

Historical Studies

2012

VOLUME 78

The Journal published by
The Canadian Catholic Historical Association

(founded June 3, 1933)

Indre Cuplinskas, Ph.D.
Editor

Patricia E. Roy, Ph.D.
Associate Editor

Editorial Board

Terrence Murphy, Ph.D.	Richard A. Lebrun, Ph.D.
Raymond Huel, Ph.D.	Peter Meehan, Ed.D.
Glenn Wright, M.A.	Fred McEvoy, M.A.
Elizabeth Smyth, Ed.D.	Roberto Perin, Ph.D.
Jeanne Beck, Ph.D.	Mark McGowan, Ph.D.
Elizabeth W. McGahan, Ph.D.	

A National Society for the Promotion
of Interest
in Catholic History

**The Seventy-eighth annual meeting of the English Section
of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association
was held at University of New Brunswick – St. Thomas University,
Fredericton, NB
31 May – 1 June 2011**

CANADIAN CATHOLIC HISTORICAL ASSOCIATION

HISTORICAL STUDIES

Historical Studies is a peer-reviewed publication of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association that publishes articles on the history of Catholicism in Canada or on topics having a connection with the Catholic Church in Canada.

Historical Studies is published annually. Subscriptions are available through the Membership Director, Canadian Catholic Historical Association, 81 St. Mary Street, Toronto, Ontario, M5S 1J4. For mailing addresses in Canada, the amount is \$50 per year; for U.S. mailing addresses – \$50 (USD) per year; for international addresses – \$60 per year; for students – \$30 per year. Copies of most back issues can be obtained from the same address at \$25 per volume, postage and handling \$5 in Canada and \$15 for international addresses.

Correspondence relating to editorial matters should be addressed to Indre Cuplinskas, St. Joseph's College, University of Alberta, Edmonton, AB T6G 2J5.

The CCHA's homepage may be accessed at the following URL:
<http://www.cchahistory.org>

CCHA *Historical Studies* is indexed in the *Canadian Periodical Index*, the *Catholic Periodical and Literature Index*, *Ulrich's International Periodicals Dictionary*, ABC-Clio's *America: History and Life*, and the *Canadian Historical Review's "Recent Publications Relating to Canada."*

ISSN 1193 B 1981
© Historia Ecclesiae Catholicae
Canadensis Publications Inc.
Ottawa, Ontario, 2012

Table of Contents

List of Contributors	4
Editors' Foreword	5
Papers not published	6

Articles

Catherine Foisy Preparing the Québec Church for Vatican II: Missionary Lessons from Asia, Africa, and Latin America, 1945-1962	7
Gordon L. Heath The Protestant Denominational Press and the Conscriptio Crisis, 1917-1918	27
Gabriela Pawlus Kasprzak How the Poles Got Organized: The Emergence of Organizational Life amongst Polish Canadians in the 1920s and 1930s	47

Historical Notes

Ollivier Hubert A Nineteenth Century Montreal <i>Collège Classique</i> : Antiquarian Survival or Education for the Future?	73
Jean-Philippe Warren Some Thoughts on Catholicism and the Secularization Question in Quebec: Worldly and Otherworldly Rewards (1960-1970)	81
Kenney Prize Announcement	93
Abstracts/Résumés	95
Submission Guidelines	101

List of Contributors

Catherine Foisy is currently completing her doctoral thesis in Humanities at Concordia University. Largely based on oral history, her thesis, entitled «Des Québécois aux frontières : dialogues et affrontements culturels aux dimensions du monde. Récits missionnaires d'Asie, d'Afrique et d'Amérique latine (1945-1980)», explores the contribution of Québécois missionary efforts to the major socio-ecclesial transformations of the 1960s (the Quiet Revolution and Vatican II). She is interested in the sociological impacts of religious changes in Québec and elsewhere.

Gordon L. Heath is Associate Professor of Christian history at McMaster Divinity College. He received his Ph.D. from St. Michael's College. His publications include *A War with a Silver Lining: Canadian Protestant Churches and the South African War, 1899-1902* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2009), *Doing Church History: A User-friendly Introduction to Researching the History of Christianity* (Toronto: Clements, 2008), and co-author with Stanley E. Porter of *The Lost Gospel of Judas: Separating Fact from Fiction* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2007).

Gabriela Pawlus Kasprzak is a doctoral candidate in history at the University of St. Michael's College, University of Toronto. Her work examines the relationship between religion and nationalism among Polish Canadian immigrants to Canada in the interwar period. She is a SSHRC Doctoral Fellowship recipient; was recently the Guest Editor of a special issue of *Polish American Studies* on the history of the Poles in Canada; and contributed to *The Polish American Encyclopedia*.

Ollivier Hubert is Associate Professor of history at the Université de Montréal, specializing in Québec and Canadian colonial history. He is the editor of «Globe, revue internationale d'études québécoises,» an international journal of Québec studies, and vice president of the «Institut d'histoire de l'Amérique française,» the leading association of Québec history. His interests center on the social and cultural history of the populations in the Saint Lawrence valley during the 17th, 18th, and 19th centuries, understood in an Atlantic perspective. He is currently completing a book about the practice of insults and slanders in Québec, and is the principal investigator of a SSHRC-funded research group in the history of education.

Jean-Philippe Warren is Associate Professor of sociology in the Department of Sociology and Anthropology at Concordia University where he holds a Research Chair in Quebec Studies. Author of more than 150 public and scholarly articles, he has published on a wide variety of subjects related to the history of Quebec, including Native peoples, social movements, pop culture, youth, the Roman Catholic Church, and the arts.

Editors' Foreword

On behalf of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association, we are pleased to present Volume 78 of *Historical Studies*. Articles and historical notes contained in this volume include a number of studies of Quebec. Two papers throw new light on the changes in the Quebec Church around the time of the Quiet Revolution. Jean-Philippe Warren proposes that an increase of worldly rewards and a decrease of otherworldly rewards fuelled the decline of the Church. Somewhat in contrast, but not in contradiction, Catherine Foisy shows how the experiences of Quebec missionaries abroad opened their minds to new cultures, to the importance of the laity in the Church, and to the need for professional training in pedagogy and health care. Although his interest is in an earlier time period, Ollivier Hubert provides evidence suggesting that classical colleges may have been more important in producing members of the middle class than as training grounds for the clergy.

Another challenge to traditional historiography is Gordon L. Heath's study. His examination of the Protestant press and its attitudes to Catholics and Quebec during the Conscription Crisis of the First World War shows its concern for conciliation. Nationalism is also a theme in Gabriela Pawlus Kasprzak's essay on how, in the inter-war years, Canadian Poles negotiated between Polish nationalism and Catholicism as a means of identifying themselves and their organizations.

We are indebted to all of the individuals whose cooperation in the writing, assessing and revising of these papers has made this edition of *Historical Studies* possible. The journal and the association continue to be grateful to Fr. Edward Jackman, O.P., Secretary General of the CCHA and the Jackman Foundation for the generous support and encouragement that has made this volume possible. We also acknowledge the support that St. Joseph's College, University of Alberta is providing Dr. Cuplinskas in carrying out her editorial duties. Due to unavoidable circumstances, we were unable to include a bibliography this year but hope to resume publication of it in our next issue.

Dr. Patricia E. Roy, professor emerita at the University of Victoria, is the new associate editor. We would like to thank Dr. Elizabeth W. McGahan for her years of work at the helm of the journal and the support and advice she has given to us as we take over this task.

Indre Cuplinskas
Patricia E. Roy

Papers presented at the Annual Meeting
University of New Brunswick - St. Thomas University, Fredericton
31 May – 1 June 2011
but not included in this volume:

Marie-Claire Arsenau, “Africadian and Acadian Catholics of Southville, Nova Scotia”

Patti Bannister, “Achieving a National Heritage Designation: The Sisters of Charity, Halifax”

Dianne Dodd, “A Rich Built Heritage Legacy: Women’s Religious Communities in Canada”

Iheanyi Enwerem O.P., “Catholics of African Descent in the Canadian Catholic Church”

Sarah Jardine, “Coast to Coast with the Catholic Women’s League of Canada in the 1920s”

Peter Ludlow, “Saints and Sinners: Popular Myth and the Study of Personalities of the Antigonish Movement”

Kathleen MacKenzie, “The Development of Masters of Their Own Destiny: The Coady Story at Home and Abroad”

Bob McKeon and Deb Schrader, “Canadian Faith Based Organizations Engaged in the Social Economy: the Example of Catholic Religious Orders and Mennonites”

Joseph Nnadi, “Then and Now: the Emerging Representation of Blacks in the Catholic Church of Western Canada”

Elizabeth Smyth and Patricia Kmiec, “Experiencing Vatican II: Reflections of Canadian Women Religious on Identity and Change”

Brigitte Violette, “The Female Religious Orders and Healthcare in Quebec: Keys for Analyzing Hospital and Nursing History”

Preparing the Québec Church for Vatican II: Missionary Lessons from Asia, Africa, and Latin America, 1945-1962¹

Catherine FOISY

The contribution of missionary institutes to the reception of Vatican II in Québec remains largely unexplored.² That is surprising because French Canada invested huge human, material, and financial capital in missions abroad.³ From the Québécois perspective, its missionaries' preconciliar experience of cultural and religious differences contributed to the emergence of a changing view on both Christianity and the Church particularly between 1945 and the opening of the Council on 11 October 1962. The help, guidance, and work of lay people in mission countries reasserted the importance of

¹ This paper was first presented as "Lessons from Asia, Africa, and Latin America: Assessing the Reception of Vatican II in Québec from a Missionary Perspective" at the 2011 Canadian Catholic Historical Association's Annual Meeting held at St. Thomas University, Fredericton, N.B. The author thanks Maurice Demers, Éric Désautels and Catherine LeGrand, members of the Interdisciplinary Research Group on Canadian Missionaries, as well as Jean-Philippe Warren, the three anonymous reviewers for their insightful comments, the editors of the journal for their precious help, which all improved the manuscript substantially. Finally, this research would have not been possible without the financial support provided by the *Fonds québécois de recherche sur la société et la culture*'s doctoral fellowship.

² Here, the expression "missionary institutes" refers to the different forms of religious and consecrated life, as institutionalized in religious communities, secular institutes, and apostolic societies, among others, devoted primarily to missions abroad.

³ According to Jean Hamelin, in 1957, French Canadians gave \$2,242,531 to pontifical missionary organizations. Jean Hamelin, *Le XX^e siècle, Tome 2 : De 1940 à nos jours*, dans Nive Voisine (ed.) *Histoire du catholicisme québécois* (Montréal: Éditions du Boréal, 1984), 202. In a paper entitled « Le missionariat canadien français : d'un engagement religieux à une action coopérative déconfessionnalisée », presented at the 2011 International Society for the Sociology of Religion in Aix-en-Provence, Éric Désautels demonstrated how, until the mid-1960s, French Canadians were very committed to supporting the missions abroad, largely through contributions to pontifical missionary organizations like *Sainte-Enfance* and *Propagation de la Foi*, whose budgets respectively attained peaks of \$345,000 in 1962 and of \$1,669,632 in 1964.

every Catholic to build strong local churches. Secondly, experiences in Asia and Africa convinced Québécois missionaries of the necessity of adapting their message for different cultures. Thirdly, confronted with non-Christian religious practices many of them started to rethink their relations with believers of other religious traditions, their colleagues, and God.

This paper draws on 43 interviews⁴ with members of four missionary institutes founded in Québec between 1902 and 1928,⁵ and the archives of these institutes. After providing an overview of missions between 1945 and 1962 from the viewpoint of the four institutes with an emphasis on the effect of the closure of China, the paper discusses the main transformations experienced by Québécois missionaries in these years, and finally, draws parallels between some of the main characteristics of the Québec Church on the eve of Vatican II and the experiences of the missionaries.

Québécois Missionary Efforts before 1945⁶

In the nineteenth century Québécois worked in Asia and in Africa as members of European missionary institutes transplanted to Québec such as the Franciscaines missionnaires de Marie (FMM), the Sœurs blanches d’Afrique, the Pères blancs d’Afrique, and the Oblats de Marie-Immaculée (OMI).⁷ The reorganization of the Sacred Congregation of the Propaganda

⁴ Between July 2010 and August 2011, the author interviewed 6 Missionnaires du Christ-Roi, 12 Missionnaires de Notre-Dame des Anges, 10 members of the Société des Missions-Étrangères du Québec, and 15 Missionnaires de l’Immaculée-Conception. All interviews were conducted in a one-on-one context, at one of the four institutes’ motherhouses. The interviewees are indicated by their real names. Overall, the author recorded 110 hours of interviews (audio only). Seven missionaries were interviewed twice, due to different circumstances and each interview lasted, on average, two hours. The interviews were conceived as life stories and were conducted on these four main themes: 1. Personal and vocational story; 2. Missionary experience; 3. Québec society, and 4. Faith and the Other.

⁵ A statistical compilation in 1947 listed 19 male and 29 female religious communities as having missionaries abroad. To our knowledge, in total, only 6 of the male communities and 7 of the female communities were missionary institutes in the strict sense, as defined in footnote 2. *Missions-Étrangères du Québec*, III, no. 14 (March-April 1949): 324-325.

⁶ Canada was a missionary country from its early seventeenth century beginnings until the twentieth century. That may have affected the development of missions abroad, but is not considered here, neither are the domestic missions to the First Nations such as the work of the Missionnaires du Christ-Roi in Longlac, Ontario, Mount Currie, and Anahim Lake in British Columbia, nor their social work with immigrants. Further research on Québécois missionaries in Canada is needed.

⁷ The Sisters of Providence had been in Chile since 1853 but constituted their own Chilean province distinct from the Mother House on 17 March 1880. http://www.providenceintl.org/en/histoire_historique_1860.php, accessed on 29 July 2011.

Fidei by Pope Pius X in 1908 encouraged missionary renewal in the first half of the twentieth century. A distinctly Québécois missionary effort, however, had already begun with the foundation in 1902 of the Missionnaires de l'Immaculée-Conception (MIC) by Délia Tétreault in Outremont, the wealthy francophone district of Montréal. Tétreault sought to develop a sense of missionary zeal in Montreal and throughout Québec and to send missionaries to foreign lands. In 1909, the first missionaries left for China. She also played a significant role in developing three institutes founded in Québec for missionary work abroad: the Missionnaires de Notre-Dame des Anges (MNDA), the Société des Missions-Étrangères du Québec (SMÉ), and the Missionnaires du Christ-Roi (MCR). The MNDA was co-founded in 1919 in the diocese of Sherbrooke by Florina Gervais, a former MIC, and a Chinese woman, Chan Tsi Kwan (Mother Marie-Gabriel). It was officially recognized by the Vatican in 1922. The Québec Episcopate founded the SMÉ, a society of secular priests devoted to missions, in Montreal in 1921 in order to represent the local Church abroad and to contribute to the missionary effort by forming a native clergy in mission countries. The fact that Tétreault was the driving force behind this formation partly explains its close relationship with the MIC as well as the symmetry in the course of their development (mainly, their establishment in Pont-Viau, Laval and the choices of mission countries). Finally, Frédérica Giroux, a former MIC, founded the MCR in 1928 in the diocese of Gaspé. Their first missionaries were sent to Japan in 1933. By 1945, Québec ranked fourth in terms of national missionary effort within the Catholic Church behind Holland, Ireland, and Belgium.⁸ However, that ranking was skewed because several European churches had repatriated many missionaries to rebuild Europe.

The Postwar Global Missionary Context Seen from the Québécois Perspective

A major change in missionary effort took place because of the Communist takeover of China that culminated with the proclamation of the People's Republic of China in 1949. The Communists sought to end missionary activities but in 1952 approximately 40% of the Catholic missionaries remained despite harassment through accusations, questionings, and imprisonment.⁹ After formally expelling the Québécois missionaries in 1953, the Chinese government imprisoned those who, like Gustave Prévost,

⁸ At that time, the ratio of missionaries to Catholics was 1 missionary for every 1120. In Ireland, it was 1/457; in Holland, 1/556, and 1/1050 in Belgium. Hamelin, *Le XX^e siècle, Tome 2*, 191.

⁹ By September 1952, all Canadian Presbyterian missionaries had left China. Serge Granger, *Le lys et le lotus. Les relations du Québec avec la Chine de 1650 à 1950* (Montréal: VLB éditeur, 2005), 125.

refused to leave. When Prévost left in May 1954, no members of the Québec Foreign Mission Society remained in China. The last Québec missionaries left in mid-1955.

The departure of their personnel from China meant a significant change for the four Québécois missionary institutes studied here. Even though the MCR had never been active in China, the larger geopolitical context of the area, including the difficult Japanese postwar context, encouraged it, like the other groups, to focus on Africa and Latin America or other parts of Asia. The MCR opened a new mission in Congo (1954),¹⁰ the MIC opened missions in Hong Kong (1947), Cuba (1948), Malawi (1948), Madagascar (1952), Taiwan (1954), and Bolivia (1957). The MNDA opened new missions in Japan (1949), Tahiti (1950), Peru (1951), Tanzania (1954), and Congo (1954).¹¹ Last, but not least, the SMÉ sent some of its members to Japan (1948), to Honduras (1955), and to Peru (1956).¹²

Expulsion from China affected the institutes in other ways. The repatriated missionaries contributed to training a new generation of novices and seminarians and, by sharing their first-hand experience of the Sino-Japanese war, of Communist China, of privations, of uncertainty, of loss, and of fear, made the newer generation more aware of the meaning and scope of their own commitment as religious missionaries.¹³ For instance, Sister Éliette Gagnon, MIC, paralleled her experience in Cuba under Castro's regime from 1959 through the 1980s with what she heard as a novice from the former missionaries to China:

They were accused of going to China to kill Chinese children. They were in jail for several months. They were on a truck where people threw tomatoes at them and everything else you want. And when these missionaries came back, I just loved listening to them telling these things, I loved it. Sure, mission, we knew it could be like that. You know, I wouldn't have looked for it, but if I'm going on a mission... Even when the time came to go to Cuba, I didn't hope

¹⁰ All the translations are the author's own unless otherwise noted. MCR General Archives, *Rapport présenté au Chapitre général des Sœurs MCR de 1954 (sexennat 1948-54)*, 3 p.

¹¹ MNDA General Archives, *Rapport présenté au Chapitre général de 1952 (sexennat 1946-52)*, and *Rapport présenté au Chapitre général de 1958 (sexennat 1952-58)*.

¹² Société des Missions-Étrangères du Québec, *Bottin 2009*, 7.

¹³ This is the notion that martyrdom is intrinsic to the missionary commitment be it concrete or latent. On this idea, see Béatrice de Boissieu, « Théologie et spiritualité du martyre à travers les écrits des missionnaires », dans Catherine Marin (ed.) *La Société des Missions Étrangères de Paris, 350 ans à la rencontre de l'Asie, 1658-2008* (Paris : Éditions Karthala, 2011), 155-69.

to go to Cuba, I felt it was too close and not poor enough and then after, I was in the hardest mission we've ever had!¹⁴

Speaking of his first year (1952) at the SMÉ called "Probation," M^{sr} André Vallée, Prêtre des Missions-Étrangères du Québec (PMÉ), recalls the particular perspectives brought by those who had been to China:

The personnel were amazing, they were old missionaries who had been to China, who came back from China and they were very human. . . . So, they were neither too demanding, nor too severe, but at the same time, they initiated us into a new life, religious life, priestly life, missionary life. As much as possible, they brought [in] missionaries on vacation in Canada. That gave us an opportunity to ask questions about missions and to get to know a little more. . . . It was lectures on life in China, life of missionaries in China, and let me tell you that it really was something!¹⁵

This is far from being anecdotal since these young missionaries in training became the pioneers in the missionary expansion of their institutes in the late 1940s and the 1950s. Sister Gilberte Giroux, MNDA, who became a pioneer of the Japanese mission for her congregation, recalls:

I was at the novitiate in 1945. And then, there, the founding Mother and the sisters, at the beginning of '46, the sisters were coming back from China after war and then, it's true that it was very emotional to get to know the founding Mother and to hear these sisters who had been there for 20, 21, 25 years talk about it, and *it gave us an extraordinary boost*. (Emphasis added)¹⁶

¹⁴ «Elles ont été accusées d'être allées en Chine pour tuer des enfants chinois. Elles ont été en prison plusieurs mois. Elles ont été promenées dans un camion où les gens leur lançaient des tomates pis tout ce que tu voudras. Puis, quand ces missionnaires-là sont revenues, j'étais au noviciat, j'adorais les entendre raconter ces choses-là, j'adorais. Oui, la mission, on s'attendait à ça. T'sais, je l'aurais pas cherché, mais si je vais en mission... Même quand y'a été le temps de Cuba, j'aurais pas désiré aller à Cuba, je sentais que c'était trop proche pis pas assez pauvre pis après, j'étais dans la mission la plus dure qu'on n'a jamais eue!» Excerpt from the interview with Sister Éliette Gagnon, MIC, on 17 May 2011 at the MIC Motherhouse, Outremont.

¹⁵ «Le personnel était extraordinaire, c'était des vieux missionnaires qui avaient été en Chine, qui étaient revenus de la Chine et puis, ils étaient très humains. ... Alors, y'étaient pas trop, trop exigeants ni trop sévères, mais en même temps, ils nous initiaient à une nouvelle vie, la vie religieuse, la vie de prêtre, la vie de missionnaire. Autant que possible, ils nous amenaient des missionnaires en vacances au Canada. Ça nous donnait l'occasion de questionner sur les missions et de connaître un peu. ... C'était des conférences sur la vie en Chine, la vie des missionnaires en Chine et laissez-moi vous dire que c'était quelque chose!» Excerpt from the interview with M^{sr} André Vallée, PMÉ, on 23 March 2011, Sainte-Anne-de-la-Pérade.

¹⁶ «J'étais au noviciat en 1945. Et puis là, mère fondatrice et les sœurs au début de 46, les sœurs revenaient de la Chine après la guerre et alors, c'est sûr que ça a été beaucoup d'émotions de connaître mère fondatrice pis d'entendre parler ces sœurs-là qui avaient passé 20, 21, 25 ans et ça nous a redonné un élan extraordinaire (nous soulignons).» Excerpt from the interview with Sister Gilberte Giroux, MNDA, on 19 June 2010 at the MNDA Motherhouse, Lennoxville.

The connection established between these missionaries and the younger generation through a simple sharing of experience became a milestone in the subsequent development of missions and an inspiration to the newer members.

It must be emphasized that the situation in China forced the leadership of the institutes to think about the future, and to prepare their younger members better professionally to meet new challenges. This movement was accelerated during the 1950s. At the MNDA's general chapter in 1958, the superior wrote: "The intellectual and technical training of our sisters is becoming more urgent and is the cause of one of the Superiors', both general and local, greatest preoccupations."¹⁷ Between 1946 and 1952, two members of the MNDA completed Bachelor degrees in Nursing; two obtained Bachelor of Arts, two earned diplomas in Music; one a diploma as a laboratory technician, five became licensed nurses, and fourteen secured teaching certificates. In contrast, in 1959 alone, 40 MIC sisters were studying for certificates at teachers colleges or universities and 32 others were at university studying music, medicine, or nursing.¹⁸ Most of the new mission countries insisted on these higher professional standards for work in the health, social services, and education sectors.

The SMÉ, which ran seminaries at all of its missions, put great emphasis on professional training in education. M^{gr} Jean-Louis Martin, PMÉ, recalls how he was sent to Pittsburgh to complete a graduate diploma in education:

Me, when I was ordained, I had been nominated for the Philippines and then, they named me to study education in Pittsburgh because there were many colleges, it was the American system, and they were opening major seminaries. So, they nominated me for the Philippines and then, in education. So, I wasn't to go right away to a mission country, but to leave afterwards for the Philippines. So, I went to Pittsburgh to Duquesne University. They credited me with several classes that I had done here because we had all sorts of classes at the major seminary.¹⁹

¹⁷ She reported that one sister was enrolled in medicine at Université de Montréal and another was working for a bachelor degree in pedagogy at Collège du Sacré-Cœur. MNDA General Archives, *Rapport du sexennat 1952-58 présenté au Chapitre général de 1958*, 18.

¹⁸ *Bilan 1959* (MIC General Archives, Fonds ANCQ-627/1900, 70956/G362).

¹⁹ «Moi, quand j'ai été ordonné, j'avais été nommé pour les Philippines et puis, ils m'ont nommé pour étudier à Pittsburgh en éducation parce que y'avait beaucoup de collèges, c'était le système américain et puis, ils ouvraient des grands séminaires. Alors, ils m'ont nommé pour les Philippines et puis, en éducation. Alors, je n'allais pas partir tout de suite, mais partir après pour les Philippines. Alors, je suis allé à Pittsburgh à *Duquesne University*. On m'a crédité certains cours que j'avais faits ici, parce qu'on avait toute sorte de cours au grand séminaire.» Excerpt from the interview with M^{gr} Jean-Louis Martin, PMÉ, on 17 March 2011 at the SMÉ Motherhouse, Laval (Pont-Viau).

The three other institutes that ran elementary and high schools also educated their members. Sister Georgette Barrette, MIC remembers the situation after she had made temporary vows in 1951:

So, what happened? Happily, I was able to do my 10th and 11th grades and I obtained my 11th grade diploma because one sister taught us, and the school board allowed us to do our exams at St. Viateur parish. So, I studied. After teaching a very short time, only one year, I taught a little at the motherhouse and I went to Trois-Rivières to serve and there, they saw I had a facility for teaching. So, this is the reason they made me pursue my studies. . . . I did my bachelor in education at that time.²⁰

Third, the diversification of mission countries brought a series of challenges related to the pioneering character of these missions and to aspects of daily life in these new countries. For instance, Sister Mariette Trépanier, MNDA, sent to Tahiti six years after the opening of a new mission by her institute, tells how the governor defended the pioneers in front of the local bishop when they arrived in Faaa to run an elementary school in 1950:

So, when, just after the sisters arrived to teach in Faaa, the bishop presented the superior to the governor, he wasn't talking about her running the school. When the bishop told the governor that a French woman would run the school, he said: 'No! They will run their school!' There, he was taking responsibility. He said: 'I take this on myself.' And right away, he prepared a letter and signed it, authorizing the Missionnaires de Notre-Dame des Anges to run their school, though they were not French. That's it!²¹

Other missionaries found that their house was not ready, so they had to move temporarily to a different diocese. Local authorities sometimes asked the missionaries to take charge of services that other religious missionaries would not undertake. Sister Antoinette Castonguay, MIC, sent in 1955 to

²⁰ « Alors, ce qui est arrivé, j'ai pu faire, très heureusement, ma 10^e et ma 11^e années et j'ai obtenu mon diplôme de 11^e année parce qu'une sœur nous enseignait et la commission scolaire acceptait qu'on aille passer nos examens dans la paroisse de St-Viateur. Alors, j'ai poursuivi mes études. Après avoir enseigné un peu, très peu de temps, juste un an. J'ai enseigné un peu à la maison-mère et je suis allée rendre service à Trois-Rivières et là, ils ont vu que j'avais de la facilité pour enseigner. [...] J'ai fait ma licence en pédagogie à ce moment-là. » Excerpt from the interview with Sister Georgette Barrette, MIC, on 13 August 2010, MIC house in Pont-Viau, Laval.

²¹ « Alors, quand monseigneur est allé avec la supérieure, la présenter au gouverneur comme les sœurs qui arrivaient à Faaa, qu'elles enseigneraient à Faaa, mais il parlait pas de direction. Alors, monseigneur lui dit au gouverneur que ce serait une dame une telle, Française, qui dirigerait l'école. Le gouverneur a dit "Non! Elles dirigeront leur école!" Là, il prenait une responsabilité, une grosse responsabilité. Il a dit: "Je prends ça sous mon bonnet." Et tout de suite, il a préparé une lettre et puis signé comme de quoi que les sœurs missionnaires de Notre-Dame des Anges étaient autorisées à diriger l'école, n'étant pas Françaises. C'est ça!» Excerpt from the interview with Sister Mariette Trépanier, MNDA, on 17 June 2010 at the MNDA Motherhouse, Lennoxville.

Baguio, the capital city of the Northern island of Luzon in the Philippines remembers:

So, we started by learning Ilocano and not Tagalog; it was specifically part of our work because the bishop, a Belgian, M^{gr} Brasseur, had said: 'I accept your community here, but because so many communities come to Baguio because it is the summer capital, I want you to go visit the tribes, the aboriginals, not the Ilocanos who live nearby.' There were five tribes. Each had its own language, but they can communicate in Ilocano because they attend the market to sell their fruits and vegetables.²²

Sometimes faced with the unexpected character of the cultural, economic, religious, and social challenges posed by these new missions, the lack of room for voicing their views in the Québec Church, and the realization that they had common interests to defend and to promote, Québécois missionary institutes recognized the need for association.²³ In 1950, thirteen communities of missionary priests founded an intercommunity secretariat independent from the Church hierarchy, the *Entraide missionnaire*.²⁴ The *Entraide* took into account the contribution of the humanities and social sciences in dealing with some of the main contemporary cultural, economic, and political issues including the Cold War and other issues related to Communism. That was a crucial step in paving the way for the development of social analysis tools that flourished in the following decades in a constant dialogue with third world churches and theologians. By initiating a new *Bulletin* in 1954,²⁵ *Entraide*

²² « Alors, on a commencé par apprendre l'Ilocano et non pas le Tagalog, surtout que ça faisait partie de notre travail parce que l'évêque était un belge, M^{gr} Brasseur. Il avait dit : "Moi, j'accepte votre communauté ici, mais y'en a tellement de communautés qui s'en viennent ici à Baguio parce que c'est la capitale d'été, mais je veux que vous alliez aux tribus, aux indigènes, pas les Ilocanos qui restent autour de vous, mais ceux des tribus." Puis, y'avait cinq tribus. Mais les tribus, elles ont chacune leur langue, mais ils peuvent communiquer en Ilocano parce qu'ils vont au marché vendre leurs fruits et légumes. » Excerpt from the interview with Sister Antoinette Castonguay, mic, on 27 July 2011 at the MIC house in Pont-Viau, Laval.

²³ The Association dealt with many issues in a concerted way, among them was the war reclamations case. As early as 1943, the Canadian government was repatriating missionaries. Once the war was over, the government asked the religious communities to reimburse them for the cost. In 1952 the communities and the Canadian government reached an agreement. *Entraide Missionnaire, Une histoire d'avenirs* (Montréal : Les éditions Départ, 1986), 3; 127-28.

²⁴ They included the Société des Missions-Étrangères du Québec, the Oblats de Marie-Immaculée, the Religieux de Sainte-Croix, the Franciscains, the Capucins, the Jésuites, the Pères blancs d'Afrique, the Dominicains, the Rédemptoristes, the Sulpiciens, the Clercs de Saint-Viateur, the Pères du Saint-Esprit, and the Missionnaires du Sacré-Cœur. The Association's first constitution, dating from 1950, was inspired by the Mission Secretariat in Washington, founded in 1949 by M^{gr} Fulton Sheen.

²⁵ In 1954, the organization revised its initial constitution to enlarge its membership by allowing orders of brothers and sisters to join. The number of members rose rapidly from 24 to 84 religious communities. The Constitution defined the organization's ends

missionnaire aimed to create conditions for critically engaging issues about mission, Christianity, and the Church. In the second edition of the *Bulletin de l'Entraide*, a missionary in Africa wrote that "Missionaries alone cannot hope to answer the needs of Africa's contemporary situation. It is necessary to rely on lay help in order for these countries to progress on a Christian basis, through religious, cultural, social, and economic life."²⁶ This comment is congruent with the experience of most missionaries interviewed, as the next section will illustrate at length.

