis, 27 March 1942; Willis to Perry, 31 March 1942; G. Amyot to Willis, 6 May 1942, ARCAV, 401/7. (This correspondence is also in British Columbia Archives [hereafter BCA], Premiers' Papers, GR1222, 38/1). In 1944 the Catholic School Board of the Archdiocese of Vancouver reminded the provincial secretary of the need for the medical examination of children in Catholic schools. His exact reply is not recorded but presumably was negative. Catholic School Board Meeting, 16 May 1944, ARCAV, 401/8; Duke to Hart, 29 May 1942, ARCAV, 401/7. (Also in GR1222, v.38/2).

Board, raised funds to build new schools, and improved educational standards, in part, to make the schools more attractive prospects for integration.[20]

Probably because of the war, the archbishop did not again press the issue of government funding or integration until 1947. That November, while blessing an addition to a Vancouver school, he urged the government to give "greater consideration" to the "great burden" of Catholics in building and maintaining their schools, supporting teachers, and providing health services. The *CCF News,* the journal of the official opposition, commented that if religious beliefs conflicted with "the critical, scientific attitude which our schools seek to develop" those beliefs must be revised and the children protected from such conflict. Through letters to the editor, the *CCF News* allowed the archbishop to correct some factual errors and explain that Catholics only wanted exemption from paying taxes for public schools or a grant to educate their children in their own ways in schools that met tests of efficiency and good conduct. The controversy drew attention in the national Catholic press, including *Le Devoir,* which agreed with the *Canadian Register* that the attitude of the *CCF News* indicated "a totalitarian mentality."[21]

In his public speeches the archbishop continued to refer to injustice and to seek political support. In blessing a new school in the Fraser Valley city of Chilliwack, he suggested that those opposed to government support for Catholic schools were "communists, atheists, irreligious, and perhaps some School Teachers' Associations."[22] A month later in opening St. Helen's School in Vancouver, the archbishop outlined the situation in New Brunswick where Catholics built schools but the government paid for their maintenance and the salaries of the teachers.[23] Before the 1949 provincial election he warned Attorney-General Gordon Wismer that denying help to Catholic schools would "lose the Catholic patronage." To make that

[20] Catholic schools survived on tuition fees, subsidies from parishes, and especially the low salaries paid to the religious women and men who did most of the teaching. Tuition fees were generally modest. In 1948, they were as low as $2 a month in the elementary grades and $3 for high school with discounts for two or more children from the same family. (Catholic School Board minutes, 2 October 1948, ARCAV, 401/9). Those were fees for parochial schools. In addition, several Catholic schools in Vancouver operated as private schools. The Convent of the Sacred Heart charged $22 per month; Vancouver College, $9, and Little Flower Academy, $7.75. Many parishes charged non-Catholics a higher fee.

[21] *BC Catholic,* 20 November 1947; *CCF News,* 27 November and 11 and 18 December 1947; *Canadian Register* quoted in *BC Catholic,* 31 December 1947; *Le Devoir* quoted in *BC Catholic,* 12 February 1948; Duke to Bishop F.P. Carroll, 18 December 1947, ARCAV, 401/8.

[22] *BC Catholic,* 9 May 1948.

[23] *BC Catholic,* 24 June 1948.

more realistic, Duke indicated that some Catholic men had recently arranged for him to meet a CCF leader to determine what that party might do for Catholic schools.[24] He also encouraged Bishop James Hill of Victoria to advise Education Minister William Straith that failing to help would produce "a great deal of criticism" of the government.[25] The archbishop also asked parish priests to urge their parishioners to get on the voters' list.[26] During the campaign, the *BC Catholic* made no editorial comment but featured a letter from T.M. Moran, chairman of a recently-formed Catholic Lay Council, [27] in which he referred to "our struggle to obtain educational facilities for our children," Moran urged readers, as part of Catholic Action, to exercise their franchise but did not specify how to vote.[28] Only the Coalition and the CCF ran a province-wide campaign. The Coalition placed several advertisements in the *BC Catholic* including one which ironically boasted of how it gave public school students free or rental textbooks.[29] Under the leadership of Byron Johnson, a Liberal who had become premier after Hart retired, the Coalition returned with a slightly increased percentage of the popular vote.[30]

After the election, Archbishop Duke asked Moran to seek Premier Johnson's advice on how, without embarrassing their government, they could present their desires to participate in the free or rental textbook programme, health and dental services, bus transportation, and a Catholic University.[31] At the same time, the archbishop invited several prominent Catholic lay men to

---

[24] Duke to Gordon [Wismer], 14 February 1949, ARCAV, 402/8.

[25] Duke to Hill, 30 March 1949, ARCAV, 401/8.

[26] Duke to all parish priests, 23 March 1949, ARCAV, 44/8.

[27] The Council was composed of representatives of such organizations as the Holy Name Society, the Catholic Women's League, the Catholic Youth Organization, the Newman Club Alumni and the Knights of Columbus. Its purpose, T.M. Moran explained to an audience in Nelson, B.C., was to develop Catholic Action throughout the province and the country and to assist the hierarchy. Its primary role as far as the schools were concerned was to lobby the government. (*The Prospector,* 10 June 1949)

Since at least 1930 Archbishop Duke sought to have a Catholic College affiliated with the University of British Columbia. The creation of St. Mark's College in 1956 as a residence and social centre established a Catholic presence on the UBC campus. In 1999 Corpus Christi College, a junior college, was established on the UBC campus and St. Mark's became a theology school.

[28] *BC Catholic,* 9 June 1949. The *BC Catholic*, however, published several boiler-plate advertisements from the Coalition as did *The Prospector.*

[29] *BC Catholic,* 12 May 1949.

[30] Of the Coalition MLAs, only Dr. Gillis and Maurice Finnerty (Similkameen) were known as Catholics.

[31] At the archbishop's request, Senator Turgeon spoke to Straith when the latter visited Ottawa. Turgeon reported that Straith was "very sympathetic" and would see what he could do. (Duke, Memo of meeting with Mr. Moran, 9 August 1949, ARCAV, 374/12). Moran planned to suggest that the premier appoint Dr. Gillis Minister of Health.

form a committee to approach the government on the schools issue.[32] After twenty years "it was time to bring the matter to a head." The lay advisors agreed that the government's past "sympathy" had "got us nowhere and cost the government nothing." The archbishop requested prayers for "success in this understanding." On 9 December 1949 A.H. J. Swencisky, a lawyer, and other members of the Lay Council met Premier Johnson and Straith. The premier claimed to have "no idea" of the Catholic burden. Straith said nothing about health services but indicated that school districts could give bus rides to Catholic students if space were available. He hinted that the government provided textbooks to give "equal opportunity" to all children but his budget would not permit extending the plan. Any optimism about a solution was dashed when the *Vancouver Sun* reported that the government had "rejected outright" any financial aid to Catholic schools. A response through the press was an added insult. "Dumbfounded," Swencisky reminded the premier that the delegation had stressed its desire not to embarrass the government with press releases. After delegates publicly made some "particularly bitter remarks about the Johnson government," Johnson arranged for Swencisky and twenty-six others, mainly from Vancouver, to meet the full cabinet on 23 March 1950 and to present a brief calling for justice notably, property tax exemptions and medical and dental care. Some cabinet members appeared sympathetic but Swencisky accused them of "double-talk" because there was nothing in the estimates for medical and dental care or textbooks. Swencisky warned Wismer that they could no longer "restrain mounting resentment." A year later, in March 1951, Straith announced the extension of the textbook programme to private schools.[33]

By then, another group of lay Catholics had also approached the government. Two years earlier, in February 1949, stressing that Catholic schools were not private schools because they had "truly mass support" from families "in relatively humble circumstances" who made "Catholic schools possible, not from compulsion but from love of God," the board of Our Lady of Fatima School had asked Premier Johnson to allow Catholic students to benefit from the textbook programme. Extension of the programme, however,

[32] At the archbishop's request, A.H.J. Swencisky and Thomas Dohm, lawyers; Dr. David Steele, a physician; Joseph Brown, wholesale and retail florist; H.S. Foley, executive vice-president, Powell River Company; Robert J. Burroughs, F. Monahan and Senator J.G. Turgeon joined the committee.