Experiencing Difference: Renewing the Church from Missionary Ground

In order to show how Québécois missionaries came to adopt a new perspective on Christianity and on the Church, it is necessary to focus on their relationship with local churches in mission areas, with other cultures, and finally, with other religions, as examples of ways in which the experience of difference and otherness became a solid ground from which they renewed their understanding of mission. After the Council, mission understood as dialogue became the dominant conception in Catholic missiology.²⁷ For example, Kenyan Catholic theologian Francis Anekwe Oborji insists on interreligious dialogue, dialogue with cultures and local churches, and dialogue as human promotion.²⁸ The change of perspective by Québécois

as follows: "*Entraide Missionnaire* aims at entertaining and promoting between the missionary institutes of Canada a cordial and active cooperation in all matters of interest to them, mainly by 1) providing means to get in touch with each other; 2) facilitating more efficient means of action; 3) providing an information office, and 4) collaborating on Missionary study weeks." These objectives, though reformulated over time, remain core to the *Entraide* mission and work. (*Entraide Missionnaire, Une histoire d'avenirs*, 130-133).

²⁶ « Les missionnaires seuls ne peuvent espérer répondre aux besoins de la nouvelle situation en Afrique. Il est nécessaire de recourir à des aides laïques pour faire progresser le pays sur une base chrétienne, par la vie religieuse, culturelle, sociale et économique. » *Bulletin de l'Entraide*, 1, no. 2 (April 1954): 4.

²⁷ The foundation of Missiology as a theological science can be traced back to 1910 when German Church historian Josef Schmidlin started lecturing at the Catholic Faculty of Theology in Münster. Other chairs in mission studies were created across Europe in the late 1920s and early 1930s. Canada's first chair in missiology was at the University of Ottawa in 1948. In short, mission in the Catholic Church was recognized as a valid object of study before Vatican II.

²⁸ The South African Protestant missiologist David J. Bosch aimed his theological reflections at developing an ecumenical postmodern missionary paradigm in thirteen elements: Church-with-the-others, *missio dei*, mediating salvation, the quest for justice, evangelism, contextualization, liberation, inculturation, common witness, ministry by the whole People of God, witness to People of other living faiths, theology, and action in hope. For its synthetic quality, though, we prefer to use Oborji's typology here. For more on both works, see David J. Bosch, *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission* (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 1991), 587 and Francis Anekwe

missionaries through their experiences during the preconconciliar years corresponds to this major shift in the Catholic Church.

In most of their endeavours in mission countries, in addition to establishing close and efficient collaboration with the local ecclesiastic authorities and helping to develop vocations to religious life and the priesthood, missionaries relied on lay people for help in their daily activities and acknowledged the importance of this assistance. Working with the laity became the best way into the mission countries' culture and language, as Sister Gisèle Beauchemin, MCR, evokes describing her arrival in Katanga (Congo) in 1959:

What helped me a lot when I arrived at the hospital was a young woman, one of the first Congolese nurses. She was 21 years old; I was 26, I had done all of my training and I began working with her. She taught me the language and everything else, and the local custom. So, this, this truly helped me a lot because I had a young friend and we worked together.²⁹

In terms of pastoral work, the development of the Legion of Mary³⁰ and of specialized Catholic Action³¹ movements by Québécois missionaries in Asian, African and Latin American contexts contributed to the development of lay leadership. For instance, the experiences of members of the SMÉ in the diocese of Choluteca in southern Honduras in the late 1950s led to the

Oborji, *Concepts of Mission: the Evolution of Contemporary Missiology* (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 2006), 240.

²⁹ «Puis, j'avais, ce qui m'a aidée beaucoup, je suis entrée à l'hôpital avec une jeune, une des premières infirmières congolaises, elle avait 21 ans moi, j'en avais 26, j'avais fait tout le trajet de formation. Pis c'est avec elle que j'ai commencé à travailler, elle m'a enseigné la langue et tout pis la coutume. Elle, elle était catholique, par exemple. Ses parents, c'était des enseignants. Alors ça, ça m'a beaucoup aidée parce que j'avais une amie jeune comme moi pis on travaillait ensemble.» Excerpt from the interview with Sister Gisèle Beauchemin, mcr, 28 September 2010, at the MCR Motherhouse, Laval (Chomedey).

³⁰ The Legion of Mary was founded in Dublin, Ireland on 7 September 1921. As a lay Catholic organisation whose members are involved in the life of the parish "through visitation of families, the sick, both in their homes and in hospitals and through collaboration in every apostolic and missionary undertaking sponsored by the parish, the Legion's priority remains the spiritual and social welfare of each individual." <http://www.legionofmary.ie>, accessed 20 June 2012.

³¹ The first specialized Catholic Action movement, the *Jeunesse ouvrière catholique* (JOC), was founded in 1925 by the Belgian priest Joseph Cardjin. The movement's pedagogy, "see, judge, act," offered a synthesis of the Church social doctrine and teachings to the Catholic youth of the time in order to transform the world according to these teachings and the Gospel. For more on the specialized Catholic Action movements in Québec, see Louise Bienvenue, *Quand la jeunesse entre en scène. L'Action catholique avant la Révolution tranquille* (Montréal: Boréal, 2003), 291 and Lucie Piché, *Femmes et changement social au Québec. L'apport de la jeunesse ouvrière catholique (1931-1966)* (Québec: Les Presses de l'Université Laval, 2003), 349.

establishment of delegates of the word,³² to the emergence, in collaboration with the local diocese, of radio shows for adult education and literacy, and the development of cooperative movement leaders among the peasantry, a reality that attained its peak in the 1960s and the 1970s.³³

Jean-Paul Guillet, PMÉ, a pioneer of the Honduran mission, was involved in the establishment of the radio schools system, following a model established in Colombia in the early 1950s in Sutatenza, a small village, where Joaquin Salcedo, a priest, created the *radioescuelas* concept to promote rural development through education. From it evolved the Catholic Popular Cultural Action, an association that expanded to all of Colombia.³⁴ Rev. Guillet recalls the first years of the project:

I was program director, I didn't have any experience; I learned from scratch. And at a certain point, the auxiliary bishop told me: 'Listen, let's leave the radio to Father Molina. I would like you to devote yourself to the creation of the radio schools system.' So, we formed a civil association with bankers, lawyers, doctors to provide some funding and to manage a system. We had hired teachers, managers and I'm the one who started travelling a bit through the country, in the Southern zone in order to organize it all. So, I had seen how the system was organized in Colombia. It's a Church system.³⁵ It was the parishes that decided, a bit like in Honduras. There were many small rural villages, and the parish was in charge of finding what we called monitors, literate people who acted a bit like the guide for a group of students and who were a bit like the eyes and the ears of the teacher to each small group.... Then, they had established a centre where monitors were to be educated, to

³² Delegates of the word were lay people, both men and women, who had been identified as community leaders by members of the SMÉ in the diocese of Choluteca in Honduras. Given the large number of rural communities and the lean diocesan resources in terms of personnel at the turn of the 1950s and during the 1960s, these lay people were given catechetical and pastoral training by the Québécois missionary priests to chair weekly celebrations of the word in the place of a priest.

³³ For more on the 1960s and 1970s in Honduras, see Fred Burrill and Catherine LeGrand, "'Une double solidarité': The Société des Missions-Étrangères du Québec in Honduras, 1955-1979," a paper presented at the Inside and Outside the Nation workshop, University of Manitoba, April 2009 and Jean-Paul Guillet, *Une aventure formidable! Quelques données sur les 25 premières années de la mission du Honduras (1955-1982)* (Laval, 2006), 26-32.

³⁴ Jean-Paul Lafrance, Anne-Marie Laulan et Carmen Rico de Sotelo (eds.) *Place et rôle de la communication dans le développement international* (Québec : Les Presses de l'Université du Québec, 2006), 92.

³⁵ For further information on the emergence and development of the radio schools system in Colombia, see Maria-Piedad Fino-Sandoval, «Les écoles radiophoniques colombiennes, 1950-1960, Mission et développement», dans Caroline Sappia et Olivier Servais (eds.) *Mission et engagement politique après 1945. Afrique, Amérique latine et Europe* (Paris : Éditions Karthala, 2010), 245-252.

be trained.... So, we built it on the same schema, the same structure. And it gave results, everybody was impressed.³⁶

In addition to working with lay people to create and develop a social project run by the local church, this system was also a direct response to the local cultural, economic needs, and to realities of social injustice. Of course, the missionaries also endeavoured to establish close and efficient collaboration with the local ecclesiastic authorities and to develop vocations to religious life and to the priesthood, notably through educational institutions.

In the same vein, M^{gr} Jean-Louis Martin, PMÉ, in recalling what he and his companions in Lima, Peru did in order to face their daily pastoral challenges, underlines their reliance on lay people and the development of training programs:

What we did, to be honest, we were overwhelmed because when we arrived in mission, we had a lot of tasks, even material tasks, we had to rebuild a church. ... So, we were overwhelmed. Then, what happened, for us, it was not about doing new things. To have more people coming to church, there are two things. We said, one is we are three and one of us works full time on the material aspect of the mission and the two others a little. It is as if we had, each of us, between 10,000 and 12,000 inhabitants. So, right there, we invested in the training aspect of people. Training. So they will do it. Those who came to the church, we took them. So, we organized ourselves to have young people work with young people. The catechists worked with 400, 500 children who came for catechesis; I didn't do any of it and never did! Maybe I did once, and after, I put this into the hands of other adults, of young people for them to train other people. The same goes for weddings, the same for choral singing. Instead of

³⁶ « Alors, on a commencé pendant un an ou deux, c'était de développer la radio. J'étais directeur des programmes, j'avais pas d'expérience; je me suis entraîné sur le tas. Et un moment donné, ... l'évêque auxiliaire, il m'a dit: "Écoute, laissons la radio au père Molina (qui était le prêtre hondurien). Moi, j'aimerais que toi, tu te consacres au système, à l'établissement du système d'écoles radiophoniques." Alors, on a formé une association civile avec des banquiers, des avocats, des médecins pour un peu faire du financement, ramasser des fonds et administrer un système. On avait engagé des professeurs administrateurs et c'est moi qui me suis mis à voyager un peu à travers le pays, surtout dans la zone sud pour organiser tout ça. Alors, j'avais vu comment était organisé le système en Colombie. C'est un système d'Église: c'était les paroisses qui choisissaient, un peu comme au Honduras, y'avait beaucoup de petits villages ruraux, agricoles et c'est la paroisse qui s'occupait de chercher des groupes, ce qu'on appelait des moniteurs, des gens alphabétisés qui étaient un peu le guide du groupe d'étudiants et qui étaient un peu comme les yeux et les oreilles du professeur dans chaque petit groupe. ... Puis, y'avait, ils avaient établi un centre où les moniteurs allaient être instruits, formés. C'était soutenu par l'Église. C'était une œuvre d'Église, en fin de compte. Alors, on a établi un peu sur le même schéma, la même structure. ... Et ça a donné des résultats, tout le monde était émerveillé. » Excerpt from the interview with Jean-Paul Guillet, PMÉ, on 17 March 2011 at SMÉ Motherhouse, Laval (Pont-Viau).

doing it all, right from the start, the point was to delegate, even material things, when possible. But to train people is the first thing to do.³⁷

Another example, taken from the African continent, is that of the MNDA. They started collaborating with lay people and local Episcopal authorities to foster the creation of native religious communities, such as the Franciscan Sisters of St. Bernadette in the diocese of Rulenge in former Tanganyika (Tanzania).³⁸ Creating such an association of lay women was one of the first steps of this missionary institute's *modus operandi* leading to the foundation of native local religious communities in Tanzania and in Tahiti.³⁹ A former local superior in Rulenge, Sister Annette Roberge, MNDA, who arrived there in 1954, comments that: "The official recognition of lay people should have come before Vatican II. In mission countries, it was these people who helped us, assisted us, as catechists, for instance. Already, back in the 1950s, we closely collaborated with lay people."⁴⁰ Her observation echoes the conciliar interventions of African and Latin American bishops

³⁷ «Ce qu'on a fait, pour être vrai, on était débordé parce que quand on arrive en mission, nous autres, on avait beaucoup de tâches, même des tâches matérielles, on avait à refaire une église. ... Alors, on n'arrivait pas, on était débordé. Donc, ce qui est arrivé, c'est que pour nous, ça a pas tellement été de s'attaquer à des choses. Pour qu'il y ait plus de gens, y'a deux choses. Nous autres, on disait, l'une, on est trois pis y'en a un qui travaille à temps plein dans le matériel pis les deux autres un petit peu. C'est comme si on avait chacun 10 à 12 000 habitants. ... Alors, tout de suite, on s'est mis sur l'aspect de formation des gens. La formation. Alors, c'est eux autres qui vont le faire. Ceux qui venaient, on les prenait. Alors, pis on s'organisait pour avoir des jeunes, pour travailler avec les jeunes. Les catéchètes travaillaient avec les 400, 500 enfants qui venaient pour la catéchèse; j'en faisais aucune, jamais j'en ai faite. J'en ai peut-être faite une pis après, j'ai confié ça à des adultes, à des jeunes pour former du monde. La même chose pour les mariages, la même chose pour le chant. Au lieu de tout faire, alors, tout de suite, c'est déléguer, même les choses matérielles, quand c'était possible. Mais c'est former du monde, première chose.» Excerpt from the interview with M^{sr} Jean-Louis Martin, PMÉ, on 17 March 2011, SMÉ motherhouse, Laval (Pont-Viau).

³⁸ The 1958 Superior General's report for the 1952-1958 period notes that: "The beginnings have been painful and we needed all of the local Superior's ingenuity and virtue, to stay on our feet. . . . The work goes well, developing in such a way that we will soon form an Association of Secular Virgins who will be of great help in our work with the women of the region, where there is no local school." MNDA General Archives, *Rapport de la supérieure générale au Chapitre général (1952-1958)*, 1958, 9-10.

³⁹ In China, they created an association of secular virgins in response to the demand of local bishops. Their main purpose was to assist Western missionary priests with their work, specifically to reach out to Chinese women. This Chinese association never led to the foundation of a specific native Chinese religious community, unlike the Tanzanian and Tahitian cases.

⁴⁰ «L'heure des laïcs, ça aurait dû venir avant Vatican II. Là-bas, en mission, ce sont nos laïcs qui nous aident, les catéchètes, par exemple. Déjà, dans les années 1950, on travaillait avec les laïcs, dans le témoignage, ils sentaient qu'on les aimait. Nos cœurs sont de la même couleur, pas de différence.» Excerpt from the interview conducted with Sister Annette Roberge, MNDA, on 18 June 2010, MNDA Motherhouse, Lennoxville.

who stressed the laity's essential contribution to missionary work due to the lack of priests and religious personnel to answer their people's growing spiritual and material needs.⁴¹

Throughout the 1950s, the Société des Missions-Étrangères du Québec began teaching its seminarians that mission could be conceived somewhat differently than the two mainstream conceptions of the time, *Plantatio ecclesiae*⁴² and individual conversion. M^{gr} François Lapierre, PMÉ, recalls:

After this, on a missionary level, from the first year in Québec City, [students had] a book, *Au cœur des masses* (1951) by Father Voillaume. A book related to Charles de Foucauld's experience. So, there was a certain way to question mission. You know, a little more contemplative, with the poor, etc. This has marked our mission years, mine.⁴³

Interviews with missionaries make clear that their initial training did not systematically treat interreligious dialogue. Nevertheless, the notion of otherness was at the centre of missionary encounters with a diversity of cultures, and the older generations of missionaries transmitted that to students in their initial training. The very experience of difference, intrinsic to mission, created conditions for transforming most missionaries' personal vision of what it actually meant to "do mission." For instance, Sister Gisèle Beauchemin, MCR, remembers a conversation with an elderly Congolese woman whom she met several weeks after arriving in 1959:

I can tell you this; it was 'Outside of the Church, no salvation!' ... I had a grandmother full of fetish, you know, a real one. ... So, the young children, when they were about to die, if the parents wanted it, we baptized them. It's true. ... But my old lady, when I saw that she was about to die. ... I asked her: 'You're going to die. Are you afraid of dying?' And she looks at me like this. She says: 'No! Me, I am a daughter of God! I am the daughter of God and I will go...'⁴⁴

⁴¹ Eddy Louchez, « L'innovation dans le champ missionnaire conciliaire », in Gilles Routhier and Frédéric Laugrand (eds.) *L'espace missionnaire. Lieu d'innovations et de rencontres interculturelles* (Paris : Éditions Karthala, 2002), 271-303.

⁴² A Latin expression that literally means church planting, *Plantatio ecclesiae* was the conception of mission based on the establishment of a local Church, including a hierarchy, parishes, and a teaching clergy. During the preconciliar period, Louvain missiologist Pierre Charles strongly defended this vision of Catholic mission.

⁴³ « Ensuite de ça, au plan missionnaire, dès la première année à Québec, il y avait un livre, *Au cœur des masses* du père Voillaume. Un livre en lien avec l'expérience de Charles De Foucauld. Alors, y'avait une certaine façon de remettre en question la mission. Vous savez un peu plus contemplative, avec les pauvres, etc. Ça a marqué nos années de mission, les miennes. » Excerpt from the interview with M^{gr} François Lapierre, PMÉ, on 15 February 2011 at the Bishop's house, Saint-Hyacinthe.

⁴⁴ « Je peux vous dire ça, c'était "Hors de l'Église, point de salut!" ... J'avais une grand-mère qui était pleine de fétiches, tu sais une vraie. ... Alors les petits enfants, quand ils allaient mourir, si les parents voulaient, on les baptisait, c'est vrai. ... Mais ma vieille, quand j'ai vu qu'elle allait mourir. ... Ben, je lui ai demandé : "Tu vas mourir.

From that experience, Sister Beauchemin felt that she needed to enlarge her own view of salvation, of the Church, and of mission. Such attitudes towards difference, whether cultural or religious, were prevalent at the time among many Québécois missionaries. Similarly, Sister Marie-Thérèse Beaudette, MIC recalled how she learned, during her first six years as a Biology and English teacher in Hong Kong (1958-1964), to become a missionary by acquiring a better knowledge of the local culture and beliefs:

And then, it is there that I learned that we could not teach the Word of God if we were not aware of the culture. What do I want to say? That I can't talk about the Word of God if I don't begin by knowing someone's culture, the belief of someone I don't know. It is there that I truly became interested in Confucian philosophy. Ah! I picked up everything I could find on Confucius to try to know the culture and the belief of my students. Now, I see more and more how it is that the culture, the philosophy of Confucius and all the Enlightenment of Buddha, how it leads to joy. . . . So, I meditated very much on Confucian philosophy and then, I could see that this Word of God corresponded to that and we saw all of the values, the human values, the Christian values, the biblical values. Still today, it is from experience, I haven't been trained this way. I've listened a lot, I listened to people speaking, and I listened to our old sisters from China. It changed my way of doing mission. . . . For Chinese, harmony, for Confucius, harmony is a constant objective. . . . Even if we don't demonstrate it in the same manner as we do with kisses, this human touch, it has to be there, in our way of being, exactly. So that, it all changed my mission, my way of looking at it, and my religious life, and my life in God, and my way of approaching other people.⁴⁵

Est-ce que tu as peur de mourir?" Pis elle me regarde comme ça. Elle dit : "Non! Moi, je suis une fille de Dieu! Je suis la fille de Dieu pis je vais m'en aller. . . » Excerpt from the interview conducted with Sister Gisèle Beauchemin, MCR, on 28 September 2010 at the MCR Motherhouse in Laval (Chomedey).

⁴⁵ « Et puis, c'est là que j'ai appris aussi qu'on pouvait pas enseigner la Parole de Dieu si on connaissait pas la culture. Qu'est-ce que je veux dire? Que je ne peux pas parler de la Parole de Dieu si je ne pars pas de la culture de quelqu'un, de la croyance de quelqu'un que moi, je ne connais pas. C'est là que j'ai commencé vraiment à m'intéresser à la philosophie de Confucius. Ah! Je ramassais tout ce que je pouvais sur Confucius pour essayer de connaître la culture et la croyance de mes élèves. Et je vois aujourd'hui, de plus en plus, comment est-ce que la culture, la philosophie de Confucius et tout le *Enlightenment* de Bouddha, comment ça mène à la joie. . . . Alors, moi, j'ai beaucoup, beaucoup médité la philosophie de Confucius et puis, je pouvais voir que telle Parole de Dieu correspondait à ça pis on voyait toutes les valeurs, les valeurs humaines, les valeurs chrétiennes, les valeurs bibliques. Encore aujourd'hui, c'est du terrain, j'ai pas été formée comme ça. J'ai écouté beaucoup, j'écoutais les personnes parler, j'écoutais nos vieilles sœurs de Chine. Ça a changé ma façon de faire la mission. . . . Pour les Chinois, l'harmonie, pour Confucius, il faut toujours arriver à l'harmonie. C'est très important et puis, il faut donner comme Bouddha qui se base sur Confucius, il faut qu'on sente un groupe ou dans une communauté, qu'on vit la chaleur humaine. Même si on le démontre pas comme nous on le fait avec des baisers, mais cette chaleur humaine-là, faut que ce soit là, dans notre manière d'être, exactement. Alors, ça, ça a tout changé toute ma mission, toute ma façon de voir, et ma vie religieuse et ma vie en Dieu et mon approche avec les personnes. »

Although much of the time puzzled by cultural and religious differences and somewhat transformed in their thinking about these issues by their actual experience of mission, at the end of the day, all the missionaries interviewed retained their initial ideal: to bring Christ to mission peoples.

Most of the missionaries' new understanding of Christianity, the Church, and mission came from their experiences in Africa and Latin America and, to a lesser extent, Asia. Members from the four institutes studied here collaborated to the best of their knowledge and as closely as possible with the local ecclesial authorities in order to build strong local churches. By establishing different groups and movements, missionaries were slowly transforming their vision of Christianity and of the Church through daily contacts with married people, mothers, fathers, children, and young adults. By taking into account both their material and spiritual needs, missionaries developed innovative approaches and projects such as the radio schools in Honduras or visits to tribes usually out of reach in the Northern Philippines. Similarly, in Cuba, M^{gr} Martin Villaverde, the bishop of Matanzas, asked the MIC to teach the children in small village schools across the diocese, since the female religious communities in Cuba preferred to run colleges in the major cities for children from middle and upper classes families. Sister Éliette Gagnon, MIC, recalls that story:

We had small rural schools, in *pueblos*. We really lived with the people there. And, around these schools, there were places, *bateyes*, little groups of houses where they went to teach catechism to children under a tree, in a house entryway. We went upon the bishop's request, who told us in his letter: 'We need sisters who will go [and] get, who will go to those who don't come to us.' So, he wanted sisters who would get out of their convents to go to those who don't come to us. It wasn't the custom, this, that sisters go out. The nuns who were in Cuba had large colleges in the provinces' capital cities. They taught the upper class.⁴⁶

Encounters with cultural and religious differences deeply influenced these missionaries' understanding of mission. As they put their training, knowledge, and own way of being in perspective, they entered into a different sort of relational dynamics with the people they were sent to serve, with their colleagues, the local authorities, and God. Some parallels can be established between these elements and the state of the Québec Church during the preconiliar period.

Excerpt from the interview conducted with Sister Marie-Thérèse Beaudette, MIC, on 19 August 2011 at the MIC house in Pont-Viau, Laval.

⁴⁶ Excerpt from the interview conducted with Sister Éliette Gagnon, MIC, on 17 May 2011 at the MIC Motherhouse, Outremont.

The Québec Church on the Eve of the Council

Renewal movements like the catechetical and the liturgical ones as well as specialized Catholic Action movements were active in Québec in the postwar period.⁴⁷ According to Claude Ryan, a prominent journalist and politician, “profound mutations were taking place from the early 1950s in the daily culture of Québécois, notably in terms of the people’s spiritual and moral reference points and the values promoted by their lifestyles.”⁴⁸ Nevertheless, the Church in Québec still considered “that any political, social or cultural issue was also a religious one.”⁴⁹ This was how the hierarchy understood local reality until the second phase of the preparatory period for Vatican II (September 1961 to October 1962), a period that coincided with the unfolding of the Quiet Revolution and the preconiliar consultations held in several dioceses in the province.

Gilles Routhier, who has studied the reception of Vatican II extensively, notes that the reformist movement in Québec arose from two concerns: the participation of the laity in the Church and the place of the Church in society. He argues that “the reformist push came more from the social movements than from the theological renewal, which determined a different understanding of the conciliar *aggiornamento*, during the Council and afterwards.”⁵⁰ In that same vein, the preconiliar consultations became milestones in the emergence of a conciliar consciousness among several

⁴⁷ According to Gilles Routhier: «Ces mouvements introduisent des brèches importantes dans le discours ancien [et préparent] les grandes révisions des années 1960.» Gilles Routhier, «Quelle sécularisation? L’Église au Québec et la modernité», in Brigitte Caulier (ed.) *Religion, sécularisation, modernité. Les expériences francophones en Amérique du Nord* (Sainte-Foy: Presses de l’Université Laval, 1996), 93.

⁴⁸ «... des mutations profondes étaient en cours dès les années 1950 dans la culture quotidienne de la population, notamment dans les points de repère spirituels et moraux des personnes et dans les valeurs véhiculées par les milieux de vie.» Claude Ryan, «L’Église du Québec à la veille du Concile et de la Révolution tranquille», in Gilles Routhier (ed.) *Vatican II au Canada: enracinement et réception* (Montréal: Fides, 2001), 168. Trained in the student Catholic Action movement, Ryan became its leading lay figure in 1945, and later was appointed editor and director of the daily newspaper *Le Devoir* during the Quiet Revolution years. He led the Québec Liberal Party from 1978 to 1982.

⁴⁹ «... considérer que toute affaire politique, sociale ou culturelle est également une affaire religieuse. . . » Routhier, «Quelle sécularisation? L’Église au Québec et la modernité», 90.

⁵⁰ «La poussée réformatrice vient davantage ici des mouvements sociaux que du renouveau théologique, ce qui détermine une compréhension différente du programme d’aggiornamento conciliaire, au moment du concile et dans les années qui suivirent.» Gilles Routhier (ed.) *L’Église canadienne et Vatican II* (Montréal: Fides, 1997), 1.

Québécois bishops,⁵¹ deepening their knowledge of local realities.⁵² Aware of the mutations that Québec society was undergoing, the episcopate focused its discussions around two major issues, namely the confessional status of social institutions, given that until the Quiet Revolution most of them were under the leadership of religious communities, and freedom of expression in the Church and in society. By the opening of the Council in October 1962, the Québec Church was moving from a religious interpretation of society to one that fully recognized the autonomy of civil authorities and the transition to lay institutions.⁵³

More closely related to the Québécois missionary effort is the positive response given by several Québec bishops to the call of Pope Pius XII⁵⁴ for a greater and more active collaboration of Western dioceses in the Catholic missionary enterprise. They started to establish missions in Latin America.⁵⁵ The bishop of Nicolet, M^{gr} Albertus Martin made the first move in that direction when, in response to the Holy See's request, he founded missions in the Brazilian areas of Alcantara and Guimarães. Six diocesan priests were then sent abroad, supported by ten Sœurs de l'Assomption de Nicolet. In 1957, two other bishops acted positively with respect to missions. M^{gr} Arthur Douville, bishop of Saint-Hyacinthe, opened a mission in Cururupu in North-Eastern Brazil and sent two diocesan priests initially and three others in 1959. Six Sœurs de Saint-Joseph de Saint-Hyacinthe supported them as did 17 teachers, one doctor and his wife, a nurse. M^{gr} Georges Cabana, bishop of Sherbrooke, sent two diocesan priests to

⁵¹ According to Sylvain Serré, ten dioceses held preconciliar consultations with lay people: Montreal, Joliette, Saint-Jean, Québec City, Sainte-Anne-de-la-Pocatière, Saint-Jérôme, Amos, Sherbrooke, Rimouski, and Nicolet. Sylvain Serré, «Les consultations préconciliaires des laïcs au Québec entre 1959 et 1962», in Routhier (ed.) *L'Église canadienne et Vatican II*, 113-141.

⁵² «Je fais aujourd'hui l'hypothèse que la formation de la conscience conciliaire des évêques tient à la fois et tout autant à leur enracinement dans leurs Églises locales qu'à leur insertion dans l'assemblée conciliaire, que leurs positions en concile relèvent à la fois et tout autant, des aspirations et des attentes de leurs fidèles, des échanges et discussions in aula, en commission ou dans les coulisses conciliaires.» Routhier (ed.) *Vatican II au Canada : enracinement et réception*, 168.

⁵³ With the Quiet Revolution, the Québec state re-entered the field of social development to play its role as leader, a role that had been played by religious communities and the clergy since the Patriots' Rebellion of 1838.

⁵⁴ Pope Pius XII published two major documents on missions during the 1950s: the encyclical *Evangelii Praecones* (1951) on the promotion of missions, especially in Latin America, and the encyclical *Fidei Donum* (1957), calling for a special effort of the missionary movement to Africa.

⁵⁵ This paragraph draws largely on the data collected and presented by Gilles Routhier, «L'Amérique du Sud: nouvel horizon missionnaire de l'Église du Québec au XXe siècle», a paper presented at the 62th annual conference of the Institut d'histoire de l'Amérique française, Montreal, 17 October 2009.

the apostolic prefecture of Pinheiro. Many other dioceses including Trois-Rivières, Amos, Chicoutimi, Montréal, and Québec sent missionaries abroad over the next decades, mainly to Latin American countries.

A sketch of the Québec Church on the eve of the Council suggests four parallels with the preconciliar experiences of Québécois missionaries and their institutes. The first was a tendency to reproduce in the missions the Québec ecclesiastical model, establishing organizations such as specialized Catholic Action movements, and the Legion of Mary, and focusing on work in education, health, and social services. Secondly, missionary experiences were reflected in Québec particularly in the growing importance of the laity in the Church in Québec in the late 1950s and early 1960s, a matter that became a growing preoccupation of its bishops. The third point is that the growing interest of Québécois bishops in the laity came from a better assessment of the lay people's reality. This change of perspective for the bishops came largely from preconciliar consultations held by some of them, which represent a formal mechanism for dialogue between the episcopate, the clergy, and the lay people. In mission countries, pastoral tools and organs were also put in place in order to reach out to people on the basis of their aspirations and needs, especially through training programs, more or less formal. The fourth point is that the opening of new missions in Latin America by some Québécois bishops was a move similar to the one made by the missionary institutes, establishing themselves massively in this particular area over the 1950s.

Conclusion

This paper established three main points. First, the geopolitical context in postwar Asia, especially with the closure of China to Western missionaries, was a major turning point in the development of the institutes studied here. As former missionaries to China shared their personal accounts with younger colleagues, they encouraged their institutes to provide members with better professional training and to diversify geographically with several new missions in Latin America and Africa while they maintained a presence in Asia. The returnees also gave the newer generation of missionaries a strong and deep sense of what mission was about, preparing them to open new missions.