[33] Meeting of Lay Advisory Council, 13 October 1949, ARCAV, 374/12; Duke to Pastors and to the Sisters of the Diocese, 1 December 1949, ARCAV, 44/8; Duke to the bishops of the province, 12 January 1950; Johnson to Swencisky, 15 December 1949; Straith to Swencisky, 30 December 1949, ARCAV, 402/8; *Sun,* 8 February 1950; Swencisky to Johnson, 6 February 1950, ARCAV, 402/8; *BC Catholic,* Easter 1950; Swencisky to Wismer, 23 June 1950, ARCAV, 374/12; Duke to Straith, 13 March 1951, ARCAV, 375/5.

did not satisfy that board or that of the nearby Our Lady of Lourdes School in Maillardville. Consequently, they formed a joint board to draw attention to the need for immediate aid to counteract the unfair treatment of their schools.[34]

Maillardville, a community within the municipality of Coquitlam, was settled in 1909-10 by 75 French-Canadian Roman Catholic families from Quebec whom Father P.E. Maillard recruited to work for the Canadian Western Lumber Company at Fraser Mills. They opened a church and an elementary school, Our Lady of Lourdes. With natural increase and migration, especially from the prairies, the population grew. In 1946, a second parish and school, Our Lady of Fatima, were created. By then, there was also a high school. The Sisters of the Child Jesus, a French order that had been in B.C. since 1896 and had some Irish members, taught the B.C. curriculum mainly in English.[35] The parishes, however, considered themselves primarily French-speaking. Nevertheless, some anglophone children attended the schools and some major spokesmen for the Joint School Board were anglophones.[36]

Maillardville was the only place in British Columbia with a significant number of Catholic students in a compact area but some children lived beyond walking distance so the schools hired a bus and the parish priests acted as taxi drivers.[37] After Straith said that local school boards could transport private school students, the Our Lady of Fatima Board asked for transportation for its students but got no satisfaction.[38] When it repeated the request, the public school board again replied that its buses were full. That two letters, a year apart, were identical save for the date, added "insult to injury;" the second letter was the immediate impetus for the strike.[39]

Although Fr. J. Fouquette at Our Lady of Lourdes and Fr. O.A. Meunier at Our Lady of Fatima knew what was going on, laymen arranged the strike and appealed to Quebec for help. The School Board of the diocese of Chicoutimi offered moral support and asked Straith to give their British

---

[34] Chairman of Our Lady of Fatima School to Byron Johnson, 20 February 1949, BCA, GR1222, 66/7; Meeting of Joint School Boards, 26 March 1951, ARCAV 375/4.

[35] Thank you to Jacqueline Gresko for this information and for other suggestions about this paper.

[36] Our Lady of Fatima, which had more Anglophone parishioners than Our Lady of Lourdes, reported in 1943 that it had 400 French-speaking and 35 English-speaking families. (*BC Catholic,* October 1953, Jubilee Edition).

[37] Duke to Ildebrando Antoniutti, Apostolic Delegate, 10 April 1952, ARCAV, 375/1.

[38] D.A. Bowen to Mme. Chairlady, Transportation Committee, Public School Board, Maillardville, 14 March 1950, ARCAV, 375/4.

[39] J. Goulet and J. Haddock, 3 April 1951, circular letter, ARCAV, 375/4.

Columbia compatriots the same rights as Quebec gave to Protestants. Through the League of the Sacred Heart, over 4,000 children in Chicoutimi sent $200, letters, and souvenirs to the Maillardville students. The League itself sent at least $331.82. Le Comité permanent de la survivance Française en Amerique, a cultural organization, voted $500 to assist. Municipalities and organizations such as the students at Collège Jean Brebeuf sent letters of support and regretted that they could not give money. The archbishop, however, felt it necessary to advise Quebec donors that the money was being used in the fight for all Catholic schools, not just the bilingual schools in Maillardville.[40]

The archbishop had only learned of the strike plan when the Maillardville Board sought his permission for it a few days in advance. "After consultation," with whom he did not say, he gave it, probably reluctantly, and reserved the right to approve any settlement. When the press asked about the strike, the archbishop did not claim to be "in the dark" as Fr. Fouquette suggested but followed Fouquette's advice to stress the "unfair treatment" of Catholic schools and to ask citizens interested in Canada's "Christian heritage" to consider the matter and make their opinions known.[41]

By telegram, at 8 a.m. on Monday, 2 April the Joint Board informed Straith and Johnson that "in view of the grave injustices and penalties placed on our schools" and the Department of Education's evasive attitude to their claims, they were closing their schools that morning. Carrying banners such as "Equality," "We Want Justice, not Evasion," "University Question, Minority Rights, Health Benefits, Bus Transportation," and "We are Canada's future soldiers," 840 children paraded to the School Board office. The Joint Board called for what became known as the Seven Points: equality with the public schools; tax exemption for school buildings; a 50% grant for building costs; a 60% grant for transportation; a "proper" per diem grant per school room; designated taxation; and "a complete health program."

---

[40] Guillaume Tremblay, La Federation des Commissions Scolaires du Quebec to Duke, 26 April 1951, ARCAV, 375/5; Duke to Jos. Bonnea, secretary, School Commission, Chicoutimi, 11 January 1952; *Sun,* 31 May 1951; Duke to Paul-Emil Gingras, 12 October 1951, ARCAV, 375/3.

[41] Duke to Antoniutti, 10 April 1951; Memo by Archbishop Duke to BCCEA, c. late April 1951, ARCAV, 375/1. In what was probably a press release for the French language press, Fr. Meunier noted that the joint school board had always worked under "la dependence et la surveillance" of the archbishop in the "L'affaire Maillairdville," [c.mid-April 1951, copy in ARCAV, 376/5]. The anonymous author of a draft history of the BCCEA, probably written in the summer of 1952, said that "after a great deal of deliberation," the archbishop decided "that he would finally acquiesce to the repeated requests of the Maillardville [people] for some definite militant action." [Copy in ARCAV, 375/1]; J. Fouquette to Duke, 31 March 1951, ARCAV 375/4; *Vancouver News-Herald,* 3 April 1951.

They claimed to save the province approximately $175,560 annually, that replacing the buildings would cost over half a million dollars, that the schools performed "a moral and financial service to the community," and that British Columbia was the only province to discriminate in such a manner.[42]

On Tuesday evening over 1,000 parents attended a rally. In English, Joe Haddock, secretary of the Joint Board and a tire dealer in private life, declared: "We are ready to go to the limits to obtain what we stand for, simply because it is a matter of conscience." After outlining grievances and urging parents to enrol their students at public schools, he added: "Some say that this is purely a local affair, others that it is only the French of Maillardville who are getting unruly…[but] a question of justice cannot be localized in any one place." He quoted the archbishop's statement that their claims had "much to be said in their favor." Arthur Chermay then read the speech in French. Emotions were high. Most Catholic children registered at public schools on Wednesday.[43] Someone suggested closing all Catholic schools in the province and some in Maillardville expected this would happen.[44] There is, however, no evidence of any plan to close other Catholic schools, a pointless exercise since the Catholic population was so scattered no individual public school would have faced a major influx of students.

Meanwhile, the Maillardville School Board kept the strike in the news. Until funds ran out in June, it sponsored weekly English-language radio broadcasts by a variety of speakers including Everett Roy Moore, a Protestant and active member of the International Woodworkers of America

---

[42] J.B. Goulet and Joe Haddock on behalf of the Committee of the Joint School Boards to Straith and to Johnson, ARCAV, 375/4; *Province,* 2 April 1951; New Westminster *British Columbian,* 2 April 1951; Goulet and Haddock, circulars, 2 April 1951, copies in ARCAV 375/4.

[43] Joe Haddock, Rally Speech, 4 April 1951, ARCAV, 375/4. Also in *BC Catholic,* 5 April 1951. *The Prospector* published Haddock's speech (13 April 1951); *Province,* 4 April 1951. The School Board coped by hiring more teachers. (*Vancouver Sun*, 3 and 4 April 1951)

The strike became an issue in Coquitlam municipal politics. After a "stormy" meeting in which the three Catholic members fought Reeve J.L. Christmas, who opposed private schools, the council asked Straith to intervene. Saying it was a local matter, he refused. More seriously, the Council withdrew its previous grant in lieu of taxes. In the municipal election that fall, separate schools were an issue. Catholics, who formed slightly less than a quarter of the electorate, seem to have voted in a bloc for M.J. Butler, a friend of the Catholic schools and a prominent Liberal, but Christmas was re-elected with a comfortable margin. Nevertheless, Maillardville Catholics believed that with several parties running in a provincial election, a solid bloc of voters could elect the party of their choice. (*Sun,* 6 April 1951; Straith to Pobst, 25 May 1951, ARCAV, 375/8; *Columbian,* 8, 9, and 11 April, 17 October, 6 and 17 December 1951).

[44] Léon Lebrun quoted in Florence Debeugny, *Maillardville: 100 ans et plus/100 Years and Beyond* (Coquitlam: Société francophone de Maillardville, 2009), 87.

(IWA). It withdrew the children for a day of religious instruction, for Ascension Thursday (then a Holy Day of Obligation), and for a pilgrimage to the shrine of Our Lady of Consolation where students from the Catholic schools of the archdiocese prayed to win "for our schools the powerful assistance of the Blessed Mother, our Diocesan patroness."[45] The public school board threatened prosecution for truancy and the withdrawal of the family allowance. Over 250 parents, mostly French Canadians, signed mimeographed letters stating their "intention to exercise my God-given right of educating my children as I see fit – even to allowing them one day of religious instruction from time to time." Parents indicated they would welcome prosecution since it would bring the question into the courts although their legal advisor correctly predicted that the public board was unlikely to carry out its threat because prosecution would "be political dynamite."[46]

Already, however, Archbishop Duke was exercising nominal authority over the broader campaign although the laity sometimes challenged his control. A week to the day after the Maillardville schools closed, he convened a special meeting of the executive of the Catholic School Board which served as the executive of the Catholic School Association (CSA), a body made up of clerical and lay representatives from the parishes. There he outlined the events leading up to the closure of the schools. A long discussion of the principles of the action followed; in the end the Board unanimously supported the Maillardville board, which, though acting on its own, did so "in the interest of all Catholic school children in the province." The phrase "on their own" reflected concern that such actions might seriously weaken its own position in lobbying the government. The archbishop agreed that henceforth parochial school boards must clear their actions through the Catholic School Board and himself.[47]

Two days later, at a closed general meeting of the CSA, Joseph F. Brown, a prominent Vancouver florist and chair of the Association, reported that his board had been unaware of the events at Maillardville. The archbishop replied that he had "gladly" given permission for the strike without referring to the CSA because "the strictest secrecy" was necessary to surprise the municipality. The "present crisis," the archbishop suggested,

---

[45] *BC Catholic,* 3 May 1951. Some children may have been serious pilgrims; others looked upon it as a school picnic. (Personal recollection).

[46] *Province,* 27 April 1951; *Sun,* 24 April 1951; R.B. McLean to all parents, 30 April 1951, copy in ARCAV, 375/4; *Columbian,* 11 and 15 May 1951; Fouquette to Duke, 26 December 1951, ARCAV, 402/3; BCCEA, Executive Meeting Minutes, 11 December 1951, ARCAV, 373/3.

[47] Special Executive Meeting of the Catholic School Board and Members of the Steering Committee called by the Archbishop, 9 April 1951, ARCAV, 373.

would be an opportunity to show that Catholics paid taxes but wanted the right to educate their children in schools of their choice. After the archbishop spoke, J.B. Goulet of Maillardville said his committee had planned to focus on its own district but a central committee could distribute propaganda especially to educate non-Catholics. Several speakers mentioned the need to overcome "the seeming passivity" of Catholics. That meeting also deleted the phrase "although the action was taken on their own." A few days later, Brown resigned. He doubted the wisdom of the Maillardville action as did Mrs. A.E. Clay who also resigned from the Board.[48]

To reflect the province-wide nature of the problem, the archbishop proposed changing the name of the Archdiocesan Catholic School Association to the British Columbia Catholic Education Association (BCCEA). The other provincial bishops welcomed this although Bishop Martin Johnson of Nelson warned that where Catholic schools did not exist, as in most communities in his diocese, few Catholics saw a problem.[49] At the same meeting on 11 April, Pat Power and Leo Stadnyk, both of whom worked at Fraser Mills but lived in New Westminster, suggested a policy committee of twelve laymen carry on the campaign.[50] The meeting accepted the archbishop's suggestion that the executive select a committee from the elected parish delegates "to bring the problem direct" to government officials. At a later meeting, the BCCEA elected Power and Reg Paxton to replace Brown and Clay on the executive.[51] Previously the archbishop had relied on business and professional men in Vancouver as lobbyists; now suburban trade unionists took the lead. Men such as Power, Stadnyk, and John Busch had honed their political skills as part of the "white bloc" in the New Westminster local of the IWA that drove Communists from the leadership of the union.[52]

---

[48] *BC Catholic,* 26 April 1951; Minutes of meeting of Vancouver Archdiocesan Catholic School Association, 11 April 1951, ARCAV, 102/5; Brown to Duke, 15 April 1951, ARCAV, 401/9.

[49] Minutes of meeting of Vancouver Archdiocesan Catholic School Association, 11 April 1951, ARCAV, 102/5; Hill to Duke, 20 April 1951, Jennings to Duke, 21 April 1951, Johnson to Duke, 21 April 1951 and Jordan to Duke, 23 April 1951, ARCAV, 375/5; Hill to Duke, 2 April 1951, ARCAV, 375/4.

[50] Power, then in his early 30s, had been a business agent in the International Woodworkers of America (IWA) and was among those who had driven the Communist influence out of the IWA (*BC Catholic*, 15 January 1953).

[51] BCCEA, Minutes, 31 May 1951, ARCAV, 102/5. Paxton had served as financial secretary of the Catholic School Board in 1949. (*BC Catholic*, 24 February 1949).

[52] Similarly, in Trail, the home of the Consolidated Mining and Smelting Company, many local union leaders resigned from the Communist-led Mine, Mill and Smelter Workers' Union and joined the United Steel Workers, a member of the non-Communist Congress of Industrial Organizations. In Trail and in its surrounding parishes, the moral aspect of the problem was a topic for Sunday sermons. (Earling Johnson to H.W.

The BCCEA hired Paxton, an insurance underwriter, as its full time secretary, established a central office, and made plans to sell memberships to every wage earner in the archdiocese to supplement the $12,000 that the archbishop supplied from funds previously set aside for school purposes. The archbishop discouraged the BCCEA from raising a "Fighting Fund" and tried to dampen the enthusiasm of members who wanted to "strike while the iron is hot." He agreed with the need to have the full support of the laity, "with the direction of the clergy," but opposed issuing a manifesto lest it impede bargaining with the government. He also insisted that he and his school board, which oversaw the schools, must approve all actions of the BCCEA which he viewed mainly as a publicity agency.[53]

The archbishop hoped to use the Maillardville situation to force the provincial government to act or, if it refused, to appeal to Ottawa. A young Catholic lawyer initially advised that such an appeal was possible but later concluded that the federal cabinet would probably refer it back to the province. Nevertheless, he recommended that a Catholic ratepayer refuse to pay school taxes and send an equivalent amount to a Catholic school. He would likely lose the case but it might be useful politically. The archbishop thought about it but did not act.[54]

Given the archbishop's preference for negotiation not confrontation, Power, Busch and Paxton interviewed Education Minister Straith on 27 June. Though sympathetic to religious instruction in schools, Straith said that denominational differences and the fact that some teachers had no religion made it impossible. He had provided textbooks, appreciated the need for health and transportation services, and tax exemptions for non-profit educational institutions but separate schools had "caused bigotry and intolerance" in Ontario. Thus, neither he, nor the cabinet, nor the major political parties wanted them. Moreover, the Maillardville strike had

---

Herridge, 2 March 1947, LAC, H.W. Herridge Fonds, (MG32C13), v. 24; *The Prospector,* 17 February 1950).

At the time of the efforts to expel Communists from the unions, Catholic trade unionists in the Vancouver area formed an Association of Catholic Trade Unionists in October 1948 (*BC Catholic,* 14 October 1948), which sponsored a labour school consisting of lectures on labour ethics and parliamentary procedure. (*BC Catholic,* 23 February 1950) Some of the IWA men had attended a labour school under the direction of the pastor of Our Lady of Mercy parish, which served parts of New Westminster and Burnaby. (*BC Catholic,* 27 February 1947.) Trail also had a labour school. (*The Prospector,* 29 September 1950). On the struggles within the IWA see Irving Martin Abella, *Nationalism, Communism, and Canadian Labour* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1973), 127-136.

[53] BCCEA, Minutes, 8 and 22 May 1951, ARCAV, 373/3; BCCEA Minutes, 31 May 1951, ARCAV, 102/5.

[54] BCCEA, Executive Meeting, 22 May 1951; Duke to T.A. Dohm and Swencisky, 19 June 1951, ARCAV, 102/6; Dohm to Duke, 26 June 1951, ARCAV, 376/6; Dohm to Duke, 22 July 1951 and 12 February 1953, ARCAV, 402/6.

"strongly incensed" public opinion and no concessions could be made until public opinion "quietened down."[55]

To generate support for its cause, the BCCEA, whose executive met weekly, held a provincial convention on 6 October 1951. By then it had printed 70,000 pamphlets and leaflets, distributed material for speaking notes,[56] organized rallies in 34 parishes, and distributed 12,000 membership cards. However, the Association suspected that it was not reaching Catholics who did not believe in separate schools. Diocesan newspapers regularly had to remind parents of their duty, under pain of sin, to send their children to Catholic schools if they were available.[57] The convention heard how the BCCEA distributed information to the English and French press in eastern Canada and approved a BCCEA constitution with a goal of gaining recognition of the rights of Catholics to have their children educated in Catholic schools and to have their school taxes applied to schools their children could attend. The secular press gave the convention considerable coverage. Statements by Maurice Lizee of Maillardville and Power sounded like warnings to the Liberal party but it was Fred Peters, a delegate, who got the most attention by calling for the formation of a Catholic political party, the Christian Democratic Party (CDP) with a platform based on the archbishop's seven point programme.[58] Other delegates wanted to find an

[55] *BC Catholic,* 5 July 1951; Power, Busch and Paxton, interview with Straith, 27 June 1951, ARCAV, 402/6. A subsequent BCCEA brief emphasized its desire to negotiate "a satisfactory solution to its just demands for obtaining equality in Education" and called to Catholic teachings as a "direct variance to the scourge of Communism." (BCCEA Executive, Minutes, 17 July 1951, ARCAV, 373/3; Paxton to the government of British Columbia, 9 August 1951, ARCAV, 375/5).

[56] *BC Catholic,* 19 July 1951; BCCEA Minutes, 17 July 1951, ARCAV, 373/3; Maurice Lizee to Paxton, 19 June 1951, ARCAV, 378/8. A series of 39 mimeographed documents are in ARCAV 375/4 and 376/4.

[57] In pastoral letters, Archbishop Duke reminded parents that one sin was "reserved" in the diocese, namely disobedience when, if both parents were Catholics, they sent their children to public schools or non-Catholic private schools when a parochial school was available. For example, *BC Catholic,* 22 August 1936, 3 September 1937, 28 August 1947, 31 August 1950; *The Prospector,* 25 September 1953.