Diversification of mission countries posed a series of challenges to Québécois missionaries in their daily practices notably the need to work as closely as possible with the local church, including lay people and the clergy. In most places, their purpose was twofold: planting or consolidating the local church and transmitting the faith (conversion). In both cases, Québécois missionaries rapidly realized that lay help was essential since in

neither Latin America nor Africa were there sufficient religious personnel. Through this, as in the case of southern Honduras, new projects emerged that were outside the traditional missionary services of education, health, and social services. Local people, with the help of missionaries, designed the radio schools system. In addition, cultural and religious differences forced most missionaries to put their own beliefs, culture, training, and ways of being in perspective if they wanted to reach out to the people to whom they had been sent. In sum, they had to open themselves to the other's culture, lifestyle, and religion. Finally, there were clear similarities in the ideas of the preconiliar experiences and practices of Québécois missionaries and the ways in which the Québec Church, notably through the Episcopaté, prepared itself for Vatican II.

The Protestant Denominational Press and the Conscription Crisis in Canada, 1917-1918¹

Gordon L. HEATH

Canadians in 1917 recognized that the war against the Central Powers had not been going well. The previous year's carnage in the battles of Verdun and the Somme on the Western Front had ended in stalemate; Russia was suffering and by the end of the year faced revolution and civil war; France was being bled dry; troop morale was plummeting, and soldiers were mutinying – although this was not widely known at the time; German U-Boats were sinking merchant ships almost with impunity in the North Atlantic; and the Central Powers were making significant gains in the Balkans. The entrance of the United States into the war in April 1917 was cause for optimism, but American troops would not begin to make an impact on the Western Front until well into 1918. And what made it seem an even worse crisis for the Entente Powers was the perception that Germany was doing a better job of marshalling resources for the war effort through the proficient exploitation of conquered territories, centralized government control of resources, and universal conscription.

Despite the discouraging military situation, Canadians were surprised when Prime Minister Robert Borden returned in May 1917 from a trip to Britain and announced that he intended to implement conscription. He was motivated by his observation that the desperate needs of the front called for an increased commitment from Canada, as well as by the conviction that Canada needed to act like a great nation if it were to be treated like one in the war's aftermath.² Two domestic realities further justified his decision: the unwillingness of Quebecois and the reluctance of a significant number

¹ I would like to thank the Social Science and Humanities Research Council for financial assistance for archival visits.

² J.L. Granatstein and J. Mackay Hitsman, *Broken Promises: A History of Conscription in Canada* (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1977), 62-63. See also Tim Cook, "'Our first duty is to win the war at any cost': Sir Robert Borden during the Great War," *Journal of Military and Strategic Studies*, 13, no. 3 (Spring 2011): 1-24.

of eligible English Canadians to enlist.³ Borden was convinced of the pressing need to compel recruits to fill the depleted ranks of the Canadian Expeditionary Force (CEF).

The political battles related to the passage of the Military Service Act (MSA) on 29 August 1917,⁴ the formation of the Union Government in October,⁵ and the debates surrounding the 17 December 1917 federal election led to the pulling of “all the stops” and the unleashing of “the flood tide of Anglo-Saxon racism.”⁶ Conscription threatened to divide the nation along ethnic and religious lines: indeed, some historians assert that “no single issue has done more to muddy the political waters or to destroy the unity of the nation” than conscription, and it “seemed that the end had come” to the unique Canadian experiment of fusing two races into one.⁷

In general, English Canadians supported Conscription, while French Canadians did not. A riot occurred in Montreal the night the bill became law, and Borden’s electoral victory over Wilfrid Laurier and the Liberals alienated many Quebecers.⁸ When serious violence erupted in Quebec City on Easter weekend 1918 over 4000 troops were stationed in Quebec City and 2000 near Montreal to ensure that the riots did not develop into a province-wide

³ J.L. Granatstein, “Conscription in the Great War,” in David MacKenzie (ed.) *Canada and the First World War: Essays in Honour of Robert Craig Brown* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2005), 65-66. See also Elizabeth Armstrong, *The Crisis of Quebec, 1914-1918* (1937; repr., Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1974), 189-91, 247-50. It has been argued that demographics played an important role in the lower number of French-Canadian recruits. For instance, Granatstein and Hitsman claim that French-Canadian men married earlier and worked in predominately rural areas, two important factors that worked against volunteering. However, this argument has also been discounted. For a discussion and analysis of statistics related to recruitment in the CEF, see Granatstein and Hitsman, *Broken Promises*, 28-29; C.A. Sharpe, “Enlistment in the Canadian Expeditionary Force 1914-1918: A Regional Analysis,” *Journal of Canadian Studies*, 18, no. 4 (Winter 1983-1984): 15-29.

⁴ The MSA yielded approximately 24,000 conscripts. Views on the Act vary, and one well-known critic later changed his mind and declared that it was both necessary and effective. See J.L. Granatstein, “Conscription and My Politics,” *Canadian Military History*, 10, no. 4 (Autumn 2001): 35-38.

⁵ A Union Government was Borden’s attempt to unite his Conservatives with the Liberals primarily in order to support conscription. Sir Wilfrid Laurier and most Liberals refused the offer, but a number of Liberals (mainly those in English ridings) and Independents joined Borden. The Union government handily won the election in 1917, but the election pitted Anglophone against Francophone in a bitter contest.

⁶ Granatstein and Hitsman, *Broken Promises*, 76.

⁷ Granatstein and Hitsman, *Broken Promises*, 264; Armstrong, *The Crisis of Quebec*, 161.

⁸ For a summary of other violent reactions, or threats of violence, see Armstrong, *The Crisis of Quebec*, 179-81.

insurrection.⁹ The close of the war ended the Borden government's nightmare of enforcing a law that even English Canadians were starting to resent.

What made the matter so dangerous for the fledgling nation were the shrill denunciations of Quebec emanating from English Canada that stoked the passions of an already enflamed populace in Quebec. Yet, there were voices of moderation in English Canada, namely various Protestant denominational newspapers that counseled understanding from their readers. By the end of the nineteenth century, and into the twentieth, the major Protestant churches—Anglican, Baptist, Methodist, and Presbyterian—had a strong influence on English-Canadian society¹⁰ and many of their leaders and institutions were committed to shaping national identity.¹¹ Particularly in wartime the churches constructed imperial and national ideals and identity through their services, sermons, organizations and literature.¹² This article describes and analyzes the reaction of the Canadian Protestant press to the 1917-1918 conscription crisis by examining how it used its nation-building potential and mission to deal with an acute crisis.¹³ The response of the

⁹ Martin F. Auger, "On the Brink of Civil War: The Canadian Government and the Suppression of the 1918 Quebec Easter Riots," *Canadian Historical Review*, 89, no. 4 (December 2008): 503-40.

¹⁰ The Anglicans, Baptists, Methodists and Presbyterians were the largest and most influential Protestant churches at that time and, unless noted otherwise, "churches" refers to these four denominations. In 1911, there were 1,079,000 Methodists, 1,115,000 Presbyterians, 1,043,000 Anglicans, and 382,000 Baptists for a total of 50.6% of the Canadian population. In the same year, there were 2,833,000 Catholics, for a total of 39.3% of the Canadian population. See Neil Semple, *The Lord's Dominion: The History of Canadian Methodism* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1996), 182.

¹¹ Phyllis D. Airhart, "Ordering a Nation and Reordering Protestantism, 1867-1914," in George Rawlyk (ed.) *The Canadian Protestant Experience, 1760-1990* (Burlington, ON: Welch Publishing, 1990), 99.

¹² For the role of the Protestant churches and their press in nation-building, see Gordon L. Heath, "'Forming Sound Public Opinion': The Late Victorian Canadian Protestant Press and Nation-Building," *Journal of the Canadian Church Historical Society*, 48 (2006): 109-59 and *A War with a Silver Lining: Canadian Protestant Churches and the South African War, 1899-1902* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2009). During the South African War (1899-1902) the Protestant press was less shrill and more responsible than the secular press when it came to French Catholic opposition to the war in South Africa. (Heath, *A War with a Silver Lining*, 84-86). This confirms Carman Miller's argument that the South African War established a number of important precedents in Canada. See Miller, "Framing Canada's Great War: a case for including the Boer War," *Journal of Transatlantic Studies*, 6, no. 1 (2008): 3-21.

¹³ The publications examined in this paper are as follows: *Canadian Churchman*, editors Rev. W.H. Griffin Thomas (1914-1916), R.W. Allin (1916-1918), Rev. W.T. Hallam (1918-1920), published in Toronto, circulation 4500 (located at the Anglican General Synod Archives, Toronto); *Montreal Churchman*, editor Rev. A.H. Moore,

papers to the war in general, and to the conscription crisis in particular, demonstrates the nation-building mission of the Protestant publications. In varying degrees, editors of the denominational papers weighed in on the debates, urging support for conscription and for the Unionists, while at the same time promoting an understanding of French Canada.

The actions of the religious press reveal a subtle but important shift in its nation-building project. Its moderation arose out of its goal of building the new Dominion into a prosperous, powerful, and mainly Protestant nation, but the rancour surrounding the conscription crisis led to the realization that prejudices entrenched in race and religion would ultimately destroy the very nation they were trying to build. Motivated more by political reality than by theological ecumenism, their reaction mirrors broader shifts within the British Empire and nation. The same nation-building role that prompted the churches to evangelize Catholics, especially in the newly-settled West,

published in Montreal, circulation unknown (located at the Anglican Diocesan Archives, Montreal); *Maritime Baptist*, editor E.M. Sipprell, published in St. John, circulation 5500 (located at the Baptist Archives, Acadia University); *Canadian Baptist*, editor Rev. W.J. McKay, published in Toronto, circulation 6500 (located at the Canadian Baptist Archives, McMaster Divinity College); *Christian Guardian*, editor Rev. W.B. Creighton, published in Toronto, circulation 21,250 (located at Mills Library, McMaster University); *Presbyterian Record*, editor Rev. E. Scott, published in Montreal, circulation 57,000; *Presbyterian Witness*, editor Rev. George S. Carson, published in Halifax, circulation 6250; *The Presbyterian*, editors Rev. Robert Haddow and P.M. MacDonald, published in Toronto, circulation 13,250; *The Westminster*, managing director P.M. MacDonald, published in Toronto, circulation 11,750; *Presbyterian and Westminster*, editor Rev. Robert Haddow, published in Toronto, circulation 10,500 (all Presbyterian papers located at the Presbyterian Archives, Toronto). Circulation information taken from *McKim's Directory of Canadian Publications* (Montreal: A. McKim Limited, 1909-1919).

It was a common practice to not include an author's name on articles. While it is difficult to know in every case, anonymous articles most often seem to be the work of the editor, or commissioned by him and represent the position of the paper. Editors were usually clergymen and their papers were expected to be the "voice" of the denomination on pressing religious and social issues. Nevertheless, editors often included dissenting opinions in letters to the editor and in various articles. For instance, the *Christian Guardian* printed an article critical of the paper's support for Union Government. See "Please Stop My Paper," *Christian Guardian*, 2 January 1918, 6. Editors also did not hesitate to criticize their own denomination, and even attacked articles printed in their own papers. See, for example, *Canadian Churchman*, 22 February 1917, 115.

An example of editorial policy and its relation to a denomination can be seen in the *Presbyterian and Westminster's* treatment of church union. Before the denomination made its decision, articles and letters to the editor presented a variety of positions. Once the denomination made a formal decision, however, the paper only printed material in favour of the decision. See "About Ourselves," *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 1 March 1917, 238. Of course, these examples raise the intractable issue of just how much the pages of the press actually represent the views of constituents. However, the point of this research is to indicate the overall and uniform editorial position of the various denominational papers in regards to the conscription crisis.

motivated the denominational press to condemn anti-French rhetoric and encourage an understanding of French Canadian history, culture and religion. Consequently, and ironically, the Protestant denominational press, a formidable tool to Protestantize Canada, became – at least for a few brief months – a proponent of conciliation with Catholics in Quebec.

The conscription crisis could be a recipe for disaster. Within the Protestant churches was a welter of assumptions and ideas that could easily encourage anti-Catholic violence: Protestants had a long history of harsh anti-Catholic polemics, wanted to convert Roman Catholics to the “true” faith, ardently supported the empire, believed the war was a righteous and necessary one, endorsed the call for conscription, and resented those who opposed it.

Protestant churches had a lengthy history of harsh anti-Catholic polemics dating from the sixteenth century reformations, but the varying intensity of those polemics “reflected prevailing social, political, and religious conditions.”¹⁴ After Waterloo, Britain constructed a national identity around five interrelated notions: free, civilized, prosperous, Christian and Protestant, and the “linchpin” of those was Protestantism.¹⁵ Protestant-Catholic tensions were transplanted into Canada, which had a large well-established French-Catholic community when it became part of the British Empire. Along with the triumph of Protestantism Britons developed the view that Britain and its empire were uniquely Protestant entities with divine blessing. This fusion of imperial and anti-Catholic rhetoric spread from Britain to South Africa, Australia, New Zealand and Canada.¹⁶ By the end of the nineteenth century, however, Canadian anti-Catholicism had become domesticated rather than derivative from the Britain.¹⁷

The evangelical distrust of and dislike for Catholics strengthened the fusion of empire and Protestantism. Evangelicalism began as a reforming movement within the Church of England in the eighteenth century, but by the end of the nineteenth century its distinct characteristics transcended denominational boundaries.¹⁸ As John Wolffe notes, “anti-Catholicism was

¹⁴ John Wolffe, *The Protestant Crusade in Great Britain, 1829-1860* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991), 9.

¹⁵ Hugh McLeod, “Protestantism and British National Identity, 1815-1945,” in P. van der Veer and H. Lehmann (eds.) *Nation and Religion* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1999), 50.

¹⁶ John Wolffe, “Anti-Catholicism and the British Empire, 1815-1914,” in Hilary M. Carey (ed.) *Empires of Religion* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), 43 and 58.

¹⁷ Canada also imported anti-Catholicism from the United States. J.R. Miller, “Bigotry in the North Atlantic Triangle: Irish, British and American Influences on Canadian anti-Catholicism,” *Studies in Religion*, 16, no. 3 (Summer 1987): 289-301.

¹⁸ David Bebbington’s fourfold characteristics of biblicism, conversionism, activism and crucicentrism are the most commonly held descriptors of evangelicalism. See David

very deeply rooted in evangelical identity and ideology. It was not a mere negative prejudice but an impulse at the heart of the movement's spiritual aspirations and religious activity."¹⁹ Organizations such as the Orangemen and the Protestant Protective Association formalized and mobilized those prejudices.²⁰ This impulse could be very harsh as one wartime letter to the editor in the *Canadian Churchman* illustrates: "The Roman Catholic religion is a religion of usurpation, blasphemy, and idolatry; they have usurped Christ's place with their altars and sacrifices. ... The Romish Church is the cause of all the trouble in the world today."²¹

The nineteenth century has been called the "great century of Protestant missions."²² By the middle of the nineteenth century contemporaries hailed "the missionary spirit" as the "characteristic feature" of Victorian religious piety.²³ While the Protestant missionary enterprise targeted non-Christian religions overseas, it also regarded Catholics as a legitimate target. In Canada, that meant supporting missions in Quebec in order to "penetrate the very heart of darkness and destroy the citadel of Antichrist."²⁴ An article "Why Evangelize Romanists?" in the *Presbyterian Record* argued for the evangelization of Catholics because Catholicism did not teach the true gospel.²⁵ This theological conviction had political implications particularly in the race to ensure that Canada, especially its West, was a predominantly Protestant nation.²⁶ Methodist missions among aboriginal groups in Quebec sometimes led to protracted confrontation and legal battles with

Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1730's to the 1980's* (Grand Rapids: Baker, 1989), ch. 1.

¹⁹ John Wolfe, "Anti-Catholicism and Evangelical Identity in Britain and the United States, 1830-1860," in Mark A. Noll, David W. Bebbington, and George A. Rawlyk (eds.) *Evangelicalism: Comparative Studies of Popular Protestantism in North America, the British Isles, and Beyond, 1700-1990* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994), 184.

²⁰ See C.J. Houston and W.J. Smith, *The Sash Canada Wore: A Historical Geography of the Orange Order in Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1980); James T. Watt, "Anti-Catholic Nativism in Canada: The Protestant Protective Association," *Canadian Historical Review*, 48, no. 1 (March 1967): 45-58.

²¹ James G. Kidd, "Anglicans and the Roman Catholic Church," *Canadian Churchman*, 13 June 1918, 381.

²² Kenneth Scott Latourette, *The Great Century, A.D. 1800-1914* (New York: Harper, 1941), 1. Numbers alone made the twentieth century an even greater century for Protestant missions. See Brian Stanley, *The Bible and the Flag: Protestant Missions and British Imperialism in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries* (Leicester: Apollon, 1990), 83-84.

²³ Susan Thorne, *Congregational Missions and the Making of an Imperial Culture in Nineteenth-Century England* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1999), 5.

²⁴ John Webster Grant, *The Church in the Canadian Era* (New York and Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Limited, 1972; repr., Vancouver: Regent College Publishing, 1988), 83.

²⁵ "Why Evangelize Romanists?" *Presbyterian Record*, October 1916, 459.

²⁶ J.R. Miller, "Anti-Catholicism in Canada: From the British Conquest to the Great War," in Terrence Murphy and Gerald Stortz (eds.) *Creed and Culture: The Place of*

Catholic authorities,²⁷ Presbyterians worked in Quebec in the shadow of the controversial renegade, Father Charles Chiniquy,²⁸ and Baptists supported the Grande Ligne Mission just south of Montreal.²⁹ Not surprisingly, as John Webster Grant has noted, “two militant expressions of an exclusive claim to Christian truth could scarcely coexist in Canada without colliding.”³⁰

The same ardent imperialism and enthusiastic commitment to the British Empire and Canada’s growing role within it exhibited by Canadian English Protestants during the South African War persisted through the First World War.³¹ The churches also believed that, despite the horrific casualties, the First

English-Speaking Catholics in Canadian Society, 1750-1930 (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 1993), 41.

²⁷ Semple, *The Lord’s Dominion*, 291.

²⁸ John S. Moir, *Enduring Witness: A History of the Presbyterian Church in Canada*, 2nd ed. (Toronto: Presbyterian Church in Canada, 1987), 154-57. Charles Chiniquy left the Catholic priesthood in Quebec to become a Presbyterian minister. He wrote and spoke passionately against the Catholic Church.

²⁹ Harry A. Renfree, *Heritage and Horizon: The Baptist Story in Canada* (Mississauga: Canadian Baptist Federation, 1988), ch.14 and 25.

³⁰ Grant, *The Church in the Canadian Era*, 82.

³¹ For analysis of imperialism in the churches, see Heath, *A War with a Silver Lining*; Gordon L. Heath, “‘Were We in the Habit of Deifying Monarchs’: Canadian English Protestants and the Death of Queen Victoria, 1901,” *Canadian Evangelical Review* (Fall 2005–Spring 2006): 72-97; Gordon L. Heath, “‘Citizens of that Mighty Empire’: Imperial Sentiment among Students at Wesley College, 1897-1902,” *Manitoba History* (June 2005): 15-25; Gordon L. Heath, “Sin in the Camp: The Day of Humble Supplication in the Anglican Church in Canada in the Early Months of the South African War,” *Journal of the Canadian Church Historical Society*, 44 (Fall 2002): 207-26; Gordon L. Heath, “Passion for Empire: War Poetry Published in the Canadian English Protestant Press during the South African War, 1899-1902,” *Literature and Theology*, 16 (June 2002): 127-47. For studies of Canada and empire, see Carl Berger, *The Sense of Power: Studies in the Ideas of Canadian Imperialism, 1867-1914* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1970); Norman Penlington, *Canada and Imperialism, 1896-1899* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1965); Robert Page, “Canada and the Imperial Idea in the Boer War Years,” *Journal of Canadian Studies* 5 (February 1970); Robert Page, *The Boer War and Canadian Imperialism* (Ottawa: The Canadian Historical Association, 1987); Robert Page, “Carl Berger and the Intellectual Origins of Canadian Imperialist Thought, 1867-1914,” *Journal of Canadian Studies*, 5 (August 1970): 39-43; Douglas Cole, “Canada’s ‘Nationalistic’ Imperialists,” *Journal of Canadian Studies*, 5 (August 1970), 44-45; Terry Cook, “George R. Parkin and the Concept of Britannic Idealism,” *Journal of Canadian Studies*, 10 (August 1975): 15-31; Philip Buckner, “Whatever Happened to the British Empire?” *Journal of the Canadian Historical Association*, 4 (1993): 3-32; Phillip Buckner, “Canada,” in David Omissi and Andrew S. Thompson (eds.) *The Impact of the South African War* (Houndmills, UK: Palgrave: 2002). For a study of Canadian anti-imperial sentiment, see Carman Miller, “English-Canadian Opposition to the South African War as Seen through the Press,” *Canadian Historical Review*, 55 (December 1974): 422-438; Karen Ostergaard, “Canadian Nationalism and Anti-Imperialism, 1896-1911,” (Ph.D. dissertation, Dalhousie University, 1976). For French-Canadian views of empire, see A.I. Silver, “Some Quebec Attitudes in an Age of Imperialism and Ideological Conflict,” *Canadian Historical Review*,

World War was a righteous battle that had to be fought against the evils of pan-Germanism, a barbaric Hun that committed unspeakable deeds, and an almost equally despicable fiendish Turkish ally. In the words of an editorial in the *Presbyterian Witness*, there was to be “no ‘truce with hell’ - meaning the Kaiser and his henchmen who sat ‘in Satan’s seat in Berlin.’”³² With the end of hostilities in November 1918, the same paper’s editorial entitled “Jehovah Hath Triumphed” made it clear who had ultimately given them the victory.³³

Framing the war as a holy crusade against tyranny and ungodliness, it is no surprise that the churches supported the call for conscription and resented those who opposed it especially as conscription became a live issue. Few articles on conscription occurred in the *Canadian Churchman* in 1915,³⁴ but the coverage intensified in July 1916, peaked in late 1917, and tapered off in mid-1918. Reports on the decisions of synod meetings included sermons and resolutions in favor of conscription,³⁵ and advertisements, inserted by friends of the Union government, sought to sway voters to vote for it.³⁶ Letters to the editor revealed a spectrum of opinion, the majority in favor of

57 (December 1976): 441-60. For Canadian churches and the First World War, see Murray E. Angus, “Living in the ‘World of the Tiger’: The Methodist and Presbyterian Churches in Nova Scotia and the Great War, 1914-1918,” (MA thesis, Dalhousie University, 1993); Samuel J. Richards, “Ministry of Propaganda: Canadian Methodists, Empire, and Loyalty in World War I,” (MA thesis, Salisbury University, 2007).

³² “No Truce with Hell,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 21 July 1917, 4.

³³ “Jehovah Hath Triumphed,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 16 November 1918, 4.

³⁴ For instance, see “Conscription,” *Canadian Churchman*, 11 February 1915, 92; “Universal Military Service,” *Canadian Churchman*, 22 April 1915, 255.

³⁵ “Diocese of Ontario Annual Synod,” *Canadian Churchman*, 13 July 1916, 442; “Canada’s Share in the War,” *Canadian Churchman*, 22 February 1917, 116; “Charge to Synod,” *Canadian Churchman*, 28 June 1917, 408; “Synod of the Diocese of Rupert’s Land,” *Canadian Churchman*, 12 July 1917, 443; “The World Situation,” *Canadian Churchman*, 30 May 1918, 344.

³⁶ *Canadian Churchman*, 13 December 1917, 791, 809, 810. The Unionist Party Publicity Committee and The Citizen’s Union Committee placed these advertisements. The *Canadian Churchman* also published notices about the National Service Cards (21 December 1916, 817).

conscription.³⁷ Officially, the paper supported the government; its editorials and opinion pieces argued vigorously for conscription.³⁸

As in the other denominational publications, the pattern of coverage in the Baptist press followed the course of political events – increasing commentary in 1917 and a tapering off by mid-1918. Initially it was hesitant about conscription,³⁹ and, even when it became law, deemed volunteering to be better. However, by mid-1917 the editors of both the *Maritime Baptist* and the *Canadian Baptist* declared their support for Borden's decision to move forward with conscription. They pronounced on the need for it and for the election of the Union government if the war effort were to be carried on successfully.⁴⁰

Like the Baptist press, the Presbyterian press initially believed that volunteering expressed the ideals of the freedom for which the British Empire was fighting. By 1916, however, it wondered if the voluntary system could fill the depleted ranks of Canadian battalions.⁴¹ It endorsed registration for

³⁷ Anglo-Canadian, "Conscription," *Canadian Churchman*, 11 February 1915, 92; Wm. Hamilton Merritt, "Universal Military Service," *Canadian Churchman*, 22 April 1915, 255; S. H. Bleakley, "The Pro-German Pope," *Canadian Churchman*, 12 August 1915, 511; B. Capel, "'Spectator' and the French-Canadians," *Canadian Churchman*, 5 October 1916, 641; Shamus O'Hoka, "Conscription of Wealth," *Canadian Churchman*, 1 February 1917, 76; F.H. Du Vernet, "Voluntary, Compulsory," *Canadian Churchman*, 31 May 1917, 353; Ed. Harper Wade, "French-Canadians," *Canadian Churchman*, 23 August 1917, 544, 20 September 1917, 609-10, and 4 October 1917, 641; A.W. Savary, "French-Canadians," *Canadian Churchman*, 6 September 1917, 576-77; An Ontario Woman, "French-Canadians," *Canadian Churchman*, 20 September 1917, 607-08.

³⁸ For instance, see "National Service," *Canadian Churchman*, 28 December 1916, 827.

³⁹ "Is There To Be Conscription?" *Canadian Baptist*, 18 November 1915, 1; "Compulsory Volunteering," *Canadian Baptist*, 14 December 1916, 1.

⁴⁰ "Conscription and National Service," *Maritime Baptist*, 23 May 1917, 4; "Canada and Conscription," *Maritime Baptist*, 27 June 1917, 4; "Conscription and National Service," *Maritime Baptist*, 25 July 1917, 4; "Baptists and the War," *Canadian Baptist*, 21 June 1917, 1; "Toronto Association and Conscription," *Canadian Baptist*, 21 June 1917, 8; "Country or Party?" *Maritime Baptist*, 14 November 1917, 4; "United Empire Loyalists," *Maritime Baptist*, 5 December 1917, 12; "Why Support the Union Government," *Maritime Baptist*, 12 December 1917, 4; "Good Christian People of Canada," *Maritime Baptist*, 12 December 1917, 11; "A Triumph for Union," *Maritime Baptist*, 19 December 1917, 1.

⁴¹ "The Call for Men," *Presbyterian Witness*, 31 July 1915, 4; "The Recruiting Campaign in Canada," *Presbyterian Witness*, 9 October 1915, 1; "Universal Service," *Presbyterian Witness*, 6 November 1915, 4; "Voluntary or Compulsory Service?" *Presbyterian Witness*, 15 January 1916, 4; "Conscription in Canada," *Presbyterian Witness*, 22 April 1916, 1; "The Call for Men," *The Presbyterian*, 16 November 1916, 420; "Canada Must Do More," *The Presbyterian*, 14 December 1916, 515-516; "Canada's Best," *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 8 February 1917, 163.

National Service.⁴² By mid-1917 the editor of the *Presbyterian Witness* declared unequivocally “that compulsory military service is the most equitable and just system of national defence.”⁴³ At their June 1917 General Assembly, Presbyterians passed a resolution in support of conscription,⁴⁴ and in the following months their three major papers gave extensive support to the conscription law, the Military Service Bill.⁴⁵

The Methodists also enthusiastically supported conscription, and marshalled their resources to convince the faithful to vote Union in the December 1917 election, for to vote otherwise “would mean Canada’s withdrawal from the war.”⁴⁶ The *Christian Guardian* presented a case for both the necessity of conscription⁴⁷ and voting for the Union government.⁴⁸

⁴² “Registration for National Service,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 21 October 1916, 1; “The National Service Campaign,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 4 November 1916, 1; “National Service,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 6 January 1917, 1.

⁴³ “Selective Conscription for Canada,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 26 May 1917, 1.

⁴⁴ *Acts and Proceedings (1917)*, 37.

⁴⁵ “The Conscription Bill,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 16 June 1917, 1 and 30 June 1917, 1; “Universal National Service,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 14 July 1917, 4; “The Military Bill and the Clergy,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 21 July 1917, 1; “Canada’s Compulsory Military Service Law,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 4 August 1917, 1; “The Military Service Bill,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 18 August 1917, 1; “A National Win-the-War Government,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 1 September 1917, 1; “The Military Service Act,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 15 September 1917, 1; “The War-Time Elections Act,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 22 September 1917, 1; “Conscription or Voluntary Service,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 24 November 1917, 1.

⁴⁶ J.M. Bliss, “The Methodist Church and World War I,” *Canadian Historical Review*, 49, no. 3 (September 1968): 221.

⁴⁷ “The Government and the Crisis,” *Christian Guardian*, 23 May 1917, 5, 30 May 1917, 5 and 20 June 1917, 5; “The Need of the Hour,” *Christian Guardian*, 6 June 1917, 5; “Why We Favor Conscription,” *Christian Guardian*, 20 June 1917, 5; “The Honor of Canada,” *Christian Guardian*, 1 August 1917, 6; *Christian Guardian*, 7 November 1917, 11.

⁴⁸ “Canada’s Plain Duty,” *Christian Guardian*, 15 August 1917, 5; “Union Government for Canada,” *Christian Guardian*, 17 October 1917, 6; “The Union Government’s Policy,” *Christian Guardian*, 24 October 1917, 6; “Canada’s War Election,” *Christian Guardian*, 14 November 1917, 5; “The Coming Election,” *Christian Guardian*, 21 November 1917, 5; “Canada’s Great Day of Destiny,” *Christian Guardian*, 28 November 1917, 5; Edward Trelawney, “Party or Union Government?” *Christian Guardian*, 28 November 1917, 7-8; “The Real Issue,” *Christian Guardian*, 5 December 1917, 5; “Ministerial Association and the Union Government,” *Christian Guardian*, 12 December 1917, 2; “The Issue and the Issues,” *Christian Guardian*, 12 December 1917, 5; “The Church and the Present Situation,” *Christian Guardian*, 12 December 1917, 6; Rev. Dr. Chown, “An Open Letter on the Duty of the Hour,” *Christian Guardian*, 12 December 1917, 7-8; “After the Battle,” *Christian Guardian*, 19 December 1917, 5; “The Record of the Polls,” *Christian Guardian*, 26 December 1917, 6. For pro-Unionist letters to the editor, see “A Strong Unionist,” *Christian Guardian*, 12 December 1917, 21; “For Union Government,” *Christian Guardian*, 12 December 1917, 21. For pro-Unionist advertisement, see *Christian Guardian*, 12 December 1917, 18. For a call for

Each of these ingredients on its own – a history of harsh anti-Catholic polemics, the desire to convert Roman Catholics to the “true” faith, support for the empire, belief in righteousness of the war, and backing for conscription – contributed to Protestant animosity towards Catholics. Together, they spelled potential trouble for a nation whose two solitudes had not yet fully recovered from the wounds of the South African War. This welter of ideas, passions and historical precedents was indeed a recipe for disaster.

The denominational papers collectively presented a picture of a Canada not doing enough.⁴⁹ Canada’s organization of the war effort had not measured up to perceived German efficiency, and the voluntary system had not been capable of providing replacements for the appalling casualties of modern warfare. A larger CEF was also needed, an unattainable goal without a change in how Canada recruited soldiers.

Canada faced a crisis in 1917. The denominational papers unanimously declared that uncommon times required extreme measures (measures, however, that needed to be rescinded at the end of the war.)⁵⁰ The first extreme measure was to replace party government with a national or union

provincial Unionist governments, see “A Unionist Government in Ontario,” *Christian Guardian*, 9 January 1918, 1. For a response to reader opposition to the paper’s support for the Union government, see “Please Stop My Paper,” *Christian Guardian*, 2 January 1918, 6.

⁴⁹ “Conscription,” *Canadian Churchman*, 28 June 1917, 408; “The World Situation,” *Canadian Churchman*, 30 May 1918, 344; “National Service,” *Montreal Churchman*, March 1917, 9; “Conscription in the United States,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 5 May 1917, 1; “The Conscription Bill,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 16 June 1917, 1; “Canada Must Do More,” *The Presbyterian*, 14 December 1916, 515; “Canada’s Best,” *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 8 February 1917, 163; “A Crisis in Canada,” *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 7 June 1917, 642; “Conscription and National Service,” *Maritime Baptist*, 23 May 1917, 4. The *Canadian Churchman* had mentioned conscription in 1915, but the commentary was brief and was carried on through exchanges in letters to the editor. See Anglo-Canadian, “Conscription,” *Canadian Churchman*, 11 February 1915, 92; William Hamilton Merritt, “Universal Military Service,” 22 April 1915, 255.

⁵⁰ “Abolition of Conscription,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 21 December 1918, 1; “The Conscription Issue,” *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 28 June 1917, 741; “The Situation in Canada,” *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 30 August 1917, 209; “An Unwise Measure,” *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 13 September 1917, 259; “To Be Retraced,” *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 29 August 1918, 187-88; “Canada and Conscription,” *Maritime Baptist*, 27 June 1917, 4; “Conscription and National Service,” *Maritime Baptist*, 25 July 1917, 4; “Why We Favor Conscription,” *Christian Guardian*, 20 June 1917, 5. The *Presbyterian Witness* expressed hope that the Union government would become a permanent feature of Canadian political life. See “The Future of Parties,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 29 December 1917, 1.

government and to support it.⁵¹ Some editors, however, felt uncomfortable with telling their readers how to vote partly because they did not want to be identified as a party paper, and partly (drawing on a common Protestant caricature of Catholic priests) because they believed that only Catholic priests did so.⁵² Secondly, some editors argued that cherished rights and freedoms had to be set aside to implement conscription immediately. Thirdly, by 1917 social reformers, especially among the Methodists and Presbyterians, equated their aims with war aims, and, reflecting their support for state-initiated redistribution of wealth and control of industry, called for the conscription of wealth.⁵³

While the Protestant press supported conscription, it was not always without qualification. The *Presbyterian and Westminster* called for a careful

⁵¹ "Editorial," *Canadian Churchman*, 26 July 1917, 471; "Loyalty," *Canadian Churchman*, 15 November 1917, 727; "The Church and Politics," *Canadian Churchman*, 10 August 1916, 504; "General Election Results," *Montreal Churchman*, January 1918, 5; "A Coalition Government," *Presbyterian Witness*, 2 June 1917, 1; "A National Government for Canada," *Presbyterian Witness*, 9 June 1917, 1; "A National Win-the-War Government," *Presbyterian Witness*, 1 September 1917, 1; "The Union Government," *Presbyterian Witness*, 27 October 1917, 1; "Canada Must Do More," *Presbyterian*, 14 December 1916, 515; "Canada's Best," *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 8 February 1917, 163; "Compulsory Service in Canada," *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 24 May 1917, 592; "Union Government," *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 18 October 1917, 371-372; "Union Government for Canada," *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 18 October 1917, 372; "The Union Government," *Presbyterian Witness*, 27 October 1917, 1; "A Plea for National Unity," *Presbyterian Witness*, 10 November 1917, 4; "Conscription and Coalition," *Maritime Baptist*, 13 June 1917, 1; "Canadian Politics," *Maritime Baptist*, 8 August 1917, 1; "The Forthcoming Election," *Maritime Baptist*, 7 November 1917, 1; "Country or Party?" *Maritime Baptist*, 14 November 1917, 4; "Why Support the Union Government," *Maritime Baptist*, 12 December 1917, 4; "A Triumph for Union," *Maritime Baptist*, 19 December 1917, 1. For examples of advertisements in support of the Union government in the following papers, see *Canadian Churchman*, 13 December 1917, 791, 809, 810; *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 13 December 1917, 573, 575; *Maritime Baptist*, 12 December 1917, 12, 16.

⁵² "The Church and Elections," *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 13 December 1917, 557.

⁵³ See Richard Allen, *The Social Passion: Religion and Social Reform in Canada, 1914-1928* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1971), 42; "Conscription of Wealth," *Presbyterian Witness*, 2 June 1917, 1; "The Conscription Bill," *Presbyterian Witness*, 30 June 1917, 1; "Universal National Service," *Presbyterian Witness*, 14 July 1917, 4; "Conscription of Wealth," *Presbyterian Witness*, 4 August 1917, 1; "Conscription of Wealth," *Christian Guardian*, 20 June 1917, 5; "Conscription of Wealth," *Christian Guardian*, 11 July 1917, 2; "War, Wealth and Christian Patriotism," *Christian Guardian*, 1 August 1917, 5; Edward Trelawney, "Profiteering of National Service," *Christian Guardian*, 7 November 1917, 7-8. The *Maritime Baptist* was hesitant to endorse this idea wholeheartedly. See "Canada and Conscription," *Maritime Baptist*, 27 June 1917, 4.

application of the MSA and consideration of the need of farmers for help.⁵⁴ Presbyterian journals were also highly critical of the Wartime Elections Act (WEA). Passed on 20 September 1917 by Parliament, it gave the vote to wives, widows, mothers and sisters of soldiers. It also disfranchised citizens from enemy countries (Germany and Austria-Hungary) who had been naturalized since 1902, which effectively took the vote away from people who tended to vote Liberal and oppose Conscription. The Presbyterian press argued that selecting some women over against others was neither fair nor defensible, that revoking privileges affronted fair play and the principles for which Canada and the empire were fighting, and that manipulating the electoral roll set a dangerous precedent.⁵⁵

Where the Protestant press differed most significantly from common attitudes in English Canada was in its conciliatory attitude to French Catholics in Quebec even though it did not always appreciate the nuances of French and Catholic participation in the war. The Catholic response to the war was diverse. A number of Catholics in Quebec and elsewhere favoured the war and empire. For instance, Archbishop Paul Bruchési organized Montreal clergy to back the British Crown.⁵⁶ The Quebec Easter Riot did not develop into something more destructive and widespread in part because the Quebec clergy did not defend it.⁵⁷ Other Canadian Catholics, including the Acadians, French Catholics in the Maritime provinces, actively supported the war effort.⁵⁸ English Canadian Catholic leaders such as Bishop Michael Fallon of the Diocese of London, Ontario, embraced the war effort.⁵⁹ Toronto Catholics supported the war effort. Unlike many Catholic communities in Ireland, the United States and Australia, Toronto Catholics (both lay and clerical) actively assisted in recruitment, bond purchases and national registration. Like their Protestant brethren, they believed the war was just and needed to be fought. On a more practical level, the war provided an

⁵⁴ "Farmers and the Military Service Act," *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 13 June 1918, 561; "The Question of Cancelled Exemptions," *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 25 July 1918, 77. For the arrest of Jesuit seminarians in Guelph, see "Roman Catholic Students," *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 27 June 1918, 617; Brian F. Hogan, "The Guelph Novitiate Raid: Conscription, Censorship and Bigotry during the Great War," *Canadian Catholic Historical Association, Study Sessions* (1978): 57-80.

⁵⁵ "An Unwise Measure," *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 13 September 1917, 259; "The War-Time Elections Act," *Presbyterian Witness*, 22 September 1917, 1.

⁵⁶ Terence Fay, *A History of Canadian Catholics: Gallicanism, Romanism, and Canadianism* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2002), 241. He notes how Bruchési tried to rally his clergy in 1917, but felt betrayed by the passage of the conscription bill.

⁵⁷ Auger, "On the Brink of Civil War," 539.

⁵⁸ Armstrong, *The Crisis of Quebec*, 191-192.

⁵⁹ Adrian Ciani, "'An Imperialist Irishman': Bishop Michael Fallon, the Diocese of London and the Great War," *CCHA Historical Studies*, 74 (2008): 73-94.

opportunity for Toronto Catholics to prove that they were loyal Canadians and supporters of the empire.⁶⁰ The Protestant press usually missed this multilayered response of Catholics and the reality that Catholics were not confined to Quebec. Instead, it often simplistically portrayed the issue as English-Canadians patriotic and French-Quebecers disloyal.

Thus, the Protestant press deemed that the war served the purpose of revealing to Canadians the intractable national problem of racial and religious division. The war had not created the division, but it had, in the words of a number of articles in the *Maritime Baptist* and *Canadian Baptist*, exacerbated it by fanning “from a smoking flax condition into a devastating flame” the tensions between the French and English.⁶¹ The threat was considered to be real, “for many foolish and some treasonable things have been spoken, and it is evident many of the people are in sympathy.”⁶² And the problem was serious, without an easy solution:

In this we find one of the gravest problems which confronts our nation. It is almost inevitable that the gap which now divides the two races in Canada will be further widened as an outcome of the war. We need not consider who will be most to blame for this. Each race will be somewhat at fault. But already bitterness is being developed, and many are apparently ready to fan the flames of discord. ...Here, then, is our national problem. Where shall we look for its solution? Our political leaders are apparently helpless. Indeed often it seems that they are chiefly interested in the problem as a means of obtaining political influence.⁶³

Realizing the danger to the nascent nation, the Protestant press offered a solution to the crisis. It began by severely condemning those who fostered racial strife. If one good was to come out of the war, one author in the *Presbyterian and Westminster* concluded, it was that the war had “wakened us from our complacency and made us think” about race in the country.⁶⁴ The animosity between Anglophone and Francophone was obvious, but what was one to do?

⁶⁰ Mark G. McGowan, “Sharing the Burden of Empire: Toronto’s Catholics and the Great War, 1914-1918,” in Mark G. McGowan and Brian P. Clarke (eds.) *Catholics at the ‘Gathering Place’: Historical Essays on the Archdiocese of Toronto, 1841-1991* (Toronto: Canadian Catholic Historical Association, 1993), 177-207. See also Mark G. McGowan, “The Degreening of the Irish: Toronto’s Irish Catholic Press, Imperialism, and the Forging of a New Identity, 1887-1914,” *Canadian Historical Association Papers*, 24, no. 1 (1989): 118-45.

⁶¹ “The Present Situation in Quebec,” *Maritime Baptist*, 20 March 1918, 1; “The Present Situation in Quebec,” *Canadian Baptist*, 21 March 1918, 1.

⁶² “Conscription and Nationalism,” *Maritime Baptist*, 30 May 1917, 1.

⁶³ “Our National Problem,” *Maritime Baptist*, 21 March 1917, 4.

⁶⁴ A.J. Hunter, “The Race Problem in Canada,” *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 4 April 1918, 322-23.

The English look down upon the French with more or less disdain, and the French look at the English with resentment and rage. ... What are we going to do about it? Continually quarrel? Attempt to down one another? Use strong language? Cast slurs at one another? . . . That would be human nature, but it is not Christianity....⁶⁵

Not only was fostering racial tensions unchristian, but anyone who did so was a traitor playing into the hands of the nation's enemies: "he who seeks to further embitter political and racial relations is as much the enemy of the nation as is the foe upon the battlefield!"⁶⁶ The editor of the *Christian Guardian* declared such actions "unwise and unpatriotic."⁶⁷ His counterpart at the *Montreal Churchman* echoed that sentiment when he declared "the man who deals in inflammatory speeches, poses as the superlative patriot or adds to the tension of our national situation by giving deliberate offense to those who do not agree with him is no patriot but is playing directly into the hands of our enemy."⁶⁸

Collectively, the papers exhorted their readers to rise above the rancor and exhibit virtues that would build a unified nation, whose future depended upon them. While his paper officially supported the Union cause, the editor of the *Presbyterian and Westminister* nevertheless distanced it from the more strident Union supporters in Toronto, calling them "extremists," "firebrands," and "mischief-makers."⁶⁹ Earlier that year the paper reported how the 1917 Presbyterian General Assembly's presence in Montreal highlighted the nation's dilemma:

At Montreal the visitor comes face to face with Canada's greatest political problem. This is the meeting place of the two races, separated by language and religion, in whose hands the destiny of our country chiefly lies. What wisdom, what forbearance, what sympathetic insight into the standpoint of others; what high nobility of temper and of aim, are needed if we are to find a way by which our differences may be overcome and the divergent elements united in the task of building up a happy, prosperous, and God-fearing Canadian nation!⁷⁰

The exhortation was to act responsibly as Christians (whether Catholic or Protestant), for Christianity – properly applied – would bring salvation to both individuals and the nation.

⁶⁵ "The Present Situation in Quebec," *Maritime Baptist*, 20 March 1918, 1; "The Present Situation in Quebec," *Canadian Baptist*, 21 March 1918, 1.

⁶⁶ "After Fifty Years," *Maritime Baptist*, 4 July 1917, 4. See also "The Assembly and the War," *Presbyterian and Westminister*, 21 June 1917, 715.

⁶⁷ "Canada's War Election," *Christian Guardian*, 14 September 1917, 5.

⁶⁸ "Conscription," *Montreal Churchman*, June 1917, 5.

⁶⁹ "The great desideratum is that men of broad patriotism and moderate views from both races should get together in an endeavor to promote a better understanding. The extremists, the firebrands, the mischief-makers, should be brushed aside." See "The Elections and After," *Presbyterian and Westminister*, 27 December 1917, 601-02.

⁷⁰ "Meeting in Montreal," *Presbyterian and Westminister*, 31 May 1917, 615.

In the weeks preceding the divisive 1917 federal election, the Anglican *Montreal Churchman* published an exhortation from Bishop John Cragg Farthing. His message was clear; citizens must act wisely for they were facing a crisis that threatened to destroy the country:

Amidst the world crisis Canada is facing a great crisis of her own, a consequence of the war. Never was there need for wiser statesmanship in our leaders, and cooler heads on our people. While this applies to all Canadians, it particularly applies here in the Province of Quebec, which will be the storm centre. We who live here must be especially careful.⁷¹

Our hope lies in the moderate and reasonable men of all parties and all faiths, who will seek to understand the point of view of those who differ with them, and who in relation to those of another race and faith will observe the rules of fair play and justice. Especially we must look to those who are actuated by the spirit of Christ, in which even justice is transcended, though never displaced, by the spirit of good-will and brotherhood. The Gospel of Christ will be found the solvent for this and all other national problems, even as it is the hope of salvation for the individual.⁷²

The ideal was for politicians, clergy and newspapers to engage in the controversy devoid of acrimony, living up to their responsibility to build a Christian nation by acting as Christians.

Others agreed. While the ideal was to act Christianly because it was the right thing to do, the practical reality, as some Protestant papers noted, was that violence would not change people's minds. The "weapons of war" would not break down attitudes in Quebec.⁷³ Political pressure or other such threats would only lead to further resentment and "stimulate the fires of enmity and mistrust."⁷⁴ Even a Protestant majority with its concomitant political power was not the answer: "Men talk at times as if the pressure of a British majority were the all-sufficient remedy for the evil of the situation. To this view the Christian Church cannot consent. Our French brethren must be slowly wooed; they are to be won by the gentle constraint of love and truth."⁷⁵

One way in which editors attempted to mitigate hostility towards French Canadians was to remind readers that Quebecers were involved in the war effort and that not all were "slackers."⁷⁶ One article in the *Canadian*

⁷¹ John Montreal, "The Bishop's Message," *Montreal Churchman*, September 1917, 1. (Anglican bishops often took as their last name the name of their diocese – thus "John Montreal.")

⁷² "Our National Problem," *Maritime Baptist*, 21 March 1917, 4.

⁷³ "French Canada," *Canadian Churchman*, 21 June 1917, 391.

⁷⁴ "From Week to Week," *Canadian Churchman*, 3 January 1918, 6.

⁷⁵ D.M. Ramsay, "The French in Canada and the Church's Task," *Presbyterian Record*, March 1918, 79.

⁷⁶ In his address to the Synod of Huron in 1918, Bishop Williams called Quebec a "slacker province" and declared that residents of the province should be denied the vote if

Churchman noted that it was not fair to lump Quebecers all together, since many were loyal and had laid down their lives in South Africa and Europe.⁷⁷ Another noted that they had not volunteered to the same degree as English Canadians but those who did were “deserving of special note” since it was more difficult for them to do so.⁷⁸ Yet another declared that while Quebecers must be informed of the present threat in Europe, it was also necessary to “heal the breach” in Canada, and readers should remember that Quebec had provided “great men” who gave their lives for the country.⁷⁹

As part of their effort to counteract the strident condemnations in English Canada (even among their own constituents) some editors attempted to look at the war and conscription from the French-Canadian perspective. The clearest example of this was an article in the *Presbyterian and Westminister*, which sought to explain how, despite their differences, English and French Canadians were both loyal to the nation.⁸⁰ English Canadians recently arrived from Britain retained a strong sense of loyalty to Britain, and gradually become Canadian in their affections. English Canadians born in Canada naturally placed their prime allegiance to Canada, but retained a loyalty to Britain and its empire based on family ties and heritage. French Canadians, however, the article argued, were unlike either. Their loyalty was to Canada and to Canada alone: “this is his fatherland, his motherland. To die abroad would be to die in exile.” The critical difference was in the attitude to Britain and the empire. Although quite satisfied to be loyal British subjects, French Canadians were not enthusiastic about empire and did not feel the “call of the British blood” to defend it. If Canada was at risk, their “response would be much more hearty,” but they did not think that was the case. What was needed was a “sane imperialism” balanced with a “staunch Canadian nationalism” that allowed for these differences and an increased engagement between the two groups so “every brand of loyalty” could “learn from one another.”⁸¹

they did not serve on the battlefield. See David Williams, “Charge to Synod,” *Canadian Churchman*, 28 June 1918, 408.

⁷⁷ “Our French-Canadian Citizens,” *Canadian Churchman*, 14 December 1916, 791.

⁷⁸ “Spectator,” *Canadian Churchman*, 14 September 1916, 584.

⁷⁹ “French Canada,” *Canadian Churchman*, 21 June 1917, 391.

⁸⁰ “Canadian Loyalty,” *Presbyterian and Westminister*, 19 July 1917, 59-60.

⁸¹ Another example of conciliatory language was a statement in the *Canadian Churchman*. “In attempting to bring about a reconciliation between these two people it is essential that we respect both their faith and their traditions. That, of course, doesn’t mean that we are to turn our back upon our own faith or our own traditions. It means that our rights are their rights and their rights ours, but there must be no attempt at transfusion of personality or nationality.” See “From Week to Week,” *Canadian Churchman*, 3 January 1918, 6. For other examples, see “Quebec and the Dominion,” *Presbyterian and Westminister*, 31 January 1918, 95; “Spectator,” *Canadian Churchman*, 14 September 1916, 584; “From Week to Week,” *Canadian Churchman*, 31 May 1917, 346.

Editors also encouraged mutual understanding with articles that praised the “Bonne Entente” movement that led the mayor of Quebec City and one hundred French dignitaries to visit Toronto and other Ontario cities in January 1917. Papers such as the *Christian Guardian* praised the initiative and encouraged readers to endorse such events as a way of gaining a “better understanding” and “sympathetic appreciation” for the French Canadian perspective.⁸² The press practiced what it preached. When unrest over conscription turned to violence in Quebec City at Easter 1918⁸³ the press reported the riots but made no hateful or divisive denunciations.⁸⁴

Conciliatory language over wartime issues did not mean that Protestants had abandoned their idea that Catholicism was an inferior version of Christianity that needed to be corrected by the purer form of true Christianity – Protestantism. In fact, some writers suggested that the solution to Canada’s unity problem was converting Quebec to the democratic views of Protestantism as compared to the autocracy of Catholicism.⁸⁵ Harsh judgments and traditional prejudice towards Catholics persisted with articles

⁸² “Quebec and the Future,” *Christian Guardian*, 9 January 1918, 4. See also “The Canadian ‘Bonne Entente,’” *Presbyterian Witness*, 13 January 1917, 1; “From Week to Week,” *Canadian Churchman*, 18 January 1917, 36.

⁸³ That followed a precedent set during the 1900 riots in Montreal that saw McGill students and others attack the premises of French language newspapers and Laval University’s Montreal campus to protest French Canada’s lack of support for the imperial cause in South Africa. (Carman Miller, “The Montreal Flag Riot of 1900,” in John Crawford and Ian McGibbon (eds.) *One Flag, One Queen, One Tongue: New Zealand, The British Empire and the South African War* (Auckland: Auckland University Press, 2003), 165-79). At that time, the Canadian Protestant denominational press responded by calling on readers to be moderate and to refrain from hateful invectives and further violence. (Heath, *A War with a Silver Lining*, 84-86). Auger, “On the Brink of Civil War,” 539.

⁸⁴ “Trouble at Quebec,” *Maritime Baptist*, 3 April 1918, 1; “Trouble in Quebec,” *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 4 April 1918, 315; “Canada A Nation,” *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 11 April 1918, 343; “Quebec Anti-Conscription Riots,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 6 April 1918, 1; “The Pope’s Apologists,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 29 June 1918, 4; “Quebec Coming Into Line,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 18 May 1918, 1; “Editorial,” *Canadian Churchman*, 11 April 1918, 232; “From Week to Week,” *Canadian Churchman*, 11 April 1918, 234; “Machine Guns in Quebec,” *Christian Guardian*, 10 April 1918, 6; “The Case of Quebec,” *Christian Guardian*, 17 April 1918, 5.

⁸⁵ “The Grande-Ligne Mission After the War,” *Maritime Baptist*, 3 April 1918, 3; “The Opportunity in Quebec,” *Canadian Baptist*, 22 March 1917, 3; M.B. Parent, “The Religious Situation in Quebec,” *Canadian Baptist*, 22 March 1917, 5; “Quebec Baptist Church,” *Canadian Baptist*, 14 February 1918, 15; J.E. Duclos, “Restoration of French Protestantism in Canada,” *Presbyterian and Westminster*, 7 February 1918, 127-128; J.U. Tanner, “Our French Work in Quebec,” *Presbyterian Record*, August 1918, 231; “Why Evangelize Romanists,” *Presbyterian Record*, October 1916, 459; A.H. Ransom, “Solving a National Problem,” *Presbyterian Record*, July 1918, 203; “The Present Situation in Quebec,” *Maritime Baptist*, 20 March 1918, 1; “The Present Situation in Quebec,” *Canadian Baptist*, 21 March 1918, 1.

that revealed distrust of the papacy and negative views of the power of the Catholic Church in Quebec. Reports from synods, letters to editor, editorials and articles often contained statements that worked against the desire to be more understanding of Quebecers.⁸⁶ Nevertheless, the practice of conciliatory language not only reveals an example of the nation-building enterprise of the churches, but also an important shift in this endeavor.

In conclusion, the observation that the political battles in 1917 led to “all the stops [being] pulled and the flood tide of Anglo-Saxon racism [being] unleashed”⁸⁷ does not apply to the powerful Protestant denominational press. Despite a pedigree and proclivity for anti-Catholic rhetoric, the denominational papers distanced themselves from their past and the attitudes of a number of their constituents, and rejected the shrill denunciations of Quebec by English Canadians.

Although all the denominational papers supported conscription and the Union Government, their response to the war in general, and to the conscription crisis in particular, demonstrates their nation-building mission and the subtle and significant shift in it. The moderation exhibited in the press arose out of its nation-building ethos. The goal was to build the new Dominion into a prosperous, powerful, and mainly Protestant nation, but the rancor surrounding the conscription crisis led to the realization that prejudices entrenched in race and religion would ultimately destroy the very nation they were trying to build. Motivated more by political reality than theological ecumenism, the reaction exhibited in the press mirrors broader shifts within the British Empire reflecting a realization that harsh anti-Catholic rhetoric was “too narrow a basis for a cohesive overall imperial Protestant ideology.”⁸⁸ In Britain, a shift had begun towards a more generic

⁸⁶ “A Catholic Attitude,” *Canadian Baptist*, 31 January 1918, 1; “Roman Catholicism and the War,” *Canadian Churchman*, 28 January 1915, 51; “The Vatican and the War,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 13 April 1918, 4; “The Pope’s Apologists,” *Presbyterian Witness*, 29 June 1918, 4; “French Presbyterianism,” *Presbyterian Record*, February 1916, 54; “Light and Shadow,” *Presbyterian Record*, July 1916, 297; “The Tragedy of Quebec,” *Presbyterian Record*, February 1914, 61; “Pope and Kaiser,” *Presbyterian Record*, September 1917, 258-259; J.U. Tanner, “The Problem of Quebec,” *Presbyterian Record*, June 1916, 244-246; “The Knights of Columbus,” *Presbyterian Record*, October 1918, 291-292; “The French in New Ontario,” *Presbyterian Record*, August 1917, 230; “Editorial Notes,” *Canadian Churchman*, 15 March 1917, 163; “The Vatican’s Peace Move,” *Christian Guardian*, 29 August 1917, 6; “The Pope’s Peace Proposals,” *Christian Guardian*, 22 August 1917, 5; “The Pope and the Peace Conference,” *Christian Guardian*, 1 January 1919, 6; “Roman Catholics and the Flag,” *Christian Guardian*, 29 January 1919, 6.

⁸⁷ Granatstein and Hitsman, *Broken Promises*, 76.

⁸⁸ Wolfe, “Anti-Catholicism and the British Empire,” 58.

national identity that was Christian, but not specifically Protestant.⁸⁹ As for Canada, the historian J. R. Miller argues that a “waning vitality of those who were opposed to Rome”⁹⁰ had occurred by the time of the First World War.

While it would be premature to conclude that conciliatory language meant the Reformation had ended, the responses manifested in the press demonstrate a realization that the new nation could not survive harsh anti-Catholic rhetoric. Canadians began to learn this lesson during the South African War, but the severity of the 1917 conscription crisis made it clear – to repeat the vitriol of the past was to threaten Canada’s future. The same nation-building role that prompted the churches to evangelize Catholics, especially in the West, motivated the denominational press to condemn anti-French rhetoric and to encourage an understanding of French Canadian history, culture and religion. Consequently, and ironically, the Protestant denominational press, a formidable tool to Protestantize Canada, became – at least for a few brief months – a proponent of conciliation.

⁸⁹ After 1945 even the “Christian” identity would “dwindle away”. (McLeod, “Protestantism and British National Identity.”)

⁹⁰ Miller, “Anti-Catholicism in Canada,” 41.

How the Poles Got Organized: The Emergence of Organizational Life amongst Polish Canadians in the 1920s and 1930s¹

Gabriela PAWLUS-KASPRZAK

“Keeping vigil over nationalism belongs to agents of government and clerics, [and the] church, and not to individual persons,”² a Polish consul admonished a farmer who emigrated to Canada in 1928. The consul had mistakenly assumed that nationalism would merely trickle down from the elites to the masses. Though consuls, priests and parishes played a significant role in the maintenance of a Polish identity, the initiative for nurturing it was rooted in the actions of immigrants. After calling for ethnic parishes as a means of preserving Polish culture, language and identity, Polish immigrants in Canada created new venues for nationalist expression in the form of various culture-based organizations and associations.³ The many small, regional groupings that comprised Polish cultural and organizational life since before the Great War eventually came together in the early 1930s to create three main federations: *Zjednoczenie Zrzeszeń Polaków w Kanadzie* (Federation of Polish Societies, ZZPwK), *Stowarzyszenie Polaków w*

¹ The author would like to thank the anonymous reviewers, and especially, the editors of *Historical Studies* for their insightful comments.

² Szkoła Główna Handlowa (Warsaw School of Economics, thereafter SGH), Sekcja Zbiorów Specjalnych, *Memoir #27*, Rose Valley, Saskatchewan, January 3, 1937. The names of individuals have been omitted, as per the policy of the Szkoła Główna Handlowa. All individuals cited from the SGH—unless otherwise noted—will be omitted or italicized to indicate that they are pseudonyms. All translations, unless otherwise stated, are my own.

³ Polish organizational life consisted of varying degrees of established groupings, which operated in accordance with a specific idea or principle. Organizations (*organizacje*), associations (*towarzystwa*), and mutual aid societies (*stowarzyszenia*) were the three types of official groupings. Though all of these organizations had constitutions that defined their ideals and activities, not all registered with the government to obtain a charter and official status as “organizations.” Nevertheless, any group, which self-identified as any of the three forms of organizational bodies and had a constitution will be considered an “organization.” For the sake of simplicity, unless referring to an individual group, I use the term “organization” when discussing these established groups.

Kanadzie (Association of Poles, SPwK), and Związek Polaków w Kanadzie (Polish Alliance Friendly Society of Canada, ZPwK). These federations encompassed and directed Polish community life until after the Second World War.⁴ Their creation was fixed in a desire to unify Polish-Canadians and prevent the denationalization of the Polonia.⁵ While vying for the hearts of the community, the three organizations used diverse approaches to garner support. To that end, each federation's claims to an authentic Polish identity became central to its policies and propaganda, and a significant source of contention among them. At the centre of this definition of Polishness was the debate over the role of Catholicism. Hence, Polish organizations, whether independent or belonging to a federation, had to define their approach to religion: some embraced it as a vehicle for nationalism; others rejected it.

Despite amalgamation during the 1920s and especially in the 1930s, fragmentation continued. Rather than a single national body, three distinct organizations emerged. Moreover, a plethora of independent organizations continued to protect their ideological, regional and administrative autonomy. All federations pursued these smaller clubs, associations and societies, which carefully considered amalgamation but, in various ways, feared that entering a larger institution would affect their socio-ideological foundations.

Secondly, the emergence of the federations called attention to the need to sharpen the definition of Polishness. Centre stage in this discussion was the issue of Catholicism. Should it comprise an inseparable component of the national identity? A closely related question was: to what extent should cultural, political and economic ties be maintained with a restored Poland?

Thirdly, the formation of the federations revealed a shift towards secularization. This did not necessarily equate to anti-clericalism or a rejection of the Pole-Catholic identity. Rather, it meant that power, authority and leadership in the community were placed in the hands of the lay masses.

Lastly, fluidity rather than rigidity defined the emergence of an organizational life. Despite disagreements and disputes about various issues—ties to Poland, the role of Catholicism in Polish identity, relationship to Canada, assimilation, etc. — federations recognized the need for flexibility

⁴ After World War II, a new organization was created in hopes of offering a new start to Polish organizational life. In May 1944, the executives of the ZZPwK, ZPwK and the PZN met to discuss the creation of a new umbrella organization, which came to be known as the Kongress Polonii Kanadyjskiej (Canadian Polish Congress, KPK). The KPK based its statutes on that of the ZZPwK. However, worried about losing its autonomy, the ZPwK never joined the KPK. For more information on the KPK see Benedykt Heydenkorn, *The Organizational Structure of the Polish Canadian Community* (Toronto: Canadian Polish Research Institute, 1979).