[58] Presidential Address by Pat Power at BCCEA convention, 6 October 1951, ARCAV, 401/6. A copy of the constitution is in ARCAV, 373/2; *Sun,* 9 October 1951; *Province,* 9 October 1951. See also *News-Herald,* 10 October 1951. In fact, a test case on taxes was already underway with Father Gordon McKinnon of Chilliwack refusing to pay a $20 annual tax imposed on him and several Protestant clergymen who earned their livings in the municipality but did not contribute to local education costs through taxes on personally owned property. (*BC Catholic,* 11 October 1951) Fr. McKinnon was convicted in small claims court but he and the Anglican and United Church clergyman won on appeal. (*BC Catholic,* 3 January 1952).

existing party that would support the cause and suggested that political action might take the form of refusing to pay taxes.[59]

An unnamed cabinet spokesman said the government would not respond to any Catholic pressure lest other groups, including the Doukhobors, Mennonites and Seventh Day Adventists, seek the same privileges and make the "school system inefficient, expensive and chaotic." When Paxton expressed regret at the government's "apparent refusal" of "a just solution for the Catholic Educational needs," Straith warned that if the BCCEA was seeking a Royal Commission it could expect a response similar to that of Ontario's recent Hope Royal Commission which had been critical of separate schools.[60]

In mid-November, Paxton told an audience at the University of British Columbia that Catholics insisted on their right to give their children a religious education but would give it after regular school hours in integrated schools. Archbishop Duke had advocated integration intermittently since 1941 but it seemed like a new idea. According to the press, Straith claimed not to know what it meant but said that Catholic schools, including their buildings, could become part of the public school system if operated by district school boards.[61] A pleased Archbishop Duke stressed to the BCCEA the importance of negotiating with Straith on the basis of the Seven Points with the provisos that Catholic authorities must approve the appointment of teachers and retain ownership of school buildings "as a safeguard against any future eventuality."[62] Given his desire to avoid confrontation, the archbishop had already advised the BCCEA to ensure that its press releases indicated that citizens, not the archbishop, were agitating for separate schools. He prepared "press releases to rectify misunderstandings" which the BCCEA conceded were "generally guarded in meaning and tone."[63]

---

[59] *The Prospector,* 12 October 1951.

[60] *Province,* 11 October 1951; Paxton to Johnson, 17 October 1951, ARCAV, 376/6; Straith to Paxton, 13 November 1951, ARCAV, 375/5. The majority report of the Hope Commission was critical of separate schools as detracting from the role of the public schools as a unifying force and as a source of additional cost. [Royal Commission on Education in Ontario, 1950, *Report,* (Toronto: King's Printer, 1950), 492-493].

[61] *Vancouver Sun,* 20 November 1951; *Prince Rupert Daily News,* 19 November 1951; *Province,* 17 and 22 November 1951; Press Release, 19 November 1951, ARCAV, 402/6; Paxton to Rev. J.A. MacLellan, 23 November 1951, ARCAV, 374; Report of Minimum Demands Committee, 27 November 1951 ARCAV, 375/1.

[62] This idea of retaining ownership of the buildings came from Bishops in the Maritimes who Archbishop Duke had consulted about the integration plan. (The correspondence is in ARCAV, 375/1 and 375/2.)

[63] Duke to Paxton, 8 November 1951, ARCAV 402/6; BCCEA, Executive Meeting, 20 November 1951, ARCAV, 373/3.

The archbishop was in a difficult position. He had to support the BCCEA but could not afford to alienate the government although he had recently questioned his support for the Liberal party. "It was always thought that the first principle of liberalism was to value the first capital, the human capital, over all other natural resources," he mused.[64] In a private meeting with Straith, Father M.R. Hanley, director of the archdiocesan Catholic Charities and Superintendent of Catholic Schools, stressed that he did not represent the BCEEA. When Straith complained of "vilification" in some BCCEA statements, Hanley assured him that "vilification" was not part of the programme but warned that the Catholic people "felt very keenly about the school situation. . . and would leave no stone unturned to rectify what they thought are injustices towards our children."[65]

Earlier that day, Hanley met Straith, A.D. Turnbull, the minister of health and welfare, and his deputy, about health and dental services in Vancouver since the Community Chest, a charitable organization, had withdrawn its support for them. The ministers agreed that a comprehensive medical and dental plan could not ignore Catholic children. Turnbull quietly exercised some influence; early in 1952, Vancouver extended these services to parochial schools.[66]

The archbishop had reason to believe that there might be more good news. The previous October, in a long editorial in his *Prince Rupert Daily News*, Harry G.T. Perry, a former Minister of Education, had asserted that a "minority (not entirely Catholic)" educated their children at no cost to the state and paid taxes to support schools that did not benefit their children. The archbishop had this "finest presentation of the case" reprinted in the *BC Catholic* and *The Prospector,* the diocesan newspaper of Nelson*;* the BCCEA reprinted it as a widely distributed leaflet.[67]

Perry followed through by consulting the archbishop who, through Father Fouquette, had the Maillardville Liberal Association sponsor a resolution at a Liberal executive meeting asking for the integration of

---

[64] Duke to BCCEA, c. late April 1951, ARCAV, 375/1.

[65] Memo of Hanley's interview with Straith, Turnbull and Amyot, 11 December 1951, copy in ARCAV 374/12.

[66] *BC Catholic,* 8 November 1951 and 10 January 1952; Elsie G. Turnbull, diary, 10 January 1952, BCA, MS0841, A.D. Turnbull Papers; *Sun,* 8 January 1952; Memo of Hanley's interview with Straith, Turnbull and Amyot, 11 December 1951, copies in ARCAV 374/12 and 375/6. On 3 January 1952, Frank Lavalle had a five-hour interview with Straith, a personal friend, in which they discussed the school question. Lavalle informed the BCCEA that Straith seemed ill-informed on certain aspects of the school question, opposed the overall acceptance of integration, but would consider the possibility of further concessions. (BCCEA, Executive Minutes, 8 January 1952, ARCAV, 373).

[67] *Prince Rupert Daily News,* 23 October 1951; Duke to Perry, 30 October 1951, ARCAV, 375/2. Perry was a Unitarian.

minority group schools into the public system so they might enjoy its services and an exemption from property taxation. Religious instruction would be before or after regular school classes. This was everything Catholics wanted; some of the wording was identical to the archbishop's Seven Points. The resolutions committee approved. To improve the chances of the party approving the resolution at its April convention, Archbishop Duke asked pastors to have some of their "faithful workers" attend local Liberal meetings to explain it and to vote for it at the convention. He also appealed to prominent non-Catholics, securing promises from Chief Justice W.B. Farris, a prominent Liberal, and A.E. Dal Grauer, the president of the B.C. Electric, the largest utility company in the province, "to help us in every possible way."[68] Given division within the Liberal party over separate schools, the archbishop rightly worried that the convention would "by-pass" the resolution until after the election. In a registered letter sent to Premier Johnson at his home, the BCCEA warned it would withdraw its support from both the provincial and federal Liberals if the Liberal Party in B.C. did not give an "accredited assurance" before the election that if returned to power, it would grant "EDUCATIONAL MINORITY RIGHTS." The BCCEA sent mimeographed copies of that letter to Prime Minister St. Laurent, C.D. Howe, the minister of Trade and Commerce, and all B.C. Members of the House of Commons and the Senate, although it is not clear what help they could offer save possibly for some influence on provincial Liberals.[69] Because the Coalition had broken up over a number of issues unrelated to Catholic schools in January 1952, the Liberals alone now formed the government.

The secular press expected a "fiery debate" at the Liberal convention. Straith had recently pleased the B.C. Teachers' Federation (BCTF) by saying that the government opposed integrating Catholic schools into the public system. The BCTF had feared for the autonomy of school boards in hiring teachers, the selection of textbooks, and further financial demands from Catholics. It was as much a trade union as it was a professional organization so also wondered how vows of poverty taken by members of religious orders

[68] Duke to the other British Columbia bishops, 24 December 1951, ARCAV, 374/12. On his marriage certificate, Grauer is listed as a member of the United Church, but his bride was Anglican and he was married in Christ Church, the Anglican cathedral in Vancouver. When he died in 1961 he was buried from that church.

[69] Duke to Perry, 19 December 1951, ARCAV, 402/3; Duke to Fouquette, 24 December 1951, ARCAV, 374/12; Duke to Perry, 2 January 1952, ARCAV, 402/3; Perry to Paxton, 1 December 1951, ARCAV, 374; Resolution re Minority Group Schools in British Columbia sent by the BC Liberal Association to District Associations [January 1952]; Duke to Rev. J. Masse [and others], 16 January 1951, ARCAV, 402/3; Paxton to Johnson, 4 April 1952. (capitals in the original). ARCAV, 374 and 402/3. A copy of the original letter is also in GR1222, 87/2. Johnson merely acknowledged its receipt.

could affect pensions and salaries of teachers who had to meet "normal economic responsibilities." At their April 1952 annual general meeting, BCTF delegates from across the province voted 500 to 6 against integration.[70]

Straith's opposition to integration upset Catholic leaders. In an editorial in the *BC Catholic,* Father Henry Bader called Straith's statement a "direct denial" of Catholic educational rights and warned Liberals that the outcome of their convention would determine if they would get the Catholic vote.[71] The BCCEA went to the Liberal convention, set up a caucus room in the convention hotel, and worked out a strategy. Paxton spent almost 48 consecutive hours explaining the BCCEA's position to visitors. Some prominent Catholics lobbied in their own way. Swencisky, who was president of the B.C. Hospitals Association, strongly opposed the co-insurance aspect of the troubled B.C. Hospital Insurance Service, whereby patients paid a modest daily charge in addition to their insurance premiums. According to Turnbull, the minister in charge of hospital insurance, Swencisky offered to withdraw his opposition to co-insurance if the party changed its "intolerable" stand on separate schools. Turnbull would not change his mind on schools, so Swencisky led the fight against co-insurance.[72]

Meanwhile, behind closed doors, until 3 a.m. the Liberal Resolutions Committee "sweated out" a policy on separate schools. It rejected integration. Instead, after noting that the government now provided textbooks and health care to Catholic students, a new resolution urged the government "to consider any other apparent matters of discrimination with a view to further eliminating such discrimination." Rumors circulated that Catholic delegates were "ready to raise the roof" but behind-the-scenes meetings with Attorney General Wismer and other prominent Liberals convinced the dissidents, possibly with a promise of bus transportation, to accept it.[73] The convention unanimously passed the new resolution.