⁵ Polonia is the name given to Poles residing outside of the Polish borders.

of attitudes. A federation aspiring to be secular still drew on religious traditions to mobilize its members. A federation that demanded allegiance to the Second Republic of Poland could also call for loyalty to the Canadian state. Polish identity fluctuated between various discourses; none were written in stone. The community's organizational life became an expression of and a negotiation between the various, often contradictory, perceptions and definitions of the Polish national identity.⁶

Scholars have neglected the study of Polish organizational life in Canada. Beyond Benedykt Heydenkorn's *The Organizational Structure of the Polish Canadian Community* and Henry Radecki's *Ethnic Organizational Dynamics: The Polish Group in Canada*—both published in the late 1970s—little has been written on this topic.⁷ Moreover, Heydenkorn and Radecki's pioneering works offer only a superficial chronology of organizations and their evolution. This study begins to fill this gap by examining the main characteristics of the Polish diaspora's organizational life in Canada in the interwar period.

For the most part the question of nationalism has traditionally been associated with the politicization of the nation. Eric Hobsbawm and Ernst Gellner accurately identify nationalism as a political phenomenon that involved the standardization and transformation of "folk culture" into a

⁶ Comparing the rise and development of Polish Canadian organizational life to the much older Polish community in the United States is problematic. Not only did migrations occur in differing periods, the populations were different and developed in a different manner. The first wave of Poles came to the United States from the Prussian sector between 1850 and 1880. They included educated and skilled individuals, who migrated with their families, becoming the leaders of Polish and church organizations and associations. The second group came from the Russian and Austrian sectors between 1880 and 1914 and had little education and few industrial skills. Both groups tended to settle in urban centres. Whereas Polish immigration to Canada was increasing in the 1920s, Polish immigration to the United States effectively ended after the introduction of the Immigration Act of 1921 and the more stringent National Origins Act of 1924. Already in the late nineteenth century, Polish American organizations were shifting their focus from the needs of the homeland to the Pole in the United States as epitomized by their organization after the Great War under a new motto: "Wychodźstwo dla wychodźstwa" ("Emigrants for Emigrants") or more aptly, emigrants for themselves. Strong mutual aid and benefits principles governed Polish organizations in the United States. The Poles in Canada, however, distinguished between mutual aid societies and those offering cultural and/or religious activities. Polish Canadians tended to found cultural associations as opposed to establishing insurance-based fraternal aid societies. Such a comparison is beyond the scope of this article.

⁷ The secondary sources cited in this article are the most recent publications on the history of Poles in Canada. My work attempts to further scholarship in an area that has academically stagnated. For an introductory overview of the historiography please see, Gabriela Pawlus Kasprzak, "A History Reawakened: Contemporary Approaches to the Study of Poles in Canada," *Polish American Studies* 68, no.2 (Autumn 2011): 5-10.

high culture but do not consider what happens to nationalism after the establishment of a nation-state. Nationalism does not cease to exist because the object of nationalism—i.e., the acquisition of statehood—has come to fruition. As a modern phenomenon, nationalism has generally been defined as both an ideology and a form of behaviour that provides a cultural, economic or political plan of action based on a people's self-awareness as a nation.⁸ Nationalism relates the nation to issues of common identity, culture, language, myth and memory, history and territorial claims.⁹ These factors give the nation legitimacy: language becomes a means of transcribing culture and transmitting specific values and beliefs. It also links the people to an authentic past and becomes a marker of differentiation from the "other."¹⁰ Myth and memory become a means of understanding and articulating the development of the nation while pointing to the nation's uniqueness from other nations through its practices, customs, and conventions.

Furthermore, nationalism speaks about the relationships between people: how they perceived themselves over time and space, and how others perceived them. Accordingly, this perception of self is not an automatic, spontaneous or organic process that occurs within a vacuum. Instead, this process employs agencies, messages and symbols to construct and maintain boundaries of identity.¹¹ Nationalism echoes the need for cultural homogeneity within a certain territorial group, but it also refers to what Benedict Anderson calls an "imagined political community," members of a group who appear to be in communion with each other despite being strangers.¹² The success of nationalism depends on the convergence of state, nation and society. One manner in which this is achieved is through the (re) creation of tradition(s). The community is bound together by a local high culture that has been revived or invented by the high culture of the elites.

By replacing the existing local low culture of the masses, the new local high culture becomes a source of cultural identity for all.¹³ I would extend this definition and argue that the "imagined community" involves a

⁸ James Kellas, *The Politics of Nationalism and Ethnicity*, 2nd ed., (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1998), 2.

⁹ Philip Spencer and Howard Wollman, *Nationalism: A Critical Introduction* (London: Sage Publications, 2002), 2; Montserrat Guibernau, *Nationalisms: The Nation-State and Nationalism in the Twentieth Century* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1996), 43-7; Stuart Hall, "The Question of Cultural Identity," in Stuart Hall, (ed.) *Modernity and Its Futures* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1992), 293-295.

¹⁰ Spencer and Wollman, *Nationalism*, 74-76.

¹¹ Spencer and Wollman, *Nationalism*, 57-60.

¹² Benedict Anderson as quoted in Spencer and Wollman, *Nationalism*, 38; Ernest Gellner, *Encounters with Nationalism* (Cambridge, Mass.: Blackwell, 1994), 42-46.

¹³ Gellner, *Encounters*, 54-6; Eric Hobsbawm, *Nations and Nationalism since 1780* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 130, 263-5.

continuous negotiation between high and low cultures, between the elites and the masses, between an agency such as an organization or federation and an agent. Moreover, this process is in a continuous flux, with identity being defined and redefined in time and space as in the case of the Polish immigrant in Canada in the 1920s and the 1930s. Nevertheless, though the process remained fluid, certain critical characteristics defined the parameters or boundaries of this negotiation.

The Pole-Catholic construct was central to the negotiation of Polish national identity. Though statehood is a requirement of nationalism, in Poland the rise of nationalism followed a different order than the one experienced in Western Europe (e.g., France, Italy, Germany). There, the creation of a nation was preceded by the existence of the state, whereas in Eastern Europe, those lands, which had been under foreign occupation, established a nation prior to achieving statehood. According to Hans Kohn, Eastern Europe also experienced a different form of nationalism—one that was cultural (perhaps ethnic) in nature as opposed to the political or civic nationalism common in Western Europe.¹⁴ This specific form of nationalism arose in a context where both the political and economic systems were relatively weak: a fragile middle class; a nation divided between feudal aristocracy and rural proletariat. Cultural nationalism focused on turning inward. It tended to look toward emotion and imagination as revealed, for instance, in Romanticism, rather than to reason; it centred on tradition and history, for example, the so-called Golden Age instead of on the present and future.

Unlike most Western European states, the Polish nation was created in the nineteenth century, although statehood was only realized in 1918 after the collapse of the European empires that had partitioned Polish territories in the eighteenth century. Without political institutions run by a national government, Polish nationalism had to be based on bottom-up national identifiers, such as ethnicity, culture, language and religion. The experience of the partitions set the foundations for a national identity that intertwined culture with religion and nationalism.¹⁵ Consequently, Polish nationalism

¹⁴ Spencer and Wollman, *Nationalism*, 99.

¹⁵ Poland was partitioned in the latter half of the 18th century among Russia, Prussia and Austria, and ceased to exist as a state. The partitions lasted until the conclusion of the First World War and the collapse of the Russian, Prussian and Austro-Hungarian empires that had divided and occupied the Polish territory. The last partition of 1795 removed the state from the map of Europe. The ensuing period was fraught with failed insurrections (1830, 1846 and 1863), the rise of Messianism, and mass migration. This ideological movement of the nineteenth century associated the “martyrdom” of Poland with a crucified Christ and the redemption of the other European nations. The rise of nationalism sweeping throughout Europe turned the Polish elites towards armed rebellion and later towards “Organic Work”. The latter entailed a critical attempt at the cultural preservation of Polish identity, history and language until a new Polish state could arise.

emerged as a grass-roots movement. During the partitions era, the Polish episcopacy operated at this level, participating in the social life of the people and experiencing firsthand the politics of oppression. For the most part, the partitioning states, especially Prussia and Russia, wanted to place the Catholic Church under their influence and to reduce its power by favouring those of a different faith or language.¹⁶ More importantly, with the loss of official Polish political organs of power, the Church became the only institution providing a readily recognizable source of authority. In effect, the Church became a surrogate for Polish nationalism. In the struggle to maintain its rights and garner support among the people, the Polish Catholic Church began to associate that which was Catholic with that which was Polish.¹⁷ This association was further reinforced by emphasizing the Protestant and Orthodox persuasions of two of the partitioning powers (Prussia and Russia, respectively), and presenting Poland as a protector of the Latin Rite in Prussia and Western Culture in Russia. The political exiles distinguished Catholicism as the most important of their political goals in hopes of gaining papal support for Polish independence. The consequence of such a policy resulted in Catholicism becoming a prominent component of the Polish identity.¹⁸ Subsequently, the Church came to be seen as a pillar of Polishness and the amalgamation of *Pole* and *Catholic* asserted itself not only culturally, but also politically.¹⁹ As the mythology of the Pole-Catholic grew stronger, it became deeply rooted within the Polish national identity. After the Polish state was restored in 1918, the majority of the Polish elite continued to endorse the marriage of nationalism with Catholicism.²⁰ Politicians often drew on the

Stefan Kieniewicz, *Historia Polski, 1795-1918* (Warszawa: Państwowe Wyd. Naukowe, 1970); Piotr S. Wandycz, *Land of Partitioned Poland, 1795-1918* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1974); Leon Dyczewski, (ed.) *Wartosci w kulturze polskiej* (Lublin: Fundacja Pomocy Szkolom Polskim na Wschodzie im. Tadeusza Goniewicza, 1993), 185.

¹⁶ Marzena Dzidek, *Miejsce i rola polskiego kościoła katolickiego w życiu publicznym: Zarys relacji między państwem, kościołem i społeczeństwem* (Toruń: Wyd. Adam Marszałek, 2007), 85.

¹⁷ This process started in the 17th century but was magnified considerably during the partitions period.

¹⁸ Wojciech Wrzesiński, (ed.) *Polskie Mity Polityczne XIX i XX wieku* (Wrocław: Wydawn. Uniwersytetu Wrocławskiego, 1994), 107-14.

¹⁹ Dzidek, *Miejsce i rola polskiego* 86.

²⁰ Both the government and clerical elites had misgivings concerning the rise of nationalism and its relationship to Catholicism. Not everyone was convinced of a symbiotic relationship between nationalism and Catholicism. Among the politicians, some saw religion as the handmaid of nationalism, whereas others tended towards a civic nationalism. Amongst churchmen, the opposite held true; some considered nationalism as a doorway to Catholicism, serving religion, others were apprehensive about the possibility of religion's reductive role in the process.

rhetoric of the Pole-Catholic to shore up support among the masses.²¹ The interwar period solidified Catholicism as the main criterion of Polishness, an identity that many immigrants brought to Canada.²²

Prior to 1918, Polish organizational life in Canada was plagued by a lack of experience and inadequate leadership. Issues of self-identification complicated this reality. Poles of this period did not always affiliate with a national identity or were late in ascertaining it, quite often only after arriving on Canadian shores.²³ In addition to this issue, the Polish state did not yet exist, and as a result, the Canadian environment also lacked official Polish institutions, such as consulates, that could direct the numerous, small organizations that were regionally isolated and lacked strong leadership.²⁴ For nationalism to persist, something else was required to take over the state's responsibility regarding education, tradition, and furthering culture. Religion and the Catholic Church served this role. Originally, the parish was at the centre of Polish national life and in the majority of cases organizational life was limited to religious or parish-based associations and mutual aid societies, which focused on Polish national interests, education and cultural celebrations, and to some degree, insurance matters.²⁵ Rural areas were more concerned with religious matters, whereas urban centres focused more on mutual aid societies.²⁶

Parish organizations functioned as a place of gathering where individuals could interact, celebrate cultural and national events, and where language and customs permeated everyday life. It is thus no surprise that when Polish organizational federations, the ZZPWK and ZPWK, emerged in the 1930s, they contested the role of religion in their definition of Polishness. The former saw the parish as too vague in its stance on nationalism and commitment to Polish interests and the latter thought that it over-emphasized these matters and should refocus its attention on the adopted homeland.

²¹ Jarosław Macała, *Polska katolicka w myśli politycznej II RP* (Toruń: Wyd. Adam Marszałek, 2005), 54.

²² Wrzesiński, *Polskie Mity Polityczne XIX i XX wieku*, 116.

²³ Unlike their predecessors the post-war immigrants tended to have some form of elementary education and organizational experience and did not intend to settle permanently in Canada. Henry Radecki, *Ethnic Organizational Dynamics: The Polish Group in Canada* (Waterloo: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 1979), 63-4.

²⁴ Radecki and Heydenkorn, *A Member of a Distinguished Family: the Polish Group in Canada* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1976), 61.

²⁵ Radecki and Heydenkorn, *A Member of a Distinguished Family*, 61; Radecki, *Ethnic Organizational Dynamics*, 67.

²⁶ Religiously based organizations also experienced greater longevity than their secular counterparts. Of fifteen secular organizations created between 1902 and 1920, only two existed in the late 1970s. Radecki, *Ethnic Organizational Dynamics*, 64-67, 50.

It is important to emphasize that ideological transformations and their politicization within the networks of organizations went hand in hand with structural changes. During the interwar period, the Polish organizational dynamic underwent three defining shifts. The first was a move from small, independent and local organizations and associations to the creation of three large “all-encompassing” federations that actively sought support for their ideologies and activities which, they claimed, held the best possible measures for protecting Polish identity abroad. The federations became the chief players in the organizational life of the community and expressed varying definitions of Polishness. The second shift involved a move from cleric-led parish-oriented organizations to lay-established and lay-run organizations that were not necessarily associated with a parish. Unlike their pre-war counterparts, the interwar Polish immigrants had some organizational experience and no longer relied on the parish priest for direction. Moreover, a shortage of priests meant the clergy could not fully meet the demands of the growing community, thus facilitating this transition. The final shift was the beginning of a move from religious to secular organizations. After the Second World War the battle over Polish-Catholic identity was viewed in light of the hostile nature of the Communist regime towards religion in Poland. In this context and with a new wave of Polish immigrants, religion ceased to be a point of contention and became a point of unity.

Categorizing Polish-Canadian organizations into church-oriented or secular is not always useful, as not all secular organizations were non-religious, anti-religious or anti-clerical. Considered the forerunner of Polish secular organizations in Canada, Montreal’s Sons of Poland (1902), for example, was concerned with preserving and supporting Polish culture and identity and Christian morals.²⁷ Many secular organizations had a priest on their board of directors. Conversely, parish-based organizations also fluctuated between outright rejection of secular organizations to collaboration. The Society of St. Stanislaus Kostka, for example, was a founding member of a secular federation ZPwK.

As in other ethnic immigrant communities, organizations were essentially voluntary associations that fulfilled the economic, social, cultural or political needs of individual members and of the broader community and assisted with the preservation of culture, traditions and language, while functioning as a means for social networking.²⁸ However, cultural

²⁷ These changes coincided with the formation of professional and trade associations, women’s auxiliaries, and new cultural clubs concentrating on education. Edward Kołodziej, *Dzieje Polonii w XIX and XX wieku* (Warszawa: Książka i Wiedza, 1991), 240. Radecki and Heydenkorn, *A Member of a Distinguished Family*, 66-68.

²⁸ Thomas Owusu, “The Role of Ghanaian Immigrant Associations in Toronto, Canada,” *International Migration Review* 34, no. 4 (Winter, 2000): 1155, 1159. Saskia

preservation is only one of an organization's manifestations. Another is that of "instrumental" organizations, which enter into dialogue with the host society and mobilize the community towards political and economic goals.²⁹ Before the establishment of the federations, Polish organizations were unable to move beyond cultural preservation. Though the federations had cultural maintenance as their primary focus, they had trouble politicizing the Poles. For the ZZPwK politicization meant political and economic benefits directed towards Poland, and for the ZPwK, this entailed greater influence and say within the Canadian political system. ZPwK only began attempting to bridge the gap between the Polish community and the host society in the latter half of the 1930s, with its emphasis on integration into the larger society. However, the onset of the Great Depression, followed by the war, generally impeded the "instrumentalization" of all organizations.

The environment in which these organizations were created was a critical determinant of the trajectory of their ideological development. The experience of Italian immigrants to Switzerland is similar to that of Poles in Canada.³⁰ Since official Swiss institutions remained disinterested in the Italian workers, the established ethnic organizations strengthened the myriad of Italian-sponsored institutes, such as consulates and embassies, trade union federations and Catholic organizations, which, in turn, financially supported ethnic organizations and assisted immigrants in maintaining ties with the Italian state.³¹ In the 1920s and 1930s, the Canadian government showed similar disinterest towards the Polish community, but the Polish government and the Catholic Church supported ethnic organizations abroad to various degrees, always underlining the relationship between the emigrant and the country of origin.

Given this history of fragmented, dysfunctional and ineffective organizational life, the objective of the federations established in the 1930s was to bring all Poles across Canada under one umbrella organization in order to ensure that neither the immigrants nor their children would lose their language and culture. The formation of the federations was important as it denoted the centralization and advancement of the community by amalgamating the diverse concepts of Polish identity, especially those pertaining to religion and nationalism. There is no doubt that interwar organizational life was a response to this quest for identity.

Sassen-Koob, "Formal and Informal Associations: Dominicans and Colombians in New York," *International Migration Review* 13, no. 2 (Summer, 1979): 322.

²⁹ Sassen-Koob, "Formal and Informal Associations," 324-5

³⁰ Barbara Schmitter, "Immigrants and Associations: Their Role in the Socio-Political Process of Immigrant Worker Integration in West Germany and Switzerland," *International Migration Review* 14, no. 2 (Summer, 1980): 183, 187.

³¹ Schmitter, "Immigrants and Associations," 187-8.

The rise of the federations began with the creation of the ZPwK, followed by the ZZPwK, and lastly the SPwK. Their emergence within a short period illustrates the lack of consensus about how Polishness was to be preserved, defined and propagated. The ensuing ideological battleground and rivalry for members is best revealed through debates over the role of religion in constructing and maintaining Polish identity. This process of identity formation was highly politicized by the organizational rivalry, by the very nature of nationalism, and by various institutions such as the consulates and the Church. Could a Pole be a Pole without Catholicism? What was the relationship between the state (Poland), the Church, and nationalism? How was a Pole in Canada to define himself?

The ZPwK was established in Toronto in 1924 as a local organization amalgamating three Toronto-based organizations: Synowie Polski (the “Society of the Brotherly Aid of the Sons of Poland, under the Protection of the Holy Mother of Częstochowa, the Queen of the Polish Crownlands,” est. 1907); Towarzystwo Św. Stanisława Kostki (St. Stanislaus Kostka Society, est. 1912); and Spójnia Narodowa (Postępowa) Polska (Polish National (Progressive) Society, est. 1918).³² Synowie was ostensibly a secular organization created as a mutual benefit organization.³³ Originally, its membership was limited to Polish and Lithuanian practicing Catholics, but by 1920 it had opened its doors to all Poles regardless of religious affiliation and even accepted atheists.³⁴ The society was very active in preserving Polish culture and organizing national festivities. In its early years, it combined national issues with religious services,³⁵ carried out educational activities and established a school in western Toronto.³⁶

The Towarzystwo Św. Stanisława Kostki, which Rev. Joseph Hinzmann founded at St. Stanislaus Kostka Parish, joined Synowie in 1921 to create the Związek Polaków w Kanadzie (Polish National Alliance of Canada).³⁷

³² Benedykt Heydenkorn, *A Community in Transition: the Polish Group in Canada* (Toronto: Canadian Polish Research Institute, 1985), 9-10; Zofia Gagat, “St. Stanislaus Parish: the Heart of Toronto Polonia,” *Polyphony* 6, no.1 (Spring/Summer 1984): 50.

³³ The President of Związek Narodowy Polski w Chicago (Polish National Alliance in Chicago), Ferdynand Stefan Adalia Satelecki founded this organization. Anna Reczyńska, “Związek Polaków w Kanadzie—Dzieje i rola w życiu kanadyjskiej Polonii,” in Gregorz Babinski, (ed.) *Studia nad organizacjami polonijnymi w Ameryce Północnej: praca zbiorowa* (Wrocław: Zakład Narodowy im. Ossolińskich, 1988), 167.

³⁴ Zofia Shahrodi, “From Sojourners to Settlers: The Formation of Polonia in Toronto and Hamilton, 1886-1929,” (PhD diss., University of Toronto, 1989), 169-170.

³⁵ Shahrodi, “From Sojourners to Settlers,” 171.

³⁶ For the most part, schools, whether associated with a parish or not, tended to teach Polish language and history, along with English lessons and other educational classes for adults. These schools were not meant to substitute for public education, but focused on Polishness. Heydenkorn, *A Community in Transition*, 9.

³⁷ Heydenkorn, *A Community in Transition*, 9.

Before this union, the society provided financial assistance to members in cases of unemployment, illness and death, established a library and a night school (1915), and actively participated in Polish national celebrations.³⁸ The third organization to complete the ZPwK was Spójnia Narodowa (Postępowa) Polska in 1923, a self-improvement organization, which also supported socialism and Józef Piłsudski, Poland's Chief of State, 1918-22.³⁹ It was the first to open its doors to women and provided educational services while promoting cultural and national activities.⁴⁰

The creation of the ZPwK was rooted in the declining membership and finances of the originating three societies and concern over the loss of language and culture. By uniting, these organizations hoped to strengthen the Polish community. Not until 1927, however, did ZPwK establish groups in other Ontario centres. The first branch outside Toronto was organized in Hamilton (1927), followed by St. Catharine's (1928).⁴¹ By 1939, ZPwK had 17 branches in Ontario along with its own newspaper (*Związkowiec*), auxiliary bodies and schools, and about 4,000 members.⁴² Despite its initial aims of striving to uphold Catholicism, supporting Polish parishes, and celebrating Polish historical events, with a motto, "brotherhood and tolerance," it quickly became liberalized, opening its membership to all except Communists.⁴³ In part, this change may have centred on accentuating national identity over religious affiliation as a way of including the largest number of Poles under one umbrella organization. This was especially important since ZPwK was the first such organization in Canada.

While the organization was concerned with maintaining Polish culture and issues of self-improvement (i.e., education, moral betterment, insurance),

³⁸ Shahrodi, "From Sojourners to Settlers," 174; William Makowski, *History and Integration of Poles in Canada* (n.p.: Canadian Polish Congress, 1967), 96.

³⁹ This organization was originally part of the Związek Socjalistów Polski (Alliance of Polish Socialists), which traced its origins to immigrants from the turn of the century. Józef Piłsudski was Poland's Chief of State from 1918 to 1922. This was followed by the presidencies of Gabriel Narutowicz (December 1922) and Stanisław Wojciechowski (December 1922 to May 1926). Following the coup of 1926, although the official presidency was given to Ignacy Mościcki (June 1926 to September 1939), real power lay with Piłsudski until his death in 1935. Reczyńska, "Związek Polaków w Kanadzie," 167.

⁴⁰ Shahrodi, "From Sojourners to Settlers," 176, 179.

⁴¹ Frank Kmietowicz, (ed.) *Diamentowy jubileusz Związku Polaków w Kanadzie, 1907-1957* (Toronto: Polish Alliance Press, 1982), 17.

⁴² In 1930, branches in Kitchener, West Toronto, Preston and New Toronto were created; in 1932 in Swansea, Toronto, Brantford; in 1933, Guelph; in 1934, in Welland; in 1936, Sudbury, Sarnia, Port Colborne; in 1938, Oshawa; in 1939, Delhi. Kmietowicz, *Diamentowy jubileusz Związku Polaków w Kanadzie 17*; Radecki, *Ethnic Organizational Dynamics*, 71; Kołodziej, *Dzieje Polonii*, 241.

⁴³ Rudolph Kogler, *The Polish Community in Canada* (Toronto: Canadian Polish Research Institute, 1976), 22-3.

it also called on Poles to become Canadian citizens, to consider Canada their homeland, and to participate more fully in its political and economic life.⁴⁴ Consequently, it emphasized familiarizing immigrants with Canadian laws and customs rather than on duties to Poland.⁴⁵ Throughout the 1930s, the ZPwK became more uncompromising in its anti-Poland and anti-clerical campaign because of the immigrants' economic situation, unemployment, increasing xenophobia in Canada, and a shift in leadership that reflected a leftist ideology. As a result, the organization faced much internal conflict and, eventually, a large number of its members defected and created a new organization in 1937, the *Polski Związek Narodowy w Kanadzie* (Polish National Union of Canada, ZNPwK), whose motto "God, Honor, Fatherland" reaffirmed the Pole-Catholic identity.⁴⁶

This ideological shift is best revealed in the evolution of the ZPwK's constitution. Its 1921 constitution laid out the main principles of the organization. According to Article II, it sought to improve the social and financial standing of the Poles through a focus on economic issues. It also emphasized advancing the education of members through cultural events such as lectures, amateur theatre productions, social gatherings and schools for both children and adults in an attempt to improve the latter's skill-set. The organization was also concerned about increasing the number of Polish businesses and helping Poles find employment.⁴⁷ In addition, it provided a clear mandate regarding the Poles' role in Canada, stating in Article II, pt.7: "Aiding members in becoming familiar with the laws of the Canadian constitution, our adopted Fatherland, as well as helping each other in gaining naturalization papers."⁴⁸

Not only did the ZPwK emphasize the need for integration and adaptation into Canadian society, none of its listed aims focused on the need to maintain Polishness among its members. In 1933 and 1934 the organization made minor changes to its constitution. Thus, instead of just focusing on improving its members' social and financial status in general terms, the 1933 constitution laid out its aim to "[c]reate jointly organized interests in respect

⁴⁴ Mateusz Bogdanowicz, "Kanada a sprawa polska: Kanadyjska droga ku wojnie od układu monachijskiego do polskiego Września," in Mirosław Buchholtz, (ed.) *Polska w Kanadzie, Kanada w Polsce* (Toruń: Wyd. Adam Marszałek, 2008), 19; Kogler, *The Polish Community in Canada*, 22-3.

⁴⁵ Shahrodi, "From Sojourners to Settlers," 185.

⁴⁶ The organization would go on to join the ZPPwK.

⁴⁷ Ontario Archives (hereafter OA), Multicultural Historical Society of Ontario (hereafter MHSO) Fond, Polish Alliance of Canada Papers (Constitutions and By-Laws), F1405, POL0013, MU 9164, (hereafter PACP) *Konstytucja Polaków w Kanadzie* *Towarzystwo Zajemnej Pomocy* (hereafter KPKTZP), 1921, 1931.

⁴⁸ OA, MHSO Fond, PACP, F1405, POL0013, MU 9164, KPKTZP, 1921.

to social, political, economic, physical and cultural-educational [matters].”⁴⁹ The next year, this attitude was further refined: “Create a jointly organized Polish people’s front in Canada for the protection and the development of its vital interests in regards to social, political, economic, physical and cultural-educational [matters].”⁵⁰ The constitution gave little consideration to the preservation of Polish identity, a position reinforced by ZPwK’s refusal to take an oath of loyalty to the Polish state at Światpol.⁵¹ Lastly, identifying the coming together of immigrants in a “Polish people’s front” reflected the left-leaning currents that were gaining ground in the ZPwK throughout the 1930s. The boldness of the 1934 constitution came at a time of growing conflict between the ZPwK and the other two Federations, in particular, the ZZPwK.

In 1936, the ZPwK again changed its constitution, this time, accentuating its role in raising the social and economic position of the Polish community to be on par with that of Canadian society.⁵² Again, it showed greater concern for integration into Canadian society rather than on maintaining a relationship with the Polish state. Another indicator of ZPwK’s openness to Canadian society was its attitude towards potential members. Its 1921 and 1931 constitutions opened membership to all individuals “of Polish birth

⁴⁹ OA, MHSO Fond, PACP, F1405, POL0013, MU 9115, KPKTZP, 1933.

⁵⁰ OA, MHSO Fond, PACP, F1405, POL0013, MU 9164, KPKTZP, 1934.

⁵¹ Światpol, or the Światowy Związek Polaków z Zagranicy (World Association of Poles Abroad). Światpol was the realization of Poland’s policies towards emigrants and their political and economic relationship to the homeland. As an organization that functioned on Polish territory, its remoteness from Canada may have presented a perception of irrelevance to immigrants in Canada. That, however, would undermine a discussion of the religion-nationalism conflict on Canadian soil. Światpol served as a platform for the manifestation of the attitudes and policies of the Federations on defining the identity of the Poles and their relationship to the Polish and, by default, to the Canadian state.

Established as a way of uniting Polish clusters and supporting ties between these clusters and the Polish state, Światpol was a creation of the MSZ and the Rada Opieki Kulturalnej (Cultural Patronage Committee). The organization was not just concerned with maintaining culture among Polish emigrants, but also wanted to ensure that these groups would support the politics of the governing party in Poland. The main focus of the 1934 convention was the cultural-educational problems of emigrants and the need to maintain their Polishness. The delegates to this convention were selected from countries with Polish settlements. The number of mandates issued to each country (each delegate received one mandate) depended on the size of its Polish population. Canada received four mandates. Each of the three Canadian Federations appointed delegates who were approved by the Consuls and the Organizational Committee of Światpol. Cezary Lusiński, *II Rzeczpospolita a Polonia 1922-39* (Warszawa: PAN, 1998), 7, 14. For more information on the history of Światpol see Cezary Lusiński, *II Rzeczpospolita a Polonia 1922-39; Kołodziej, Wychodźstwo Zarobkowe*, 188.

⁵² OA, MHSO Fond, PACP, F1405, POL0013, MU 9164, KPKTZP, 1936.

or heritage...regardless of religious or political preferences;⁵³ in 1934 it extended membership to non-Polish spouses.⁵⁴ No longer would membership be limited by ethnic identity. Non-Poles, however, did not flood the ranks of the ZPwK; it retained its predominantly Polish character.

The fact that aims were centred on Canada and not Poland indicates a shift in the understanding of Polish identity. Without denying its Polish heritage, the ZPwK saw this heritage in the broader Canadian context: the community's loyalty must be to Canada and not to the Second Republic. The ZPwK stripped the identity of any political, economic and religious connotations; instead, language became the main signifier. This, of course, struck at the core of the commonly held notion that Polishness and Catholicism were the two components comprising Polish identity and reflected the rising labour-oriented leftist trend in the organization's executive board and its concern for the economic well-being of Polish immigrants. Whether all members and associated organizations held these views is a matter of debate. By attempting to become more Canadian, ZPwK was abandoning the religious roots of the traditional way of defining and understanding Polishness.

For Polish consuls and most Polish clergy, this was a radical move as they propagated the notion that an active relationship with the Polish state was indispensable to Polishness. The consuls responded by creating the ZZPwK in Winnipeg in 1931, which received its charter in 1933. Recognizing the growing Polish community in Toronto, the organization's first convention took place in that city.⁵⁵ At its founding, twenty-four organizations joined the ZZPwK, and by 1934, its membership had swelled to thirty-seven, with its greatest support in Manitoba and Montreal.⁵⁶ Jan Pawlica reported to the Ministerstwo Spraw Zagranicznych (Ministry of Foreign Affairs, MSZ), in 1934 that this represented about 6,000 individuals.⁵⁷ The focus

⁵³ OA, MHSO Fond, PACP, F1405, POL0013, MU 9164, KPKTZP, 1921, 1931; F1405, POL0013, MU 9115, KPKTZP, 1930.