Though disappointed that the "watered-down" resolution "side-stepped" the issue, Catholic delegates were quoted as saying they accepted it because it admitted past discrimination and left the way open for further concessions. Bishop Johnson of Nelson told the premier of his gratitude at the government's intent "to go farther down this road of removing

---

[70] *Sun,* 21 November 1951 and 16 April 1952; "What about 'Integration?'" *The B.C. Teacher,* February 1952, 202-204; 210. The B.C. School Trustees Association feared that funds for separate schools would come from their budgets. (*Province,* 20 November 1951).

[71] *Columbian,* 17 April 1952.

[72] *BC Catholic,* 1 May 1952; Elsie G. Turnbull, Memoir, circa 23 April 1952, A.D. Turnbull papers. For the context of hospital insurance see A. Douglas Turnbull, "Memoir: Early Years of Hospital Insurance in British Columbia," *BC Studies,* 76 (Winter 1987-88): 58-81; *Province,* 24 April 1952.

[73] *BC Catholic,* 1 May 1952; *Columbian*, 25 April 1952; *Province,* 23 April 1952.

discrimination." As for the BCCEA, after briefly planning to withdraw support from the Liberals, the executive merely expressed dissatisfaction with the "ambiguous" resolution, urged the government to consider ways of eliminating discrimination, announced it would oppose any candidate who did not favour ending double taxation, called Straith's statement "unworthy of a minister of the Crown," and the premier's action in allowing it to stand as unfaithful "to the public trust which he holds."[74]

A few days later, 700 delegates, mostly from Vancouver Island, attended a BCCEA convention in Nanaimo. Pat Power, the president, in referring to the Maillardville protest, asserted that Catholic education was being "stifled" because Catholics could barely support their existing schools. He described how Straith "got huffy" when a BCCEA delegation met him the previous summer. The slogan of the BCCEA, said Power, was "Work, Pray, and Vote." John Busch, the vice-president, claimed the government "was trying to starve the Catholics into submission." The *Vancouver Sun* and some other secular papers had interpreted the resolutions passed at the BCCEA convention as a condemnation of the Liberals, but the *BC Catholic* explained that accepting the Liberal platform depended on the views of individual candidates. Similarly, *The Torch,* the magazine of the Victoria diocese, agreed that people should "support favourable candidates of any political party." As for comments on Straith and the premier, the *BC Catholic* noted that many Catholics were "tempted to be vicious" in their condemnation of them but the BCCEA was only pointing to their errors "in a very factual way" and not predicting any future action. The election, it asserted, "will prove enough." It concluded, Catholics must vote according to their "consciences but for the sake of your God-given rights and for the sake of your children, PLEASE VOTE." The BCCEA explained that it would ask each candidate for a statement on the Catholic school question and interpret any refusal to do so as opposition. To insure "unified action" on the "SCHOOL question and the coming ELECTION" the archbishop met all priests in the Vancouver and New Westminster deaneries.[75]

In anticipation of an election, the BCCEA increased its efforts to gain support among Catholics for not all Catholics were "impressed by the

[74] *Sun,* 25 April 1952; *Columbian,* 25 April 1952; Martin M. Johnson to B.I. Johnson, 5 May 1952, GR1222, 87/2; Special Meetings of the Executive, 25 and 26 April 1952, ARCAV, 373; *BC Catholic,* 1 May 1952.

[75] *Sun,* 28 April 1952; *Province,* 28 April and 2 May 1952; *BC Catholic,* 1 and 8 May 1952; *The Torch,* May 1952; the Canadian Press carried the story. *Victoria Daily Times,* 3 May 1952; Duke to pastors, 19 May 1952, ARCAV, 44/10. The capital letters are in the original.

supreme necessity of religious instruction."[76] It organized study groups based on constituencies not parishes. Its constituency rallies drew significant numbers: in Burnaby, 600; in Vancouver East, 800; in Vancouver-Point Grey, 600; and in Dewdney, which included Maillardville, 700. The BCCEA distributed leaflets and pamphlets, and Paxton analysed the 1949 election results to show BCCEA organizers that in closely-contested constituencies, a minority could be effective. Reflecting a continuing Liberal bias, he secured a list of officers of Liberal constituency organizations that the BCCEA could pass on to the clergy. During Catholic Press Month the archbishop had all pastors read a letter exhorting parishioners to subscribe to the *BC Catholic* as "a weapon" in the fight for minority educational rights.[77]

Beyond the archdiocese, the BCCEA had mixed success. It complained of a "very poor" financial response from the province "as a whole" and of weak sales of membership cards which were supposed to fund the election campaign. After a slow start because of the illness of Bishop Hill of Victoria and the hostility of some lay men, the BCCEA on Vancouver Island became very active as shown by the successful Nanaimo convention that, through the wire services, got press coverage in eastern Canada and especially in Quebec. In Victoria, *The Torch* encouraged readers to support the BCCEA. In Nelson, Bishop Martin Johnson, who believed in Catholic Action but not political action, welcomed BCCEA speakers; Bishop Edward Jennings of Kamloops said having a speaker would not be convenient.[78]

Because of opposition to integration, the BCCEA and Archbishop Duke returned to the earlier stress on double taxation. At a sod-turning for the new Notre Dame High School in Vancouver, the archbishop called for an end of the "double tax" and complained that taxes collected from Catholics went only to support non-sectarian schools.[79] In Nelson, *The Prospector*

---

[76] *BC Catholic,* 16 September 1945, ed. J[ames] F. C[arney]. Fr. Carney, then editor of the *BC Catholic*, later became archbishop of Vancouver.

[77] Paxton to "Dear Father," 6 March 1952 and Duke to "Dear Father," April 1952, ARCAV, 402/6; *BC Catholic,* 31 January, 22 May and 5 June 1952; BCCEA, Executive Minutes, 22 and 29 January and 3 June 1952, ARCAV, 373; Paxton to Jack Varcoe, Trail, 24 March 1952, ARCAV, 374.

[78] BCCEA, Executive Meeting, 4 March 1952, ARCAV, 373; *BC Catholic,* 6 March and Easter 1952; Rev. A. McDonald to Paxton, 11 February 1952, ARCAV, 374; H.I. Bader to Duke, 26 April 1952, ARCAV, 402/3; *The Torch,* April 1952; *The Prospector,* 29 February 1952; *BC Catholic,* 12 June 1952; BCCEA, executive minutes, 10 June 1952, ARCAV, 373. Given travel logistics, no one from the BCCEA seems to have visited the Okanagan Valley. Jennings to Power, 4 May 1952, ARCAV, 374. The Kamloops diocese covered a relatively small geographic area with Kamloops as the only significant population centre. Apart from a large Indian Residential School, the only Catholic school, St. Ann's Academy, was operated by the Sisters of St. Ann and was more akin to a private school than to a parochial one.

[79] *Province,* 14 May 1952.

pointedly noted in capital letters that integration into the public school system was merely a proposal. Catholics did not want "one red cent of Protestant money" but only a fair share of their taxes, an argument that Bishop Johnson repeated a few weeks later at a Knights of Columbus banquet in Penticton. A BCCEA leaflet, *Education in a Democracy,* said nothing about integration but concluded that it was "a strange sort of thinking which considers members of a religious body a part of the public when it is a question of raising funds, but not part of the public when it is a question of spending them." A Vancouver woman who had taught for as little as $15 a month in Catholic schools told Premier Johnson that all that was asked was that taxes paid by Roman Catholics be set aside to finance Catholic schools.[80]

As voters, supporters of separate schools had few choices. Premier Johnson did not mention separate schools in his campaign speeches. When asked, he replied that they should not be mixed up with politics and that the Liberal convention had said "no" to any grants to separate schools. Similarly, a Vancouver Point-Grey Liberal, frustrated by hecklers, rebuked Catholics for pressing for Catholic schools. Most disconcerting to Catholics was the statement of Maurice Finnerty, a sitting MLA and a Catholic, that a separate school system "would completely undermine. . . the finest educational system in Canada."[81]

The Conservative platform frankly stated a belief "in the democratic system of non-sectarian schools." If Catholics were not aware of that, the Conservatives advertised their platform in the *BC Catholic* and *The Prospector.* During the campaign, Herbert Anscomb, the party leader, told a questioner that the public school system was open to all and he did not want to get into a religious argument. A Vancouver candidate favoured more emphasis on the Bible and the Lord's Prayer in the public schools but would "rather go down to defeat than support separate schools for any group." In Rossland-Trail the candidate noted the cost of separate schools and concern about upsetting "the present unity and harmony" between Catholics and Protestants. In Dewdney, R.C. MacDonald, the Conservative incumbent who believed that separate school integration was "unfair and discriminatory," expressed sorrow that the Liberal candidate supported separate schools.[82]

The CCF, the party thought most likely to challenge the Liberals, had never favoured separate schools and Harold Winch, its leader, repeated that

---

[80] *The Prospector,* 16 and 30 May 1952. The *BC Catholic* reprinted Johnson's speech (5 June 1952); *Education in a Democracy* (Vancouver: BCCEA, [1952]; Vancouver correspondent to Johnson, 21 May 1952, GR1222, 87/1.

[81] *Province,* 30 April 1952; *Sun,* 7, 10 and 26 May 1952.

[82] *Columbian,* 1 May 1952; *BC Catholic,* 15 May 1952; *Prospector,* 16 May 1952; *Colonist,* 22 May 1952; *Sun,* 23 May 1952; *Trail Daily Times,* 10 May 1952; *Province,* 8 June 1952. No independent ran in Dewdney.

on the hustings. *The Prospector* declared that the CCF had "openly defied Catholic voters." Confusing the political situation was the emergence of two new political parties. Particularly awkward for the BCCEA was the CDP, which the *BC Catholic* noted was not a Catholic Party even though the majority of its members were practising Catholics and some had a high profile in the BCCEA. Fred Peters argued that Catholics should form their own party, open it to others, and have an economically "sound and just" programme based on the encyclicals of Leo XIII and Pius XI. During the election campaign the CDP issued a broadly-based platform with such promises as revisions in the Industrial Conciliation and Arbitration Act, reduced hospital insurance premiums, the abolition of the 3% sales tax, low cost housing, a government takeover of major public utilities, and the sale of foreign wines in government liquor stores. Education appeared only as a minor point, but the CDP would give "equality of opportunity in educational institutions of parents' choice in accordance with the UN Declaration of Human Rights." The CDP denied any link with the BCCEA or being a Catholic party and noted that it had members who belonged to the Anglican and United Churches and that it would support Mennonites, Jews, and others who might want separate schools.[83]

Social Credit, the other new party, had considerable strength especially in the interior. *The Prospector* had published several sympathetic articles about it in the spring and summer of 1951. Bishop Johnson proposed submitting a resolution to the Social Credit convention but the BCCEA feared contact with the Socreds might suggest a division of purpose among Catholics. No official of the BCCEA had attended the Socred convention in November 1951, but "a goodly number" of Catholics did – some as official delegates." Lyle Wicks, its leader, explained that the separate school question "was handled in as satisfactory a manner as possible, under the circumstances." The convention supported "equal rights for all and special privileges to none." That translated as opposition to separate schools.[84]

Social Credit spokesmen were not consistent. Rev. E.G. Hansell of Alberta, who ran the Socred campaign, declared that a Socred government would give private schools their "just share of tax monies as they do today in Alberta." W.A.C. Bennett, a former Conservative MLA who had recently

---

[83] *Sun,* 5 April and 16 May 1952; *Prince Rupert Daily News,* 5 April 1952; *Prospector,* 25 April 1952; *BC Catholic,* 28 May 1952; F.T. Peters to Paxton, 30 November 1951, ARCAV 375/6; "Why the Christian Democratic Party?" copy in ARCAV, 376/4; *Province,* 21 and 22 May 1952.

[84] *The Prospector*, 20 April and 21 September 1951; BCCEA, Executive Meeting, 30 October 1951, ARCAV, 373/3; Paxton to Johnson, 2 November 1951, ARCAV, 374; Wicks to Paxton, 23 November 1951, ARCAV, 375/6; Rhoda J. McGibbon to Paxton, 13 November 1951, ARCAV, 374.

joined Social Credit, echoed party policy of "special privilege to none." After an interview with Wicks, Father Bader concluded that the Socreds would not adopt the Alberta way of supporting separate schools.[85]

Since only the CDP, which had no chance of winning, endorsed separate schools, the BCCEA polled all candidates about separate schools and recommended certain candidates. Not everyone agreed; the Knights of Columbus who helped fund the BCCEA, believed that Catholics should support the Liberals or their efforts would be to no avail. Nevertheless, Archbishop Duke repeated his usual admonition that Catholics were free to vote according to their consciences while observing that the BCCEA would recommend candidates who should be supported and those who should be rejected. The information was supposed to be given verbally but not from a public platform. Unfortunately, Paxton suggested that constituency committees distribute a ballot with the names of recommended candidates marked. The election was unusually complicated because, before breaking up, the Coalition had replaced the "first past the post" system with an alternative ballot on which voters were asked to list their choices in rank order. Some constituency committees could find no candidate who favoured separate schools. The Dewdney committee solved the problem by making the leading party, the Liberals, their first choice and Social Credit their second. A copy of the ballot fell into the hands of R.C. Macdonald who showed it to a *Province* reporter. The local press reported on many of the choices featured on these ballots.[86]

Although used in only a few constituencies the sample ballots were a bad idea. Reiterating the archbishop's admonition that Catholics could vote as they pleased, the *BC Catholic* asserted that the ballots were only recommendations, were prepared by the BCCEA on its own, possibly recommended wrong choices as candidates sometimes contradicted earlier statements, and the BCCEA may have overlooked some candidates. In at least one case, the marked ballot backfired. Dr. J.J. Gillis, an incumbent MLA and a Catholic, complained that several people had intended to vote for him but after learning that marked ballots had been handed out at some churches after Sunday Mass they changed their minds. Archbishop Duke admitted that some BCCEA constituency associations had "overstepped" instructions and some priests may have interfered. He specifically referred to Maillardville where

[85] K.Gogo to BCCEA, 18 April 1952, ARCAV, 374; *Sun,* 26 March 1952; *BC Catholic,* 1 May 1952; *Trail Daily Times,* 17 May 1952. Curiously, as an Independent MLA he had implied support for access to bus services for Catholic students. (*Victoria Daily Times,* 13 April 1951).

[86] BCCEA Executive Meeting, 3 June 1952, ARCAV, 373; *BC Catholic,* 5 and 12 June 1952; Paxton to pastors, 27 May 1952 and BCCEA, Meeting in Haney, 1 June 1952, ARCAV, 374; *Province,* 10 June 1952.

he believed "the French-speaking priests" instigated sending out a letter saying that the BCCEA had recommended the Liberal which, the archbishop, apparently misinformed, said was not true. The BCCEA executive, though gratified by the demonstration of Catholic Action at the constituency level, admitted that some of its members had been partisan.[87]

Social Credit narrowly won a minority government in 1952. With the future under Social Credit uncertain, the Joint School Board in Maillardville re-opened its schools in September 1952. The strike had failed. Why? In the first place, there were too few Catholics to swing the vote save possibly in a few constituencies and that would have happened only if Catholics acted as a bloc, which they did not. The Liberals knew that and paid no attention to threats that they would lose the Catholic vote. In any case, a solid Catholic vote would have been ineffective in the 1952 election because no party save the Christian Democrats, promised aid to Catholic schools and it had no chance of electing anyone.

Why were the major parties so opposed to aiding Catholic schools? There was some overt anti-Catholicism. At its provincial convention in May 1951, the Grand Orange Lodge declared its "complete and unalterable opposition" to separate schools because of the financial burden, the granting of "a special privilege to a religious sect," and a tendency to create divisions in society. The BCCEA was delighted because that action indicated that Catholic schools were a provincial issue.[88] The BCCEA, however, criticized the CBC when it re-broadcast a speech attacking the Catholic school question in a "scandalous and defamatory manner" given by Rev. E. Morris, the president of the Canadian Protestant League.[89] Another attack on Catholic schools came at the annual convention of the Regular Baptists in Vancouver when one resolution described the "prevailing purpose" of separate schools to be "the ultimate conquest of Canada and the submergence of all others."[90] These blatant attacks on Catholic schools from minorities were not significant. British Columbia, however, had a long tradition of a non-sectarian system of public education and, except for Catholics and a few friends, no one wanted a change. Even the Anglican and United Churches, which wanted religion taught in the public schools, did not favour separate schools.

Secondly, Catholic spokesmen were inconsistent in their demands. Not only did they change their requests according to what they thought

---

[87] J.J. Gillis to Duke, 19 June 1952, ARCAV, 402/5; Duke to Gillis, 28 June 1952, ARCAV, 402/6; BCCEA, Executive Meeting, 17 June 1952, ARCAV, 373.

[88] BCCEA, Executive Meeting, 22 May 1951, ARCAV, 373.

[89] *BC Catholic,* 7 June 1951.

[90] *Province,* 22 June 1951.

the politicians would accept but the needs of the schools varied across the province. Many municipalities required Catholic schools to pay property taxes; Vancouver exempted them. Local health authorities in some regions extended health services to students in Catholic schools; Vancouver did not. And, in most places outside greater Vancouver and Victoria, the Catholic population was too small and too scattered to support Catholic schools. Because of that and distance, despite the efforts of the BCCEA to send speakers to interior points, Catholics outside greater Vancouver and southern Vancouver Island were only peripherally involved in the campaign.

Even where Catholic schools were available, the need of the bishops to remind parents of their obligation to send their children to Catholic schools suggests that not all Catholics favoured separate schools. Thus, the BCCEA had to spend much of its energy selling its cause to what should have been its natural constituency rather than cultivating support in the broader community. In addition, there was a division in lay leadership between the business and professional people of Vancouver and the working classes and small businessmen of the suburbs. The men who took over the leadership of the BCCEA were zealous and hard-working and willing to co-operate with the archbishop but they could not control the excessive enthusiasm of some of their members.