⁵⁴ OA, MHSO Fond, PACP, F1405, POL0013, MU 9164, KPKTZP, 1934.

⁵⁵ Radecki, 71; Heydenkorn, *A Community in Transition*, 210-11.

⁵⁶ In 1934, the president of the organization was B.B. Dubieński; the General Secretary, J. Sikora; and the organization's delegates were K. Konarski and A. Wach. AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.31-31a, Report from Jan Pawlica to MSZ, Departament Konsularny, 20 March 1934; Krystyna Romaniszyn, *Chłopi polscy w Kanadzie (1896-1939)* (Warszawa: Polska Akademia Nauk, Instytut Rozwoju Wsi i Rolnictwa, 1991), 75; Radecki, *Ethnic Organizational*, 71; Heydenkorn, *Organizational Structure*, 14.

⁵⁷ However, in a list of organizations and membership from 1934, the membership totalled at 3,401. Two of the organizations—St. Mary's Parish, Toronto and Holy Trinity Parish, Windsor—provided the number of families (i.e., 110 families and 140 families respectively) and not the total number of individuals. By including a total count, the overall membership could have increased by at least another 250 members. According to Benedykt Heydenkorn, in 1938 membership in ZZPwK totalled 3,089 despite the large

of the federation was to maintain culture and preserve national and historic traditions through the creation of Polish schools, libraries, concerts and theatrical productions.⁵⁸ According to the ZZPWK, Poles were to remain Poles, recognize and support the Polish government, and ensure that future generations were not denationalized.⁵⁹ Especially important was establishing relationships between Polish-Canadian and Polish organizations back home. At its outset, the consuls wanted to model the organization on “a Roman Catholic or a national association, as these types of organizations are able to encompass a large group of Poles.”⁶⁰ Religion was a very viable medium, which could bring together the dispersed Polish immigrants. Each convention of the ZZPWK, for example, began with a Mass.⁶¹

In an effort to gather all Poles under its leadership, however, the ZZPWK presented itself as a secular organization, which sought out all Poles regardless of religious affiliation. To appeal to non-Catholics, ZZPWK accentuated statehood and economic progress as components of Polish identity. Yet, it also highlighted language, history, culture and above all religion, specifically Roman Catholicism as elements comprising identity. The consuls and most Polish clergy continued to emphasize the Pole-Catholic identity while underlining the importance of a relationship between the community and the Polish state. The ZZPWK’s constitution clearly defined these very goals:

(b) Wielding high the banner of national honour, strengthened by forces of an inexhaustible source of the nation’s ideals and heroic past of the Fatherland, repelling the enemy’s attack on the Nation and the Polish State, while simultaneously utilizing our strength for broader Canadian progress.

number of member organizations—by that year there were seventy-four organizations. The significant discrepancy in membership cannot be explained. Though there was a general drop in membership during the Depression, it is difficult to assess the accuracy of these numbers because records are incomplete or non-existent, or Pawlica may have inflated the numbers. AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.31-31a, Jan Pawlica to MSZ, Departament Konsularny, 20 March 1934; OA, MHSO Fond, F1405, POL0236, MU 9066, Federation of Polish Societies in Canada Papers, “Wykaz Członków Zjednoczenia,” 1934; MHSO, POL Box 21, *Poles in Canada: Their Contribution to Canadian Development* (Montreal: Federation of Polish Societies in Canada, 1938), 4.

⁵⁸ LAC, MG28 v100, “Statut Zjednoczenia Zrzeszeń Polskich w Kanadzie,” *Czas*, November 29, 1932, 2; “Biuletyn Zjednoczenia Zrzeszeń Polski w Kanadzie,” *Czas*, 5 December 1932 and 13 December 1932, 7. The ZZPWK published all materials related to the federation in *Czas*. By the end of 1932, an entire section of the paper, *Biuletyn Zjednoczenia Zrzeszeń Polskich w Kanadzie* (Bulletin of the Federation of Polish Societies), was devoted to the organization and its policies and propaganda.

⁵⁹ LAC, MG28 v100, “Statut Zjednoczenia Zrzeszeń Polskich w Kanadzie,” *Czas*, 29 November 1932, 2.

⁶⁰ Archiwum Akt Nowych (hereafter AAN), Ambasada RP w Waszyngtonie, sign.964, s.83, S. Zwolski to Consulate General in Montreal, 3 January 1932.

⁶¹ Multicultural History Society of Ontario. POL D-13-4 Box, *Polonia* (Montreal), 1 December 1934.

(c) Organizing for its members effective and productive aid, spiritual and material, as well as, when necessary, defending the entire Polish community in Canada.⁶²

The consuls' agenda was disingenuous and opportunistic. They did not expect Poles to assimilate into their new homeland but to maintain their Polishness and allegiance to the Second Republic while at the same time being respectable and acceptable members of mainstream society so they could affect Polish-Canadian relations to the benefit of Poland.

ZZPwK maintained strong contact with the motherland through Światpol since this would permit Poles to retain their Polish national culture, while strengthening it through educational materials such as literature.⁶³ It also called on Poles to support local Polish businesses, and, more significantly for Poland, to demand and purchase Polish products in Canada to remedy the trade imbalance since Poland was purchasing five times more from Canada than selling to Canada.⁶⁴ The ZZPwK was able to gather both religious and secular groups into its fold, but not the ZPwK or the SPwK. The SPwK was in a discussion with the ZZPwK over the latter's acceptance of Catholicism as the federation's main religion;⁶⁵ however, the outbreak of the war in 1939 put an end to these negotiations.⁶⁶

In a similar attempt to unify the Polish immigrant community, Polish clergy created the SPwK in 1934, in Winnipeg, Manitoba.⁶⁷ Its roots can be traced back to the creation of the *Katolickie Zrzeszenie Polaków w Kanadzie Zachodniej* (Catholic Organization of Poles in Western Canada), which worked with the *Zjednoczenie Polskich Kapłanów w Kanadzie* (Alliance of Polish Clergy in Canada, est. 1927) and their *Katolickie Biuro Imigracyjne*

⁶² Library and Archives Canada (hereafter LAC), MG28 v100, "Projekt Statutu Zjednoczenia Zrzeszeń Polskich w Kanadzie," *Czas*, 12 January 1932, 3.

⁶³ Support for preserving national identity would come directly from the Polish state and would be realized through cultural events and productions, such as theatre, and the funding of Polish newspapers.

⁶⁴ OA, MHSO Fond, Federation of Polish Societies in Canada Papers, F1405, POL 0263, MU 9066, *Zjednoczenie Zrzeszeń Polskich w Kanadzie Report*, 1938.

⁶⁵ *Romaniszyn, Chłopi polscy*, 75.

⁶⁶ Kołodziej, *Dzieje Polonii*, 241.

⁶⁷ In 1934, the President was Rev. Dr. J. Kręciszewski; the Vice-President: Piotr Taraska; the Financial Secretary: Rev. Zielonka; Cashier: Franciszek Stochmal; Secretary and Editor of the *Gazeta Katolicka*: Jan Pazdor; Librarian: Rev. Wachowicz, the Vicar of Holy Ghost Parish, Winnipeg. The following directors were appointed for given areas: W. Wołoszyński, Cook's Creek; P. Kawiatkowski, Tolstoi; M. Saborski, Meleb; Rev. K. Łulasik, Selkirk; Rev. Sajka, Beausejour. AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.31-31a, Report from Jan Pawlica to MSZ, Departament Konsularny, 20 March 1934; AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.100-100a, Confidential Report from Jan Pawlica, 23 May 1934; *Romaniszyn, Chłopi polscy*, 73.

(Catholic Bureau of Immigration). The latter helped new immigrants and directed them towards existing Polish settlements in Western Canada.⁶⁸

In 1933, a province-wide organization, Stowarzyszenie Polaków w Manitobie (Association of Poles in Manitoba) consolidated parish and church-affiliated groups throughout the province.⁶⁹ It represented 35 parishes; 100 delegates and 50 parish representatives attended its first convention.⁷⁰ Consul Jan Pawlica, who believed that the SPwK should be forced to join the ZZPwK, however, disputed these numbers.⁷¹

The central aim of the SPwK was to ensure that Poles remained loyal to the Catholic Church, its traditions and moral code.⁷² The *Opieka Polski nad Rodakami na Obczyźnie* (*Opieka*)⁷³ supported it by supplying teaching materials; Winnipeg's Archbishop Alfred Arthur Sinnott also assisted it.⁷⁴ The establishment of the SPwK in 1934 was, in part, a response to the rise of the ZPwK, its acceptance of the Polish National Catholic Church and Polish Baptists, and the rise of left-leaning sentiments in its ranks. It was also an attempt to halt the trend begun in the mid-1920s of some parish-affiliated organizations joining secular organizations because of their dissatisfaction with the limited possibilities at the parish level. The SPwK sought to retain the allegiance of the groups that had not yet defected.⁷⁵

SPwK hoped to unite all those for whom God and Fatherland remained a central slogan. Its goals were to promote the Polish language and to edify the community. Not only was each household to contain Catholic literature, but youth were also not to lose their Polish spirit—"God forbid that they

⁶⁸ AAN, Akta Janiny i Kazimierza Warchałowskich, sign.244, Roman Mazurkiewicz, *Polskie wychodźstwo i osadnictwo w kanadzie* (Warszawa: MSZ, no date), 75.

⁶⁹ Heydenkorn, *Organizational Structure*, 9.

⁷⁰ Romaniszyn, *Chłopi polscy*, 73; AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.100-100a, Confidential Report from Jan Pawlica, 23 May 1934.

⁷¹ Pawlica was the Polish Consul in Winnipeg from 1933 to 1936. According to him, only thirteen clergy attended with six coming from Winnipeg. No one came from Alberta, Saskatchewan or Ontario. AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.100-100a, Confidential Report from Jan Pawlica, 23 May 1934.

⁷² Radecki, *Ethnic Organizational Dynamics*, 73.

⁷³ *Opieka Polski nad Rodakami na Obczyźnie* (Poland's Aid for Compatriots Abroad) was a Catholic organization created in a collaborative effort between Józef Piłsudski and Cardinal August Hlond to ensure the religious and national identity of Polish emigrants and "engender as its general program aid to emigrants within a Catholic and national spirit." Essentially, *Opieka* was to create a symbiosis of the patriotic with the religious. AAN, OPnRnO, sign.358/16, s.9, Booklet *Sprawozdanie okręgu Zachodniego Stowarzyszenia "Opieka Polska" nad Rodakami na obczyźnie*, 12 September 1929 to March 31, 1931.

⁷⁴ AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.100-100a, Confidential Report from Jan Pawlica, 23 May 1934.

⁷⁵ Radecki and Heydenkorn, *A Member of a Distinguished Family*, 65.

feel ashamed of their Polish heritage and their mother tongue.”⁷⁶ Faith and the national spirit were to be at the forefront among all Polish-Catholics, as only faith could preserve national identity. To increase its appeal, and to present itself as an organization that preserved the language, culture, traditions and faith that had accompanied the immigrants to Canada, SPwK addressed problems of denationalization, assimilation and discrimination faced by the Poles. Its call for members outlined the threats facing Poles regarding their national identity:

And yet, in cases regarding your spirit you encountered difficulties; your and your ancestors’ faith, national pride, native tongue, Polish traditions were drowned by foreign religions, faulty ideas and false patriotism—in addition, you, brother, are frequently subjected to humiliation and oblivion because you are a newcomer and immigrant to Canada.⁷⁷

The SPwK, however, had difficulty making headway into Eastern Canada due to its emphasis on religion, the rise of radical political movements notably socialism, and the strong presence the ZPwK and ZZPwK had established in Ontario and in Western Canada.⁷⁸ The popularity of ZZPwK among Catholic organizations in the East, the strength of ZPwK in Ontario, and the quick support given to SPwK in western Canada suggest that regionalism as well as the philosophy of the federation and the timing of its formation affected the federation’s ability to attract new members.

By the 1930s, competition for members was a prominent component of Polish organizational life. Even the like-minded federations, the SPwK and the ZZPwK, clashed. The role of the ZZPwK in subverting the SPwK is revealing. In particular, consuls such as Jan Pawlica actively sought to thwart SPwK’s aim of cross-country unification by undermining the federation of priests throughout Western Canada.⁷⁹ In a report to the MSZ, Pawlica noted that “in this act of sabotage I was helped by the changing psychology of Polish priests in Saskatchewan...I was able to gain confirmation delaying the organizational action amongst the clergy in Saskatchewan, and with this is possible the non-participation of Polish priests in the upcoming Fall convention of the Association of Poles in Canada.”⁸⁰ He even asked the MSZ not to deliver books sent to the SPwK from Opieka.⁸¹

⁷⁶ LAC, Canadian Polish Congress Fond, (hereafter CPCF), MG 28 V 10 vol. 47, Julian Topolnicki Collection, SPwK Manifesto, October 1938.

⁷⁷ LAC, CPCF, MG 28 V10 vol.47, Julian Topolnicki Collection, SPwK Manifesto, October 1938.

⁷⁸ SPwK’s popularity in Western Canada was the result of a lack of Polish leftist organizations in this area. (Kołodziej, *Dzieje Polonii*, 239).

⁷⁹ Romaniszyn, *Chłopi polscy*, 73.

⁸⁰ Jan Pawlica as quoted in Romaniszyn, *Chłopi polscy*, 73.

⁸¹ Heydenkorn, *A Community in Transition*, 223.

The ZZPWK and the consuls feared that if the SPwK expanded into Saskatchewan and Alberta it would become a competitor and undermine the former's authority and legitimacy among the immigrants that both sought to bring into their folds. The ZZPWK also worried about the potential opposition of the SPwK towards some of the secular organizations within its ranks. When the potential for unification between the ZPWK and the ZZPWK arose, the latter was especially concerned about the reaction of the SPwK.⁸² However, the support of Rev. Gulczyński of West Toronto, Rev. Dr. Tarasiuk of Hamilton, and Rev. Samborski of Kitchener among others, dispelled the fear of some consuls that if the ZPWK joined the ZZPWK, the Catholics would leave. An upcoming mission to Polish clergy led by Rev. Mazurkiewicz from New York reassured the consuls that that occasion would "increasingly transform the attitude of the Catholic sphere in regards to the Federation [ZZPWK] in favour of the latter." Accordingly, the consuls placed greater emphasis on trying to bring the ZPWK into the fold, seeing this as the final gateway to creating a strong national identity within Canada, which would finally "garner all isolated organizations, church et al."⁸³ The ZZPWK relied on Pawlica to approach the SPwK and get it to join the ZZPWK or at least establish a committee focusing on mutual understanding and cooperation.

Two main trends can be identified in relation to these federations. First, the federations that were positively disposed to religion and its role in furthering nationalism were also strong supporters of maintaining the connection between Poland and her emigrants, as in the case of the ZZPWK and to a certain degree, the SPwK. Secondly, those like the ZPWK, with its anti-clerical stance, were also critical of maintaining the link between immigrants and their homeland; instead, they emphasized integration and improving the social condition of Poles in Canada. Though positively disposed to preserving Polish language and culture, they saw Canada as their new motherland so Poland could no longer receive their loyalty.⁸⁴

Not all organizations clamoured to join a larger movement. The persistence of smaller independent groups that tended to centre on regional life and interests exacerbated the fragmentation that the establishment of the three federations had fostered. Not joining a federation did not mean that these organizations isolated themselves from the greater community. They often established communication lines with all or some of the federations but

⁸² Heydenkorn, *A Community in Transition*, 223.

⁸³ AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.76-83, Minutes of the Consular Conference in Ottawa, 24 March 1934.

⁸⁴ The contentious issue of the relationship between ethnicity, Catholicism and state loyalty eventually led to a break within the ZPWK and a new organization, the *PolSKI Związek Narodowy* (Polish National Union, PZN), which rejected this alternate version of the Polish identity.

remained independent because of their focus on regional concerns and their desire to avoid the political debates regarding Polishness and its relationship to religion and to the Polish state. The Polish community in Sudbury, Ontario, and its surrounding area (Copper Cliff, Garson and Falconbridge), for example, which represented 909 individuals in 1931,⁸⁵ began its forays into organizational life by coordinating cultural activities, such as amateur theatrical performances in private homes. By 1934, the community had established the “Polish Club” that functioned as an umbrella organization for the Sudbury region. Its aims, according to the English-language version of its mandate, included the following:

- a) To establish, maintain and conduct a club for the accommodation of its members and their friends ... and to promote friendly and social intercourse among its members;
- b) To promote among persons of Polish nationality in ... Ontario a knowledge of the requisites of good Canadian citizenship;
- c) To promote a knowledge of the English and Polish languages among persons of Polish nationality; and
- d) To aid in the relief of persons of Polish nationality who are in distressed circumstances or who require help of any kind by reason of their recent arrival in Canada.⁸⁶

The Polish-language version, however, clearly rejected this assimilation and pro-Canadian stance and called for the strengthening of Polish identity:

- 1) To organize and establish brotherly contacts among all Poles in Sudbury and area;
- 2) Cooperation and defence of the good Polish name;
- 3) To build our own organizational home;
- 4) To establish a library;
- 5) To organize and give theatre performances, concerts and lectures; and
- 6) To maintain the spirit of Polishness in Canada, and close ties with Poland.”⁸⁷

The latter mandate, speaking to the community, emphasized identity and culture as key elements needing preservation. The former text, one that Canadian authorities would read, illustrated a desire to assimilate into the broader society.

⁸⁵ By 1941, this number increased to 815 in Sudbury and 478 in the adjacent towns. Henryk Radecki, “Polish Immigrants in Sudbury, 1883-1980,” *Polyphony* 5, no.1 (Spring/Summer 1983): 49-50.

⁸⁶ OA, MHSO Fond, Polish Club of Sudbury Incorporation Papers, F1405, POL0128, MU 9059, ser.54-128, “Polish Club of Sudbury Limited,” 1936.

⁸⁷ Radecki, “Polish Immigrants in Sudbury,” 50.

It is important to note that not all organizations directly mentioned religion within their mandate although it could be implicit in a discussion concerning the preservation of Polishness. This was especially true during the 1920s and 1930s, when the Polish state reinforced the connection between Pole and Catholic.

The two versions of the Sudbury Polish Club's mandate illustrate how Polish organizations may have approached their relationship to Canada and to Poland in a manner that reflected the hybridity of identity. By calling on Poles to become familiar with requirements of good Canadian citizenship in their English mandate, the Poles were also fulfilling the very enterprise that the Polish consuls had asked of them.⁸⁸ Both the Canadian and Polish communities may have had differing expectations, and the organization was willing, at least in theory, to meet these expectations. Lastly, and the question that appears most pressing is which of these mandates more authentically represented the interests of the organization. In this case, does the Polish-worded mandate better represent the desires of the organization? If the Polish Club was serious about assimilation, as in the case of the ZPwK, it would have incorporated components found in both the Canadian and Polish mandates.

The Niagara Peninsula also experienced a growth of organizations with the influx of immigrants. The largest groups were in St. Catharines, Welland and Niagara Falls. By the late 1920s and the early 1930s, new organizations, such as the Towarzystwo Polsko-Kanadyjskie (Polish Canadian Association), and the Stowarzyszenie Kanadyjsko-Polskie (Canadian Polish Society) were established in Welland and St. Catharines respectively. The latter was preceded by the Towarzystwo Św. Stanisława (St. Stanislaus Association), which Father Sperski, the local Polish priest, established in 1916.⁸⁹ Despite its religious character, it was very successful in bringing together the Poles of the area but it did not survive Sperski's death and the inability of the Toronto Archdiocese to find another Polish cleric to take his place. The history of the Niagara region illustrates a number of key issues related to organizational life. Religion-based organizations were the priority in the earliest stages of organizational life, and religion was not a divisive factor in the early 1920s. In addition, organizations needed good leadership, which, in the 1920s, essentially amounted to clerical leadership.

⁸⁸ The consuls were adamant that the Poles preserve their heritage but also made clear that Poles were to become familiar with Canadian laws and society. This mandate grew in part from their desire to influence Canadian economic and immigration policy through the Polish community. For more on the role of the consuls see Gabriela Pawlus Kasprzak "Priests and Consuls: Religion, Nationalism and the Polish Diaspora, 1918-1939," *Polish American Studies* 68, no. 2 (Autumn 2011): 11-39.

⁸⁹ Makowski, *History and Integration*, 103.

With an influx of immigrants to Edmonton, Alberta, Poles organized a Polish-Canadian Association in 1927 followed by the Polish Army Veterans' Association.⁹⁰ These organizations and the Polish parishes became the centre of Polish social and cultural life until after the Second World War. The constitution of the Polish-Canadian Association emphasized the maintenance of ties among Poles, including the fostering of language, tradition, culture and customs.⁹¹ In particular, these organizations, like Coleman, Alberta's Polskie Towarzystwo Bratniej Pomocy (Polish Brotherly Aid Society) established by miners, fostered what vice-consul Roman Mazurkiewicz called "national traits" (i.e., language, customs, culture, including religious traditions and customs).⁹² Where there was no Polish parish, as at Coleman, organizations became centres of cultural and national preservation through gatherings and amateur theatrical productions.⁹³

Many organizations and groups in the early 1930s faced a tough decision. Should they join one of the three federations or remain independent?⁹⁴ The establishment of the federations represented the formalization and officialization of the Polish identity. The process of amalgamation involved much debate and disagreement. Not all organizations wished to join a federation because they feared losing their administrative and ideological independence. The Polskie Stowarzyszenie Narodowe (Polish National Association, 1938-1953) in London, Ontario, for example, did not want to join the ZPwK lest it lose its provincial charter and the opportunity to build its own Dom Polski (Polish House).⁹⁵

Joining a federation also meant adopting the attitude of the overseeing organization on issues related to nationalism, religion and politics; therefore, if an organization joined a federation, it chose one whose ideological position conformed to its own. The Orzeł Biały (White Eagle) Drama Club in Hamilton, for example, indicated as much in its constitution after it joined ZPwK, Group 2: "In general matters of a national, social or political nature the Theatre Circle must adapt itself to the ZPwK Constitution, having

⁹⁰ Joanna Matejko, (ed.) *Polish Settlers in Alberta: Reminiscences and Biographies* (n.p., n.p., 1979), 16.

⁹¹ Maria Carlton, *Towarzystwo Polsko-Kanadyjskie (Edmonton), 1927-1987* (Edmonton: Polish-Canadian Society, 1987), 18.

⁹² AAN, Akta Janiny i Kazimierza Warchałowskich, sign.244, Roman Mazurkiewicz, *Polskie wychodźstwo i osadnictwo w kanadzie* (Warszawa: MSZ, no date), 76.

⁹³ Carlton, *Towarzystwo Polsko-Kanadyjskie*, 28.

⁹⁴ Sources related to decisions about joining a particular federation do not appear to have survived.

⁹⁵ LAC, Polish Alliance Friendly Society of Canada, MG 28 v55 vol.11, Polish National Association (London) File, W. Rumas to the ZPwK, 14 February 1938.

the possibility to express itself at the meetings of the Group through its representative.”⁹⁶

Identification with an ideology was more important when it pertained to matters of religion. Parish-based organizations underwent a significant transition during the interwar period, shifting from an outright rejection of secular organizations to collaboration. In many ways, the growth of the immigrant community dictated this transformation. When created in 1913, the Towarzystwo Św. Stanisława Kostki (Society of St. Stanislaus Kostka) forbade its members from belonging to secret organizations banned by the Catholic Church or certain organizations, such as Spójnia or Synowie Polski.⁹⁷ With the creation of the Federations such attitudes had to change. Since the small size of the parish and its limited resources meant it could no longer meet the demand for services, the Towarzystwo Św. Stanisława Kostki became a founding member of ZPwK in the hope that membership in the larger body would allow it to expand its services. The clergy, however, feared the loss of the religious elements within Polish customs and culture.

Religious currents were prominent in the culture of organizational life, especially within small groups whether they were parish-based or not. Winnipeg’s Związek Polskich Obrońców Ojczyzny na Kanadę Zachodnią (Association of Polish Protectors of the Fatherland in Western Canada, est.1933) and the Ognisko Związku Podhalań w Kanadzie (Central Association of Polish Highlanders of Canada, est.1933) are good examples. Both non-parish based organizations eventually joined the ZZPwK, which saw them as promising great potential for consolidation within the community. The ZZPwK recognized this mobilizing potential by highlighting the former’s *Oplątk*, the sharing of the Christmas wafer, which 108 persons attended.⁹⁸ Sharing the wafer symbolically fused religion and culture. Similarly, the first convention of Ognisko Związku Podhalań w Kanadzie

⁹⁶ OA, MHSO Fond, PACP, F1405, POL 0013, MU9110, Regulamin Kółka Teatru, no date.

⁹⁷ Archives of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of Toronto (hereafter ARCAT), St. Stanislaus Kostka Parish: Parish Community 1919-1937, Rules and Regulations for St. Stanislaus Kostka Polish Council; OA, MHSO Fond, Jozef Pankowski Papers, F 1405, POL 0038, MU 9103, Konstytucja i kwitariusz Towarzystwa Bratniej Pomocy pod Opieką św. Stanisława Kostki w Toronto, est. 1913.

⁹⁸ The *Oplątek* alludes to a Christmas Eve ritual, which begins with a prayer followed by the sharing of a wafer among the celebrants. The Christmas wafer is made from the same ingredients and produced in the same way as a Communion wafer but is not consecrated. The practice harkens back to the sharing of bread in Biblical times and early Christianity. AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.12-3, Report from Jan Pawlica, November 14, 1933; AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.21, Report from Pawlica, 17 January 1934.

began with a Mass in Holy Ghost Parish by its Rector, Rev. Baderski.⁹⁹ This tradition continued at every convention.¹⁰⁰ Roman Mazurkiewicz, commenting on the life of the Polish community, praised its focus on the faith of their ancestors and language. According to him, “the Catholic faith constitutes the Polish national tradition.”¹⁰¹ Religion had to remain a prominent component of the organizations.

The intertwining of religion and nationalism was reflected in the constitutions of both Związek Polskich Obrońców Ojczyzny na Kanadę Zachodnią and Ognisko Związku Podhalań w Kanadzie. Ties to the motherland were important, especially for organizations in the ZZPWK. Both adapted their constitutions from similar organizations in Poland: Związek Obrońców Ojczyzny in Warszawa (Association of Polish Protectors of the Fatherland) and Związek Podhalań in Kraków (Central Association of Polish Highlanders). In their call for members, representatives of the Canadian branch of the Związek Podhalań made clear their aims:

The aims and duties of the Canadian Central Association of Polish Highlanders will be the same as the aims of the Head Association: being bound to our Fatherland in the Old Country, working according to the directives and ideology of the Great Builder of Young Poland, Marshal Piłsudski, fostering the Podhale¹⁰² Spirit, Culture and the Podhale Dialect.

We do not doubt that in the name of these magnificent slogans, under the banner of the Fatherland, we will all gather and create in Canada a strong and vibrant working front for the good of Poland, for Podhale and for the improvement of our existence through the association and collaboration of working arm in arm.¹⁰³

By replicating organizations in Poland, their Polish-Canadian counterparts further reinforced the need for maintaining ties with the homeland; ensuring the welfare of the Second Republic; and recognizing the political ideology of Piłsudski, where Pole and Catholic were further bound to each other. The Związek Podhalań perceived its emphasis on regional identity (i.e., Highlander) as complimentary to a Polish nationalist identity, and not one that would subvert it. Both organizations joined the ZZPWK in 1934 because it had a similar cultural-political stance.

⁹⁹ AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.10, Report from Pawlica, 23 October 1933.

¹⁰⁰ LAC, Polish Alliance Friendly Society of Canada, MG 28 v55 vol.11, Polish Highlanders Alliance of Canada File, Program III-go Walnego Zjazdu Podhalań w Kanadzie, 6-8 August 1936.

¹⁰¹ AAN, Akta Janiny i Kazimierza Warchałowskich, sign.244, Roman Mazurkiewicz, *Polskie wychodźstwo i osadnictwo w kanadzie* (Warszawa: MSZ, no date), 79.

¹⁰² A mountainous region in southern Poland, also known as the Polish Highlands.

¹⁰³ AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.5, Announcement sent by mail from the Organizational Committee of the Canadian Fire Association of Polish Highlanders.

Again, it is important to emphasize that in the interwar years, the lines between the religious and the secular within the Polish community were blurred. Secular organizations became involved with the religious life of the community. Groups such as Ulga Stowarzyszenie Zajemnej Pomocy (Relief Mutual Benefit Association) and Ognisko Związku Podhalań w Kanadzie, united with parish-based associations, such as the Ladies' Rosary Society of St. Stanislaus parish, to petition the Archdiocese for new Polish priests or to remove unsatisfactory clergy.¹⁰⁴ Religious organizations joined secular organizations, such as the Towarzystwo Polsko Katolickie Wzajemnej Pomocy (Polish Catholic Association of Mutual Help) of Timmins, Ontario under Rev. F. Sawiński, who inquired about joining the ZPwK.¹⁰⁵ Organizations, therefore, became voices for the average person. Moreover, as formal entities, their appeals held greater weight when dealing with Canadian authorities.

Women's organizations had a particular role to play in preserving Polishness. The ZZPwK saw the creation of such organizations or branches as imperative to safeguard youth from assimilation. Women had a special role as agents of culture, education and philanthropy. This idea was linked to Polish history. At a convention for Związek Polek in Winnipeg (Associations of Polish Women) in the mid-1930s, Jan Pawlica emphasized "prominent female activists within Polish history, within the Legions, in defending Lwów and during the Polish-Bolshevik War of 1918-1920, underscoring in particular . . . Aleksandra Piłsudska, [for her role] in women's organizational life in the independence movement and within reborn Poland."¹⁰⁶ According to Pawlica, having the Związek Polek join the ZZPwK would help to consolidate and centralize women within the community and bolster their effectiveness as preservers of national-religious identity. ZPwK, however, had great difficulty in incorporating women into its ranks; of 634 applicants only 135 were women, despite the number of female immigrants nearly doubling between 1932 and 1938.¹⁰⁷ It is difficult to determine female membership to the ZZPwK due to a lack of sources. However, a visibly

¹⁰⁴ ARCAT, St. Stanislaus Kostka Parish, MN DS 36.39 (a), Letter to the Apostolic Delegation of Canada and Newfoundland, Archbishop Andrea Cassulo, 27 December 1934.

¹⁰⁵ LAC, Polish Alliance Friendly Society of Canada, MG 28 v55 vol.11, White Eagle Society Timmins 1931 File, Rev. F. Sawiński to the ZPwK, 12 February 1931.

¹⁰⁶ AAN, Ambasada RP w Londynie, sign.898, s.166, Letter from Jan Pawlica, 11 February 1935.

¹⁰⁷ Between 1926 and 1931, 34.5% of Polish immigrants were women. This number rose to 61.1% between 1932 and 1936 and to 58.8% from 1937 to 1938. Despite a significant increase in their number between 1926 and 1938, women comprised only 36.9% of the total migration. Anna Reczyńska, *For Bread and a Better Future: Emigration from Poland to Canada 1918-1939* (North York: Multicultural History Society of Ontario, 1996), 60.

stronger emphasis on women's participation by the consuls probably translated into increased membership.

The fragmentation of the Polish community through the establishment of three federations was exacerbated by the persistence of numerous independent organizations, which opted not to join the larger institutions. Smaller groups joined a federation, for the most part, because of a similarity in ideological attitudes, coupled by increased financial security and support. When the three nation-wide federations emerged, joining one of them was not a controversial issue, as distinct ideologies did not necessarily clash. In the early years, Catholic organizations joined any one of the three Federations. However, problems arose when attitudes towards religion and national identity began to change.

The 1920s and the 1930s witnessed the rise of Polish organizational life. Beyond the small regional organizations and associations, the call for consolidating and strengthening Polish culture and language through the institutionalization of these characteristics of Polishness denoted hope of preservation. Even with a shift away from religious and church-based organizations to "secular" ones, the question of defining Polishness and its relationship to Catholicism remained at the heart of Polish identity. The SPwK emphasized faith and fatherland as the foundation of Polish identity and patriotism; the ZZPwK saw religion as a means of achieving legitimacy and authority among immigrants. The support from Polish clergy meant a validation of their ideological stance: Poles were to preserve their Polishness (including their Catholicism) and remain loyal to the Polish state. The ZPwK, on the other hand, saw the triangulation of Polishness, Catholicism and Polish statehood as an inappropriate manifestation of nationalism. Instead, it defined Polishness as existing separately from a relationship with the Polish state. Hence their anti-Piłsudski and anti-Polish stance went hand in hand with anti-clericalism. The struggle between these two identities became a serious point of contention among Polish Canadians until the start of the Second World War. The war and especially the post-war settlements required a complete restructuring of the immigrant community's organizational life and a redefinition of Polishness.

HISTORICAL NOTES

A Nineteenth Century Montreal *Collège Classique*: Antiquarian Survival or Education for the Future?¹

Ollivier HUBERT

This article proposes some revisions to aspects of the history of secondary education in Quebec, and in particular of *collèges classiques* (classical colleges). The prevalent historical interpretation argues that the clerical secondary schools in Quebec considerably slowed the emergence of a modern, state-run secondary school system.² But a “secondary” state system

¹ The author thanks the Fonds de recherche sur la société et la culture and the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council for their support. He thanks Thomas Wien, Caroline McKinnon, Jean-Phillippe Warren, Michael Gauvreau and Maxime Raymond-Dufour, the priests of Saint-Sulpice and their archivists’ team: Caroline, David and Marc Lacasse. Thank you finally to the editors and the anonymous assessors for their suggestions.

² This view is put forward in Claude Galarneau’s *Les collèges classiques au Canada français* (Montréal, Fides, 1978) most notably in its conclusion. Other works sharing this view: Marcel Fournier, *L’entrée dans la modernité. Science, culture et société au Québec* (Montréal: Les Éditions coopératives Albert-Saint-Martin, 1986), 106-109; Yves Gingras, *Pour l’avancement des sciences. Histoire de l’ACFAS, 1923-1993* (Montréal: Boréal, 1994); Jacques-Guy Petit, « Darwinisme et catholicisme au Québec au début du XXe siècle: autour du Dr Albert Laurendeau, » *Revue d’histoire de l’Amérique française*, 61 (2007): 201-233; Louise Bienvenue, « Académie commerciale ou collège classique? L’enseignement secondaire des garçons dans un débat des années 1920, » *Historical Studies in Education Journal/Revue d’histoire de l’éducation*, 21 (Spring 2009): 4-23. On the critique of Quebec’s *collèges classiques* by francophone business circles, see Fernande Roy, *Progrès, harmonie, liberté. Le libéralisme des milieux d’affaires francophones à Montréal au tournant du siècle* (Montréal: Boréal, 1988), 251-255; Johanne Rochette, « Les débats sur l’enseignement des sciences dans les collèges classiques au Québec, 1929-1953, » (M.A. thesis (History), Université de Montréal, 1991). In the 1960s, the Parent commission pointed out the non-democratic appearance of college enrolment numbers — a “thin layer of the population, generally privileged from all points of view” — as one of the main problems that justified a reform of the education system (*Rapport*

did exist before the middle of the twentieth century,³ and clerical colleges can be best understood as being part of a system of classical education based on social class.⁴ Catholic colleges were not so much Catholic as they were private. They represented an important tool in the hands of the elite, which helped perpetuate its dominant position in society. This article presents arguments that may lead to a reinterpretation of Quebec colleges in sociological terms, more as producers of a distinctive male middle class Catholic habitus, and less as producers of an already abundant clergy.

The history of *collèges classiques* may reveal more about the evolution and strategies of Quebec's middle classes than about the dark influence of the Catholic Church over its people. Although generalizations based on an in-depth examination of only one college and superficial studies of others cannot be considered conclusive, a study of the Collège de Montréal raises questions about the credibility of past interpretations based on a traditional approach by historians who have been overly influenced by the image that colleges projected of themselves rather than by investigations of the actual experiences of the schoolboys. There is somewhat of a paradox in publishing this article in a Catholic historical review, as its core argument rests on the conviction that historians have attached too much importance to religion in the general interpretation of what is known in Quebec as *collèges classiques*. Downplaying the fundamentally religious nature of Catholic colleges shows that the education they gave to their students was linked less to the Church

de la Commission royale d'enquête sur l'enseignement dans la province de Québec, 2, 1964, chapter 1).

³ Georges Croteau, *Les frères éducateurs, 1920-1965. Promotions des études supérieures. Modernisation de l'enseignement public* (Montréal : Hurtubise HMH, 1996) and Paul-André Turcotte, *L'enseignement secondaire public des frères éducateurs (1920-1970): utopie et modernité* (Montréal : Bellarmin, 1988). To follow the chronology of the creation of this complex system, see Jean-Pierre Charland, *L'entreprise éducative au Québec* (Sainte-Foy : Les Presses de l'Université Laval, 2000), 239-264; Robert Gagnon, *Histoire de l'École Polytechnique de Montréal* (Montréal: Boréal, 1991), and *Histoire de la Commission des écoles catholiques de Montréal* (Montréal : Boréal, 1996).

⁴ For an international perspective on the link between social class and "secondary" education: Fritz Ringer, *Education and Society in Modern Europe* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1979); Roger L. Geiger, (ed.) *The American College in the 19th Century* (Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press, 2000); Robert Gildea, "Education and the Classes Moyennes in the Nineteenth Century," in Donald N. Baker and Patrick J. Harrigan, (eds.) *The Making of Frenchmen: Current Directions in the History of Education in France (1679-1979)* (Waterloo: Historical Reflections Press, 1980), 275-299; Fritz Ringer, « La segmentation des systèmes d'enseignement. Les réformes de l'enseignement secondaire français et prussien, 1865-1920, » *Actes de la recherche en sciences sociales*, 149, 4 (septembre 2003), 6-20; Pierre Bourdieu and Jean-Claude Passeron, *Les héritiers* (Paris : Éditions de Minuit, 1964); Antoine Prost, *Histoire de l'enseignement en France, 1800-1967* (Paris: Armand Colin, 1968); Alain Plessis, « Une France bourgeoise » in *Histoire de la France, Les formes de la culture* (Paris : Seuil, 1993), 272-278.

as an institution, and more to the Catholic religion as a culture that helped shape modern citizens in North America.

As in other histories of secondary education, the main sources of information have been published by the institutions themselves. These studies are often very well researched, full of precise and accurate information. From a narrative point of view, they are both a memoir (addressed to alumni) and an advertising discourse addressed to the parents of students. At times, these publications may also have tried to please teachers, former principals, and employees.⁵ While they are useful, it is striking how historians of education have relied so heavily on them. Several problems arise from a naïve use of them. They were produced within a specific context (for example, a commemoration or an advertising campaign) and at a particular moment in the history of each college. A critical look at them reveals both an outline of some of the major trends - and for an historian, traps - within them.

First, they are teleological. They always justify the present and try to find the origins of the trends that define the college at the time of publication. For example, a book published at the end of the nineteenth century might present the college primarily as a boarding school from its beginnings. Similarly, a study from the mid-twentieth century may attempt to demonstrate a very long history of teaching science.⁶ Such an approach tends to overlook important features of the past that seemed irrelevant at the time of publication.

Secondly, these stories tend to over-represent the leaders of the school such as priest-teachers, and particularly headmasters. Moreover, they are written for, or from, a very specific perspective - that of the alumni. And who is an alumnus? Usually, he is someone who completed the entire eight-year curriculum. The history thus becomes a version of the college's past, written by and about the winners in order to project the idea that a particular college can also transform the reader's son into a winner. The problem is that the great majority of students did not complete the entire eight-year program, sometimes because parents could not afford it, sometimes because of a lack of talent, but very often because students neither needed nor intended to spend so many years at school.⁷

⁵ A good and recent example of this is Jean Panneton, *Le Séminaire Saint-Joseph de Trois-Rivières, 1860-2010* (Québec: Septentrion, 2010).

⁶ For example, the first edition of the history of the Collège de Montréal (1918) makes very little reference to sciences, whereas the 1967 edition values them: Olivier Maurault, *Le Petit Séminaire de Montréal* (Montréal: L.-J.-A. Derome, 1918) et Olivier Maurault, *Le Collège de Montréal, 1767-1967*, édition révisée et mise à jour par Antonio Dansereau, s.l., s.é., 1967.

⁷ Ollivier Hubert, «De la diversité des parcours et des formations dans les collèges du Bas-Canada : le cas de Montréal (1789-1860)», *Historical Studies in Education/Revue d'histoire de l'éducation* 21, no. 1 (Spring 2009): 41-65.

Finally, the last trope of institutional historiography is its insistence on the specific to construct a more favourable image of the college as it competed for students. It is very much about distinction, in both meanings of the word. Consequently, such studies do not allow a full understanding of the history of secondary education in Quebec including its curricula, programmes, and methods of instruction or in the demography and social history of its students. In sum, these books are of limited help to an historian, unless the subject is a history of *collège classique* commemorative books.

In 1976, Quebec historian Claude Galarneau wrote a synthesis on *collèges classiques* based mainly on such works, though he also drew insights from archival research on the social origin of the students and the curricula.⁸ Galarneau's book, published over thirty years ago, remains the only academic study on the subject. It is a very useful overview of the subject but falls into the previously outlined trap. First, it focuses its attention on schoolboys who became *finissants* (graduates). In fact, a large majority of collegians never completed the eight-year program, and in the nineteenth century only ten percent of the pupils did so.⁹ Considering only those who completed the eight-year program overvalues the experience of alumni, and builds the representation of the *collège classique* as a device for producing Catholic priests (nearly half of the *finissants* chose the priesthood) and lay economic, intellectual and political elites of Quebec society. Moreover, this representation of the *collège classique* as an ideal place to build the future of a modern and stable French Catholic nation by educating future lay and religious elites together thereby learning to respect each other is precisely what was at the heart of the colleges' propaganda.¹⁰ Secondly, the Galarneau synthesis presents a portrait of the education, instruction and discipline, daily life, behavioural control, and subject matter that gives too much importance to classical culture, Greek and Latin, and religion. Those aspects were important, but mainly concerned the fewer than five per cent of boys who were boarders and who stayed more than the one to three years that most students attended. Thirdly, because he connects historical and factual information about the origins of each college with knowledge that comes from memories of alumni, Galarneau presents the *collège classique* mainly as an ahistorical institution.

⁸ Galarneau, *Les collèges classiques*.

⁹ Hubert, «De la diversité des parcours et des formations dans les collèges du Bas-Canada», 41-65.

¹⁰ For example, during a Collège de Montréal Conventum in 1885, the speeches and all the ceremonies reiterated the theme of the union of elites through a common education. A complete report of this large-scale event was published in the conservative newspaper *Le Monde*, from September 8th to September 12th, 1885.

According to Galarneau, *collèges classiques* were traditional and fearful of innovation. They were created as minor seminaries in the French regime and remained as such into the twentieth century, giving an old fashioned and irrelevant education to the leaders of pre-Quiet Revolution Québec. It should be emphasized that Galarneau wrote his book just after a major reform of secondary education in Quebec altered the curriculum to make more room for sciences and English training.¹¹ Obviously, he wanted to hasten the end of the Church's control over secondary education in the dark ages of Quebec education.

What is now needed is careful, time-consuming, socio-historical research in the wonderful archives and primary sources that have been preserved to tell another story of the *collèges classiques*. A brief overview of the main results of preliminary research dramatically changes the representation of the colleges as religious, traditionalist and elitist institutions. Instead, they appear as spaces characterised by mobility and plurality.

This overview is based primarily on the case of a single institution, the Collège de Montréal, run by the French community of Saint-Sulpice. A careful study of the boys who actually attended reveals quite a different picture than the traditional studies that focused on the *finissants*. Rather than following only the graduates, as one is naturally encouraged to do with archives that deal mainly with end-of-year prizes and the sources produced by alumni, this study uses registration records.¹² These records allow a revision of the general understanding of the *collèges classiques* as traditional and clerical but show that the college was constantly evolving to adapt to the times.

Until the 1840s, the Collège de Montréal was primarily a day school serving mainly students from Montreal. An increased proportion of boarders both from outside Montreal reflects a shift in the type of education offered by the college: a tendency to cater to a growing French Canadian upper middle class who saw the boarding school system as a device to protect its adolescents from the bad influences of lower middle class youth that they might meet in the newly created modern secondary schools for boys.

What is striking about the student body in the first half of the nineteenth century is that it was neither exclusively French Canadian nor Catholic. The

¹¹ *Rapport de la Commission royale d'enquête sur l'enseignement dans la province de Québec, 2, Les structures pédagogiques du système scolaire, A, Les structures et les niveaux de l'enseignement* (Québec : Gouvernement du Québec, 1964).

¹² It was thought that these records had been lost but they are preserved in the archives of the Sulpician Fathers of Montreal.

names of approximately a quarter of the students indicate British origins.¹³ Letters from Anglo-Protestant parents seeking reasonable accommodations demonstrate that a number of boys were not Catholic. This represents another breach in the image of the *collège classique* as a backward, mono-ethnic school closed to the growing diversity of Quebec society.

The most important discovery of this research is the great difference between the colleges in the nineteenth century and what they became in the twentieth. In the nineteenth century, they had not one, but three, or even four, programs. The *école anglaise* taught English language and practical knowledge - especially arithmetic and accounting - to Anglophone and French Canadian pupils alike, aged between six and fifteen years. This program was the most popular one at the beginning of the nineteenth century. Another program, the *école française*, taught the same subjects as the *école anglaise*, but in French. The pupils were aged between five and seventeen years, and were, once again, both English- and French-speaking. Except for a minority of students these programs were not preparatory training for the main program, the *école latine*, the ancestor of the Classical course. Nor were the *école française* and the *école anglaise* elementary schools. Since a free elementary school was located just across the street from the college, it can be concluded that the families of storekeepers and craftsmen who wanted their children to be bilingual and know the basic principles of accounting used the *école française* and *école anglaise*. They were the precursors of the commercial courses that developed in the second half of the 19th century.

Within the classical or Latin school, only a small minority of boys completed the entire eight-year program. Indeed, in the middle of the nineteenth century, about sixty percent of the boys, aged between eleven and fifteen years, registered in the college completed only the first two years of the course.¹⁴ A few stayed for another two years. The final years of the curriculum, which covered rhetoric and philosophy, and that attracted so much attention in the usual historiographical narrative of the *collège classique*, were tiny clubs reserved almost exclusively for those who were destined for the priesthood, and by the end of the century, for the liberal professions.¹⁵

During the second half of the nineteenth century, the *collèges classiques* abandoned the teaching of practical knowledge and skills and created new entities called *collèges commerciaux*. Until the middle of the twentieth

¹³ Archives des prêtres de Saint-Sulpice à Montréal, fonds "Collège de Montréal," Boxes I2: 8 to 12.

¹⁴ Calculations made from the pupils' registers of accounts and books of registration preserved by the Archives des prêtres de Saint-Sulpice de Montréal, fonds "Collège de Montréal," Boxes I2: 8 to 12).

¹⁵ In 1890, the Hall Bill made the *baccalauréat dès arts* into a diploma necessary (in theory) to enter university programs and the liberal professions.

century, however, in small towns classical and commercial courses were found in the same establishments, sometimes segregated, sometimes integrated. In every case, the colleges downplayed the commercial course and highlighted the prestigious classical course as required, by the use of the name *collège classique* to describe the establishment in general. One can assume that the vast majority of boys who obtained secondary education attended these institutions. Still, very little research has been conducted on these establishments. The division between the practical and classical curriculum is a fascinating subject and is linked to the creation of a true French Canadian bourgeoisie. Still, one must remain cautious about the myth of the historic *collège classique*. One might say that they were not as classical as previously believed, even after the split into the lower middle class *collèges commerciaux* and the primarily upper middle class *collèges classiques*.

Preliminary as they may be, these results (which follow the population of a single college over less than a century) do allow for a reconsideration of the *collèges classiques* in several ways. First, the *collèges* changed significantly over time. The notion that draws a simple line from the Jesuits' college in New France to the *collèges classiques* that were contested during the Quiet Revolution in the mid-twentieth century must be abandoned. *Collèges classiques* adapted to the evolving demands of a clientele shaped by the diverse elements of the middle classes. In any case, they never corresponded to the model of the minor seminary. Upon arriving in Lower Canada, French Sulpicians were shocked to discover what they referred to as the "profane nature" of the Collège de Montréal. Yet this was the very institution that later earned the reputation of having been among the colony's most clerical and orthodox colleges. The evidence, however, suggests that most students at the Collège de Montréal studied practical subjects rather than classical ones. Few boys ever learned even the basics of Latin.

These conclusions point in one direction: *collèges classiques*, at least the Collège de Montréal, were less classical (and less religious) than historiography has presented them. Although Quebec's Roman Catholic Church used them to fill and eventually to crowd the ranks of the clergy, that was not the *collèges'* main concern. As studies of some other colleges also demonstrate, the main purpose of these institutions was to offer an educational service desired by the middle class (and even in some cases the working class) of Quebec's small towns.¹⁶ Religion was indeed important

¹⁶ Research done thus far provides a very impressionistic view of the social composition of colleges. Much remains to be done in this domain. See Félix Bouvier, *Histoire du Séminaire de Mont-Laurier. Formation d'une élite et d'une classe moyenne* (Montréal: Fides, 2005); Ulric Lévesques, "Les élèves du collège de Sainte-Anne-de-la-Pocatière, 1829-1842," *Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française*, 21, no. 4 (mars

in the *collège classique*, especially through the strong liturgical framework that punctuated everyday life. Other than this division of time, which was typically Catholic in its form, but otherwise common to every Western school system of the time, *collèges classiques* do not appear particularly exceptional. They look like Catholic colleges that existed elsewhere at the time¹⁷ and, on a more general level, although a comparative study of the international historiography remains to be made before being able to assert it, one could also say that they were very similar to many of the middle-class Protestant or state secondary schools in the Atlantic world and beyond. Much research still must be done, and will probably reveal more of Quebec's *collèges classiques*' particular traits. However, the work can only be completed after a preliminary recognition that Quebec, in this aspect as in many others, is less exceptional than is often thought: it is indeed an old, and modern, American society.

1968): 774-791; Jean-Paul Simard et Bérard Riverin, "Origine géographique et sociale des étudiants du Petit Séminaire de Chicoutimi et leur orientation socioprofessionnelle : 1873-1930," *Sessions d'étude, Société canadienne d'histoire de l'Église catholique*, 40 (1973): 33-53; Claude Lessard, "Les élèves des séminaires de Nicolet et de Trois-Rivières : leur origine géographique, leur persévérance," *Revue d'ethnologie du Québec*, 2 (1975): 57-76; Claude Lessard, "Les élèves des séminaires de Nicolet : leur origine sociale, leur persévérance 1803-1969," *Revue d'ethnologie du Québec*, 3 (1976): 29-50; Claude Lessard, "L'origine sociale des élèves du séminaire de Trois-Rivières (1860-1976)," *Revue d'ethnologie du Québec*, 10 (1979), 57-70. The lack of research is even more striking for the girls' secondary school system. See for example Micheline Dumont and Nadia Fahmy-Eid, *Les couventines. L'Éducation des filles au Québec dans les congrégations religieuses enseignantes. 1840-1960* (Montréal: Boréal, 1986).

¹⁷ See, for example, Sarah A. Curtis, *Educating the Faithful: Religion, Schooling, and Society in Nineteenth-Century France* (DeKalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 2000).

Some Thoughts on Catholicism and the Secularization Question in Quebec: Worldly and Otherworldly Rewards (1960-1970)¹

Jean-Philippe WARREN

Quebec society has repeatedly been described as unique in its radical emancipation from religious institutions in the wake of the Quiet Revolution (1960-1970), a period during which the province underwent major social, economic, and educational reforms. Although Roman Catholic activities also declined rapidly in the United States, France, Germany, Spain, and Ireland,² Quebec offers a particularly interesting opportunity to reflect on the question of institutional secularization because of the previously close connection between the Church and the provision of social services, including most notably education and health care.³ Notwithstanding the question of Quebecers' sustained spiritual beliefs (which are not addressed in this paper), how can historians account for the spectacular marginalization of the Roman Catholic Church during the Quiet Revolution? What contributed

¹ I would like to thank the editors as well as the three anonymous reviewers of *Historical Studies* for their thorough and insightful comments.

² In 1965, 181,421 nuns lived in the United-States; in 1970, 153,645. Thirty-five years later in 1995, there were a mere 92,107. Over the same thirty years the number of nuns in other Western countries also shrank dramatically: 44 per cent in France; 48 per cent in Germany and 51 per cent in the Netherlands (Rodney Stark and Roger Finke, "Catholic Religious Vocations: Decline and Revival," *Review of Religious Research*, 42, no. 2 (2000): 125-126). In Quebec, the diminution was of the same magnitude (42.7 per cent), going from 32,418 nuns in 1961 to a mere 18,580 in 1996 (Bernard Denault and Benoît Lévesque, *Éléments pour une sociologie des communautés religieuses au Québec* (Sherbrooke and Montréal : Les Presses de l'Université de Montréal et de l'Université de Sherbrooke, 1975); *Annuaire de l'Église catholique au Canada*). For England, see Callum G. Brown, *The Death of Christian Britain: Understanding Secularization (1800-2000)* (London: Routledge, 2001).

³ For the most recent scholarly discussion on the subject see: E.-Martin Meunier and Sarah Wilkins-Laflamme, "Sécularisation, catholicisme et transformations du régime de religiosité au Québec. Étude comparative avec le catholicisme au Canada (1968-2007)," *Recherches sociographiques*, 52, no. 3 (2011): 683-730.

to the sudden faltering of institutionalized Catholicism after more than a century of growth and consolidation?

Building on the existing literature this paper hypothesises that an increase of worldly rewards and a decrease of otherworldly rewards fuelled the decline of the Church.⁴ It argues that an individual will more likely turn to a career with the Church if it provides clear social or cultural advantages over those presented by the larger society, specifically the state and consumer society. In the 1960s it was difficult for Quebecers to find in the Church an inspiring or engaging place because of a decline in Roman Catholic incentives, the persistence of old conservative institutional practices in an age of profound cultural and social changes, and a spectacular rise in secular opportunities in a rising consumer society, itself the product of the general elevation of the standard of living. Not only did that erode the bases of the traditional moral of sacrifice and penitence, which had attracted men and women to the religious life, but at the same time the *aggiornamento* trumpeted by Vatican Council II (1962-1965)⁵ reduced the sacred religious gratifications that maintained a sense of purpose, cohesiveness and moral superiority among religious communities and the clergy. The cost associated with leading a religious life suddenly outweighed the rewards.

A first explanation of the sudden decline in religious vocations in the mid-1960s would suggest that it was the result of improved economic conditions, which created more opportunities for employment. Historically, there is evidence that the religious life was attractive in hard economic times. The most fruitful years of recruitment for the female religious orders were from 1930-1934 when the economic crisis pushed many women to seek the material security that a religious life seemingly provided.⁶ A decline in the number of sisters in the generally prosperous times between 1945 and 1965

⁴ This hypothesis should not be confused with the interpretation of the “supply-side” theory which asserts that, given the universality of death and suffering, human beings will always need religion and that the strength or weakness of churches results from their capacity to respond efficiently to this spiritual demand. “Supply-side” theorists posit that the decline of the church’s monopoly fostered greater competition among denominations and faiths, which in turn contributed to enhance the dynamism of the market of spiritual goods. This view links Quebec’s religious decline to a problem of meaningful supply, not demand. Reginald Bibby, “La religion à la carte au Québec : un problème d’offre, de demande, ou les deux?” *Globe*, 10, no 2 (2007-2008): 151-179.

⁵ Helen Rose, Jon Lorence, and Janet Saltzman Chafetz, “The Growth and Decline of the Population of Catholic Nuns Cross-Nationally, 1960-1990: A Case of Secularization as Social Structural Change,” *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 35, no. 2 (1996): 171-183; Stark and Finke, “Catholic Religious Vocations,” 125-145.

⁶ Marc A. Lessard and Jean-Paul Montmigny, “The Census of Religious Sisters of Canada,” in *Universal Call to Holiness and Religious Vocations* (Ottawa: Canadian Religious Conference, 1966), 316.

from 99.6 to 80.0 per 10,000 Catholics suggests that the economic climate accounts for some of the lows and highs of religious vitality.

The attractiveness of the Church was also conditioned by its domination over a more rural, traditional French Canadian society, a fact that is illustrated by analyzing the composition of female religious orders. Throughout the first part of the twentieth century (1900-1970), more than 80 per cent of Quebec sisters originated from large families (six children or more) and half of them grew up in families with more than eleven children. They belonged to the social classes' lower strata, with only a few recruited from the bourgeoisie and the professional sectors. As shown in Table 1, half of them were the daughters of farmers even though the percentage of farmers in the population was declining. "The cradle of a religious vocation is therefore Quebec's countryside: these thousands of tiny villages erected around the church and the convent."⁷ Close to 70 per cent of sisters who entered a religious community in the sixties and seventies had grown up in a village of 5,000 inhabitants or less. In short, the female religious recruits were likely to belong to a poor, rural, culturally homogeneous, agricultural milieu. A religious vocation could offer the promise of a decent job and an escape from the farm.

Table 1

Percentage of Sisters' Fathers Who Were Farmers (A) Compared to Percentage of Farmers in the Total Active Male Labour Population in Quebec (B)

	1931		1951		1961		1971	
	A	B	A	B	A	B	A	B
Farmers(%)	52.2	21.4	45.6	17.1	33.7	11.5	40.2	5.6

Source: Bernard Denault and Benoît Lévesque, *Éléments pour une sociologie des communautés religieuses au Québec*: 453.

Through a series of institutions that performed secular functions but had a religious identity, the French Canadian ecclesiastical hierarchy had organized the life of the province – and beyond - along denominational lines in the first half of the twentieth century. The Church controlled or oversaw the management of schools, hospitals, charitable organizations, newspapers, trade unions, youth associations, social clubs, among others. In this context, men who became priests did not necessarily do so for purely spiritual motives. Many sought a prestigious position within the Church's web of

⁷ Nicole Laurin, Danielle Juteau and Lorraine Duchesne, *À la recherche d'un monde oublié. Les communautés religieuses de femmes au Québec de 1900 à 1970* (Montréal: Éditions Le Jour, 1991), 342.

activities. Canon Lionel Groulx, for instance, embraced a religious vocation because he wanted to be a teacher, a profession almost closed to laymen.⁸ According to Colette Moreux, a sociologist who interviewed a great number of French Canadian female Catholics in the sixties, parents had profane reasons for being pleased when one of their sons entered priesthood. Being a priest would give their son an enviable position and long-term financial security; in short, he would obtain a good job. “Never,” concluded Moreux, “do we think of the priest as an individual marked by a divine seal. He does not differ from his fellow men by his nature, but only by his functions.”⁹

Traditionally, the secular role of the church was so prominent that historians and sociologists have described French Canada as a “nation-church” rather than a nation-state.¹⁰ The French Canadian nation’s embeddedness in the Church’s fold was conditioned by the various services provided by the clergy and the religious institutes. If one can talk of a “nation-church” to describe French Canada, the Church was itself an “ethnic religion.” The symbols, narratives, rites and celebrations of the French Canadian nation were regularly borrowed from the Church’s repertoire, including the patron of French Canada (John the Baptist) and the messianic mission – the *Manifest Destiny* – of French Canadians in America. Historically, the French Canadian national identity and the Catholic faith overlapped in what Meunier and Wilkins-Laflamme call a “cultural religion.”¹¹ Educated, well-fed, enjoying a high level of power and prestige, the French-Canadian priest was a man of considerable importance in the village. “Priests,” commented one sociologist, “benefit from uncontested and supreme prestige. ... Their authority in the spiritual domain extends in the concrete and strictly human domain of business where society awards them as much importance and responsibility as in the domain of spiritual affairs.”¹²

⁸ Gisèle Huot, “Études critiques de Groulx,” *Revue d’histoire de l’Amérique française*, 37, no. 4 (1984): 676.

⁹ Colette Moreux, *La fin d’une religion? Monographie d’une paroisse canadienne-française* (Montréal: Les Presses de l’Université de Montréal, 1969), 331.

¹⁰ Roberto Perin, “Elaborating a Public Culture: The Catholic Church in Nineteenth-Century Quebec,” in Marguerite Van Die, (ed.) *Religion and Public Life in Canada: Historical and Comparative Perspectives* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2001), 87-105; Jean Philippe Warren, “L’invention du Canada français: le rôle de l’Église catholique,” in Martin Pâquet and Stéphane Savard, (eds.) *Balises et références. Acadies, francophonies* (Québec: Presses de l’Université Laval, 2007), 21-56; Sylvie Lacombe, “French Canada: The Rise and Decline of a ‘Church-Nation,’” *Quebec Studies*, 48, (Fall 2010): 135-158.

¹¹ Meunier and Wilkins-Laflamme, “Sécularisation, catholicisme et transformations du régime de religiosité au Québec.”

¹² Jean-Charles Falardeau, “Stratifications sociales de notre milieu,” *Mémoires de la Société Royale du Canada*, 1st section, Third Series, 39, (May 1945): 69.

In the immediate aftermath of the Second World War, increased provincially-supported social services widened the scope of the clergy. The Quebec government found it more convenient - and less costly - to delegate the administration of civil society to clerical institutions.¹³ The Church, therefore, was doing many of the things that modern governments do, from curing the sick to caring for the poor, a situation that dragged the Church away from its core evangelical objective. The extent of the Church's involvement in social services is illustrated by the fact that of the over 65,000 members of female religious institutes in 1965, only 6.8% were engaged in missionary or contemplative works; the remainder were employed in education, health, or social welfare. (See Table 2) The situation was even more pronounced for male Catholic congregations: only two per cent were involved in contemplative activities.

Table 2¹⁴

Distribution of Female Institutes According to their Principal Function in 1965

	No. of Institutes	%	No. of Sisters	%
Contemplation	18	10.2	1,897	2.9
Mission	8	4.3	2,566	3.9
Health care (only)	13	7.1	3,836	5.9
Education (only)	80	43.6	30,855	47.2
Education and Health care	33	18.0	22,301	34.2
Social Work	16	8.7	969	1.5
Domestic Help	15	8.1	2,824	4.3
Total	183	100	65,248	100

In the sixties, the rise of the welfare state in Quebec reshaped the bonds between the Church and the French Canadian nation.¹⁵ Increasingly

¹³ Gilles Bourque and Jules Duchastel, *Restons traditionnels et progressistes. Pour une nouvelle analyse du discours politique. Le cas du régime Duplessis au Québec* (Montréal : Boréal, 1989).