Although there were hints of division among them,[91] through diplomacy, the bishops, especially Archbishop Duke, won the minor concessions of access to textbooks and medical and dental care in Vancouver. These did not satisfy the Maillardville School Board which, frustrated by the slow pace of change, appears to have taken the archbishop almost by surprise. The strike put him in the embarrassing position of having to support a course that was contrary to his preference for diplomacy over direct action. The Maillardville strike and propaganda circulated by its Board and by the BCCEA publicized the plight of Catholic schools – even the BBC had a report[92] – but it was a failure. It won few friends outside Quebec and cost sympathy where it counted most, among British Columbia politicians.[93]

Post Script

Although the strike failed, some in Maillardville believed it was responsible for the government giving Catholic schools access to its textbook

[91] Cunningham, *Justice Achieved,* 50.
[92] *BC Catholic,* 5 April 1951.
[93] Cunningham, *Justice Achieved,* 50.

programme, but that was announced a month before the strike began.[94] The archbishop and bishops still lobbied cabinet ministers and the BCCEA continued with its work, particularly in the parishes, as it correctly anticipated that there would be another election within the year. Indeed, before its planned interview with the legislature's committee on social welfare and education, the government fell. Again, the BCCEA interviewed candidates and some local groups circulated marked sample ballots. Some candidates seemed sympathetic, but no party, save the CDP, which had few supporters, promised to support Catholic schools. Social Credit won a majority government. Archbishop Duke and the other bishops of the province continued to raise the issue but to no avail. The BCCEA still promoted the cause of Catholic schools, but much less vigorously. Under the direction of the archbishop it did not deal directly with the government.[95] Over the next few years it gradually faded away.

Memories of the disruption caused by the strike may have inspired Premier W.A.C. Bennett to push for an amendment to the Municipal Act in 1957 to exempt educational institutions, including Catholic schools, from municipal taxation. The province, however, made no further concessions to private schools, which included the Catholic schools, until 1977 when, under pressure from the Federation of Independent Schools, a consortium of private elite schools and various religious schools particularly those of the Christian Reformed Church, it recognized independent schools and, under specified conditions, agreed to grant them up to half the per capita funding provided for students in their respective public school districts.[96] It was not all that Archbishop Duke had wanted but, had he still been alive, he undoubtedly would have been pleased.

---

[94] In the summer of 1953 *Le Devoir* sent its reporter Pierre Laporte on a western tour. His article "Maillardville a déjà des victoires à son credit," (19 August 1953) described the injustices faced by Catholic schools in British Columbia, summarized the Maillardville Strike, but noted that as a result of the strike the students received visits from public health nurses and participated in the government's textbook programme. The Francophone Society of Maillardville in 2009 published a collection of short interviews with residents of Maillardville. Only four interviewees, all of whom were students at the time, mentioned the strike. Two recalled attending public school for a time; a third who was in high school remarked that the small high school at Our Lady of Lourdes did not close. A fourth spoke of "a sort of revolution" in our schools but attributed the government's grant of free or rental textbooks to the strike. That concession did not come into effect until September 1951 but was announced before the strike. (Debeugny, *Maillardville 100 ans et plus/100 Years and Beyond*, 55, 64,87, 191).

[95] Secretary of BCCEA to Duke, 15 March 1956, ARCAV, v.376/7.

[96] L.W. Downey, "The Aid-To-Independent Schools Movement in British Columbia," in Sheehan, *Schools in the West,* 312-313; Cunningham, *Justice Achieved,* 46-48.

Academic Year 2014-2015

THE JAMES F. KENNEY PRIZE

This $500 prize is awarded annually by the Canadian Catholic Historical Association in honour of its founder, James F. Kenney (1884-1946), for the best essay on any aspect of the History of Catholicism in Canada written in a course by an undergraduate or graduate student.

Conditions: Entries must be essays between 2500 and 8500 words in length on some aspect of Catholicism in Canada. The author must be a part-time or a full-time student in a degree program at an accredited university or college in Canada.

The essay must have been written to meet the requirement of a credit course during the current academic year and must not have been published or be under consideration for publication elsewhere. By submitting their essays for consideration, students assign the first rights of publication to *Historical Studies,* the journal of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association.

Submissions: Entries shall be submitted by course instructors no later than 1 May 2015. No instructor shall submit more than two entries. Essays must be typed neatly and should not indicate the instructor's comments or grade. Essays may also be submitted electronically. Entries should be sent to the President, Canadian Catholic Historical Association:

Dr. Robert Dennis
Department of Religious Studies
University of Prince Edward Island
550 University Ave.
Charlottetown, PEI C1A 4P3

Entries may be submitted electronically to robert.dennis@upei.ca

Adjudication: Entries will be judged by a panel determined by the CCHA. The winner will be announced in the autumn of 2015. There will be no runners-up or honourable mentions. The CCHA reserves the right not to award a prize in a given year should applications not be of sufficient quality.

CCHA *Historical Studies*, 80 (2014), 91-94

Abstracts/Résumés

Edward MACDONALD

The Working Life of an Island Priest: The Diary of Father Angus McDonald, Diocese of Charlottetown, 1871-1883

The extant diary of Rev. Angus McDonald, covering the years 1879-1883 in the Diocese of Charlottetown, on Prince Edward Island, affords a rare glimpse of the rhythms of parish life from the perspective of a country pastor in the last quarter of the nineteenth century. A former college rector and newspaper polemicist, McDonald was living out the last decade of a troubled pastoral career. Against a backdrop of chronic ill-health, McDonald's diary traces his pastoral duties within an eastern Canadian diocese that had recently emerged from its missionary period yet still suffered from an insufficiency of priests. The diary charts the arduous daily round of a priest who was constantly on call, yet was not chained to his parish. At the same time it provides an instructive case study in how diarists – both deliberately and unconsciously – "compose" personal identity through their daily diary entries.

Le journal complet du révérend Angus McDonald, couvrant les années 1879 à 1883 dans le diocèse de Charlottetown à l'Île-du-Prince-Édouard, offre un rare aperçu, du point de vue d'un pasteur de campagne, de la vie paroissiale dans le dernier quart du XIX^e^ siècle. Anciennement recteur d'université et polémiste, McDonald a connu plusieurs difficultés dans la dernière décennie de sa carrière pastorale. Malgré des problèmes de santé chroniques, il a noté le détail de ses fonctions pastorales au sein d'un diocèse de l'est du Canada qui, bien qu'à peine émergée de la période missionnaire, souffrait du manque de prêtres. Le journal illustre donc le quotidien difficile d'un prêtre au service de sa paroisse, sans pour autant y avoir été enchainé. Il fournit également une étude de cas révélatrice de la façon dont les auteurs – intentionnellement ou inconsciemment – « composent » leur identité personnelle par leur contribution quotidienne à leur journal.

Marie ELLIOTT

Mission to New Caledonia: The Letters of John Nobili, S. J., 1845-1848

By expanding our knowledge of missionary work with First Nations in New Caledonia, and of Hudson's Bay Company (HBC) personnel, the John Nobili letters make a tremendous contribution to the histories of British Columbia, Canada, and the Pacific Northwest. Like many Jesuits, Nobili abandoned an uncertain future during Italy's Risorgimento for the perilous life of a missionary in North America. After ten months' residence at Fort Vancouver, where he learned English and the Chinook trade jargon, he was assigned to proselytize the First Nations of New Caledonia (British Columbia), under the auspices of the HBC which operated nine forts in the region. This paper is based on translations of the Nobili letters to Father General John Roothan in Rome and to his immediate superiors, Fathers Peter De Smet and Joseph Joset, of the Rocky Mountain missions. Nobili recorded his experiences in his diary, then transferred them to letters at the earliest possible moment. Their immediacy, their broad spectrum of fresh information and the fact that they are rare, non-HBC manuscripts from the 1840s make them valuable historical documents. Copies of the majority of the letters were obtained from Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu, Rome.

Les lettres de John Nobili ont grandement contribué à enrichir notre connaissance de l'histoire de la Colombie-Britannique, du Canada et du Nord-Ouest Pacifique, grâce à une meilleure compréhension du travail des missionnaires avec les Premières nations en Nouvelle-Calédonie, ainsi que celle des travailleurs de la Compagnie de la Baie d'Hudson (CBH). Comme beaucoup de jésuites, Nobili a abandonné un avenir incertain pendant la Renaissance en Italie pour adopter la vie périlleuse du missionnaire en Amérique du Nord. Après dix mois de résidence à Fort Vancouver, où il a appris l'anglais et le jargon commercial Chinook, il a été affecté à la conversion des Premières nations de Nouvelle-Calédonie (Colombie-Britannique), sous les auspices de la CBH qui opérait neuf forts dans la région. Cet article s'appuie sur la traduction des lettres de Nobili adressées au Père général John Roothan à Rome et à ses supérieurs immédiats, les Pères Peter de Smet et Joseph Joset, des missions des montagnes Rocheuses. Rédigeant d'abord ses expériences dans son journal, Nobili les transféra rapidement sous forme de lettres. Leur immédiateté, leur rareté, puisque n'étant pas des manuscrits de la CBH, ainsi que le large spectre couvert par ces informations inédites, confèrent à ces précieux documents des années 1840 leur valeur historique. Des copies de la plupart des lettres ont été obtenues de l'Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu, à Rome.

David A. KINGMA

Calling Them to Their Duties: William Henry Judge, S.J., American Missionary to the Canadian North

Jesuit Father William Judge established St. Mary's Church and Hospital in Dawson City well before the rush of gold seekers into the Yukon region. Judge's heroic service in this frontier environment reinforced positive social values and saved many lives, at the cost of his own, and thus earned him a reputation for extraordinary sanctity. This article examines the widely known "Saint of Dawson" within the context of the sectarian instincts, social milieu and historical events that framed nineteenth century missionary work in Alaska and the Canadian North. The needs and sensibilities of the early Klondike community invited Judge and his contemporary clerics to exhibit practical piety and ecumenical cooperation rather than competition, moralism and class consciousness.

Avant même le début de la grande ruée des chercheurs d'or dans la région du Yukon, le Père jésuite William Judge fonda l'Église et l'Hôpital St. Mary à Dawson City. En plus de sauver de nombreuses vies, parfois au péril de la sienne, le service héroïque de Judge renforça les valeurs sociales positives dans cette zone frontalière, ce qui lui a valu la réputation d'être un saint. Cet article examine le parcours de celui qui était bien connu comme le « Saint de Dawson », du point de vue des rivalités sectaires, du milieu social et des évènements historiques qui ont forgé le travail des missionnaires du XIX^e^ siècle en Alaska et dans le Nord canadien. Les besoins et les particularités de la communauté Klondike ont amené Judge et ses clercs contemporains à faire preuve d'une grande piété, suscitant la coopération œcuménique plutôt que la concurrence, le moralisme et la conscience de classe.

Patricia E. ROY

The Maillardville, B.C. School Strike: Archbishop W.M. Duke, Catholic Schools, and the British Columbia Election of 1952

In April 1951, the joint board of the two Catholic schools in Maillardville, B.C., a French-Canadian settlement, closed them and sent the students to the overcrowded public schools. Although the board secured financial and moral support from Quebec, its concern was provincial financial support for Catholic schools, not language. For decades, Archbishop William Mark Duke of Vancouver and his predecessors had lobbied the government directly or through prominent Catholic business and professional men, many of whom

were associated with the Liberal party. Archbishop Duke had recently gained some minor concessions; the action in Maillardville surprised him. Nevertheless, he effectively co-opted the enthusiastic laymen, several of whom had learned their political skills in labour unions, who took the lead in agitating for government aid. The schools issue played a minor role in defeating the Liberals in the 1952 provincial election but neither quiet diplomacy nor direct action secured government support for the schools of British Columbia's Catholic minority, not all of whom saw the value of separate schools.

En avril 1951, la commission scolaire de deux écoles catholiques de Maillardville en Colombie-Britannique – une communauté principalement canadienne-française – ferma ses établissements et envoya ses élèves au sein d'écoles publiques déjà surpeuplées. Bien qu'elle ait obtenu le soutien financier et moral du Québec, sa préoccupation était non pas linguistique, mais plutôt liée au soutien financier des écoles catholiques de la Province. Pendant des décennies, l'archevêque William Mark Duke de Vancouver, ainsi que ses prédécesseurs, avait fait pression sur les instances du gouvernement, directement ou par l'intermédiaire d'hommes d'affaires et de professionnels catholiques de premier plan, dont plusieurs ont été associés avec le Parti libéral. Comme l'Archevêque Duke avait récemment obtenu quelques concessions mineures de la part de la Province, il fut donc surpris par la fermeture des deux écoles de Maillardville. Néanmoins, il a réussi à coopter des laïcs engagés, dont plusieurs avaient acquis leurs aptitudes pour la politique dans les syndicats, afin de réclamer un meilleur soutien du gouvernement. Malgré tout, le problème des écoles a joué un rôle mineur dans la défaite des Libéraux aux élections provinciales 1952: ni la diplomatie discrète ni les actions directes n'ont contribué à pérenniser le soutien du gouvernement pour les écoles de la minorité catholique de la Colombie-Britannique alors que peu voyaient alors l'importance de maintenir des écoles séparées.

SUBMISSION GUIDELINES

Historical Studies

Journal of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association

1. General Author Guidelines

Published once a year by the Canadian Catholic Historical Association, *Historical Studies* is a fully refereed journal that features articles and critical notes aimed at advancing knowledge in the religious history of Canada. The journal invites comparative and interdisciplinary approaches and welcomes manuscripts from the greatest possible number of researchers, including graduate students. All manuscripts are assessed through a double-blind process that ensures confidentiality. The editorial board considers only unpublished manuscripts and does not consider works of popularization. The journal only publishes English-language articles.

Submission Guidelines

Manuscripts must be submitted electronically as Word files. Texts should be double-spaced and should be no longer than 35,000 characters (6,500-8,500 words) or ***25 double-spaced pages***, including notes.

Authors whose manuscripts are selected will be required to provide the editors with a revised version of the manuscript in a timely manner following the application of any changes and corrections required.

Articles accepted for publication must be accompanied by an abstract (roughly 150 words) as well as a biographical sketch of the author (no more than 75 words).

Article Selection and Copyright

Submissions are evaluated by the editors of *Historical Studies* and by external readers. The editors will decide whether to publish, reject or request a revision of each article. In cases of conditional selection, the editors will communicate with the author to insure that the conditions for publication are fulfilled. The editors reserve the right to reject articles that, although acceptable in terms of content, will require such extensive revision that it is unlikely that the changes can be completed in time to meet publication deadlines.

Authors whose work has been accepted for publication in *Historical Studies* assign to the Canadian Catholic Historical Association the exclusive copyright for countries as defined the Copyright Act to the contribution in its published form. The CCHA, in turn, grants the author the right of republication in any book of which the author is the exclusive author or editor, subject only to the author giving proper credit to the original publication in *Historical Studies.*

2. Submission Format

As the journal does not possess a secretarial office, we thank you in advance for meeting the following conditions *exactly* so as to help us reduce printing costs and speed up the publication process. The editors reserve the right to reject manuscripts that stray too far from the following formatting rules.

Reminder: Texts must not exceed 25 pages, notes included.

Texts should be formatted for standard dimensions (8.5 x 11). Long quotations and notes should all be **single-spaced** within the text. The first page of the manuscript should contain the title of the article followed by the author's name. To make the double blind process work, authors must not indicate their name on any page and, if referring their own work, must not refer to "my" article or book but cite it in the normal way as if it were by another author.

Text should appear in New Times Roman 12 font, with 9 font in the footnotes.

Titles, Tables, Figures and Illustrations

All tables, graphics, figures and illustrations should be referred to in the body of the text. They should be numbered in Arabic numerals and include an appropriate title or key. Notes on the source, if any, should follow immediately. Maps (vector processing software), graphics (e.g., Lotus and Excel spreadsheets) and tables (spreadsheet or word processing software) must all be submitted in electronic format.

Photographs must be submitted as jpeg files, and include captions, credits and permissions where appropriate.

Capitalization, Parentheses, Abbreviations, Dates and Spacing

Texts should make as little use as possible of capitalization, parentheses and abbreviations.

Centuries should be indicated in written form (i.e. "nineteenth century").

In text references and footnotes, dates should be indicated as follows: day, month, and year (i.e. 1 April 1966).

Paragraphs should be preceded and followed by a 6-point spacing. Make sure to indent the first line of each paragraph. The period ending each sentence should be followed by one space.

Italics

The use of italics should be reserved for foreign-language terms and titles of books and periodicals.

Quotations

Authors should endeavour to avoid long quotations. If quotations of more than three typed lines are necessary, they should be placed as a separate paragraph with a five-space indent on the left, no indent on the right and without quotation marks. Omissions or cuts within quotations are indicated by suspension points … .

Notes

Historical Studies employs footnotes for the purpose of referencing. Superscript numbers in-text should be offered sequentially in the paper, and should be placed immediately following punctuation marks. Notes and references should be single-spaced and appear at the bottom of each page or at the end of the article.

Bibliographical information should be provided in full when books and articles are first cited. Afterwards, only the name of the author, the first few words of the title and the page number need be mentioned. Do not use *op. cit.* or *ibid*.

Here are some examples:

Books

Robert Choquette, *Language and Religion: A History of French-English Conflict in Ontario* (Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1975), 161-247.

For subsequent references: Choquette, *Language and Religion*, 9-43.

Edited book

Paul Bramadat and David Seljak, eds., *Christianity and Ethnicity in Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008).

Article in book

Mark McGowan, "Roman Catholics (Anglophone and Allophone)," in Paul Bramadat and David Seljak, eds., *Christianity and Ethnicity in Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008), 49- 100.

Journal Articles

Elizabeth Smyth, "Congregavit Nos In Unum Christi Amor: The Congregation of the Sisters of St. Joseph in the Archdiocese of Toronto, 1851-1920," *Ontario History*, 84, no. 3 (1992): 230-233.

Archival Sources

St. Francis Xavier University Archives (hereafter STFXUA), Extension Department Papers (hereafter EDP), Moses M. Coady to R.J. MacSween, 24 March 1953, RG 30-2/1/2963.

Dissertation

Heidi MacDonald, "The Sisters of St. Martha and Prince Edward Island Social Institutions, 1916-1982," (Ph.D. diss., University of New Brunswick, 2000), 10-12.

Web Site

Author's name, title of publication, date of publication, <url>, and date accessed.

William Lyon Mackenzie King Papers, MG 26J, Series 13, Diary entry for 10 June 1940, http://king.collectionscanada.ca, accessed on 20 June 2005.

Spelling

Spelling follows that recommended by the *Canadian Oxford Dictionary.* Where this dictionary offers options, the first one is favoured.