¹⁴ Marc A. Lessard and Jean-Paul Montmigny, "The Census of Religious Sisters of Canada," 295-296.

¹⁵ Nicole Laurin, "Le projet nationaliste gestionnaire. De l'hôpital des religieuses au système hospitalier de l'État," in Michael Elbaz, Andrée Fortin and Guy Laforest, (eds.) *Les Frontières de l'identité* (Paris : L'Harmattan, 1996), 95-104; Nicole Laurin and Danielle Juteau, "La sécularisation et l'étatisation du secteur hospitalier au Québec de 1960 à 1966," in Robert Comeau, (ed.) *Jean Lesage et l'éveil d'une nation* (Montréal : Les Presses de l'Université du Québec, 1989), 155-167; Nicole Laurin and Louis Rousseau,

operating on strictly secular terms, Quebec Catholic intellectuals jumped on the bandwagon of Keynesianism and state intervention. When the provincial government took over the educational and health care sectors that the Church had hitherto administered, the social shift ignited a radical redefinition of the Church's place in society. By separating the religious and secular spheres and by isolating the clergy within the limited boundaries of the parish and the church, the Church lost much of its prestige. University-trained psychologists, social workers and medical doctors presented science as a panacea to society's ills. Those who wanted to devote their life to the well-being of their fellow citizens found opportunities in the provincial bureaucracies and social institutions that rapidly expanded in every direction. As a result, the number of sisters, brothers and priests dropped precipitously.

Table 3

Ratio of the Total Quebec Population over 15 years-old to Religious Personnel¹⁶

Year	Ratio Cath. Pop. / Total Priests	Ratio Cath. Pop. / Sisters	Ratio Cath. Pop. / Brothers	Ratio Cath. Pop. / Religious Personnel
1901	437	122	602	80
1910	500	96	428	66
1921	478	92	419	63
1931	450	69	361	49
1943	456	70	308	48
1951	452	72	370	50
1961	457	78	398	53
1971	674	123	735	85
1983	1054	174	1595	126
1991	1215	216	1738	153
2001	1738	317	2525	222

Not surprisingly, the communities most affected were those devoted to teaching, health care and social service, while those devoted to missionary

¹⁶ "Les centres de la régulation : Essai sur les rapports entre l'Église et l'État dans l'histoire québécoise," *Studies in Religion/Sciences religieuses*, 12, no. 3 (1983): 247-272.

¹⁶ 1901 to 1971, Canada ecclésiastique. 1983 to 2006, *Annuaire de l'Église catholique au Canada*, Montréal, Publicité B.M. Advertising Inc.

work and contemplation fared better.¹⁷ Sisters and brothers who had acquired a university degree were more likely to leave their community not only because they had mingled with secular society and had been exposed to new streams of thought, but also, as many admitted, they could more easily enter a dynamic secular job market and earn a decent living. “Many sisters who had a profession, teachers and nurses, all those who had a demanding job... came to ask themselves: what do I do more as a religious person?”¹⁸ In a phenomenon that also occurred elsewhere, the passage from a religious vocation to a secular - if not governmental - career seemed all too natural.¹⁹

Entering a religious institute or priesthood was never only a job-seeking decision. Before committing themselves to a “life of sacrifices,” prospects always weighed out the future they would enjoy. In the 1960s most of the Catholic intelligentsia still promoted the values of poverty and abnegation even though the mass media was promoting an ethos of personal well-being, material comfort, therapeutic values, and individualism. Many critics believe that the Church did not respond swiftly enough to these changes and allowed the gap between the religious institutions and secular culture to widen.²⁰ In many domains the Church’s teachings and practices appeared antithetical to the aspirations of the baby-boom generations, including, of course, sexuality and gender.²¹ The Church promoted abstinence and patriarchy in a society accepting of free love, divorce, abortion and feminism. In addition, there were divisions of opinion on education and politics.²² The result was a rejection not of religion—which remained a strong collective identifier – but of the more institutionalized positions people could occupy within the Church.²³

There is, however, another way to look at the question. One may think that the Church’s very attempts to modernize itself also negatively

¹⁷ Micheline Dumont, “Les charismes perdus. L’avenir des congrégations religieuses féminines en l’an 2000,” *Recherches féministes*, 3, no. 2 (1990): 73-111.

¹⁸ Micheline D’Allaire, *Vingt ans de crise chez les religieuses du Québec, 1960-1980* (Montréal: Éditions Bergeron, 1984), 282.

¹⁹ “It became easier and less costly for Catholics to participate in society, and participating in the Catholic Church or Catholic organizations was no longer the only option available... a decline in participation [was] the logical consequence.” (Erik Sengers, “Although We Are Catholic, We Are Dutch – The Transition of the Dutch Catholic Church from Sect to Church as an Explanation for its Growth and Decline,” *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 43 (2004): 135.

²⁰ Isabelle Matte, “The Pope’s Children, Generation Lyrique: The Decline of Catholic Practices in Ireland’s Celtic Tiger and Quebec’s Révolution Tranquille,” *The Canadian Journal of Irish Studies*, 33, no. 1 (Spring 2007): 22-30.

²¹ Hugh McLeod, *The Religious Crisis of the 1960s* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007).

²² Denis Pelletier, *La crise catholique. Religion, société, politique en France (1965-1978)* (Paris: Payot, 2004).

²³ D’Allaire, *Vingt ans de crise chez les religieuses du Québec*.

impacted on the number of religious vocations. In particular, the Second Vatican Council made “an extraordinary set of revisions of basic doctrines and practices” that led to “extremely rapid change” in core doctrines and liturgical practices.²⁴ Although we should not downplay the role of the Council, it should be noted that Vatican II can be defined as a symptom as much as a cause of the decline of the Roman Catholic Church in Quebec. One scholar compared the Council’s resolutions to Gorbachev’s policies of *glasnost* and *perestroika* that announced the collapse of the Soviet Union.²⁵ These policies only precipitated a crisis that was already brewing in the shadows; they did not provoke the fall of the Berlin Wall. In the same way, Vatican II did not generally trigger the crises of Catholicism in Quebec, it only accompanied them. That being said, Vatican II was not without influence on the secularization of Quebec society. One can even claim that the Council’s intention to close the gap between the Church’s teachings and modern culture also contributed to the decline in Catholic commitment.

The Council’s *aggiornamento* sent a strong message to all Catholics: that lay people and religious figures alike could attain holiness; that non-Catholic faiths could lead to God; that social engagement in the world might constitute a better, more charitable choice than withdrawal in the confines of a cloistered life; that rites and symbols should be in harmony with the present-day conditions of Catholics. “On the ideological level, the church no longer sought confrontation but was investigating how positive aspects of modern society and Catholicism could go together.”²⁶ Religious folks who had chafed under the restrictions and requirements of the Church were freer to pursue a more personalized spirituality, informed by modern aspirations and values. In Quebec, discourses on the progressiveness of the Church’s teachings accumulated; theologians tried to formulate a new humanism that would not be rooted in a specific Catholic philosophy but would connect faith with modern life experience; in most progressive circles, Jesus was presented as a human being burdened with challenges, doubts, temptations and desires; the Roman Catholic Church was no longer defined as a hierarchical institution but a collection of people, God’s assembly. Personalist ideology²⁷ invited Catholics to work towards the establishment of a truly Christian society, one benefiting each and every citizen, not only

²⁴ Stark and Finke, “Catholic Religious Vocations”.

²⁵ Peter Beyer, “Religious Vitality in Canada: The Complementary of Religious Market and Secularization Perspective,” *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 36, no. 2, (1997): 285.

²⁶ Sengers, “Although We are Catholic, We Are Dutch,” 134.

²⁷ E.-Martin Meunier and Jean-Philippe Warren, *Sortir de la Grande noirceur. L’horizon personnaliste de la Révolution tranquille* (Sillery: Septentrion, 2002). Michael Gauvreau, *The Catholic Origins of Quebec’s Quiet Revolution, 1931–1970* (Montreal & Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2005).

the chosen ones. The attempts to lower the tension between the waning French Canadian Catholic community and the emerging dominant social order culminated with the publication of the Dumont Commission's report. Presided over by Fernand Dumont, the Commission d'étude sur les laïcs et l'Église was set up by the French Canadian bishops in 1968 and sought to establish new ways to reconcile the Church and contemporary French Canadian culture.²⁸

Yet, it is precisely at this point that a growing number of Quebecers stopped following the practices that were not related to the great rites of passage of birth, marriage, and death. Slowly, Quebecers "excultured" themselves out of Catholicism. "Exculturation" was not the abandonment of all religious beliefs and rites but rather "the possible un-bridging of the elective affinity that history has deeply established between" a people's "shared representations (the 'culture' that is common to them)" and Catholic culture, as well as "perhaps an ultimate hollowing out of Catholicism" within society's bosom.²⁹ This "exculturation" can be linked to the Vatican Council's impact on religious institutional practices because, as the distinction between the rewards of the pious life and that of ordinary good citizenship faded, believers became distanced from the Church. As a missionary priest returning from Tanzania to Canada commented, the new theology, by insisting on the religious insights of pagans and their capacity to know God through their own culture and traditions, swiftly erased a powerful motive to sacrifice oneself to the cause of Catholicism in the world. "If men," he asked, "can save themselves without being baptised in the Church, why continue to instruct catechumens and convert people?"³⁰

In Quebec the number of priestly ordinations only dropped from 135 in 1960 to 127 in 1965 but then suddenly dropped to 71 in 1967. The decline in women entering a religious order followed a more dramatic path, from 1,260 in 1960 to 100 in 1969. The steep reduction in the number of religious men and women and of new recruits during or right after the closing of the Council was also observed in the United States, France, Germany and the Netherlands. Ironically, this occurred exactly when the Church was attempting to appeal to younger generations by adapting its message. Somehow paradoxically the perceived incentives for becoming a priest, nun or a brother were drastically reduced – and not heightened, or at least maintained—at the end of Vatican II. Many Quebecers now believed that a lay life could equally lead to personal sanctification.

²⁸ Commission d'Étude sur les Laïcs et sur l'Église 4 volumes (Montréal : Fides, 1971-1972).

²⁹ Danièle Hervieu-Léger, *Catholicisme. La fin d'un monde* (Paris : Bayard, 2003), 97, 20.

³⁰ Marcel Boivin, "Missionnaires chez vous!... (?)," *Kerygma*, 20, tome 7 (1973) : 32.

It seems that the less enthused individuals were by the Council's *aggiornamento*, the more they could continue to believe that religious life offered a route to personal satisfaction. Although a comparative analysis for Quebec has yet to be done, the more conservative religious institutes attracted a greater number of recruits than liberal orders³¹ and the small and medium congregations (50 to 100 members) lost proportionally fewer members in the past fifty years than very large congregations (100 members and more).³² Some close-knit orders more effectively resisted the general religious drawback. The Moniales Bénédictines, a traditional cloistered order that kept its distinctive black dress and conveyed a rigorous message, was one of the very few that maintained its membership from 1961 to 1981. So did the Carmélites de Montréal. But the overall decline in recruitment has been so brutal in the past fifty years that the conservative congregations' resilience must not be overstated.

In Quebec, the contemporary situation seems a classic case of institutional secularization. The decline of religious vocations, which started shortly after the Second World War, sharply spiralled downward in the 1960s. The religious calling of priests, nuns, and brothers was then almost completely silenced. This decline can be partly attributed to a drought of appealing otherworldly rewards in a time of fast-developing secular worldly rewards. Indeed, if it made sense to enter the priesthood or sisterhood in the 1930s, this choice was much less compelling after the 1960s: to an increasing number of Quebecers, religious "jobs" were no longer prestigious and did not hold unique spiritual incentives. The disenchantment of religious beliefs and rites accompanied the fall of the Church's organizational prominence in the development of French Canada. Attempting to explain the massive and rapid desertion of churches, Hubert Guindon (1999) emphasized that a tradition could only preserve its sacredness in the eyes of a people if it remains useful in everyday life.³³

³¹ Stark and Finke, "Catholic Religious Vocations."

³² Dumont, "Les charismes perdus."

³³ Hubert Guindon, "La Révolution tranquille et ses effets pervers," *Société*, 20-21 (1999): 1-38. It is true that Guindon ("Social Unrest, Social Class and Quebec's Bureaucratic Revolution," *Queen's Quarterly*, 71 (Summer 1964): 150-162) also pointed to the increasingly influential modern values of efficiency, meritocracy, and rationality fostered by the university-educated French Quebecers who worked in the public and para-public sectors. In this sense, one might be tempted to conclude that secularization is also the outcome of an evolving self-concept rather than just self-interest. But such a distinction is often impossible to draw: people define their life-goals according to aspirations that are never totally detached from questions of prestige, wealth or social recognition. People's disinterest is an interest to disinterestedness (Pierre Bourdieu, "Intérêt et désintéressement. Cours du Collège de France à la faculté de sociologie et d'anthropologie de l'Université Lumière Lyon II," *Cahiers du GRS* 7, 1988). Bourdieu's assertion is generally valid for religious beliefs and practices as it is for just about anything else.

Without further theorization, we find in this fact a convincing and sufficient explanation to understand why the new middle classes and the ordinary urban world neglected their religious practices [in the 1960s]. Indeed, with the laicization of social institutions, bureaucratic and professional jobs integrated to developing the welfare state did not transit through the Church anymore. As well, the urban population in general no longer depended on institutions ruled by the Church. The Church was no longer rooted in the everyday life of the new and modern Quebec society.³⁴

This paper has attempted to substantiate Guindon's intuition – although we disagree with him in believing that it offers a “sufficient explanation.” In the 1960s, the Church found itself in competition with a rapidly developing consumer and state-controlled society. Adhesion to the Church became a personal affair that had to be weighed against other interests, desires, aspirations, and needs. If, in the 1950s, the relationship of those who opposed the Church's control over Quebec society was characterised by anticlericalism, it was characterized by “de-Catholicization” in the sixties—before it entered, according to Pérez-Agote, a period of “exculturation.”³⁵ However, this interpretation does not mean that Quebecers increasingly became irreligious in the 1960s. Quite surprisingly self-identification to the Roman Catholic Church remained strong through the 2000s. Catholic was what Quebecers wanted to “be.” It was just no longer what they wanted to “do.”

34 Guindon, “La Révolution tranquille et ses effets pervers,” 22.

35 Alfonso Pérez-Agote, “Les trois vagues de la sécularisation des consciences en Espagne,” *Social Compass*, 56, no. 2 (2009): 189-201.

Academic Year 2012-2013

THE JAMES F. KENNEY PRIZE

This prize is awarded annually by the Canadian Catholic Historical Association in honour of its founder, James F. Kenney (1884-1946), for the best essay on any aspect of the history of Catholicism in Canada written in a course by an undergraduate student in any university.

Conditions: Entries must be undergraduate essays between 2500 and 5000 words in length on some aspect of Catholicism in Canada. The author must be a part-time or a full-time undergraduate student in a degree program at an accredited university or college in Canada. The essay must have been written to meet the requirement of an undergraduate credit course during the current academic year.

Submissions: Entries shall be submitted by course instructors no later than 1 May 2013. No instructor shall submit more than two entries. Essays must be typed neatly and should not indicate the instructor's comments or grade. Essays may also be submitted electronically. Entries should be sent to the President, Canadian Catholic Historical Association [Dr. Edward MacDonald, University of Prince Edward Island, 550 University Ave., Charlottetown, PEI C1A 4P3 or gemaconnald@upei.ca].

Adjudication: Entries will be judged by a panel determined by the CCHA. The winner will be announced in the autumn of 2013. There will be no runners-up or honorary mentions. The CCHA reserves the right not to award a prize in a given year should applications not be of sufficient quality.

Prize: \$500

www.cchahistory.org

Recent prize winner: Erika MacRae, Queen's University
"Marian Devotion: A Research Paper on the Divine Worship of the Blessed Virgin Mary, The Reconstruction of Sacred and Public Spaces."

Abstracts/Résumés

Catherine FOISY

Preparing the Québec Church for Vatican II: Missionary Lessons from Asia, Africa, and Latin America, 1945-1962

What contribution did the Québécois missionary effort bring to the reception of Vatican II in Québec? To answer that, this paper focuses on the experience of members of four missionary institutes founded in Québec: the *Missionnaires de l'Immaculée-Conception*, the *Missionnaires de Notre-Dame des Anges*, the *Société des Missions étrangères du Québec*, and the *Missionnaires du Christ-Roi*, between 1945 and 1962. This paper analyses the missionaries' preconiliar experience of cultural and religious difference, and shows how it contributed to the emergence of a changing perspective on Christianity, the Church, and mission. Based on interviews conducted with missionaries, the institutes' archives, and secondary sources, this paper argues that parallels exist between shifts in the missionary field with respect to lay people, the local church, cultural and religious differences, and the way the Québec Church prepared itself for Vatican II.

Quelle fut la contribution des missionnaires québécois à la réception de Vatican II au Québec? Pour y répondre, cet article analyse l'expérience des membres des quatre instituts missionnaires de fondation québécoise : les Missionnaires de l'Immaculée-Conception, les Missionnaires de Notre-Dame des Anges, la Société des Missions étrangères du Québec et les Missionnaires du Christ-Roi, de 1945 à 1962. L'auteure montre comment le renouvellement des pratiques missionnaires, particulièrement eu égard aux différences culturelles et religieuses, ont contribua à l'émergence d'une perspective différente sur le christianisme, l'Église et la mission. En mobilisant des entrevues menées auprès de missionnaires, des archives des instituts ainsi que les sources secondaires, cet article met en lumière les similarités entre, d'une part, les changements opérés au plan missionnaire au sujet des laïcs, de l'Église locale, des différences religieuses et culturelles et, d'autre part, la manière dont l'Église québécoise s'est préparée pour le concile Vatican II.

Gordon L. HEATH

The Protestant Denominational Press and the Conscription Crisis, 1917-1918

What made the conscription crisis of 1917 so dangerous for the fledgling nation were the shrill denunciations of Quebec emanating from English Canada that stoked the passions of an already enflamed populace in Quebec. Yet, there were voices of moderation in English Canada, namely various Protestant denominational newspapers that counseled understanding from their readers. The responses manifested in the press indicated the realization that the new nation could not survive harsh anti-Catholic rhetoric. The conscription crisis made it clear – to repeat the vitriol of the past was to threaten Canada's future. The same nation-building role that prompted the churches to evangelize Catholics and to win the race to the West motivated the denominational press to condemn anti-French rhetoric and to encourage an understanding of French-Canadian history, culture and religion. Consequently, and ironically, the Protestant denominational press, a formidable tool to Protestantize Canada, became – at least for a few brief months – a proponent of conciliation.

Ce qui avait rendu si dangereuse la crise d'enrôlement de 1917 pour la toute jeune nation était des dénonciations persistantes contre le Québec qui se détachait du Canada anglais; elles nourrissaient en même temps les passions d'une population déjà échauffée au Québec. Cependant, des voix s'étaient levées du côté du Canada anglais pour prôner la modération, notamment celles de plusieurs journaux confessionnels protestants qui recommandaient à leurs lecteurs la bonne compréhension. Des réactions relevées dans la presse indiquaient que la jeune nation ne pouvait survivre à un rude discours anticatholique. La crise d'enrôlement avait ainsi mis en évidence le fait que poursuivre le discours haineux du passé menaçait l'avenir du Canada. Le même rôle de bâtisseur de la nation qui motivait les Églises à évangéliser les catholiques et à gagner la ruée vers l'Ouest avait conduit la presse confessionnelle à condamner le discours anti-français et à encourager la compréhension de l'histoire du Canada français, sa culture et sa religion. Par conséquent, et par ironie, la presse confessionnelle protestante, l'outil par excellence pour convertir le Canada au protestantisme, était ainsi devenue – au moins pour quelques mois – le chantage de la réconciliation.

Gabriela PAWLUS KASPRZAK

How the Poles Got Organized: The Emergence of Organizational Life amongst Polish Canadians in the 1920s and 1930s

This study explores the challenges and changes facing Polish organizational life in Canada during the interwar period. Before 1918, the community's life centred on parish and parish-related organizations. However, the reestablishment of the Polish state in 1918, the arrival of consuls in Canada, and another wave of Polish immigrants redefined the Polish diaspora's organizational life. By the early 1930s, three main federations had emerged: Zjednoczenie Zrzeszeń Polaków w Kanadzie (Federation of Polish Societies, ZZPwK), Stowarzyszenie Polaków w Kanadzie (Association of Poles, SPwK), and Związek Polaków w Kanadzie (Polish Alliance Friendly Society of Canada, ZPwK). Each wanted to bring together the entire community under its own roof to stave off denationalization. However, each federation offered a distinct vision of what it meant to be a Pole and the manner in which to protect it. Central to this ideological struggle was the relationship between nationalism and religion (i.e., Catholicism).

Cette étude explore les défis et les changements rencontrés par les Polonais dans leur vie associative pendant l'entre-deux-guerres. Avant 1918, la vie communautaire reposait sur des organisations paroissiales ou en rapport avec des paroisses. Cependant, le rétablissement de l'État polonais en 1918, l'arrivée des consuls au Canada et une autre vague d'immigrants polonais ont donné corps à la vie communautaire de la diaspora polonaise. Vers le début des années 1930, trois fédérations principales ont vu le jour: Zjednoczenie Zrzeszeń Polaków w Kanadzie (Fédération des sociétés polonaises, ZZPwK), Stowarzyszenie Polaków w Kanadzie (Association des Polonais, SPwK), et Związek Polaków w Kanadzie (Amicale de l'Alliance polonaise du Canada, ZPwK). Chacune avait l'objectif de rassembler sous sa bannière la communauté toute entière pour empêcher la dénationalisation. Néanmoins, chaque fédération donnait une vision distincte des valeurs qui font un Polonais ainsi que de la façon de les protéger. La relation entre nationalisme et religion (le catholicisme par exemple) était au centre de cette lutte idéologique.

Ollivier HUBERT

A Nineteenth Century Montreal Collège Classique: Antiquarian Survival or Education for the Future?

This article proposes some revisions to aspects of the history of secondary education in Quebec, and in particular of *collèges classiques*. The prevalent

historical interpretation argues that the clerical secondary schools in Quebec considerably slowed the emergence of a modern, state-run secondary school system. But a “secondary” state system did exist before the middle of the twentieth century, and clerical colleges can be best understood as being part of a system of classical education based on social class. Catholic colleges were not so much Catholic as they were private. They represented an important tool in the hands of the elite, which helped perpetuate their dominant position in society. This article presents arguments that may lead to a reinterpretation of Quebec colleges in sociological terms, more as producers of a distinctive male middle class Catholic habitus, and less as producers of an already abundant clergy.

Cet article propose une réinterprétation de certains aspects de l'histoire de l'éducation secondaire au Québec, particulièrement à propos des collèges classiques. La lecture historique la plus commune suggère que l'existence d'un réseau de maisons d'enseignement secondaire contrôlé par le clergé constitua un frein pour la constitution d'un système public au Québec. Pourtant, un ensemble d'institutions publiques de niveau secondaire existait avant le milieu du XX^e siècle et les collèges cléricaux peuvent être interprétés dans le cadre d'une architecture éducative segmentée par une logique sociale plutôt que religieuse. Les collèges catholiques, avant d'être catholiques, étaient privés et constituaient un des outils de la domination élitaire. Cet article présente donc une série d'arguments en faveur d'une réinterprétation des collèges classiques selon une grille sociologique, comme producteurs de l'habitus d'une élite sociale masculine catholique plutôt que comme producteur d'un clergé pléthorique.

Jean-Philippe WARREN

Some Thoughts on Catholicism and the Secularization Question in Quebec: Worldly and Otherworldly Rewards (1960-1970)

Quebec society has repeatedly been described as unique in its radical emancipation from religious institutions in the wake of the Quiet Revolution (1960-1970). Notwithstanding the question of Quebecers' sustained spiritual beliefs, how can historians account for the spectacular marginalization of the Roman Catholic Church during the Quiet Revolution? This paper hypothesises that an increase of worldly rewards and a decrease of otherworldly rewards has fuelled the decline of the Church. In the 1960s, the Church found itself in competition with a rapidly developing consumer and state-controlled society. Adhesion to the Church became a personal affair that had to be weighed against other interests, desires, aspirations, and needs. To an increasing

number of Quebecers, religious “jobs” were no longer prestigious and did not hold unique spiritual incentives. The disenchantment of religious beliefs and rites accompanied the fall of the Church’s organizational prominence in the development of French Canada. Catholic may have been what Quebecers still wanted to “be.” It was, however, no longer what they wanted to “do.”

La société québécoise du XX^e siècle a souvent été décrite comme un cas unique d’émancipation du giron religieux. Nonobstant la question de la résilience des croyances religieuses des Québécois, comment les historiens peuvent-ils comprendre la marginalisation radicale de l’Église catholique en tant que mode d’encadrement social au moment où éclate la Révolution tranquille (1960-1970)? Cet article formule l’hypothèse qu’une augmentation des récompenses terrestres, couplée à une diminution des récompenses ecclésiastiques, a contribué au déclin de l’Église. Dans les années 1960, l’Église s’est retrouvée placée en compétition avec une culture de consommation en plein essor et une société technocratique où prédominait l’interventionnisme gouvernemental. L’adhésion à l’Église est devenue une affaire personnelle qui devait être mise dans la balance d’autres intérêts, désirs, aspirations et besoins. Pour un nombre croissant de Québécois, les « emplois » religieux n’avaient plus le prestige profane de naguère et ne possédaient plus des attraits spirituels distinctifs. Le désenchantement des croyances et des rites religieux a accompagné la fin de la domination de l’Église organisationnelle dans le développement du Canada français. Les Québécois voulaient encore « être » catholiques, mais ce n’était plus ce qu’ils voulaient « faire ».

SUBMISSION GUIDELINES

Historical Studies

Journal of the Canadian Catholic Historical Association

1. General Author Guidelines

Published once a year by the Canadian Catholic Historical Association, *Historical Studies* is a fully refereed journal that features articles, critical notes, book reviews and a bibliography aimed at advancing knowledge in the religious history of Canada. The journal accepts comparative and interdisciplinary approaches and welcomes manuscripts from the greatest possible number of researchers, including graduate students. All manuscripts are assessed through a double-blind process that ensures confidentiality. The editorial board considers only unpublished manuscripts and does not consider works of popularization. The journal only publishes English-language articles.

Submission Guidelines

Manuscripts must be submitted electronically as Word files. Texts should be double-spaced and should be no longer than 35,000 characters (6,500-8,500 words) or **25 double-spaced pages**, including notes.

Authors whose manuscripts are selected will be required to provide the editors with a revised version of the manuscript in a timely manner following the application of any changes and corrections required.

Articles accepted for publication must be accompanied by an abstract (roughly 150 words) as well as a biographical sketch of the author (no more than 75 words).

Article Selection and Copyright

Submissions are evaluated by the editors of *Historical Studies* and by board-selected external readers. The editors decide whether to publish, reject or request a revision of each article. In cases of conditional selection, the editors will communicate with the author to insure that the conditions for publication are fulfilled. The editors reserve the right to reject articles that, although acceptable in terms of content, will require in their estimation too much revision in order to meet publication deadlines.

Authors whose work has been accepted for publication in *Historical Studies* assign to the Canadian Catholic Historical Association the exclusive copyright for countries as defined in section 3 of the Copyright Act to the contribution in its published form. The CCHA, in turn, grants the author the right of republication in any book of which the author is the exclusive author or editor, subject only to the author giving proper credit to the original publication in *Historical Studies*.

2. Submission Format

As the journal does not possess a secretarial office, we thank you in advance for meeting the following conditions *exactly* so as to help us reduce printing costs and speed up the publication process. The editors reserve the right to reject manuscripts that stray too far from the following formatting rules.

Reminder: Texts must not exceed 25 pages, notes included.

Texts should be formatted for standard dimensions (8.5 × 11). Long quotations and notes should all be **single-spaced** within the text. The first page of the manuscript should contain the title of the article followed by the author's name.

Text should appear in Times New Roman 12 font, with 9 font in the footnotes.

Titles, Tables, Figures and Illustrations

All tables, graphics, figures and illustrations should be referred to in the body of the text. They should be numbered in Arabic numerals and include an appropriate title or key. Notes on the source, if any, should follow immediately. Maps (vector processing software), graphics (e.g., Lotus and Excel spreadsheets) and tables (spreadsheet or word processing software) must all be submitted in electronic format.

Photographs must be submitted as jpeg files, and include captions, credits and permissions where appropriate.

Capitalization, Parentheses, Abbreviations, Dates and Spacing

Texts should make as little use as possible of capitalization, parentheses and abbreviations.

Centuries should be indicated in written form (i.e. "nineteenth century").

In text references and footnotes, dates should be indicated as follows: day, month, and year (i.e. 1 April 1966).

Paragraphs should be preceded and followed by a 6-point spacing. Make sure to indent the first line of each paragraph. The period ending each sentence should be followed by one space.

Italics

The use of italics should be reserved for foreign-language terms and titles of books and periodicals.

Quotations

Authors should endeavour to avoid excessively lengthy quotations (more than ten lines). Quotations of more than three typed lines should be placed as a separate paragraph with a five-space indent on the left, no indent on the right and without quotation marks. Omissions or cuts within quotations are indicated by suspension points

Notes

Historical Studies employs footnotes for the purpose of referencing. Superscript numbers in-text should be offered sequentially in the paper, and should be placed immediately following punctuation marks. Notes and references should be single-spaced and appear at the bottom of each page.

Bibliographical information should be provided in full when books and articles are first cited. Afterwards, only the name of the author, the first few words of the title and the page number need be mentioned. Do not use *op. cit.* or *ibid.*

Here are some examples:

Books

Robert Choquette, *Language and Religion: A History of French-English Conflict in Ontario* (Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1975), 161-247.

For subsequent references: Choquette, *Language and Religion*, 9-43.

Edited book

Paul Bramadat and David Seljak (eds.) *Christianity and Ethnicity in Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008).

Article in book

Mark McGowan, "Roman Catholics (Anglophone and Allophone)," in Paul Bramadat and David Seljak (eds.) *Christianity and Ethnicity in Canada* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008), 49-100.

Journal Articles

Elizabeth Smyth, "Congregavit Nos In Unum Christi Amor: The Congregation of the Sisters of St. Joseph in the Archdiocese of Toronto, 1851-1920," *Ontario History*, 84, no. 3 (1992): 230-233.

Archival

St. Francis Xavier University Archives (hereafter STFXUA), Extension Department Papers (hereafter EDP), Moses M. Coady to R.J. MacSween, 24 March 1953, RG 30-2/1/2963.

Dissertation

Heidi MacDonald, "The Sisters of St. Martha and Prince Edward Island Social Institutions, 1916-1982," (Ph.D. diss., University of New Brunswick, 2000), 10-12.

Web Site

Author's name, title of publication, date of publication, <url>, and date accessed.

For example: William Lyon Mackenzie King Papers, MG 26J, Series 13, Diary entry for 10 June 1940, <http://king.collectionscanada.ca>, accessed on 20 June 2005.